















THE

# *CALCUTTA REVIEW.*

VOLUME LXXVII.

1883.

*4392*  
*19.*

---

*No man who hath tasted learning but will confess the many ways of profiting by those who, not contented with stale receipts, are able to manage and set forth new positions to the world: and, were they but as the dust and cinders of our feet, so long as in that notion they may yet serve to polish and brighten the armoury of truth, even for that respect they were not utterly to be cast away.—MILTON.*

---

CALCUTTA :

PRINTED & PUBLISHED BY

THOMAS S. SMITH, CITY PRESS, 12, BENTINCK STREET,

BOMBAY : MESSRS. THACKER & CO., "LIMITED."

MADRAS : MESSRS. HIGGINBOTHAM & Co.

LONDON . MESSRS. TRÜBNER & CO., 57 & 59, LUDGATE HILL.

052

AD:

Vol

Fi

Interprete distribution Public Library,

Acq. No. 7909 Date 6.8.75

# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

No. CLIII.

## CONTENTS.

	PAGE.
ART. I.—THE MATERIAL PROGRESS OF CEYLON ...	1
“ II.—KURUKASHIT RYOT OF BENGAL ...	9
“ III.—THE PRESS OF CALCUTTA:	
1.—Life of John Thomas, by C. B. Lewis ...	58
2.—The Indian Gazette ...	il.
3.—Alexander's East India Magazine, December 1831 ...	il.
4.—The Calcutta Quarterly Magazine and Review, 1831 ...	ib.
5.—The Calcutta Review, June 1844 ...	ib.
6.—The Calcutta Review, October 1876 ...	ib.
7.—The Englishman, 1880 ...	ib.
“ IV.—RESULTS OF PRIMARY EDUCATION IN THE NORTH-WEST AND OUDH ...	72
“ V.—ADAMOL'S NOTES ON A JOURNEY FROM PERM TO TASHKEND ...	129
“ VI.—SOME GHAZALS OF NAZIR AKBARABADI ...	145
“ VII.—ABOUT INDIGO PLANTING AND INDIGO PLAN- TER ...	148
“ VIII.—FOLKLORE OF THE HEADLESS HORSEMAN IN NORTHERN INDIA ...	158
THE QUARTER ...	184

### CRITICAL NOTICES:—

#### I.—GENERAL LITERATURE.

- 1.—A Grammar of the Classical Arabic Language,\*  
Translated and Compiled from the Works\* of  
the most approved Native or Naturalised Autho-  
rities. By Mortimer Sloper Howell, II. M.'s  
Bengal Civil Service, etc. Published under the  
Authority of the Government, N.-W. Provin-  
ces. In an Introduction and four Parts. The  
Introduction and Part I. The Noun: Allaha-  
bad. Printed at the North-Western Provinces  
and Oudh Government Press, 1883 ...

- 2.—A "Year of Life." The Price of the Bishop, and PAGE.  
other Poems. By John Cameron Grant. (Au-  
thor of "Songs from the Sunny South," etc.)  
London: Longmans, Green & Co. 1883 ... ii
- 3.—Indian Snake Poisons, their Nature and Effects.  
By A. J. Wall, M. D. (Lond.) Fellow of the  
Royal College of Surgeons of England: of the  
Medical Staff, H. M.'s Indian Army. London:  
W. H. Allen & Co., 13, Waterloo Place, Pall  
Mall, S. W. 1883 ... v
- 2.—VERNACULAR LITERATURE.—
- 4.—Nisitha Chintā. Book I. Translated by Nivai  
Chafan Gangopadhyāya. Printed by Bama  
Charan Majumdar at the Barat Press, 12, Patal-  
dāngā Street, Calcutta, 1882 ... xi
- 5.—Himalaya. Printed by Sarachchandra Deb at  
37 Mechubabazar Street, and published by  
Kedarswar Saanyal at Shikdarpatā, Calcutta,  
1803, Sakabda ... xii
- 6.—Bichitra Paush-pārban. By Nihāl Chand.  
Published by Jogendra Nath Bandyopādhyāya,  
Calcutta ... xiii
- 7.—Raj Jibani. By Gopal Chandra Mukho-  
padhyāya. Printed by Hara Chandra Das at  
the Eden Press, 34, Nilmani Mitra's Street,  
Calcutta, 1289, B. S. ... xv
- 8.—Ayurbardhan. Part I. By Dr. Annada Charan  
Khāstgir. Printed and published by B. L.  
Chakrabarti at the New School Book Press, 8,  
Dixon's Lane, Calcutta, 1882 ... ib.
- 9.—Bibidha Prabandha. Part I. By Rajnarayn  
Basu. Printed by Adhar Nath Chattopadhyāya  
at the Kar Press, 167, Cornwallis Street, and  
Published by Sinha and Banerji Friends, at  
the Oriental Publishing Establishment, Calcutta,  
1289, B. S. ... xvii
-

# THE CALCUTTA REVIEW.

---

NO. CLIII.

---

## ART. I.—THE MATERIAL PROGRESS OF CEYLON.

THE material condition of the Island of Ceylon has lately shown marked progress, and, as its prosperity seems now destined, after a critical period of depression, to continue without check, some description may not be uninteresting of an island which has been styled “the richest possession of the English Crown” Whereas nature had intended it to be a mere appendage of whatever state chanced to be the most powerful kingdom of Southern India, the force of destiny has at all times availed to keep its fortunes apart and distinct from those of its neighbours on the great mainland of Hindustan. The Island of Ceylon, however, has enjoyed its successive dynasties, and has passed through vicissitudes similar to those which larger States have undergone. Undisturbed by the revolutions that were of periodical occurrence on the other side of the famous Adam’s Bridge, and which were marked by the triumphs of antagonistic races and religions, its own history represented in miniature the same tragic features as marked the fortunes of greater nations and wider Empires. The same peculiarity attaches to it still, now that it has passed under the sway of the Anglo-Saxon. The schoolboy knows the proximity of Ceylon to India, but only a few persons are aware how widely apart their respective fortunes are sundered. While the possessions of the old East India Company have expanded in the course of a century into an Empire larger, more thickly peopled, and far more prosperous than any previously established in the plains below the snowy crests of the Himalayas, the island of Ceylon has indeed passed under the same all-conquering thralldom, but its destiny does not depend on the decrees of



the magnates of Calcutta and Madras. The questions of its happiness have for eighty years been decided at Whitehall, and, untrammelled by the cares of Empire, it has proceeded along its tranquil and prosperous way under the guise of a Crown colony.

To the ancients the island of Taprobaue represented all that was magnificent, mysterious, and attractive in the East. It has been described as "the mother-land of fables—the country which to the Greeks, the Romans, the Egyptians, and the Arabs offered the same mysterious attractions that the East long did to the peoples of Western Europe." It possessed also more vulgar recommendations, for it was the common meeting-place of the merchants of India, and, indeed, of China, with those who came by the Gulf, or the Red Sea from the countries of Europe; the various commodities of three Continents were there interchanged with convenience, and without difficulty; and what Taprobaue was to the Western traders, such was it also under the name of Lanka to the Hindoos, some of whom, at a very early period of history, had established their authority over the island, and subjected the aboriginal inhabitants, the Veddahs, to their yoke.

A native Hindoo potentate reigned at the town of Kandy, and his jurisdiction was generally recognised throughout the island. The king of Kandy, or Kaudia, as it was called in the old records, continued to exercise undisputed authority over his people until the beginning of the present century; and the relations of that prince with the early representatives of European commerce were not devoid of interest. The Portuguese were the first people who succeeded in establishing their diplomatic rights at his court, and also in securing the privilege of trading with his subjects. So far back as the year 1505, they founded colonies in the Southern and Western parts of the island, where the milder character of the climate invited races of the temperate zone; and these they retained so long as the naval enterprise of the countrymen of Da Gama remained at its zenith. But about the time that the great ruler of Persia, Shah Abbas, was regaining possession of the island of Ormus, which Albuquerque had conquered as the gage of further triumphs over Asiatics, the Portuguese came into collision, in Ceylon, with a more vigorous race and suffered the proverbial fate of the weaker. The Dutch, rescued by their own valour and fortitude from the terrors of Alva and Spain, turned to the conquest of fresh States the courage and energy they had shown in preserving their own. In Ceylon, as further east, at Batavia and in the China seas, they came into hostile contact with the Portuguese, and the result was flattering to their superior valour and enterprise. What the Portuguese had been for a century in Ceylon, that the Dutch became by virtue of

their naval prowess; and for another century the latter remained the foremost and undisputed representatives of European superiority in the island.

Such was the condition of affairs there, until the eighteenth century had nearly reached its close. With the exception of two unimportant and unsuccessful missions—the first as far back as the year 1664, and the second in 1763—there had been no communication whatever between this country and the native king of Kandy, until in the year 1782, when war was carried on by the Madras Government against the Dutch Settlements on the Coromandel Coast. An expedition was despatched in that year to seize the Dutch possessions in Ceylon, and the co-operation of the king of Kandy was invited. Whether out of affection for the race with which he had long had treaty relations, or merely through distrust of our intentions, the king of Kandy rejected these overtures and refused to participate in the war against the Dutch. The staunchness of the principal ruler of Ceylon to his Dutch friends compelled us to have recourse to measures of greater vigour, and the necessary military preparations led to the postponement of the expedition for more than ten years. The task of ousting the Dutch from all participation in the trade of India, which had been begun under the auspices of Warren Hastings, was not crowned with success in Ceylon until the time of the Marquis Wellesley.

In 1795 a military force was landed on the coast, and the towns and districts of Trincomalee, Jaffna, and Calpentin were captured and subjected to English authority. The king of Kandy could not remain indifferent to this display of power, and hastened to conclude with us a treaty of friendship in general terms. The Dutch remained for a short time longer in possession of Colombo, and other places in the South, but the insecurity of their position was so great, that they were led to risk every thing by openly intriguing against us at the Kandian Court. At first their intrigues succeeded, and the king refused to ratify the promises he had made to us. But the successes of the English in the field against their European rivals furnished so convincing an argument at the native capital, that wisdom dictated a speedy and amicable understanding with the new comers. The Dutch were soon restricted to the fortress of Colombo and the small town of Galle, where an English force, under Colonel Stuart, held them in close leaguer. Having lost the command of the seas, the garrison saw no possibility of escape, and articles of capitulation were signed on the 15th of February 1796, by which all their possessions were transferred to the English. With the surrender of Colombo, the Dutch

empire in Ceylon passed away, as it had done elsewhere before a more vigorous competitor.

The king of Kandy and his advisers had not remained indifferent spectators of this crowning success. They had seen, with some alarm and much dislike, the Dutch, who had always been content with the part of traders, displaced by a more martial race which everywhere else sought to exercise all the functions of administration. The idea had been mooted, but rejected by the king as impracticable, of attacking the English with all his forces, and of expelling them before they should succeed in consolidating their position on the island. Divergent counsels produced hesitating action as well as discussions at the capital, which were only terminated after a bitter contest. The king fell a victim to his own prudence, for, although his policy was adopted, he was himself deposed by the party which claimed to be the more patriotic. An event outside his own immediate dominions occurred to strengthen the hands of his opponents and to precipitate his fall. The Madras authorities had followed up their conquest in Ceylon by an indiscretion. They had sought to force upon the Cingalese a vigorous fiscal system, which was totally inapplicable to their new subjects, and which has retarded the material development of their own Presidency. A general revolt was imminent, and nothing but the prompt reversal of the policy averted the catastrophe.

Then, for the first time in the history of British India, the Crown directly interfered in behalf of the subject-population. The possessions in Ceylon were taken from the East India Company and annexed to the Crown; and what had been intended as a mere appendage of Madras became a Royal colony administered after a different fashion to any other Indian possession. In the result Ceylon has benefited beyond any possible anticipation, and its exceptional prosperity dates from the time, when in 1798 it was severed from Madras and passed under the direct control of the English Government.

The crisis had, therefore, been precipitated in the internal affairs of Kandy by this ill-judged action of the Madras Government. An ambitious Minister, Pilamé Tilawé, deposed the king whose death, in the midst of the disturbances, spared him much further anxiety. At first Pilamé Tilawé sought to enlist in his behalf the support of the English Governor, nor were his overtures received in an unfavourable spirit. The scheme did not, however, work as well as the Minister expected, and, suddenly changing his plans, Pilamé Tilawé broke off the intrigue and proceeded to adopt violent measures. Several English merchants were seized at Kandy and plundered of their goods; and when

reparation was demanded, no satisfactory answer could be obtained. An expedition of three thousand men was accordingly despatched to Kandy, whence Pilamé Tilawé fled, on its approach, to the mountains, taking with him the puppet prince whom he had placed on the throne. The difficulty of pursuing the fugitives into their fastnesses was considerable, and the English commander wanted either the energy or the inclination to undertake the task. Recourse was made to a different mode of settlement, and an arrangement was concluded which sought to ignore the existence of Pilamé Tilawé and the Kandian king.

During the earlier intrigues of the minister, a scion of the Royal House, named Mootoo Samy, had fled for protection to the English. He was now brought forth from his retirement, and placed upon the throne. A treaty was concluded in 1803 by the terms of which Mootoo Samy was recognised king of Kandy, while he, for his part, made certain territorial concessions, and swore to be "the enemy of the enemies of the British Government." Pilamé Tilawé by a subsequent arrangement was made a party to this treaty, on the understanding that he was to be intrusted with "the administration of the provinces belonging to the Crown of Kandy"; but certainly very little trouble was taken to gauge his sincerity. When the English troops were withdrawn, the presence even of our Resident and his guard proved but a slight deterrent to the execution of the schemes he had formed. The ink of the treaty was hardly dry before Pilamé Tilawé had completed his plans for the effectual subversion of the new arrangement. A popular rising broke out in the month of June, and the garrison, cut off from their supplies, surrendered on a promise of their lives. Almost needless to say, the terms were not kept. The soldiers were massacred, and with them perished also Mootoo Samy, the king whom we had installed in power. Thus did Pilamé Tilawé celebrate his return to office.

This flagrant and treacherous act of hostility led to the resumption of warlike operations, but, although desultory fighting was carried on for a period of two years, the result proved indecisive, or rather Pilamé Tilawé succeeded in retaining the position he had seized. That minister continued to exercise the functions of authority until the year 1812, when the young prince in whose name he had been ruling, having arrived at the age of manhood, and developing the tastes of a tyrant, found his minister's advice incompatible with his own inclination. Pilamé Tilawé was accordingly arrested on a charge of treason, and summarily executed. Probably, this energetic act on the part of the king only anticipated the suspicious

apprehensions of the minister ; but the result showed that, while it rid the monarch of a possible rival, it also deprived the State of its best champion. Pilamé Tilawé was not without some of the darker traits of the human character, but the part he played during the most critical period in the modern history of Ceylon would afford a worthy theme for the eulogies of a native bard or historian.

With the death of Pilamé there departed from the counsels of Kandy the vigour that had hitherto sustained them. The king, Wikrema Rajah Singha, having tasted the blood of the greatest of his subjects, fast manifested all the ferocious instincts of a human monster. None were safe from his barbarities ; the meanest could not claim immunity from his cruel exactions. During two years he asserted, undisturbed by qualms of conscience or by the possibility of British intervention, his despotic will upon his unresisting people ; and it was not until he laid violent hands upon a party of merchants, who were British subjects, that he incurred the penalty of his crimes. The sight of these mutilated traders confirmed the native reports of the king's enormities, and it was resolved to put an end to the reign of infamy in progress of celebration at Kandy. An army was placed in the field, and marched upon the native capital. Its approach was received with manifestations of popular delight, and no resistance was attempted. Kandy was occupied without a shot being fired, and the king, abandoned by his subjects, found himself a helpless prisoner in the hands of his enemy. Wikrema Rajah Singha was deposed, like many another incompetent and tyrannical oriental ruler, and banished to Vellore, where he died seventeen years afterwards in 1832. With the deposition of this prince the royal line of Kandy came to an end, although the chiefs retained for a short time longer their virtual independence. It was not, indeed, until three years later, and after another rebellion, that general peace settled down over the whole island. The English sovereignty was then indisputably established, and the mass of the people were benefited by the abolition of the fendal rights which their chiefs had asserted over them. For sixty-five years Ceylon has enjoyed internal tranquillity, disturbed only by a few insignificant attempts at insurrection hardly worthy of a higher name than riot, although it was probably the vigour of Lord Torrington that alone prevented the rising of 1848 from assuming serious proportions.

The destiny of the Cingalese being thus decisively arranged, the opportunity was afforded of developing the resources of their country ; and the opportunity was not neglected. In an island approximating in size to Ireland, there were at this time, according to computation, not many more than one million persons ;

there are now two millions and a quarter. The revenue has always been in excess of the expenditure, while the surplus has been devoted to productive public works. The prosperity of the country has been enhanced by the steady importation into it of English capital, for the promotion of the coffee plantations. Among the numerous other products which constitute the wealth of Ceylon, are rice, cotton, tobacco, sugar, cinnamon and cocoanuts. In short, the climate is so varied in different parts, that almost all the productions of the temperate zone can be equally well cultivated with those of the tropics. Nature also wears her most lovely aspect in the valleys and on the hills of the interior. Round the town of Kandy in particular, the island scenery is to be seen in its highest perfection. The trees are magnificent in their size, the flowers equally resplendent in their colours, while the river Mahawell, Ganga falls from a lofty altitude into a lake beside the town.

A great disaster befell the island some few years ago, and it was thought that the prosperous days of Ceylon were numbered. Despite its numerous resources, Ceylon flourished mainly on coffee. The coffee plantations were the principal inducement to Englishmen with some capital and energy to come and settle in the island; and during many years they proved a sure means of attaining fortune.

Five years ago the ravages of insect, scientifically called the *hemeliya vastatrix*, and more commonly known as the 'borer' fly, carried widespread destruction throughout the coffee plantation. Its assaults proved as fatally effectual as those of phylloxera have in Europe among the vineyards of Germany and France. Ruined hundreds of planters in the face, and a blight fell over one of the most thriving and useful industries in the world. Nor has the coffee-planting industry, although making up much lost ground, yet recovered from the rude blow inflicted upon it by this dire visitation. But fortunately the result has shown that the prosperity of Ceylon may be preserved, notwithstanding the downfall of its staple article. Great credit is due to the principal planters, who bore up with marked courage under the calamity that had fallen upon them; and, instead of losing heart, they came to the wise determination to discover some profitable substitute for the coffee they could no longer cultivate with a reasonable certainty of success.

The last few years have, therefore, been marked by much energy on the part of the English community in Ceylon, and urged by the sharp goad of necessity, their efforts have attained a wonderful degree of success. The tea-plant has been grown with such beneficial results, that Ceylon tea is already sold in the English market—which is certain proof, if not of its intrinsic

## 8. *The Material Progress of Ceylon.*

excellence, at least of its relative merit—with regard to that now imported from China and India. Nor is tea the only, or indeed, the most important, article which is to supply the place of coffee among Cingalese productions. The Cinchona, which was introduced with such remarkable results into India thirty years ago by Mr. Clements Markham, appears to be admirably suited to the climate of Ceylon, and in consequence a large quantity of invaluable and profitable quinine will in future figure among the productions and exports of the island. The native industries in cinnamon and spices are also being developed with greater energy and skill.

In the direction of public works much has also been done for the permanent welfare of the colony. A railway connects Kandy with Colombo, and the inland city is also connected with the northern port of Trincomalee by a high road, which was among the first works we undertook in the island. The roadstead of Colombo has been made safer for vessels by the breakwater, of which the Prince of Wales laid the first stone six years ago, and the rocky harbour of Galle still forms the most frequented meeting-place of our commercial navies in the East. The prosperity of Ceylon incurred a momentary check in consequence of a natural catastrophe, but that untoward accident is already being buried in oblivion, and the future never shone more brightly for this beautiful island of the sea, than it does at the present time, when settlers, are beginning to rejoice, at the success of their vigorous and unaided efforts under a difficulty which, if it had been treated with apathy or indifference, might have proved insuperable.

---

## ART. II.—THE KHUDKASHT RYOT OF BENGAL.

IN the animated discussion about the proposed Rent Bill, most of the writers have lost sight of the original rights and status of the *Khudkasht* ryot and his position under the Permanent Settlement and subsequent laws and regulations. In the later phase of the discussion, questions of political considerations have been introduced, and finally the controversy has taken the shape of personality and partisanship. For this we believe Mr. A. Mackenzie, one of the Rent Law Commissioners, is to some extent responsible. In his note of the 20th January 1880, on enhancement, in reply to Mr. C. D. Field's note of the 13th idem, Mr. Mackenzie takes the aggressive in thus sneering at persons who happened to differ from him. Speaking of Mr. Justice Steer, he says:—"I decline to waste time in discussing Mr. Steer's views of the law. A Judge who could say that it had always been a matter of doubt whether a right of occupancy was acquired by any thing short of an occupation from a period prior to the Permanent Settlement shows such blank ignorance of the revenue history of the country as to be unfit even to enter the arena of discussion." Again:—"Mr. Field's next authority is Sir Barnes Peacock, who said he 'did not believe' that even before the Permanent Settlement every resident cultivator necessarily became a *khudkasht*. I decline to accept that eminent Judge's 'belief' as settling any point of revenue history, or to pin my faith to his dissertations on the original meaning and derivation of the word *khudkasht*." Similarly, in his remarks on the report of the Rent Law Commission, dated Darjeeling the 23rd May 1880, while sneering at Babu Mohini Mohun Roy and Babu Peary Mohun Mookerjee, the two independent native Members of the Commission, and while insinuating that their views were vitiated on account of their zemindari interests, Mr. Mackenzie observes: "They hold on tenaciously and rightly to the sheet anchor of their school—Sir Barnes Peacock; and they are, fortunately for them, able also to refer to the present Chief Justice (as having, though so far, on the unargued case) accepted the views of the zemindary propaganda." When language is hurled forth in this injudicious spirit, it is but natural to expect that it will evoke retorts. The first attack was made by the able pen of Babu Ashutosh Mukerji in the pages of the October (1880) number of the *Calcutta Review*; and in the recent pamphlet of the present Chief Justice, Messrs. Mackenzie and O'Kinealy are



said to have been spoken of as junior members of unripe experience. The matter might have been closed here, but in a note conceived rather in passion and in more than doubtful taste, Mr. Mackenzie thus speaks of Sir Richard Garth : " It is true that in the matter of age I cannot rival Sir Richard Garth. But upon any Indian question I submit that civilians, who have been for 20 years and more studying the people, their customs and their laws, are at least as much entitled to speak as any elderly London lawyer, however eminent, who comes out here with his mind steeped in the traditions of Westminster, and having had neither the time nor the inclination to digest great masses of matter that gather over every question of Indian land law." A writer in the *Englishman* thus pertinently comments upon this note :—" This is tall writing, but it is of a kind we should more reasonably have expected from an angry, naughty schoolboy than from a Secretary to the Government of India. Putting ' their laws ' on one side, I should very much like to ask Mr. Mackenzie where he has spent his ' 20 years and more studying the people and their customs.' Am I right in thinking that Mr Mackenzie's rent theories have been worked out in a comfortable chair in a Secretary's office? With these theories, Birmingham native aid may have had much to do." The whole discussion has thus ended more in a polemical and personal controversy than in judicious research.

The present discourse contemplates investigating the original status and condition of the *Khudkasht* ryot, the changes introduced into his position by statutory acts of the sovereign authorities, the relics of his rights and privileges as maintained by the common or customary law of the country, and the necessity or possibility of re-habilitating him *totidem verbis*. The main features for consideration will be his fixity of tenure and rent, and his power of alienation.

### *The Hindu Period.*

The ordinary definition of a *Khudkasht* ryot is a ryot who cultivates in his own village. It is therefore necessary to understand the conception of a village in order to have a clear idea of his status. Now the Hindu village appears to have grown out of the joint-family, the unit of Hindu society. The Hindu race colonised, as well as conquered, the country, and the joint-family with its development formed a village :—*vide* " Maine's Village Communities," page 175; Campbell's " Cobden Club Essay," page 161; Fifth Report Volume II, page 628; Evidence of Mr. Fortescue before the Select Committee of the House of Lords (1830), page 509.

The simplest form of a Hindu village community is an assemblage of blood-relations holding a domain in common. In the North of India, though the archives almost invariably show that the

community was founded by a single assemblage of blood-relations, there are reasons to suppose that men of alien extraction have always, from time to time, been engrafted on it, and a mere purchaser of a share has under certain conditions been admitted to the brotherhood. In the South of the Peninsula, there are often communities which appear to have sprung, not from one, but from two or more families, and there are some whose composition is known to be entirely artificial; indeed, the occasional aggregation of men of different castes in the same society is fatal to the hypothesis of a common descent, yet in all these brotherhoods, either the tradition is preserved or the assumption made of an original common parentage. Even at the present day the villagers commonly describe their fellow villagers as brothers, although apparently not related in any way; and in the Behar districts a villager is prohibited by custom from marrying in his village on account of a tradition of descent from a supposed common ancestor. Mountstuart Elphinstone, who writes more particularly of the Southern village communities, observes of them (*History of India*, volume 1, page 126): "The popular notion is that the village landholders are all descended from one or more individuals who settled the village, and that the only exceptions are formed by persons who have derived their rights by purchase or otherwise from members of the original stock. The supposition is confirmed by the fact that to this day, there are single families of landholders in small villages and not many in large ones; but each has branched out in so many members, that it is not uncommon for the whole agricultural labor to be done by the landholders, without the aid either of tenants or laborers. The rights of the landholders are theirs collectively, and though they almost always have a more or less perfect partition of them, they never have an entire separation. A landholder, for instance, can sell or mortgage his rights; but he must first have the consent of the village, and the purchaser steps exactly into his place and takes up all his obligations. If a family becomes extinct, its share returns to the common stock."

The same feature of common descent also characterised the agrarian communities of France in their primitive form. And we can follow the process of expansion from a family into a community in the slave villages described by M. de Laveleye. The work of colonization is effected in the same way, and by the same sort of agency: new villages are formed by offshoots from the original stock, interspersed, when necessary, with strangers.

The Hindu village communities inhabited the village homesteads which were collected together, and cultivated the village lands, some of which were detached and at a considerable distance. There was also a certain amount of waste or uncultivated

land included in the village lands.\* In some cases part of the village land was separated from the rest by intervening land of another village†. The villages, however, were not always locally compact, though their boundaries scarcely ever varied.‡ Originally the village lands seem to have been held in common by the families composing the community, and there are traces of a periodical redistribution of land similar to what was made to the Slavonian villages of the Austrian and Turkish provinces by the elders of their body. At some period of their existence, however, a further development took place, when a division appears to have been made of the cultivated lands into equal shares, probably amongst the then existing families:—*vide* the Law and Custom of Hindoo Castes in the Deccan Provinces of Bombay, by Arthur Steele (ed. 1868, p. 207); and evidence of Colonel Briggs before the Select Committee of the House of Lords (1830) 4155. The original shares continued thenceforth to be preserved as the primary divisions of the village,§ and the subsequent subdivisions were into fractions of such shares. The Punjab villages, for instance, are divided into a certain number of plough lands, which are distributed amongst the cultivators. (See Menu. Chap. VII., Slokas 118 and 119; Campbell's "Cobden Club Essay," 161 and 162.)

Contrary to the changed state of things that now exists under the British rule, there was formerly a competition for cultivators, but no competition by cultivators for land|| According to the law of demand and supply, therefore, because the whole agricultural labour of the village could not be done by the brotherhood, these communities attached to themselves certain extraneous elements which they assimilated more or less completely. These were immigrants who either came and settled in the village, cultivating land abandoned by the original settlers and their descendants, or land allotted to them by the village; or another class who, either merely sojourned in the village or cultivated while residing in other villages.¶

There were thus three classes of cultivators in the Hindu period, claiming an interest in the soil of the village: *first*, the original settlers and their descendants; *secondly*, the immigrants who had permanently settled in the village, and *thirdly*, the mere

\* Fifth Report, p. 571, vol. II, Thomason's Selections, 83, 84; Land Tenure, by a Civilian, pp. 7--21.

† Directions for Revenue Officers, p. 31.

‡ Fifth Report, p. 571, vol. II.

§ Fifth Report, vol. II., pp. 299, 352.

|| The Great Rent Case, Bengal

Law Reports, Supplement, Vols. 253, 279, 295 & 296. Campbell's Cobden Club Essay, 166; Directions for Revenue Officers, 41.

¶ Maine's Village Communities, 177; Campbell's Cobden Club Essay, p. 165.

sojourners in the village, or those who, without living in the village, cultivated lands of the village.\* In the description that we propose to give of these three classes of cultivators, we shall endeavour to note their comparative rights against ejectment from land and enhancement of rent, as well as their power of transfer.

The first were the *Khudkashts* proper. They had an hereditary right to cultivate the lands of the village in which they resided, † and their rights were regulated by custom, probably the custom of many centuries, and having at least as much force as any written law.

They could not be ousted while they continued to cultivate their holdings and pay the customary revenue; but, on the other hand, they could not transfer their holdings without the consent of the community. ‡ In his Cobden Club Essay, p. 170, 171, Sir George Campbell says, that these holdings were practically not transferable by sale, and that there was not enough profit derived from them to lead to systematic underletting. Mr. Shore seems to be of opinion that they were not transferable at all, § and Mr. Harrington agrees with his view. ||

### *Rent and Enhancement.*

They paid the customary rate of rent which could not be raised, and in some parts, when the assessment was once fixed, custom prohibited a measurement of the land with a view to surcharging the *khudkashts*. ¶ But while they had a right to cultivate on these terms, they were bound to cultivate and pay the assessment. In default of either of these conditions, they forfeited their right, a penalty which in the scarcity of cultivators was generally waived for an increased rent. \*\* They were

\* Orissa, by W. W. Hunter, vol. 1, p. 37; Directions for Revenue Officers, 63; Evidence of Colonel Briggs before the Committee of the House of Lords (1830), 4078; and of Lt.-Colonel Barnwell before the Select Committee of the House of Commons (1832), 1744.

† Fifth Report, vol. II., pp. 299, 301; Harrington's Analysis, vol. III., 353; Whinfield's Law of Landlord and Tenant, p. 15; The Land Tax of India, by Neil B. E. Baillie, p. xliii; Directions for Revenue Officers, pp. 5, 61, 62; Land Tenure, by a Civil

lian, pp. 66, 68, 80; Campbell's Cobden Club Essay, 165.

‡ Fifth Report, I, p. 488, vol. II, p. 85. An account of the Land Revenue of British India, by Francis Horsley Robinson (1856), p. 15, 41; Evidence of Mr. Stark before the House of Commons Select Committee (1832), 427, 428; and Evidence of Colonel J. Munro, 1488.

§ Fifth Report, vol. I, p. 162

|| Harrington's Analysis, vol. III, p. 460.

¶ Fifth Report, vol. I, p. 165.

\*\* Fifth Report, vol. II, pp. 303, 456.

also bound to cultivate in the customary way.\* On account of want of competition for land, their customary rate, however, fell short of the rent payable by other cultivators.

On the other hand, they enjoyed various privileges arising out of their position as the original settlers of the village. They always occupied the most central and the most easily cultivated land, and when any new allotment was to be made, they could choose their own site. They had a right to dig wells upon their land and let out the water †—a privilege guarded with jealousy in India. They received *russums*, or fees, from the other cultivators, ‡ and had a right to the services of the servile laborers, or had an allowance of one-eighth of the crop deducted from their assessment in view of such services. § In some places they had allotments of land for which they paid no revenue. || Their right was considered so strong, that even if they abandoned their holdings, or lost them by not keeping up cultivation, or by not paying the revenue, they or their descendants could at any distance of time reclaim them on paying a sufficient compensation to the holder. ¶ They were entitled, in common with other permanent cultivators, to the use of the productions of the waste for the construction and repair of their houses and implements of husbandry, and to pasturing their cattle upon the unoccupied lands of the village.\*\*

The next class of cultivators very nearly approached the position of the *khudkashts*, and were sometimes ranked with them. There are, however, some differences which demarcate the original settlers from those afterwards admitted to form part of the permanent village community. The immigrants who turned out to be merely sojourners in the village, were naturally classed with *pyekashts*, but when they became permanent residents of the village, ready to undertake the responsibilities of the community, they gradually engrafted themselves on it, and in course of time, with express or tacit consent of the brotherhood, came to be recognised as *khudkashts*. They are called *Chaperbund* or *Judiesht*, names specially applied to immigrants who have permanently settled in the village to which they have emigrated. †† Their right to the permanent interest of the soil,

\* Directions for Revenue Officers, Fifth Report, vol., I, p. 164.

† Direction for Revenue Officers, p. 5; Land Tenure, by a Civilian, p. 80.

‡ Fifth Report, vol. II, p. 41, 42, 299, 301.

§ Land Tenure, by a Civilian, pp. 78, 80.

|| Fifth Report, vol. II, p. 41.

¶ Fifth Report, vol. II, pp. 87; 496, 77, 78, 456, 467, 468, 472, 473 and 481. Land Tenure, by a Civilian, p. 82.

\*\* Whinfield's Landlord and Tenant, p. 17.

†† Whinfield's Landlord and Tenant, p. 17.

CAL 7-7  
vol. 7  
p. 7.

*The Khudkasht Ryot of Bengal.*

which nearly approaches that of the *khudkashts* proper, depends upon their having settled as permanent inhabitants in the village, building and clearing and establishing themselves as members of the village community, and by undertaking all the liabilities towards that aggregate group.\* In exceptional cases it may not depend on the length of time they have occupied; for instance, when the community found ample proofs of their intention to permanently reside in the village, they could at once admit them to their brotherhood; but in ordinary cases their disposition to become permanent settlers could hardly be satisfactorily proved without some length of possession. Accordingly those who had settled in the village for more than one generation were generally considered to have sufficiently shewn their intention, and such settlers became recognised as Chupperbund cultivators †. "It is suspected by all who have examined their history," ‡ says Sir Henry Maine, "that the communities, like the Gentes, have been very generally adulterated by the admission of strangers, but the exact mode of absorption cannot now be ascertained. \* \* \* The acquisition of the adopted member is, however, of the nature of a universal succession; together with the share he has bought, he succeeds to the liabilities which the vendor had incurred towards the aggregate group. He is an *Emptor Familiae*, and inherits the legal clothing of the person whose place he begins to fill. The consent of the whole brotherhood required for his admission may remind us of the consent which the *Comitia Curiata*, the parliament of that large brotherhood of self-styled kinsmen, the ancient Roman commonwealth, so strenuously insisted on as essential to the legislation of an adoption, or the confirmation of a will."

Sir George Campbell, in his "Cobden Club Essay," p. 165, says that a distinction was made "in the general language of the country" between ryots who had settled as permanent inhabitants of the village, and had given pledges by building and clearing, and establishing themselves and accepting a share of common obligations, and the temporary sojourners or cultivators from another village. When there he said of the *khudkashts* that they had a "moral § claim" to hold while they cultivated and paid rent, he must have meant the permanent immigrants who came to be recognised as *khudkashts*. The expression "moral claim," however,

\* Directions for Revenue Officers, p. 65; Campbell's Cobden Club Essay, p. 65.

† Robinson's Land Revenue, 15, 41; The Great Rent Case, Bengal Law

Report, Supplement vol., p. 300.

‡ Maine's Ancient Law, p. 265.

§ Campbell's "Cobden Club Essay," p. 165.

appears to indicate a right much weaker than what belongs to an original resident of the village. Mr. Shore (afterwards Lord Teignmouth) says, that tenants cultivating the lands of the village to which they belong, acquire by *long tenancy*,\* a kind of hereditary right of occupancy; while those cultivating the lands belonging to a village where they do not reside are considered mere tenants-at-will. And in Harrington's Analysis, Vol. III, p. 426, (n) it is said generally of the ryots of Behar that they have a sort of *prescriptive right* to continue tenants so long as they pay the usual rate of rent, and in Vol. II, p. 64, it is said, that "their right of possession is considered stronger than that of ordinary ryots." These immigrants appear to have come in originally to cultivate land abandoned by the *khudkashts* to whom they paid *rasums* or *fees*,† and to whom they were bound to surrender their holdings, when required, upon the receipt of a proper compensation.‡ Uninterrupted occupation and succession gave them a prescriptive right to occupy, but there is no instance of the sale of their holdings. They were in fact conditional occupants and had not so complete a right as the *khudkashts* § proper. They could be dispossessed for default in payment of the assessment, or for not keeping up the full extent of cultivation; but they could not reclaim their holdings, as the *khudkashts* proper could. || They had no share in the management of the village or in the privileges of the *khudkashts* proper. Their right was a sort of life ¶ estate which grew to be an hereditary, although inalienable, right to occupy, paying the fixed\*\* assessment. That assessment was slightly lower in former times than that of the *khudkashts* proper, but higher than that of the mere *pyekashts*. They received 45 per cent. of the crop as their share, instead of 50 per cent. which was the proportion the ordinary *pyekashts* received; out of their share they had to pay fees to the *khudkashts* proper.††

The third class is that of strict *pyekashts* who came from

\* Fifth Report, vol. I, p. 140, 162, 164.

† Fifth Report, vol. II. p. 41, 42, 87, 301, 308, 490 to 493; Campbell's "Cobden Club Essay, 161, 162;" Land Tenure, by a Civilian, 81, 82.

‡ Fifth Report, vol. II, p. 87, 456, 496.

§ Directions for Revenue officers, 63, Evidence of Col. Briggs before the Select Committee of the House of Lords (1830), 4,078, and of Lt.-Col. Barnswell before the Select Com-

mittee of the House of Commons, (1832) 1,744.

|| Fifth Report, vol. II, 301, Directions for Revenue officers, 62, 63, 65, Campbells "Cobden Club Essay" 162.

¶ Fifth Report, vol. II, 41, 42, 87, 308, 491 to 493.

\*\* Fifth Report, vol. II, p. 301; Directions for Revenue officers, 63. Evidence of Col. Briggs and Lt.-Col. Barnswell cited before.

†† Fifth Report, vol. II, p. 301.

another village, usually a neighbouring one, to cultivate the land\* of the village which the *khudkashts* were unable to cultivate, they were merely tenants-at-will, more usually from year to year, but sometimes for a fixed period. They were mere sojourners in the village, or cultivated while living in a neighbouring village.† They could not be ousted between sowing and harvest. They had to be attracted by favorable terms, and, as formerly there was a competition for cultivators, they got half the produce. They paid fees to the‡ *khudkashts*, and their rights were left to be settled by contract.

An interesting controversy between Mr. C. D. Field and Mr. A. Mackenzie, two of the members of the Rent Law Commission, has been recorded in the form of minutes, or notes, in the Appendix of the Report of the Rent Law Commission. It purports to be a discussion as to what constituted a *khudkasht*. We have already seen that a *khudkasht* was originally involved in the conception of a village community of which he formed a component part; that the original settlers of a village were considered as *khudkashts* proper, and that from time to time, the community attracted toward itself men of alien extraction,—immigrants who permanently settled in the village. These immigrants gradually absorbed themselves into the community and were ultimately recognised as *khudkashts*. As Sir Henry Maine observes,§ the exact mode of their absorption cannot now be ascertained, though we have reasons to believe that time, the great leveller of all things, was one of the many powerful agents to bring it about. Two elements went to make up a *khudkasht*: (1) the man's permanent settlement or residence in the village; (2) his admission into the village, into the community. What would constitute permanently settling in a village would certainly depend upon the nature of the circumstances that environ him, but there could hardly be any doubt that his residence for a long period in the village would be considered as a strong piece of evidence to prove his intention of permanently residing therein. In his notes of the 6th and 20th January 1880, Mr. Mackenzie misses the main point at issue. The question is, not whether long time was an essence of the ordinary *khudkasht's* title; not whether long residence was a necessary

\* Robinson's Land Tenures, p. 15. Whinfield's Landlord and Tenant, p. 16. Fifth Report, vol. II, 308, Directions for Revenue officers, 63.

† Fifth Report, vol. II, 41, 42, 87, 308, 491-493; Campbell's "Cobden Club Essay," 165; Directions for Revenue officers, 65.

‡ Thomason's Selections, 478; Directions for Revenue officers, 61, 62, 64, 65. Evidence of H. Mackenzie (1832), 2, 572; Cobbrooke's "Husbandry Commerce in Bengal," 64; Fifth Report, vol. II, 841, 308, 490, 494.

§ Maine's Ancient Law, p. 265.



ingredient to transform a migrater into a *khudkasht*, but whether, to all intents and purposes, long residence was not a strong proof of his intention to permanently settle in the village, and, as such, whether practically and in all ordinary cases long residence did not go to absorb him into the community, and confer on him the privileges and rights of a *khudkasht*. Looking from this standpoint of view, even Mr. Mackenzie will concede that the question of time occurs in order to define precisely the status of a *khudkasht*. In page 402, Report of the Rent Law Commission, Vol. II., he observes, "I would make the term of prescription necessary to entitle a ryot to the occupancy right of the old *khudkasht*, a reasonably short one; *just long enough in fact to give reasonable evidence* of his intention to cultivate *permanently* the lands he rents." In the general description of the permanent immigrants, we have given our own views of them; we have quoted Mr. Shore and Mr. Harrington to show that ordinary prescription gave them a right of occupation, and we have referred to Sir George Campbell to shew that he describes their right in much weaker terms than that of the *khudkashts* proper. In Harrington's Analysis, p. 267, Mr. Shore is thus quoted: "It is understood that the ryots by *long occupancy* acquire a right of possession in the soil and are not subject to be removed." Again, in page 252, "there are two other distinctions of importance also with respect to the rights of the ryots. Those who cultivate the lands of the village to which they belong, either from *length of occupancy* or other cause, have a stronger right than others, and may in some measure be considered as hereditary tenants, and they generally pay the highest rents. The other class cultivate lands belonging to a village where they do not reside: they are considered tenants-at-will." Mr. Mackenzie unwittingly quotes this paragraph and emphasizes the expression "other cause." True, there may be other causes than length of occupation which might give stronger rights to this class of ryots (one of those causes may be that some of them were original settlers of the village, or their descendants), but when, in making a classification, one of the classes is described by the length of their occupancy, surely the writer must have thought that in ordinary cases that was their attribute or description. In page 281 of Mr. Harrington's Analysis Mr. Shore is thus reproduced:—"To require that pottahs should be given for a definite time, as proposed by some of the Collectors, would diminish the force of that *prescription* which has established a right of occupancy in favor of the ryots." Again, in p. 301, "on the whole, therefore, I do not think the ryots can claim any right of alienating the lands rented by them by sale or other mode of transfer, nor any right of

holding them at a fixed rent, except in the particular instances of *khudkasht* ryots who from *prescription* have a privilege of keeping possession as long as they pay the rent stipulated by them." In the Directions to Revenue officers, para 130, it is said:—"It is impossible to lay down any fixed rule defining what classes of cultivators are to be considered entitled to hold at fixed rates. They are known in different parts of the country by different names as *chupperbund*, *khudkasht kadimi*, *mourusi*, *hugdar*, &c., all of which terms imply attachment to the soil or *prescriptive* right. Those who have no such right are commonly called *cutcha asamis*, or *pyekashts*. It has sometimes been supposed that all ryots resident in the village (*khudkasht*) are of the former class, and that those who reside in another village (*pyekasht*) have no right. But there are frequent exceptions to this rule. Many cultivators residing in the village are mere tenants-at-will, whilst those residing in neighbouring villages may have marked and recognised rights. *Prescription is the best rule to follow.*" The passage quoted by Mr. Mackenzie from p. 272 of Harrington's Analysis goes only to show how the right of occupancy originates, not how it ripens and develops. Mr. Holt Mackenzie in his evidence in 1832 forgets that a *khudkasht* was originally a unit of the village community without whose consent no foreigner could have admittance into the village. His tenure would not, therefore, originate, as he supposed, in "the mere act of Settlement and tillage," but also in the consent of the village brotherhood.\*

The Great Rent case, in which the question was discussed at some length is a fruitful source of information on this subject to all writers. Sir Barnes Peacock and Mr. Justice Steer seem to be quite decided in their opinions. Sir Barnes Peacock says, † in his judgment:—

"I do not believe that even before the Permanent Settlement every cultivator who resided in the village in which his lands were situate, whether let into possession for a term or only as a tenant-at-will, or to hold from year to year, necessarily became a *khudkasht* ryot.

"The definition of *khudkasht* in Wilson's Glossary (287) is a 'cultivator of his own hereditary land.' The word *khud*, self or own, and *kusht*, to sow, shew that the term has reference to some proprietary rights, rather than to the fact of residence in the village. \* \* \*

---

\* Maine's Ancient Law, p. 265 ; † Bengal Law Reports, Full Bench, Mounstuart Elphinstone's History Supp. vol. pp. 318, 319. of India, p. 73 & 126.

"A *khudkasht* ryot probably derived his title by descent from or succession to one of the old village community, or some person who in ancient times had acquired a proprietary right in the land under the old Hindu or Mahomedan Law by reason of his having reclaimed it. Menu says :—\* 'Sages pronounce cultivated land to be the property of him who cut away the wood or who cleared or tilled it.' So property in waste land was, according to the Mahomedan law, established by reclaiming it with the permission of the Imam, according to Abou Hanifa; and by the mere act of reclaiming it, according to Abu Yusaf and Mahomed. (See Baillie on the Land Tax of India, Chap. VI, para 42)."

Mr. Justice Steer, who agreed with the majority of the Judges on the main point referred to the Full Bench, expressed † himself thus on the original status and rights of the *khudkasht* :—

"What ryots were entitled under the old laws to be called *khudkasht* ryots, and what ryots were entitled to be considered as ryots who have acquired a prescriptive right of occupancy, are subjects which, I think, have never been cleared up, either by express authority of law or by the authority of any Judicial ruling. Are *khudkasht* ryots, then, as spoken of in the Regulations, those and exclusively those, who were *khudkasht* at the time of the Permanent Settlement? or, does the term *khudkasht* embrace also those ryots who, since the time of the Permanent Settlement, had by a long residence in the village in which they held and cultivated land, acquired a prescriptive right of occupancy? These were, I think, even up to the passing of Act X, moot questions and are so still.

"While no doubt exists as to the right of those ryots who, from generation to generation, have cultivated lands of the village in which they reside from a period antecedent to the Permanent Settlement, and who without any doubt are entitled to be called and classed with *khudkasht* ryots, the greatest doubt exists as to whether any other class or description of ryots are entitled to be called *khudkasht* ryots. If any ryot whose tenure came into existence since the Permanent Settlement, can, by any means, be called a *khudkasht* ryot at all, it certainly is not the ryot who simply lives in the village and cultivates the land of the village. To be a *khudkasht* ryot at all, implies that the ryot must not only be a cultivator of lands belonging to the village in which he resides, but he must be an hereditary husbandman. A *khudkasht* right is not acquired in a day, but is transmitted; and it has never, so far as my knowledge extends, been laid

\* Menu, chap. IX., para 44.

Rulings, Supp. vol., p. 310.

† Bengal Law Reports, Full Bench

down what exact length of holding gives a title to a tenant to consider himself a *khudkasht ryot*."

Mr. Mackenzie quotes\* the following passage from the Judgment of Mr. Justice Morgan (Mr. Norman's name has probably been used by mistake) in support of his theory:—

"I do not think that the right of occupancy was formerly confined to those who had acquired such a right by prescription. It extended to all who had given an unequivocal proof that they intended to remain at the place of their settlement, and who had been recognized as fixed residents of the locality, although their holding may have been of a recent date. I agree in what I understand to be the opinion of other members of this Court, that length of time or ancient origin was not essential to his existence."

We have compared this passage with the original, as reprinted in page 300 of the Bengal Law Reports, Full Bench Rulings, Supplement volume. That passage runs thus:—

"I do not think that the right of occupancy was formerly confined to those who had acquired such a right by prescription. It extended to all who had given unequivocal proof that they intended permanently to remain at the place of their Settlement, and who had been recognised as fixed residents of the locality, although their holding may have been of recent date. *The khudkashts were, doubtless ordinarily persons who derived their holdings from their ancestors and whose rights were of old date*; but I agree in what I understand to be the opinion of other members of the Court, that length of time or ancient origin was not essential to his existence."

By omitting the italicised words from this passage Mr. Mackenzie has altogether mutilated it to his own purpose, and has thus betrayed the biased spirit of a partisan with which he has studied the question. An honorable controversialist is he who represents dispassionately both sides of a question by quoting authorities, not by distorting them.

Mr. Justice Trevor and Mr. Justice Norman, however, adopted a different view of the question. They were of opinion that originally a *khudkasht* tenure was not created by prescription, though the Regulations of 1822 made it so, but still they do not say that when a migrator has by a long residence given unequivocal proof of his settling permanently in the village, that did not confer upon him the rights and privilege of *khudkasht*. They do not even explain how ordinarily such rights were created.

Mr. Justice Trevor says:—† "It has indeed been contended before

\* Report of the Rent Law Commission, vol. II., p. 414.

† Bengal Law Reports, Full Bench

Rulings, Supplement vol. I.; The great Rent Case, p. 214.

us that time is not of the essence of a *khudkasht* tenure; that a ryot simply residing in a village in which his land is, is not a *khudkasht* ryot; and that in order to constitute a *khudkasht* ryot under the Regulations he must be a resident hereditary ryot; and that if he has not succeeded by right of heirship, he does not fall within that class of tenants. But it appears to me that, whether we look to the etymology of the word, or to the thing itself, there is no reasonable ground for question. *Khudkasht* ryots are simply cultivators of the lands of their own village who, after being once admitted into the village, have a right of occupancy so long as they pay the customary rents, and therefore with a tendency to become hereditary."

As regards his views as to what transformations the *khudkasht* ryot underwent under the sale Regulations, we will speak hereafter.

Mr. Justice Norman in speaking \* of the time, before Act X of 1854, thus says:—

"In fact the circumstances of the country have been such, that while on the one hand, no Zemindar would wish to lose his ryots, on the other, the ryots cling to the soil; and the contest between the parties naturally would be, and I believe was, fought out in suits for enhancement, and not by a system of ejectment. It may well have been one of the objects of Act X to prevent this powerful engine of extensive ejectment from being brought to bear on a body of cultivators, large numbers of whom must have had some sort of prescriptive right, vague and indefinite as it may have been, to occupy or cultivate the soil. No doubt the right of occupancy before the passing of Act X of 1859 was exceedingly ill defined. There is a good deal in the Regulations which leads to the inference that *khudkasht* ryots, resident cultivators in Bengal, whether *kadimi* or not, had by custom a right of occupancy so long as they paid the usual rate. It seems to me that this custom is recognised in all the Regulations down to XI of 1822. And a reason for that custom has been suggested to me, viz., that the building or purchasing a house in the village is a security to the Zemindar for the ryot continuing to occupy as tenant."

We have already seen how Mr. Justice Campbell disposed of the question in his Cobden Club Essay. In his judgment in the Full Bench he followed Mr. Justice Trevor. He observes:—†

"It may here be observed that in truth in the later enactments the word '*khudkasht*' is so variably coupled with the other

\* Bengal Law Reports, Full Bench Rulings, Supplement vol. I., p. 304-305; The great Rent Case.

† Bengal Law Reports, Full Bench Rulings, Supplement vol., 252-253; The great Rent Case.

terms 'kadimi,' 'resident,' 'hereditary,' 'resident and hereditary,' that it became very difficult to say who were privileged against auction purchasers, and who came within the various descriptions of *khudkasht* ryots. But I have no doubt that as explained by Mr. Justice Trevor, the original *khudkasht* of the early Regulations was simply the resident ryot permanently settled in the village as opposed to the *pyekasht* ryot. The two words '*khudkasht*' and '*pyekasht*' are used as correlative and as between them including all ryots."

Of the other Judges, none commits himself as to the original status and rights of *khudkasht* ryots. \*

John Stuart Mill writing in a more modern time, thus speaks \* of them :—

"In India and other Asiatic communities similarly constituted the ryots or the peasant farmers are not regarded as tenants-at-will, nor even as tenants by virtue of a lease. In most villages there are, indeed, some ryots on this precarious footing, consisting of those, or the descendants of those, who have settled in the place at a known and comparatively recent period: but all who are looked upon as the descendants or representatives of the original inhabitants, and even many more tenants of ancient date are thought entitled to retain their land as long as they pay the customary rents."

#### *Under the Mahomedans.*

Under the Hindus the earliest authentic records seem to point to a state of things in which the gross produce of the soil was in some places, as of right, shared between the king, the village landholders, and the permanent or the *khudkasht* tenants who cultivated the lands of the village in which they resided, retaining them, during their lives, and transmitting them to their descendants; and in others, in which there were no village landholders, between the king and the aforesaid tenants. In this state of things property in the English sense of the term, that is, the exclusive and the absolute disposal of the powers of the soil in perpetuity was in no one person. †

Coming to later times, we meet with the class of persons, called the zemindars, who seem to have had no existence before the time of the Mahomedan conquest. The sovereign and the permanent or *khudkasht* tenants are of course present. There were thus three classes of persons who claimed an interest in the soil in the Mahomedan period. We are not concerned at present with any antiquarian research into the origin and development of the Zemindar.

\* Political Economy, Book II, Chap. IV., 112, People's edition.

† Mountstuart Elphinstone's India, vol. I, chap. 2.

That may form an independent subject for enquiry. We accept his position as recognised in later times, that in course of time he acquired a property in the soil, and along with it a right of disposing of it by sale, gift and mortgage, subject, however, under any mode of alienation to the sovereign's claims for revenue. The following extract from Mr. Harrington is a succinct but accurate definition of a Zemindar:—

"A Zemindar," \* says he, "appears to be under the Moghul constitution and practice, a landholder of a peculiar description not definable by any term in our language; a receiver of the territorial revenue of the State from the ryots and other under-tenants of the land, allowed to succeed to his zemindari by inheritance, yet generally required to take out a renewal of his title from the sovereign or his representative, on the payment of a fine of investiture to the Emperor and a *Nazurana*, present, to his provincial delegate the Naziim; permitted to transfer his zemindari by sale or gift, yet commonly expected to obtain previous special permission; privileged to be generally the annual contractor for the public revenue received from his zemindari, yet set aside with a limited provision in land or money when it was the pleasure of Government to collect the rents by separate agency, or to assign them temporarily or permanently by the grant of a *jaghir* or *altamgha*; authorized in Bengal since the early part of the eighteenth century to apportion to the *pergannahs*, villages and lesser divisions of land within his zemindari, the *abwabs* or cesses imposed by the *Subadar*, usually in some proportion to the standard assessment of the zemindari established by Todar Mall and others, yet subject to the discretionary interference of public authority, either to equalize the amount assessed on particular divisions, or to abolish what appeared oppressive to the ryot; entitled to any contingent emoluments proceeding from his contract during the period of his agreement, yet bound by the terms of his tenure to deliver in a full account of his receipts."

During this period the ryot had always to fight at odds with the Zemindar and a rapacious State. The settlement with him was always annual, whatever the settlement by the Government with the Zemindar might have been. † His payments were regulated ostensibly by the customary rates which were known and registered in the Patwari's records, and which were called the *nirk* ‡; but this advantage did not extend to those ryots who did not form part of the village organisation. § The customary rates

\* Harrington's Analysis, vol. III., Directions for Revenue officers, 4.  
400. § Orissa, vol. I, 54, 55, vol. II. 232

† Land Tenure, by a Civilian, 65-66. and 245; Directions for Revenue

‡ Fifth Report, vol. I, 141, 162, 163; officers, 66.

sometimes extended to the whole pergunnah, and sometimes only to the village. The records of those rates were known as the village and pergunnah *ryebandis*.\* If such rates did not exist for any particular village, a reference was made to the rates of the neighbourhood.† These rates corresponded to and were sometimes originally derived from the *assul jama*, and sometimes included *abwabs* and cesses as consolidated with the *assul jama*.‡

The ryots, tenacious of the customary rates, were averse to receiving pottahs (§ or leases). When these rates slackened and the Canongue's office fell into disuse, they could not be induced to receive pottahs unless at some ancient rates, such as the usual village or pergunnah rate, or the rate charged in a certain year, or paid by a certain previous holder of the land.|| Sometimes the pottahs fixed a rate which included all cesses, and sometimes the cesses were charged as an extra tax.¶

Mr. Shore says that there were two modes in which the enhanced assessment used to be fixed. One of these was to add the subsequent *abwabs* and the exactions by the Zemindar (calculated at so much a month, or so much a rupee) to the *assul*, or the original rate, and then to distribute this, according to the quantity and quality of land held by the ryots, on the estimated or the actual crop. The other mode was to assess at a rate fixed for the bighah, whatever might be the crop, which rate included the chief items of exaction or extra assessment.\*\* The Zemindar was, however, to some extent, controlled in his assessment by custom, which required that the rates usually paid by the village should be adhered to, at least in form. Nevertheless he ultimately contrived to extract the main portion of his profit from the surplus of his receipts beyond the juma he paid. And in this he was still further assisted when he settled with Government for a term of years, and when consequently his yearly settlements with the ryots could not at all be expected to be at the same rates as he paid to Government,†† and when the cultivators did not form part of any village organisation, he could deal with them untrammelled at least by the village *ryebandis*.‡‡

The cultivator could not be deprived of his land for not paying the *khiraj*.§§ The course prescribed in case the cultivator made default in payment of the *khiraj*, or if he abandoned the land, or

\* Land Tenure, by a Civilian, 59.

† Fifth Report, vol. i, 163 and 164.

‡ Fifth Report, vol. i, 140, 170; Harrington's Analysis, vol. iii, 346.

§ Fifth Report, vol., 23, 141; Orissa, vol., II., 242.

|| Fifth Report, vol. ii., 140.

¶ *Ib.*, 163.

\*\* Fifth Report, vol. i., 40.

†† Orissa, vol. i, 54, 55; vol. ii., 232.

‡‡ *Ib.*, vol. ii, 232, 245.

§§ Baillie's Land Tax xxxiii., 14, 15. Land Tenure, by a Civilian, 35, 36, 38.



left it uncultivated, was that the Imam should endeavour to let the land to another cultivator, allowing him half, one-third, or one-fourth of the produce; and handing over the residue, after payment of *khiraj*, to the owner. If this could not be done, he should give it in *Moozarut* (partnership), the cultivator and the State sharing the produce; and after deducting the *khiraj* from the State share, the surplus was to be paid to the owner. If this course was also impracticable, the Imam should let the land to any one who would cultivate it, and simply pay the *khiraj*. In default of all these methods the land might be sold, and the *khiraj* paid out of the proceeds; but the surplus must still be paid to the owner; and, even if he had absconded, must be kept for him in case he should return.\*

*Wuzeefa* lands were in fact grants made by the sovereign, and therefore alienable. But *Mookusuma* lands, which were ryotti lands proper (at least they covered the  $\frac{3}{4}$ ths of the State), could not be sold or mortgaged without the permission of the sovereign,† but they went to the heirs of the cultivators. The sovereign was also considered to have the right to make a grant of such land in some cases.‡

The Zemindar having stipulated to pay the full revenue of his district, and being empowered in his capacity as a Government representative to authorize the cultivation of waste land (*khamar*), or fallow (*bunjur*), within his district, the revenue derived from such land came to belong to him as part of the revenue of his zemindari. If he cultivated such land by himself or his servants, he took the whole of the benefit: if he permitted the villagers to cultivate, he took such revenue as was payable for it.§

The distinction of ryots into *khudkasht* proper, *khudkasht chupperbund*, and the *pyekushts*, remained as before, and their rights were to some extent regulated by the customary law of the country, though, as it appears, they were much unprotected on account of the intervenors, the zemindars. Practically, however, on account of the imposition of *abwabs* and *cesses* by the State, many of their rights were weakened and disturbed. Their resistance was ineffectual and inoperative.

### The Pre-Decennial Settlements.

When the ryot was thus fighting single-handed with the State and the Zemindar combined, the East India Company stepped in

\* Baillie's Land Tax, xxxiii. Land Tenure by a Civilian, 38.

† Baillie's Land Tax, xxxiv, xxxv.

‡ *Ib.*, xxxv.

§ Harrington's Analysis, vol. iii,

340, 343, 363. Land Tenure by a Civilian, 42, 60, 69. Patton's Asiatic Monarchies, 168, Rose's Dissertations; 293, 294. Wilson's Glossary *Khamar*. Directions for Revenue Officers, 4.

and took the reins of Government. Their first attempt was to replace the Zemindar in his former official position and protect the ryot. The revenue history from 1769 to 1787 discloses an earnest struggle on the part of the authorities to discover the best mode of securing revenue to the State, and yet protecting the ryot. In 1769 the Company took the first step towards bringing collection under their direct control by appointing supervisors. \* The Committee directed the supervisors to enquire into the history of the provinces (1725-1739), and among other duties to ascertain the extent, production and value of *khamar* lands, which are described as lands cultivated by contract, of ryotti lands which are tenanted and cultivated by the natives on the spot, and of waste lands, distinguishing those which have become so from decrease of population from those covered with jungles.† The Committee remarked that the *khamar* lands have no native tenants, but that the Zemindar cultivates them by contract, receiving in return one-half or two-thirds of the produce, together with his advance and interest thereon, ‡ that it is a mischievous anomaly, and that the cultivators should be induced to settle upon the *khamar* lands and change them into ryotti lands.§ This contemplates an encroachment on the Zemindar's right, who by that time had acquired a vested right in the *khamar* lands. No order for resumption is made, probably on the principle that the Zemindar assumed this right as an agent or official servant of the State.

With regard to the exactions of the Zemindar, the Committee observe that the poor and industrious tenant is overtaxed by || him, that his claim should be fixed, ¶ and that pottahs should be granted \*\* specifying it.

In 1772 it was provided by the Regulation of the 14th May of that year, that the revenue should be farmed †† for 5 years from April 1772. The farmer was prohibited from receiving on any pretence larger rents from the ryot than the amount stipulated in the pottahs ‡‡ under penalty, but the State was not to demand from him beyond the agreed rent or rent-roll delivered with his lease. §§ *Oppressive and pernicious abwabs* were abolished, and new *abwabs* prohibited. |||| The Collectors were directed to prepare a rent-roll of each farm, arranged in *perganuabs* with full account of all changes and of the highest rent ever realised. ¶¶ The President

\* Fifth Report, vol. i. 3. Harrington's Analysis, vol. ii., 7. Colebrooke's Supplement, 174.

† Colebrooke's Supplement, 174.

‡ *Ib.*, 183.

§ *Ib.*, 184.

|| *Ib.*, 185.

¶ *Ib.*, 176.

\*\* *Ib.*, 178.

†† Art. 1.

‡‡ Art. 10.

§§ Art. 11.

|||| Arts. 12 & 13.

¶¶ Art. 23.

and Council were, however, anxious that the farms should be let to zemindars, and if they did not agree to the terms proposed, to the highest bidder, the instructions from home being that "they should not by any sudden change alter the constitution nor deprive the zemindars of their former privileges and immunities." The farming settlement came to an end in 1777. From 1778 to 1790 the settlement with zemindars continued year by year. On the 7th April 1786 the Board of Revenue directed the appointment of servants who were to preserve "the ryots and other inferior tenants from the oppression and exactions to which they are in this country so peculiarly liable from the superior landholders and renters."\* By the Regulation passed on the 8th June 1787, it was provided that the Collector is to ascertain the rules and rates of assessment upon the ryots and to endeavour to fix upon some mode of regulating them upon general, fair and ascertained principles.† The sayer was to be abolished, and no new taxes to be imposed.‡

Thus in this transitional period there was a distinct tendency on the part of the authorities to thrust the Zemindar back into his official position, till opinions changed in his favor in the Permanent Settlement. During this period the authorities were ignorant of the various and conflicting rights and interests claimed in the soil by contending and rival parties, and they advanced opinions upon uninvestigated subjects without always weighing them. Mr. Shore, writing in 1782, admitted that, although he was a member of the Committee, the Committee were necessarily ignorant of the real state of any district. § Such was the mass of conflicting and groundless opinions advanced during this time that Mr. Field very properly refused to look at any thing "said or written, or thought, or opined before the Permanent Settlement, or a quarter of a century before it." Mr. O'Kinealy, however, quotes copiously from the despatches and State papers of this period. How far he is justified in doing so, how far it is fair to apply ununited theories, advanced in an unsettled state of things, to settle rights and status of conflicting parties, it is for the public to judge.

### *The Decennial and Permanent Settlements and Posterior Regulations.*

We now come to the Decennial and Permanent Settlement. A careful reader of the despatches and letters of this period will discover a distinct change of opinion in favor of the Zemindar :

\* Colebrooke's Supplement, 243.

† Art. 35.

‡ Arts. 50 & 51.

§ Harrington's Analysis, vol. ii., 41-43.

on the 18th June 1789 Mr. Shore records the memorable Minute\* which formed the basis to a great extent of the Permanent Settlement, and which was substantially the first sketch of the Decennial Settlement Regulations. † In this Minute he proposed to confer an absolute right in land upon the Zemindar. In a further Minute (18th September 1789), relating mainly to Behar, he opposes perpetuity of settlement; ‡ and Lord Cornwallis in a Minute of the same date answers Mr. Shore. § He considers that Mr. Shore has "most successfully argued in favor of the rights of the Zemindar to the property of the soil," and he is of opinion that in order to give value to these rights, they must be made permanent. Mr. Shore || replies in another Minute of the same date, in which he supports his former view that ten years will, in the estimation of the native, be equivalent to a perpetuity, ¶ and that "a definite term will be more pleasing to them than a dubious perpetuity." \*\* On the same day that these Minutes were recorded, the rates for the Decennial Settlement of Behar were promulgated. On the 8th December 1789, Mr. Shore wrote a further Minute upon the general subject of permanency of settlement †† He remarks that with respect to the relations of zemindars and their tenants, the interference of the Government is absolutely necessary (para. 13 of the Minute), but that the interference will be looked upon by the zemindars as an invasion of their proprietary right, being not consistent with each other (para. 14 of the Minute). In answer to this, Lord Cornwallis, in a Minute dated the 3rd February 1790, remarks: "If Mr. Shore means that, after having declared the zemindar proprietor of the soil, in order to be consistent, we have no right to prevent him imposing new *abwabs*, I must differ from him in opinion," since every bigha of land possessed by the ryots "must have been cultivated under an express or implied agreement, that a certain sum should be paid for each bigha of produce." This is an argument based upon the comprehensive laws of contract and a legislation that is based upon such broad principles has nothing in it to be impugned.

There were four classes of ryots or cultivators whose position at this period ought to be considered : 1st, the *kadimi khudkashts* or the *khudkashts* proper.

2ndly, the modern *khudkashts*, or the immigrants who incorporated themselves into the first class and acquired their rights as such.

\* Fifth Report, vol. i, 107.

† *Ib.*, 202.

‡ *Ib.*, 555.

§ *Ib.*, 590.

|| *Ib.*, 591.

¶ *Ib.*, 594 & 595.

\*\* *Ib.*, 596.

†† Fifth Report, vol. i, 598.

3rdly, the new settlers in the village who had not yet been absorbed into the *khudkashts*, and were therefore still *pyekashts*, and 4thly, the cultivators of the lands of the village, but not residing in the village, called the *pyekashts*.

We are to enquire what rules of enhancement and ejectment were prescribed for these ryots in the Regulations of the Permanent Settlement, and subsequently, and what were the possibilities of the creation of new *khudkashts* since the settlement.

Unfortunately, however, the earlier Regulations throw very little light upon the constitution of the *khudkasht* ryots. In the forty-eight Regulations of 1793 no definition was given of their holdings and no provision was made as to how the new settlers of the village might acquire the rights and status of the *khudkashts*. Between 1793 and 1818, in the numerous Regulations enacted for Bengal, the word "*khudkasht*" occurs only once \* (*e. g.*, in section 60, clause 2 of Regulation VIII of 1795), and that also refers to the *khudkasht* who was found as such on the land at the time of the Permanent Settlement. In all the other provisions made during these 25 years in respect of the under renters, the generic term "*ryot*" has been used. There are only two possible theories to explain this omission : (1) :—either the authors of the Permanent Settlement entirely lost or meant to destroy, the long established distinction between the *pyekashts* and *khudkashts*, and enacted laws and rules affording protection to both and maintaining no distinction between them, or (2), by the term "*ryot*" :—† whenever used in connexion with the *perganah* rate, they intended to refer exclusively to the *khudkashts*, making provisions for them, and forgot the *pyekashts*, or did not think it necessary to legislate for them. It should be remembered, that in those days there was no competition for land. The *khudkashts* paid a higher rate of rent than the *pyekashts*, who had to be attracted to the village by more favourable terms. The necessity of the time, therefore, required to protect the *khudkashts* from enhancement. The Legislature did not, it seems, anticipate that in time there might grow up (as has actually been the case) such a strong competition for

---

\* We find the words *pyekasht* and *khudkasht* expressly used in section 10 of Regulation XXI of 1795, but that Regulation refers to Benares.

† Even now in Behar a witness in Court who may be a cultivator of the plaintiff or defendant, would strenuously refuse to call himself his *ryot*

unless he happens to be a *dehi* or resident cultivator. The word *ryot* means a subordinate or dependent. The idea seems to be that unless a cultivator resides in the village, he does not consider himself to be perfectly dependent upon the Zemindar.

land that *pyekashts* would pay a higher rent than the *khudkashts*, and, being subject to rack-rent, would need protection.

Whichever of these theories may be correct, in either case as we shall presently see, the channel for fresh creation of *khudkasht* tenures was practically closed.

As regards enhancement, the "pergannah rate" was a limit to it under the 1st theory both for the *pyekashts* and the *khudkashts*, and under the 2nd theory only for the *khudkasht* ryot.

The same law of competition explains the absence of any express provision for ejectment in the Regulations of 1793. To quote Mr. Justice Norman, the circumstances of the country have been such, that while, on the one hand, no Zemindar would wish to lose his ryots, on the other, "the ryots would cling to the soil; and the contest between the parties naturally would be, and I believe was, fought out in suits for enhancement, and not by a system of ejectment.\* Ryots were then the riches of the Zemindar, and there was no demand for rules and laws of ejectment."

Similarly no provisions were made for transfer of the ryots' holdings. There was *first* no competition for land,† and *2ndly*, little left to the cultivators beyond a bare subsistence after paying the Government revenue.‡ Very little, therefore, had they to sell and very few candidates were there to buy.

Now let us analyse how under the Regulations of the Permanent Settlement the ryot stands. To begin with the *khudkashts* whose tenure existed at the time of the Permanent Settlement, (they include the first two classes of ryots mentioned above). Section 60 of Regulation VIII of 1793, provided that the laudholders and farmers should not cancel their leases except on proof that they were obtained by collusion, or that the rents for the three years before the Permanent Settlement were below the pergannah *nirk-bundy*, or that they had collusively obtained deductions from their rents, or upon a general measurement of the pergannah for the purpose of equalising and correcting the assessment.§ Under section 7 of Regulation IV of 1794, which immediately followed the Regulation of 1793, such ryot (*i. e.*, the then existing *khudkashts*) could renew their leases at the pergannah or established rates. On a sale for arrears of revenue, under section 5 of Regulation LIV of 1793, their former leases stood "cancelled"; they could,

\* Bengal Law Reports, Full Bench Rulings, Supp. vol. 304

† The Great Rent Case, B. L. R. Supp. vii, 253, 279, 295, 296. Campbell's "Cobden Club Essay," 164, Compare "Directions for Revenue officers,"

41.

‡ Campbell's "Cobden Club Essay," 170.

§ Regulation of the 23rd November 1791, article 66. Regulation VIII of 1793, section 60.

however, demand a settlement "according to the established usages and rates of the pergannah or district in which such lands may be situated." The purchasers, on the other hand, could demand an engagement at the rate of the previous proprietors, but if they declined to enter into engagements at that rate, the purchaser might ask for the pergannah rate, and if they still resisted under section 29, clause 5, Regulation VII of 1799, the purchaser might oust them.

Mr. Justice Trevor, referring to the *khudkasht* ryots of the Permanent Settlement, observes:\* "These tenants seem, at the Settlement, practically and legally, though not by express statute, to have been divided into two classes, the *khudkasht kudimi* and the simple *khudkasht*, or those who have been in possession of land for more than twelve years before the Settlement and those whose possession did not run back so long. Both by the Hindu and Mahomedan law, as well as by the legal practice of the country, twelve years have been considered sufficient to establish a ryot by negative prescription—that is, by the absence of any claim on the part of other persons during that period—and hence the doctrine which has obtained that *khudkasht* ryots in possession twelve years before the Settlement were, under no circumstances, not even on a sale for arrears of revenue, liable either to enhancement, of rent, or eviction from their holding, so long as they paid the rent which they had all along paid. The *existing leases of khudkasht ryots at the time of the settlement*,† who had no prescriptive rights, were, with certain exceptions, specified in section 60 of Regulation VIII of 1793, to remain in force until the period of their expiry; and those ryots were entitled to renewal of their leases at the pergannah rates; and on a sale for arrears of revenue could be evicted only after declining to enter into engagement with the purchaser at the same rates."

As regards the *pyekashts*, including the new settlers of the village, who might subsequently under certain circumstances, or in the course of time, acquire the rights and status of the *khudkashts*, section 52 of Regulation VIII of 1793, provided that the Zemindar might "let the remaining lands of his zemindari under the prescribed restrictions in what manner he may think proper." "What then are these restrictions?" ‡ asks Mr. Justice Campbell, and answers as follows:—

"The zemindars are to grant pottahs to the ryots which shall

\* Bengal Law Report, Full Bench Rulings, Supp., p. 215.; The Great Rent Case.

† Here Mr. Justice Trevor expressly holds that under section 60 only

the *existing khudkashts* were protected.

‡ Bengal Law Report, Full Bench Rulings, Supp. Col. page 249; The Great Rent Case.

be specific as to amount and conditions. The rents paid by the ryots, by whatever rule or custom they may be regulated, shall be specifically stated in the pottahs, which, in every possible case, shall contain the exact sum to be paid by them. He (the Zemindar) shall, in concert with the ryots, consolidate the impositions under the name of *abwab*, *mathot* and other appellations, with the *assul* into one specific sum, and he shall not impose any new *abwab* or *mathot* upon the ryots under any pretence whatever. A ryot, when his rent has been ascertained, may demand a pottah, and the pottahs must all be settled by the end of the year 1198. Again, all leases made previous to the conclusion of the settlement (and not obtained by collusion, &c.) are to remain in force till their expiration, and no proprietor shall cancel the pottahs of the *khudkasht* ryots except upon proof that they have been obtained by collusion," &c.\*

The *pyekashts*, including the new settlers of the village, were thus, under section 52 of Regulation VIII of 1793, to hold on at the rate which they have either expressly or impliedly contracted to pay to the Zemindar. Under section 7 of Regulation IV of 1794, they were entitled to the renewal of their pottahs, if cancelled under Regulations X and IV of 1793, and to such renewal at the *pergannah* rate. Under section 6 of Regulation IV of 1794, if a dispute arose between them and the Zemindar regarding the rates of the pottahs, it should be determined "according to the rates established in the *pergannah* for lands of the same description and quality as those respecting which the dispute arose." On a sale for arrears of revenue, under Regulations X and IV of 1793, section 5, their leases would be cancelled, but they were entitled to a renewal of their leases by a purchaser at the *pergannah* rate. Should they refuse to hold at the *pergannah* rate, under clause 5, section 29, Regulation VII of 1799, they could be evicted at once. On a sale of other kind, under clause 5 of section 29 of Regulation VII of 1799, they could demand pottahs from the purchaser at the rate at which they paid to the former incumbent.

Mr. Justice Trevor, however, seems to think that the Regulations of Bengal did not provide for the *pyekasht* ryots. They provided only for the *khudkashts*.

"*Khudkasht* ryots," he observes, † "whose tenancy commenced subsequently to the Decennial Settlement are entitled to hold on at the rate which they have either expressly or impliedly

\* Regulation VIII of 1793, sections 52 to 60.

† Bengal Law Report, Full Bench

Rulings, Supp. Vol. 215, 216; The Great Rent Case.



contracted to pay during the incumbency of the Zemindar \* who granted the pottah and of his representatives, whatever that rate may be; and on a sale for arrears of revenue, they also are entitled to a renewal of their leases by a purchaser at the pergannah rate. Should the rate in the engagement cancelled by the sale have been below that figure, they can only be evicted on refusing to renew the pergannah rates. Moreover, it was enacted generally by section 6 of Regulation IV of 1794, that if a dispute arises between the ryots and the persons from whom they may be entitled to demand pottahs regarding the rates of the pottahs, it should be determined in the Dewany Adawlut of the Zillah in which the lands were situated according to the rates established in the pergannah for lands of the same description and quality as those respecting which the dispute arose."

† Again, "as to *pyekasht* ryots, they are nowhere expressly mentioned in the laws referring to Bengal. If they held under pottah at the time of the settlement, they were entitled to hold them till the expiry of the lease under the comprehensive terms of clause 1, section 60, Regulation VIII of 1793, which included even them. In section 10, Regulation LI, of 1795 which referred to Benares, they are expressly mentioned, and they are declared to be equally entitled with *khudkasht* ryots to have their pottahs renewed at the established rates, provided the proprietor of the former chooses to permit them to cultivate the land held by them, which they have the option to do, or not to do, as they think proper, on the expiry of all *pyekasht* leases. In Bengal, the rates of *pye'asht* ryots at the present date, though it seems to have been different formerly, are generally above the pergannah rates. They have always been considered to have no rights independent of the particular engagements under which they hold; and those being cancelled they are liable to immediate eviction."

Whatever may be the view entertained by Mr. Justice Trevor as regards the *pyekashts*, there is no doubt, as the quotation just made fully shows, that he holds that the *khudkashts*, whose tenancy commenced since the Decennial Settlement, could only hold at the rate which they expressly or impliedly contracted to pay to the Zemindar; in other words, that they were subject to section 52, Regulation VIII of 1793. The question is important in the way that, if the Permanent Settlement gave a right to the Zemindar to treat his *khudkasht* ryot as one with whom he could

\* Here Mr. Justice Trevor evidently thinks that section 60 of Regulation VIII of 1793 is subordinate to section 52, and that with *khudkashts* whose tenancy commenced since the

settlement the Zemindar had option to "let his land in any manner he chose."

† Bengal Law Reports, Full Bench Rulings, Supp. Vol. page 219, 220; The Great Rent Case.

deal upon agreement and contract only, any provision that would propose to confer a right upon him independent of the Zemindar, would be looked upon by the latter as an encroachment upon his vested rights. There has been a division in the camp of the Rent Law Commissioners on this point : Mr. Field holding that the restrictions alluded in section 52, Regulation VIII of 1793, extend to. section 60, and Messrs. Mackenzie and O'Kinealy maintaining that they are confined to section 53. The discussion ultimately turned into a ridiculous form, Messrs. Mackenzie and O'Kinealy having insisted that a colon follows section 52, and that, therefore, the restrictions extend only to section 53. A humorous writer in the *Calcutta Review* observed on this :—\* “ It is impossible to be serious when one finds grave senators spending so much valuable time and energy in a controversy about a colon. In truth, it does not make the least difference in the world, whether section 52 is closed with a full point or a colon :

“ The contention of Messrs. Mackenzie and O'Kinealy is that section 52, which leaves the Zemindar at liberty to let the remaining lands in his estate in any manner he may think proper, subject to certain prescribed restrictions, is to be read as connected with section 53, but totally disconnected from the next following sections including section 60, which speaks of the *Khudkasht* ryots. The virtue of the colon, especially when it comes after ‘ following,’ with which it has some kind of elective affinity, is universally acknowledged to be very comprehensive, and there is no reason why the colon at the end of section 52 should be held to exhaust its connective virtue exactly at the end of section 53.”

Mr. Field gives † this answer to his opponents :—

“ First as to the argument concerned with the punctuation and the supposed printer's error, the construction of a statute cannot be made to depend upon the punctuation, which is not a part of the statute. See case quoted in Maxwell in the Interpretation of Statutes, page 35 ; and Sedgwick's work, page 225.

“ Secondly, the last sentence of section 52 speaks of restrictions in the plural. It is impossible that these restrictions can be included in, and cease at the end of, section 53, for this section, contains a single restriction only.”

Instead of confining ourselves to Regulation VIII of 1793, if we look to the amended Regulations for the Decennial Settlement passed on the 23rd November 1791,‡ and the preceding papers, we may find a more satisfactory explanation of this knotty question. It should be remembered, that these very regulations of

\* *Calcutta Review*, October 1880.

† *Calcutta Gazette*, page 481.

‡ Colebrooke's Supplement, 308-320.

the Decennial Settlement were confirmed in perpetuity by the proclamation of the Permanent Settlement, and were reproduced in Regulation VIII of 1793 with slight modifications. Articles 43-45 of this Regulation deal with the distribution of the Sudder Jama, and articles 50 to 54 with *Istemruidars* and *Taluqdars*. Article 55\* then says :—"The Zemindar is to let the remaining land of his zemindari under the prescribed restrictions in what manner he may think proper." The prescribed restrictions are set forth from article 56 to article 73,† and, then, article 74 says, the remaining restrictions are those set forth in the prescribed *kabuliuts*. Article 63 provided that all existing leases are to hold good unless granted by collusion, or without authority, and article 64 that no landholder or farmer shall cancel the pottahs of the *khudkasht* ryots except on proof of their being obtained by collusion, &c. These two articles were compressed into one section in the Permanent Code, viz., section 60 of Regulation VIII of 1793. The wording of article 74 indicates that articles 63 and 64 were also included in the restrictions of article 55.

The very fact that section 60 lays down a general rule of protection for all sorts of ryots as long as their leases subsist, and that the provision for *khudkasht* ryots is only a branch of that general rule, considerably weakens the position of those who would read section 60 as totally disconnected from section 52. On a reference to rule 27 of the Resolutions on the Bengal Settlement, No. 54, printed at page 45 of the papers, relating to the Permanent Settlement, which forms the basis of article 64 of the regulation of the Decennial Settlement, we find that it bears the following heading: viz., "Provisional rule for the security of the ryots," by which we understand a provision that was meant to meet the present need. If so, it was meant for the *khudkashts*, then on the land and abiding by existing leases. It was never the intention of the Legislature to extend it to *khudkashts* who might acquire their tenancy subsequently.

We have seen that the "pergannah rate" is the only limit to enhancement proposed by the Regulations of 1793, 1794 and 1799. Whether this was a limit only in respect of the *khudkasht* ryots, as Mr. Justice Trevor thinks‡, or a limit for all sorts of ryots, as others venture to think,§ is not a question of much importance; because in those days the *khudkasht* ryots had to pay

\* Compare Section 52 of Regulation VIII of 1793.

† Sections 53 to 66 of Regulation VIII of 1793.

‡ This also appears to be the opinion of Mr. Field, one of the

Commissioners of the Rent Bill.

§ This also appears to be the opinion of Messrs. Mackenzie and O'Kinealy, two of the Commissioners of the Rent Bill.

higher rents than the *pyekashts*, and these latter had to be tempted by more favorable terms. Practically, therefore, they paid a lower rate than the *pergannah* rate, and the *pergannah* rate was considered the maximum to which the rent of any ryot could be raised. The real question, however, appears to be—was the *pergannah* rate an effectual or substantial limit? Was it confined to the particular portion of the produce of land to which, by the custom of that *pergannah*, the demand of the Zemindar was limited, or did it include the *abwabs* recognized by Regulation VIII of 1793, which had become consolidated with it? In short, did the customary rates admit of variation or enhancement, or how were they regulated? On this question Mr. Justice Campbell observes \* with much truth—

“It seems a somewhat singular omission that in the Regulations no provision is made for any enhancement of the *pergannah* rates payable in money. The customary or *pergannah* rates were of three kinds :—

1. Grain rates, being the original share of the produce not commuted into money, and which generally continued to prevail in the province of Behar.

“In this case as the value of grain increased,—if taken in kind, it fetched more money—if annually struck in money at the market rates, more money was received; there was no need of any special provision for enhancement. The rent, as it were, enhanced itself.

2 & 3. Money rates, more common in Bengal, *i. e.*, when the grain rents were commuted into money in either of two ways which are distinguished in section 56, Regulation VIII of 1793, as follows :—

2. “Where it is the custom to vary the pottah according to the articles produced thereon (on the land), *i. e.*, there were established rates not for each kind of land, but for each kind of produce,—so much per bigha for rice, so much for wheat, so much for cotton, so much for sugar-cane. In this case the Zemindar would benefit by the substitution of more valuable for less valuable articles of produce; but, the kind of produce remaining the same while it increased in value, he would not benefit.

“And 3, the system which it was hoped would ultimately prevail where the rates were fixed, not on each kind of produce, but on each quantity of land, and thus there was fixed a specific sum for a certain quantity of land, leaving it to the option of the ryots to cultivate whatever species of produce may appear to them

---

\* Bengal Law Report, F. B. Rulings, Supplement volume, page 254-56, The Great Rent Case.

likely to yield the largest profit. In this case, it is evident that, without some mode of enhancement, the Zemindar would benefit neither by the introduction of new products nor by the rise in value of the old products. \* \* \*

"It is remarkable that throughout the whole litigation of the long period between 1793 and 1859, no principle of enhancement other than a reference to existing *pergannah* or local rates is anywhere to be found. \* \* \* When the customary rates were enhanced, it must have been done without the least assistance from the law or the Courts of Judicature. In fact, however, the rates have generally been enhanced. Zemindars had great power over their ryots; the interference of the law was but partial; the zemindars could do much without law; and the reliance of the ryots was much more on custom than on law.

"Moreover, in this matter the zemindars had a strong equity on their side. Although no rule of enhancement was laid down by the law, it seemed hard that, as the relative value of produce and money altered, as produce became relatively more valuable, and money relatively less valuable, the Zemindar should continue to receive, as representing his share of the produce, a sum of money actually representing a smaller purchasing power, a smaller quantity of grain, and smaller proportion of the produce. The fact seems to be that this contingency of a change in the relative value was omitted to be provided for.

"But as the country progressed, and as the Zemindar's expenses increased, without a corresponding increase of income, he had, according to custom and ancient rule, a strong equitable claim to a re-adjustment which should restore to him his own fair share of the produce. Power and equity being then combined, it is not wonderful that, in the absence of any regulated mode of adjustment, it was irregularly effected by various irregular devices resulting in compromise between the Zemindar and the body of the ryots. As Harrington puts it: 'every part of the transaction is a subject of contention; the demands on both sides are unreasonable, and are finally terminated by a compromise.'

"A common process seems to have been a mere repetition of the old process by which Teran Mall's assessment was enhanced. In spite of the prohibition against adding *abwabs* or cesses to the consolidated rates of the time of settlement, illegal cesses (almost always in the regulated form of percentages, so many annas or pies in the rupee, or so many seers in the maund) were from time to time added on, and gradually annexed to the custom; then, as they became complicated and heavy, and led to resistance, a compromise was effected, and the extra cesses were merged into a rate somewhat enhanced, to which the ryots consented. Then, as

further increase of value took place, more cesses were superimposed on the rates, and presently another compromise took place. Sometimes in one way, and sometimes in another, the rates by mutual compromise and consent were from time to time enhanced, and the *pergannah* rates were frequently split up into local rates especial to estates and sub-divisions, according to the area of each new compromise. Still the new rates always had and have some local area. They were and are common to the body of the ryots of that locality. When the majority or the body of the ryots had consented to an equitable compromise, an enhanced local rate was established, and refractory individuals could be and were raised to that standard."

Mr. Justice Trevor says\* :—

"Reverting then to the question, what the words '*pergannah* rate,' as used in the old laws, meant, I have no hesitation in holding that it must be considered to mean the *assal*, or original rate, the rate of Teran Mall, together with the *abwab* which had been subsequently levied from the tenants and recognized by the settlement. It is true, that these two quantities joined together did not probably exactly represent that share of the produce calculated in money which under a pure system of customary rents, would have been developed ; but judging from the increased wealth of the country which had, from commerce and the influx of precious metals, resulted between the time of Teran Mall and the Decennial Settlement, the assessment which had been increased in one form did not probably differ widely from what it would have been, had the other and natural mode of calculating the increase been adopted. Since the Decennial Settlement, however, the rates of rent have adjusted themselves to the varying prices of the produce irrespective of any extraneous demand ; and the terms used in Regulation V of 1812 have regard to the varying rates in the different localities which have resulted solely under the increased activity and industry caused by the comparative security obtained under the Permanent Settlement.

"To suppose that a *pergannah* or local rate of rent could be permanently fixed in amount when the circumstances of the country were improving, is to suppose an impossible state of things. The proportion of the produce calculated in money payable to the Zemindar, represented by the *pergannah* or local rate, remains the same ; but it will be represented, under the circumstances supposed, by an increased quantity of the precious metals."

---

\* Bengal Law Reports, F. B. Rulings, Supplement vol., page 218; The Great Rent Case.

Regulation V of 1812 legalised what the Zemindar did by force and upon equitable grounds. Under section 3 of that Regulation, "such parts of Regulation VIII of 1793 and of Regulation IV of 1794, as require that the proprietors of land shall prepare forms of pottahs, and that such forms shall be revised by the Collectors, and which declare that engagements for rent contracted in any other mode than that prescribed by the regulations in question, shall be deemed to be invalid" were rescinded, and proprietors of land were declared "competent to grant leases to their dependent Talukdars, under farmers and *ryots*, and to receive corresponding engagements for the payment of rent from each of those classes, or any other classes of tenants, according to such form as the contracting parties may deem most convenient and most conducive to their respective interests." They were not, however, to impose arbitrary or indefinite cesses under any denomination, but, "the Courts shall notwithstanding *maintain and give effect to the definite clauses of the engagement contracted between the parties, or in other words, enforce payment of such sums as may have been specifically agreed upon between them.*" Section 5 having recited that the pergannah rates have in many instances become uncertain, section 6 provided, "that if any known established pergannah rates shall exist, the same shall serve to determine the amount of rent, which should be received by persons deputed to attach the lands on the part of Government, or by the purchasers at the public sales;" and section 7, provided that "in cases in which no established rates of the pergannah or local division of the country may be known, pottahs shall be granted and the collections made, according to the rate payable for land of a similar description in the places adjacent; but if the leases and pottahs of the tenants of an estate generally, which may consist of an entire village or other local division, be liable to be cancelled under the rules above noticed, new pottahs shall be granted, and the collections made at rates not exceeding the highest rates paid for the same land in any one year, within the period of the three last years antecedent to the period at which the leases may be cancelled." Section 9 declared that no such enhancement could be made without serving a notice upon the tenant in the first instance.

We have thus seen that from the time of the Permanent Settlement the zemindars have been free to make such arrangements and contracts as pleased them regarding all lands in which no rights were held by *ryots* or others at the time of the settlement; consequently the new settlers of the village since the settlement were also subject to the contract terms imposed by the Zemindar. Of course, they, as well as the *pyekasht ryots*, could claim to hold

at the pergannah rate, but according to the process described by Mr. Justice Campbell, new cesses were imposed thereupon, and the customary rent was varied or enhanced; and under Regulation V. of 1812 the Zemindar and all the ryots (including the *khudkashts*) could legally enter into a specific contract, though that contract might override the pergannah rate. The effect of these rates was a complete stoppage of fresh creation of *khudkasht* rights. Perhaps the authors of the Regulations did not intend to interfere with custom, and perhaps it was still possible that *khudkasht* rights could grow up now and then by custom, but the holders of such rights were in a very unfavorable situation for enforcing them, having had to contend with a Zemindar whose rights had been recognised by the Government, while their own rights had been left to take care of themselves, the right to Government interference being withdrawn except in specified cases. Custom on this occasion had to fight with legalized power. Where the Zemindar had any reverence for the old custom, and while there was no competition for land, probably, custom would protect these tenants. But with the progress of time, as competition for land grew stronger and stronger, the question of interest being involved, and the Law having invested the Zemindar with powers to enhance and eject, he would stifle their customary rights and check their growth. Mr. Justice Trevor says \* :—

"Thus, then, the *khudkasht* ryots, though they were entitled to pottahs at the pergannah rates by the laws of 1793 and following years, and though under section 6 of Regulation IV. of 1794, the courts were, in case of dispute, to determine the rate of the pottah according to those rates, still under the operation of the laws above cited, ryots might, if they pleased, bind themselves by specific engagements irrespective of those rates; and, of course, having done so voluntarily, they would be held strictly to the terms of their engagement."

"The Regulation of 1812," says† Mr. Justice Morgan, "by which the Zemindar and ryot were authorized to make engagements at any rate of rent and for any term, have been regarded in very different lights. On the one hand, it has been supposed, that they merely took away the old restriction on the Zemindar's power of leasing without in any way affecting the ryots' rights; while, on the other hand, they have been regarded as having authorized the ouster even of the hereditary ryots from the possession of their lands when they refused to accede to any terms of rent which might be demanded of them, however exorbitant."

\* Bengal Law Report, F. B. Rulings, Supp. vol., p. 217; The Great Rent Case,

† Bengal Law Report, F. B. Rulings, Supp. vol., p. 298; The Great Rent Case.



Mr. Justice George Loch held that under the old Regulations it was the *khudkasht kadimi* ryots who had right of occupancy. Interrogated "who were these *khudkasht kadimi* ryots," he says:—"They were evidently ryots who were on the estate cultivating lands of the village in which they resided at the time of the Decennial Settlement. They were not ryots whose engagements date from a period after that settlement, who were settled by the first engager or his representative subsequent to the settlement; for such tenures were liable to be cancelled by the auction purchaser. They were the ryots' holding and cultivating the lands in the village in which they resided at the time of the settlement of the estate, and as such they and they alone are ryots who have a prescriptive right of occupancy. All other ryots subsequently settled, though now residing in the village and cultivating lands of the village, though entitled to be called *khudkasht* from the circumstances, are not *kadimi*, and are either tenants-at-will or tenants for a term, according as they hold their lands on lease or otherwise. We may, I think, look through the length and breadth of the Regulations, and we shall find nothing that declares a ryot settled on an estate subsequent to the Decennial Settlement to be other than a tenant-at-will, nothing that recognizes in such a ryot any prescriptive right of occupancy."

In Regulation VIII of 1819 (Putnee Talook), we find express mention of the term "*khudkasht*" for the second time. By that time it appears that the *khudkasht* rights had come to be looked upon as rights accrued not only by residence in the village but also by succession. They are noticed in section 2, clause 3, which provides that nothing in that Regulation shall entitle the purchaser at a public sale for arrears of rent of an intermediate tenure to eject a *khudkasht* ryot or resident hereditary cultivator, nor to cancel *bond-fide* engagements made with such tenants by the former holder without proof in a suit by the purchaser that a higher rate would have been demandable at the time such engagements were made by the purchaser's predecessor. Section 18, clause 5, excepts such ryots from the operation of clauses 2 and 4 of that section, which provide for sending a *sezarwal* to attach the lands of intermediate holders and to collect rents in case of default, provided a summary suit had been instituted, and which also make provision for cancelling the leases of such holders. The *khudkasht* ryots may be proceeded against by arrest, a summary suit or distraint. These latter provisions were repealed by Act X of 1859, section 1. "But," says \* Mr. Justice

---

\* Bengal Law Reports, F. B. Rulings, Supplement vol., p. 219; The Great Rent Case.

Trevor, "when Regulation XI of 1822 was passed, the use in section 32 of that law of the terms *khudkasht kadimi ryot*, or resident and hereditary ryot with a prescriptive right of occupancy, to designate the cultivator who would not be liable to eviction on a sale for arrears of revenue, \* gave rise to the doctrine, that *khudkasht* ryots who had their origin subsequent to the settlement were liable to eviction, though, if not evicted, they, under section 33, could only be called upon to pay rents determined according to the law and usage of the country; † and also that possession of all ryots whose title commenced subsequent to the settlement was simply a permissive one, that is, one retained with the consent of the landlord.‡ Again, by Act XII of 1841, and Act I of 1845 (which repealed the former), a purchaser acquired his estate free of all encumbrances which had been imposed on it after the time of the settlement; and he is entitled, after notice given under section 10 of Regulation V of 1812, to enhance at discretion, anything in the Regulations to the contrary notwithstanding, the rents of all under-tenures in the said estate, and to eject all under-tenants§ with certain exceptions, amongst which are the *khudkasht kadimi*, but not simple *khudkasht* ryots. It follows that these laws distinctly gave the purchaser the power to eject a *khudkasht* ryot whose tenure was created after the Permanent Settlement, and if not ejected, they are liable to be assessed at the discretion of the landlord. This word discretion entirely annihilated the rights of the *khudkasht* tenants created subsequent to the settlement in estates sold under these laws. It reduced them from tenants with rights of occupancy, so long as they paid the established rate of the *pergannah*, or the rate which similar lands paid in the places adjacent, into mere tenants at the will of the *Zemindar*, who might in any year eject them, and place in their stead any tenant competing for the land. It is, in short, introducing into this country competition in place of customary rents."

---

\* "Nor shall the said rule be construed to authorize any purchasers aforesaid to eject a *khudkasht kadimi ryot* or resident and hereditary cultivator having a prescriptive right of occupancy." Section 32, Regulation XI of 1822.

† "Nor in any respect to annul or diminish the title of the ryots to hold their lands subject to the payment of fixed rents or rents determinable by fixed rates, according to

the law and usage of the country." Section 33, Regulation XI of 1822.

‡ *Sudder Dewani Decisions* for 1856, pp. 617—628.

§ Here Mr. Justice Trevor quotes the exact words of Section 27 of Act XII of 1841. The exception says: "Lands held by *khudkasht* or *kadimi* ryots having rights of occupancy at fixed rent or rents assessable according to fixed rules."

*Act X. of 1859.*

Such was the state of the Law when Act X of 1859 was passed, under the power, it is said, which the Governor-General in Council had reserved to himself in the 7th article of the Proclamation inserted in Regulation 1 of 1793, of enacting, whenever he might deem it proper, such Regulations as he might think necessary for the protection and welfare of the ryots and cultivators of the soil. They were in the opinion of the Legislature insufficiently protected; hence, the new law which re-enacted with modifications certain old laws rescinded by it, and which, moreover, as we shall see presently, interfered with the rights of the zemindars as laid down in the legislation of the previous thirty years.

"At the time of the passing of Act X of 1859," says \* Mr. Justice Campbell, "the state of things was this: The tenures and rents of the ryots were still for the most part regulated by the old customs of the former times. But two things specially required legal definition:—

"*First.*—There was doubt as to the mode or prescription by which a *khudkasht* or occupancy tenure was acquired, and which tenures were of this character. It was not certain whether mere settlement in the village on the ordinary terms, without limitation of tenure, gave such a right, or what length of prescription established that right. The various sale laws had also introduced a large element of confusion, different estates being variously affected, according to the date of sale. And, what is perhaps most important of all, owing to the absence of public records in Bengal, the perishable nature of private defence, and the discredit attaching to private documents and oral evidence in this country, it was very difficult to prove whether a ryot's holding was really ancient, or what was the date of its creation; the oldest holdings were imperilled by the absence of proof.

"*Second.*—There was an entire want of any regulated and defined legal mode of enhancing the customary money rates.

"Section 6 declared that twelve years' holding was to be taken as the test of a prescriptive right of occupancy, unless the presumption was contradicted by an express written contract (Section 7.) That was a protection in favor of the ryot, settling all doubt as to the rights of those who had held so long.

"Sections 5, 13 and 17 declared the right of the Zemindar to enhance the rents of all under-tenures which had either submitted to enhancement since the Permanent Settlement, or had been

---

\* Bengal Law Reports, F. B. Rulings, Supplement vol., p. 257

created without specific stipulation since that period, provided that it was proved that the former rent was not fair or equitable, and that the grounds of enhancement should be confined to certain particular grounds specified in section 17.

"At first it appears to have been intended to confine these grounds to two, in accordance with the letter of the old Regulations, *viz* :—

1. That the rent paid by any ryot was below the prevailing rate paid by the same class of ryots in the places adjacent, and
2. That the ryot held more land than he paid for.

"But before the Bill finally passed, a third very equitable ground of enhancement was added, giving the Zemindar the right to claim an increased rent in consequence of the increased value of the produce—an increase which both the old custom of division of produce would have given him, and the subsequent practice had in fact without express provision of law more or less given him. Enhancement might henceforward be awarded on the specific ground that the value of the produce or productive powers of land have been increased otherwise than by the agency and at the expense of the ryot. This was a new provision in favor of the Zemindar.

"It appears, then, that the principal provisions of Act X were in fact those by which on two points the hitherto rough and somewhat uncertain written practice was reduced to definite law, in one case, in favor of the ryot, by defining the prescriptive right of occupancy ; in the other, in favor of the Zemindar, by acknowledging the right to enhancement on the ground of increase of the value of produce."

Section 1 of Act X of 1859 rescinded all those Regulations which laid down the rights of *khudkasht* or permanent resident ryots ; Regulation IV of 1794 and V of 1812, as to the rates at which they were entitled to pottahs, were repealed, and such parts of section 26 of Act I of 1845 (which repealed Act XII of 1841) as related to the enhancement of rents and ejectment of tenants by purchasers of an estate sold for arrears of Government revenue were modified.

Section 3 enacted that ryots who hold lands at fixed rates of rent which have not been changed from the time of the Permanent Settlement are entitled to receive pottahs at those rates, and section 4 raised the presumption that the land has been held at a certain rent from the Permanent Settlement on proof that it has not been changed for the last 20 years. These sections, therefore, replaced the *khudkasht kadimi* ryots who were declared as being entitled to hold at fixed\* rents. Such *khudkashts* whose tenures really did not

---

\* They were not liable to ejectment, and nothing is said about the transfer of their tenure.

exist at the time of the Permanent Settlement, but who can give unrebuted evidence of their holding at an unchanged rent for 20 years are also entitled to the advantage of these provisions. And the sections are so broadly worded, that unless we read them with the repealed laws, even *pyekashts* (if under peculiar circumstances they might have held at an unchanged rent) could claim advantage of these provisions.

Section 5 of Act X of 1859 provides that ryots having rights of occupancy, but not holding at fixed rates, as described in the two preceding sections, are entitled to receive pottahs at fair and equitable rates; and in case of dispute, the rate previously paid by the ryot shall be deemed to be fair and equitable, unless the contrary be shown in a suit by either party under the provisions of this Act. If, however, the neighbouring ryots of the same class pay for similar land a higher rate of rent, that rate becomes fair and equitable; or, if he should be in possession of more lands than he pays for, he should be equitably assessed for the surplus; or, if the value of the produce or productive power of the land has increased otherwise than by his agency, the Zemin-dar should equitably get an advantage of it. Hence sections 13 and 17 of Act X of 1859, in accordance with the letter of the old Regulations and the equity of the circumstances, provide that ryots having rights of occupancy are liable to enhancement if their rates are below the prevailing rates of the neighbourhood payable by the same class of ryots for similar lands, if the value of the produce or the productive power of the land has increased otherwise than by their agency, or if the quantity of land held by them is proved by measurement to be greater than the quantity for which rent has been previously paid by them. These grounds are practically the grounds on which the rent of the *khudkasht* could be enhanced under the old Regulations.

But, who are the ryots who will be considered to have acquired rights of occupancy in the land?

Then follows section 6 by which it is enacted, that "every ryot who has cultivated or held land for a period of twelve years, has a right of occupancy in the land so cultivated or held by him, whether it be held under pottah or not, so long as he pays the rent payable on account of the same; but this rule does not apply to *khamar*, *nijjote* or *seer* land belonging to the proprietor of the estate or tenure, and let by him on lease for a term, or year by year, nor (as respects the actual cultivator) to lands sublet for a term, or year by year, by a ryot having a right of occupancy. The holding of the father or other person through whom a ryot inherits shall be deemed to be the holding of the ryot within the meaning of this section."

This provision substantially restores the *khudkasht* ryot to his former position, for, probably, in Hindu times, as we have already seen, a ryot who had cultivated the same holding for twelve years would have been considered to have given the pledges required to protect him from ejection so long as he paid the rent. It was also evidently following the principles of the ancient system that the *khamar*, *nijjote* and *seer* land were excluded : such land being in the immediate occupation or cultivation of the Zemindar, or, if not in his immediate occupation or cultivation, not occupied by *khudkashts*. But the effect of this section went further. Not only does it protect the *khudkasht*, but it does confer a right of occupancy upon a *pyekasht* who has cultivated land for twelve years. We have neither time nor space to discuss the important question whether section 6 of Act X of 1859 operates by way of encroachment upon the Zemindar's right as vested by the Permanent Settlement, but we have no hesitation in stating that that section, by conferring occupancy right upon the *pyekashts* as well, created a right which they did not possess in the Hindu or Mahomedan times, or in the earlier part of the British reign. This section also suggests the fact that when Act X of 1859 came into operation, the Legislature intended to destroy the conception of a village (which was the ruling idea in ancient times respecting the distribution of soil), and the distinction between resident and non-resident cultivators of the village. This view is confirmed also by section 7, Act X of 1859, which declares that "nothing contained in the last preceding section shall be held to affect the terms of any written contract for the cultivation of land entered into between a landlord and a ryot when it contains any express stipulation contrary thereto."

#### *Ejection.*

It should be observed, however, that the right of occupancy itself is not defined, and it is not expressly said that the occupancy ryot cannot be ejected, though that may be inferred ; and section 21 of Act X of 1859, re-enacted by section 22 of Act VIII of 1869 (B. C.) provides that no ryot having a right of occupancy shall be ejected otherwise than in execution of a decree or order under the Act. This section relates to ejection for arrears of rent.

#### *Transferability.*

Act X of 1859, as I have already remarked, does not define a right of occupancy. It provides that the ryot holding for the prescribed period "shall have a right of occupancy in the land so long as he pays the rent." The right is not expressed to be heritable ; but it is

provided that "the holding of the father or other person from whom a ryot inherits shall be deemed to be the holding of the ryot within the meaning of this section."

"The clear meaning of this," says \* Mr. Bell, "is that in computing the period of twelve years, the ryot who succeeds to his father's land shall be permitted to reckon the period of his father's occupation as his own. The section does not refer to cases in which occupancy rights have been acquired, it merely lays down the conditions under which they are to be acquired. The law is absolutely silent as to the manner in which these rights, when once acquired, are to be transferred." Indeed, the literal meaning of the terms used in section 6 would not necessarily include an hereditary quality in the right. Besides the right being one created by Statute, although analogous in some respects to the right of the *khudkashts*, its nature cannot be ascertained by reference to the rights of the *khudkashts* or to custom. Occupancy tenants may of course have customary or other rights in addition; but it is difficult to see how these can exist in determining their rights as occupancy ryots. Apparently, the strict terms on which the right is bestowed would be satisfied by giving the ryot a personal right neither hereditary nor transferable. Accordingly Sir Barnes Peacock, in one case, doubted whether a right of occupancy was heritable,† but it has been now settled that the right of occupancy is transferable by inheritance, but in no other way. In the Full Bench case of Narendranath Chowdhury, *vs.* Ishan Chunder Sen, 13 Bengal Law Reports, page 274, it has been decided that the statutory right of occupancy is not transferable as such. This decision is grounded upon the personal nature of the right. Thus Chief Justice Couch says, "it is a right to be enjoyed only by the person who holds or cultivates and pays the rent, and has done so for a period of 12 years," and again, "the ordinary construction of words (in section 6) appears to me to be that the right is only to be in the person who has occupied for twelve years, and it was not intended to give any right of property which could be transferred." This view has been more fully developed by Mr. Justice Phear in the following judgment:—‡

"As the authorities stand, this question seems to be one of some nicety, and in considering it there is need to bear in mind that the relations between the Zemindar and the ryot are not generally

\* Bell's Landlord and Tenants' Act, p. 20-21.

† Ajoodhya Pershad *vs.* Mussamut Emam Bindie, 2 Indian Jurisdiction, 192; Weekly Reports, 528. Rani

Durga Sundari *vs.* Brindaban Chandra Sirkar Chowdhry, 2 Bengal Law Reports, App. 37.

‡ Bibi Sohodoron *vs.* Smith, 12, Bengal Law Reports, p. 82.

the same as those between the English landlord and tenant. No doubt the Zemindar has been made by legislative enactment the proprietor of the land which forms his zemindari; and as regards his *khumar*, *nijjote* or *seer* land, it may be taken that the cultivator of the soil has generally no other rights than those which he obtains as a tenant by contract with the Zemindar: but with regard to the ryotti lands which constitute the bulk of the zemindari, it is much otherwise. There, while the Zemindar is still proprietor of the land, the ryots of the village, as the combined effect of custom and legislation, have in most, if not in all, cases some right to cultivate the ryotti land of the village, which is altogether independent of the Zemindar, and which, in the case of a ryot having a right of occupation, is a right to occupy and use the soil quite irrespective of any assent or permission on the part of the Zemindar. This right, resting upon legislation and custom alone, is not derived from the general proprietary right given to the Zemindar by the Legislature, but is, as I understand, in derogation of, and has the effect of cutting down and qualifying, that right. I may say that, in my conception of the matter, the relation between the Zemindar's right and the occupancy ryot's right is pretty much the same as that which obtains between the right of ownership of land in England and the servitude or easement which is termed *profit à prendre*: although I need hardly say the ryot's interest is greatly more extensive than a *profit à prendre*. It appears to me that the ryot's is the dominant and the Zemindar's the servient right. Whatever the ryot has, the Zemindar has all the rest which is necessary to complete ownership of the land: the Zemindar's right amounts to the complete ownership of the land subject to the occupancy ryot's right, and the right of the village, if any, to the occupation and cultivation of the soil, to whatever extent these rights may in any given case reach. When these rights are ascertained, there must remain to the Zemindar all rights and privileges of ownership which are not inconsistent with or obstructive of them. And amongst other rights, it seems to me clear that he must have such a right as will enable him to keep the possession of the soil in those persons who are entitled to it, and to prevent it from being invaded by those who are not entitled to it."\*

But it has been held that where custom allows the transfer of an occupancy tenure, it is transferable, † the test of transferability being the original nature of the holding.

\* See Regulation VII of 1799, sec. 15, cl. 7.

† Weekly Reports, 247; 13 Bengal Law Reports, 274.



Thus, it will be observed, that the statutory declaration that an occupancy right is not transferable does not place the *khudkashts* in a worse position than they were in in Hindu or Mahomedan times.

### *Tenant-at-will.*

The old *pyekashts* were substantially replaced by section 8 of Act X. of 1859, which declared that "ryots not having rights of occupancy are entitled to pottahs only at such rates as may be agreed on between them and the persons to whom the rent is payable." Not having a right of occupancy, this tenant has no right to remain in the laud, unless he can agree with the landlord as to the amount of rent.\* But if the landlord suffers the tenant to remain on the land, he can only recover from him a fair and equitable rate of rent.† The grounds of enhancement might be those mentioned in section 18 of Act X. of 1859, or any other equitable and fair reason. Here we see that, instead of the pergaunah rate being the limit to enhancement, as under the Regulations, the limit proposed is fairness and equity of the rent claimed, and under the Great Rent Case, where the neighbouring ryots of the same class pay for similar lands a certain rate, that rate should be considered as fair and equitable.

### *The New Rent Bill.*

This is the state of Law from 1859 up to the present day. The New Rent Bill now proposes, *1st.*, to create a new prescriptive right of the ryot by three years' occupation; *2ndly*, to give statutory declaration to the transferability of twelve years' right of occupancy; *3dly*, to define a limit which is in no case to be transcendent as to the rate of rent receivable by the landholders; *4thly*, to prescribe a progressive scale of enhancement within that limit, and *5thly*, to place the tenant-at-will entirely at the mercy of the landholders.

To discuss at a full length the expediency of those innovations and the propriety of the propositions mentioned above, would require the scope of an independent article. What we, therefore, propose to offer here is merely by way of hints and suggestions.

The first proposal is embodied in chapter IV. of the Bill, and is alleged to be the result of a compromise between different views

\* Marshall's Report, p. 341, 325  
2 Bengal Law reports, section 15.

† 11 Weekly Reporter, 304; 1  
Bengal Law Report, 25.

entertained by the members of the Commission. Of the seven members signing the final Report of the Commission, dated the 19th June 1880, Babu Peary Mohun Mukherji, and Mohini Mohun Roy, both of whom command a large experience, strongly protest against the innovations; Messrs. Dampier and Field "would prefer to have chapter IV. struck out of the Bill altogether." This chapter has, therefore, the support of three members against five; and if we recollect how meagre is Babu Brojendra Kumar Seal's note on the *khudkasht* tenure, and how Mr. Harrison, one of the members of the Commission who did not sign the report, is opposed to the views of Messrs. Mackenzie and O'Kinealy, we cannot help thinking that this chapter is solely due to these two gentlemen. If, therefore, the Government accept their view of the question, contrary to all rules of equity and justice, it would accept the opinion of a minority against a majority.

The reason for this proposal may be gathered from the following extract from Mr. Mackenzie's note of the 6th January 1880:—

"I have already admitted that it is perhaps in the present day impossible and useless to attempt to rehabilitate the *khudkashts* or resident ryot *totidem verbis*, and I have said that I think that we must be content now to adopt a prescriptive test of residence. But holding as I distinctly do, that long time was not of the essence of the ordinary *khudkasht's* title, I would make the term of prescription necessary to entitle a ryot to the occupancy rights of the old *khudkashts* a reasonably short one; just long enough, in fact, to give reasonable evidence of his *intention* to cultivate permanently the lands he rents. I have suggested that three years is a sufficiently long term to raise this presumption of intention to settle, and should entitle any ryot to a right of occupancy, not of course in *khamar*, *utbundy* or similar lands, but in the ordinary village jote lands."

So Mr. Mackenzie and his opponents are agreed, that some length of time should be fixed to give reasonable evidence of an intention to permanently settle. The question, therefore, stands thus: Does twelve years or three years' occupation give such evidence? It is a question of fact which should be considered in connection with the state of the country. The period of prescription in case of land has always been twelve years in India, and this had probably some influence in determining the period chosen by Act X of 1859. In the Report of the Select Committee of the Legislative Council which settled the details of Act X of 1859, the Committee observes: "But it has been pointed out by the Western Board

that residency is not always a condition of occupancy ; and it appears that after much enquiry, it was perscribed by an order of the Government of the North-Western Provinces in 1859, as most consistent with the general practice and recognised rights, that a holding of the same land for twelve years should be considered to give a right of occupancy. We have followed this precedent, and altered the section accordingly." Mr. Justice, Trevor, in the Great Rent Case, says :—" Both by the Hindu and Mohamedan Law, as well as by the legal practice \* of the country, twelve years had been considered sufficient to establish a right by negative prescription,—that is, by the absence of any claim on the part of other persons during that period, and hence the doctrine which has obtained that *khudkasht* ryots in possession twelve years before the settlement were under no circumstances, not even on a sale for arrears of revenue, liable either to enhancement of rent or eviction from their holding, so long as they paid the rents which they had all along paid." In a Minute in support of the Decennial Settlement, Mr. Shore said, that ten years is in the estimation of the native equivalent to a perpetuity.† If, then, the former of Act X of 1859 fixed a right to a permanent occupancy by an occupation of 12 years, they were reasonably within the mark, and had strong precedents to follow. What precedent has Mr. Mackenzie for the limit of three years proposed by him ?

If Mr. Mackenzie's rule is open to the objection of being dogmatic and arbitrary, Mr. Reynolds' proposal is open to the objection that it is unsuited to the improved state of the country and will practically operate to the detriment of the tenant. In his memorandum, he observes : "The provisions of chapter IV (of the Rent Commission Bill) have been universally disapproved, and the entire chapter has been omitted from the revised Bill. But it must be understood that this omission has only been possible in view of the wide definition of an occupancy ryot which has been adopted in chapter III. If the right of occupancy is conceded to all resident ryots, it is unnecessary to make special provision for the case of ryots who have held for more than 3 years." Section 19 of Mr. Reynolds' Bill, therefore, provides that every settled ryot has a right of occupancy in the land which he holds or cultivates as a tenant, whether such land be held under a lease or otherwise," and explanation ‡ declares that "a settled ryot is a ryot who has fixed habitation in the village estate in which he holds or cultivates as a tenant, or whose fixed habitation is within a distance of two miles from the lands which he holds

\* Colebrookes's Digest of the Regulations Vol. iii., page 4

† Fifth Report, Vol. I, 594, 595.

or cultivates as a tenant." This proposition virtually proceeds on the assumption that, in legislating for the landholders and cultivators of the present day, the Government propose to legislate for the true descendants and successors of the *khudkashts* of the Hindu village community and of the zemindars of 1793. Now with the progress of time in most parts of Bengal there exists no village community. In former days there was a scarcity of cultivators; the competition was not for lands but for tenants; with the progress of time the scale has turned, and now there is a competition for land, not for cultivators. Even in the old days, an immigrant could be admitted into the village only by consent of the village community. Mr. Reynold's definition overlooks the fact that there is a strong competition for land in the present day, and under his definition any immigrant who makes a fixed habitation for the time would acquire the rights of a *khudkasht*, though the village community, or the Zemindar who now stands for the village community, would not consent to admit him as a member of the village. "Fixed habitation," again, has not been defined, and if the Courts are to exercise their discretion as to what is fixed habitation, and if they would interpret the term from the history of past legislation, anything but a satisfactory conclusion is possible for the tenant.

*Secondly*, it is proposed to make twelve years' right of occupancy transferable without the consent of the landlord. We have already shewn that in the Hindu and Mahomedan period *khudkasht* tenures were not transferable. The same reason of an absence of competition for land might have been at the root of this state of things. The so-called strongest argument for the statutory change now proposed is said to be the tendency of occupancy tenures to become transferable,—which means in other words, that there has now grown up a competition for land, and lands have acquired a marketable value. Undue prominence seems to have been given to the materials that were placed before the Commission about this *tendency*. It is said, that in most districts of Bengal, ryots' holdings are daily sold by the Courts in execution of decrees. The explanation is very easy: most of these sales happen to be at the instance of the Zemindar. The question is not whether occupancy tenures are daily sold at the instance of the Zemindar, but whether they are sold independent of him, and contrary to his will. I believe that, in all the enquiries made on this point throughout Bengal, this point has been sadly missed. The materials that the Civil Courts of the different districts have furnished have no value for the question in issue, because no inquiry

was made as to whether those sales were independent, or at the instance of the Zemindar.\*

The most formidable argument, however, *against* transferability of occupancy holdings is what is numbered 12 by Mr. Field, *viz.*, that the zemindars will be unable to choose their own ryots. Mr. Field ridicules this argument by saying—"If the Legislature would properly listen to this argument of freedom of choice, it would be bound, in order to be consistent, to alter the native marriage laws." We are not sure if Mr. Field meant to be humorous by this remark, but we know for sure that Mr. Justice Phear in the case of *Bibi Sohowda vs. Smith*, 12 Bengal Law Reports, p. 82, based † his decision against transferability expressly upon this argument. Indeed, Mr. Field seems not to have weighed the importance of this argument, loosely put down by himself: The idea of property involves two primary ingredients, *viz.*, the right of occupation, and the right of alienation. The occupancy ryot has the former, and if you invest him with a right of alienation also, you convert him into a sub-proprietor. Under the present law, the Zemindar has a right against his power of alienation, a right (to quote Mr. Justice Phear) "to keep the possession of the soil in him alone who is entitled to it, and to prevent it from being invaded by those who are not entitled to it." This power is loosely expressed by saying that the Zemindar has a right to choose his own ryot.

In pleading for the transfer of occupancy tenures, Mr. Field must have forgotten the following passage ‡ which he wrote in 1875:—

"Ryots having a right of occupancy are also more and more getting into the habit of sub-letting, and thus a fresh class of petty middlemen, ignorant and useless, if not absolutely pernicious, is being created. Whatever be the merits of the Permanent Settlement, it is obviously unfair to the zemindars that this class should in this way appropriate the increase. It is further impolitic, because it tends to rack-renting and the creation of wretched cottiers. It would not be unreasonable to enact that any ryot *regularly subletting* his land should forfeit his right of occupancy. In *Bibi Sohowdowa and others vs. M. Smith*, 12 Bengal Law Reports, 82, it was held that when a ryot having a right of occupancy transferred his rights, the Zemindar could sue the transferee to recover possession of the soil. Leasing is only another form of assignment. There are many arguments in favor of the policy,

---

\* There should have been also an enquiry as to whether the sales in Court, not at the instances of the Zemindar, were recognised by him.

† The full Judgment has been quoted ante.

‡ Field's Regulation (1875), note, p. 59.

which protected the actual cultivator: there are none that I know, which would justify his conversion into a petty middle-man."

Sir Richard Garth is more forcible in his minute of the 8th January 1880:—

"Now," he says, "however wise or politic this provision (section 6, Act X of 1859) might have been, it seems to me impossible to deny that it operates as an invasion of the landlord's right as conferred upon him by the Permanent Settlement; and the only equitable ground upon which such an invasion could be justified would seem to be this, that if a ryot has approved himself as a good tenant by cultivating his land and paying his rent satisfactorily for so long a period as twelve years, it was only fair to him and no real injustice to the landlord, to continue him in his occupation and prevent his being ejected, without some sufficient reason.

"But assuming this to be the true view of the matter, what becomes of the justification for invading the landlord's rights, if the ryot is to be allowed, as soon as he has acquired his right of occupancy, to get rid of it altogether? If the equity to the landlord consisted in his having permanently secured a good tenant, what becomes of the equity if you allow the ryot to transfer his interest?"

*Thirdly and Fourthly*, the Commission propose to fix a limit to the maximum rent claimable by the landlord from his tenant and to define a progressive scale of enhancement within that limit.

It is assumed, in the first instance, that in the interests of a prosperous peasantry, the ruling idea which the Commissioners had in view in framing the Bill, the rents must be *settled*. "They are settled only," they go on to say, "(1) by custom, or (2) by competition, or (3) by law." Custom, the most unchangeable factor in Indian society, they ignore, because it is liable to change on account of the disturbing influence of the revenue sales, thus going beyond the Permanent Settlement; competition, they ignore, because it has a tendency to bring in starvation and poverty in a populous country; so they resort to an express law or arbitrary rule: if the Legislators of the present day would replace the ryot into his former position as regards fixity of tenures—a position that he can claim only on account of the original custom of the country, why, in determining his rent, should they refuse to adopt custom which in the good old days regulated it? If, however, they look to the improved state of time, competition rent now exists to a considerable extent,\* why should not they

---

\* Field's Regulations, p. 58, note.

adopt that test? Where lies the justification or precedence of adopting an arbitrary rule fixing the rent.

But are changes really necessary? The Rent Commissioners propose to fix the rent with a view to securing a prosperous peasantry. If under the present law such a peasantry exists, there remains no necessity for fresh legislation: in the very first year of his administration, after visiting East Bengal, Sir Ashley Eden, in his public address, said: "I have just returned from visiting the Eastern districts, and I may say on this occasion, when my administration is only at the commencement, what I could not well say in a later period without seeming to seek credit for the Government of which I am the head. Great as was the progress which I knew there had been in the position of the cultivating classes, I was quite unprepared to find them occupying a position so different from that which I remembered them to occupy when I first came to this country. They were then poor and oppressed, with little incentive to increase the productive powers of the soil. I find them now as prosperous, as independent, as comfortable as the peasantry, I believe, of any country in the world; well fed, well clothed, free to enjoy the full benefit of their own labours, and to hold their own and obtain prompt redress for any wrong." In another address on his second visit in Behar, he bore the same testimony with regard to the peasantry of the country.

Indeed, before the Commission sat, and before the influence of Mr. Mackenzie prejudiced the Commission, the consensus of opinion was that the law as regards recovery and enhancement of rent should be changed in favor of the Zemindar.

Sir George Campbell, the well known champion of the ryot, in his Bengal Administration Report, p. 79, says:—"The whole Rent Law was rescinded by Act X of 1859. The law of 1859 reduced the powers exercised by the zemindars themselves, while it increased the grounds of enhancement and afforded the remedy of a summary process before Deputy Collectors, who were, however, often very insufficiently qualified. Rent-suits are now transferred to the Civil Court; they are better tried, and the rights of the ryots more respected than they were; but, on the other hand, there are now grounds of complaint that there is difficulty in quickly realising undisputed rents by legal process."

As to enhancement, Mr. C. D. Field, before he sat on the Commission, thus wrote in 1875:—\*

"When enhancement is sought on the ground that the rate of rent is below the *prevailing rate* payable by the same class of ryots for lands of a similar description and with similar

---

\* Field's Regulations, 63, note.

advantages in the places adjacent, witnesses from the vicinity are indispensable in order to succeed. The *pergannah* rate used formerly to be the prevailing rate, but the *pergannah* rates were declared by the Legislature more than half a century ago to have become very uncertain. The new law has not provided an adequate substitute for the provisions contained in section 9, Regulation XXX of 1803, and sections 6, 7 and 8 of Regulation V of 1812, as to settling rates. "If there is no prevailing rate, which under existing circumstances gives a fair share of the increase to the landlord, it is necessary to take the remaining ground of enhancement, *viz.*, that the value of the produce or the productive powers of the land have been increased, otherwise than by the agency or at the expense of the ryot. Here, if it be sought to prove an increase of the productive powers of the land, witnesses from the spot are necessary. The enquiries involved under this ground of enhancement are so extensive, and the production of evidence essential to success is a matter of so great expense, that such suits are seldom brought to a successful termination. The cost of success in a single suit is out of all proportion to the advantage gained therein; and where the ryots, getting to understand the principle '*res inter alios actæ*,' defend every individual case, the Zemindar is almost compelled to stop, more especially if his funds fail, which not unfrequently must happen, when the payment of all rent is suspended pending the dispute. It may be doubted if the existing procedure of a Civil Court is the best machinery for conducting the inquiries involved in this class of cases."

In conclusion, it appears to us that the Commissioners would give all the benefits of competition to the ryot, but block up its course to the Zemindar. In the first innovation proposed by them, they ignore competition for land, in the second, they recognize it, and in the third and fourth they again ignore it.

As to the fifth proposal, we have simply to add that poverty in this country is not among peasants, but among the landless classes, and that the innovation now proposed is calculated to convert all tenants-at-will into landless vagabonds.

K. N. R.,  
(A Judicial Officer.)



### ART. III.—“THE PRESS OF CALCUTTA” FIFTY YEARS AGO.

1. *Life of John Thomas, by C. B. Lewis.*
2. *The India Gazette.*
3. *Alexander's East India Magazine, December 1831.*
4. *The Calcutta Quarterly Magazine and Review, 1833.*
5. *The Calcutta Review, June 1844.*
6. *The Calcutta Review, October 1876.*
7. *The Englishman, 1880.*

**I**F we accept *Hickey's Gazette*, which began to be published in January 1780, as the date of the birth of the Press in India, then it has just completed the first hundred years of its existence ; and during that period it has risen from the low level of a vile, scurrilous, vindictively abusive print, till to-day, in fairness of criticism, in ability, in wealth of resource, in enterprise, and in all those qualities that go to form a vigorous and independent Press, it ranks with that of any country in the world. The father of the Indian Press, James Augustus Hickey, has been characterised as “the most objectionable rowdy that ever landed in Calcutta.” *Hickey's Gazette* was a weekly four page foolscap, of three narrow columns of indifferently printed matter. When *Hickey's Gazette* appeared, the American war of independence was in progress ; there were British troops fighting in France and Spain ; a march from Calcutta to Bombay had been accomplished by the Company's and the King's troops under Major Goddard ; Hyder Ali was on the eve of invading the Carnatic, so that war news was not by any means scanty, and there was the whole gossip of Calcutta served up in a fashion that now-a-days would very much astonish the grossest scandal-monger, and horrify a modern drawing-room. *Hickey's Gazette* simply retailed the news of Europe and America as it found its way to India in private letters and newspapers in the six months voyage round the Cape. It was the medium through which vendors advertised their wares, and budding poets “waked their tuneful lyre.” Here is how one of the poetic joker's appeal to Hickey to leave out his advertisements and serve up more poetry.

Confusion to the wight that crams  
The hallowed page with tongues and hams ;  
Shall Donald come with butts and tuns,  
And knock down epigrams and puns ;  
With chairs, old cots, and buggies trick ye ?  
Forbid it Phoebus, and forbid it Hickey.

In addition to this, *Hickey's Gazette* retailed in print, the tattle small talk, gossip, and general scandal, that formed in those days the backbone of a good deal of the talk of Calcutta society. The morals of the majority of the servants of the Honourable East India Company are truthfully, if grossly, pourtrayed in the weekly *Hickey's Gazette* of a hundred years ago; and it was frequently made the vehicle of private spite, and individual, social and moral revelations of a character that could scarcely find their way now-a-days into a public print.

It was in the pages of this notorious paper that the strictly private arrangement was made public by which the wife of the Russian portrait-painter and adventure, Imhoff, became the wife of Warren Hastings, the first and greatest of the Governor-Generals. Hastings, who had, previous to this, prohibited the Post office authorities from distributing Hickey's paper, and had established the *Gazette of India*, could bear no longer. Sir Elijah Impey arrested Hickey, but admitted him to bail on his furnishing security for Rs. 2,000. Though a great favourite for a time with a section of Calcutta society, he could make no head-way against Hastings and Impey, and sunk out of sight, his latter end lost in obscurity.

By its wholesale serving up of scandal and by its public announcements of private intrigues, by inuendoes, hints and exaggerated versions of attentions which ladies received from gentlemen not their husbands and not their brothers, *Hickey's Gazette* materially aided to make Calcutta society a nest of hornets; and Saturday afternoons, as well as the early morning before the sun was too high in the heavens, were frequently taken advantage of to get rid of the accumulated evil passions roused between gentlemen, who might be seen, commonly enough, furnished with swords and pistols, wending their way in palanquins towards Tolly's Nallah, as it enters the Hooghly, to settle their little differences after the manner of Hastings and Francis; and they not unfrequently returned with a pistol bullet or a sword thrust as a memento of their outing and a remembrancer of the region of Kidderpore.

The *Indian World*, a Calcutta paper, projected and edited by William Duane, an Irish-American adventurer, was distinguished for fearless independence and plain speaking, when neither of these were palatable to the servants of the Company. Duane had made arrangements to leave India early in 1795 and to return to Philadelphia, the city of his adoption. His passage was taken in the *Hercules*, and the sale of the *Indian World* and his other property advertised for New Year's day of that date, when on the 27th December 1794, he received an invitation to Government House from Captain Collins, Private Secretary to Sir John Shore. The

following morning, on his appearance, punctual to his engagement, at the residence of the Governor-General, he was arrested as a State prisoner at the instance of the Supreme Council, and three days afterwards was shipped on board an Indiaman. Without a single word of explanation and without having any opportunity granted him of hearing or rebutting any charge brought against him he was deported to England; the whole of his property being confiscated, and himself beggared. William Duane was not a man to be snuffed out by deportation. He settled in Philadelphia and started and successfully conducted the *Aurora*, an American journal, which probably did more to foster the bitter and uncompromising feeling of the American citizens against the old country than any other public print then in existence.

John Silk Buckingham was a Cornishman; and before entering on his career as a Calcutta Editor, had passed through a variety of adventures which mark him as a man of indomitable will, fertility of resource and unusual mental activity. In 1813 Silk Buckingham traced, for the Pasha of Egypt, the old canal across the Isthmus of Suez, and probably, had funds been forthcoming, would have made a navigable passage through the isthmus forty years earlier than the great Frenchman. For the same master he was commissioned to purchase ships and open up trade between Egypt and India. This scheme also came to nothing. The Bombay traders did not believe in Egyptian Pashas and their agents; and Buckingham's attempts to trade without the sanction of the East India Company, procured his deportation from India.

From Egypt he again started for India, dressed as a Turk and speaking Arabic, through Syria, Mesopotamia and Persia; and in the year 1818, during the Governor-Generalship of Lord Hastings, there appeared "the ablest newspaper ever published in India." That paper was the *Calcutta Journal* and its editor was John Silk Buckingham. With him were connected some of the ablest men then in the service of India, amongst whom were Henry Merideth Parker, and Lawson. The Irish-American Duane had not spared Government officials; but this roving Cornishman lashed them unmercifully. On one occasion, when a high official had his term of service extended, Buckingham made the announcement to his readers in a circular bordered with black. He seized on the green coats worn by the Secretaries of Departments and daubed their wearers "Gangrene of the State." The notorious Adams, after the departure of Lord Hastings, passed a Regulation in the April of 1823, against the "freedom of unlicensed printing," which practically destroyed the freedom of the Indian Press. Buckingham went on his own fearless way. The *doos and pawky* Minister of the Scotch Kirk, Dr. James Bryce, who came to India, the first

Scottish chaplain on the Bengal Ecclesiastical Establishment, started the *John Bull*, a thick and thin defender of all things Governmental, a Tory of the Tories. The Minister wrote occasional leaders, the Precentor did the printing and the Government used it to hound down Silk Buckingham and stifle freedom of discussion. As a reward for his services, Dr. Bryce was appointed clerk of stationery. Buckingham, in a leader, poked fun at the clerical editor, clerk of stationery and Missionary of the Scotch Kirk to convert the heathen lying in darkness. Adams swooped down on the *Calcutta Journal*, withdrew Buckingham's license and deported him from India in the same high-handed fashion as Sir John Shore had treated Duane. Buckingham, like Duane, was not to be suppressed. On his arrival in London, a subscription, to make good some of his large losses in India, was got up; he lectured to crowded audiences, vigorously condemning the monopoly of the East India Company, established the *Oriental Herald*, and for five years (1852-7) was member of Parliament for Sheffield. Some time before his death, in 1855, he was in receipt of a pension from the Company.

The *John Bull* first made its appearance as a daily paper in the June of 1821, under the name of the *John Bull in the East*. In its introductory address it proclaimed itself "the supporter of Church and King, the contemner of private scandal, the counterpoise of the pernicious influence of other journals." For several years after its first appearance, it occupied a conspicuous place in the regard of the large party who were opposed to the politics of Buckingham; and, being supported by the secret influence of the leading officers of the Government of India, it acquired a large circulation. The *John Bull* maintained its influence by the great attention it paid to its intelligence department. Being of course a semi-official journal, it could command all the earliest news, and in this respect had no rival. It continued its advocacy of Tory and Anglo-Indian Conservative politics till 1829. In that year the Half-Batta question tested its allegiance to the army, and its subscription list fell from 600 to 400. In 1830-31 it assailed the Trades Association, and its circulation fell rapidly to 100. Its supplies of intelligence fell off. It was violently opposed to reform, which at that time was agitating Englishmen in all parts of the world, and it dragged on, the organ of the clergy and the Tory party, till the 1st of May 1833, when, Dr. Bryce having returned to Britain the previous year, it changed hands, and, from violent Toryism, passed into an advocate and defender of the Whigs. It supported colonization as it was then called, that is, the throwing open of India to Englishmen irrespective of their connexion with the East India Company, and

it advocated the freedom of the Press. Stocqueler bought the *John Bull*, and in his hands it became the *Englishman*, with Peter Grant, John Farley Leith, and Charles Thackeray, uncle of Charles Mackepeace Thackeray, the well known novelist, as leader writers. It was at the press of the *Englishman* that Macaulay set up the rough proofs of the famous essays, Clive, Warren Hastings, &c., which he sent home to Napier of the *Edinburgh Review*. Of the men connected with the *Englishman* since it came into the hands of Stocqueler, it may be sufficient to mention Robert Adair Macnaughten who died in 1842, Cobb Hurry of the *Delhi Gazette*, Brett and John O'Brien Saunders, senior. A few items regarding the *John Bull* of 1833 may be interesting. The then editor set down the circulation at 305, and of these 104 were civilians, 81 military, 9 religious, 41 medical, and the remainder miscellaneous, of which 25 copies are put down under gratis, and exchange copies. The establishment of the *John Bull* published also the *Bengal Sporting Magazine*, the *Oriental Observer* and the *East India United Services Journal*.

On the decadence of *Hickey's Gazette* the supreme Government established the *India Gazette* as early at least as the year 1784. It was the medium of publishing all the advertisements issued under the authority of the Court of Directors, and it maintained this monopoly up to 1833, if not later. The early files of the *India Gazette*, at all events till the paper passed into the hands of Dr. John Grant in 1822, contain the usual advertisements of the period, Government and General orders, shipping intelligence, local news, the campaigns, reports of the Supreme Court, Criminal Sessions, correspondence, and extracts from English newspapers and notices of new books. It was a weekly paper up to 1822, when it was published twice a week. The predecessor of Dr. John Grant in the editorial chair of the *India Gazette* was Mr., afterwards Sir Herbert, Compton. From the time when Dr. Grant became connected with the paper it entered on a wide sphere of usefulness and popularity, and up to the March of 1829, when the order of the Court of Directors, prohibiting the servants of the Company from having any connexion with the press, severed his connexion with the paper, it exercised considerable influence. In politics it was a supporter of the Whigs, with a tendency to Radicalism. In the January of 1830 it was published twice a week, and in November of the same year it was issued daily. Its circulation in 1833 was 568, of which 103 were civilians, 123 military, 40 medical, 79 mercantile, 5 religious, 172 miscellaneous and 46 gratis and exchange copies. Two-thirds of the circulation was confined to the Bengal Presidency and one-third went into the interior.

Candour and fairness were notable features in its editorials. It discussed fully the numerous questions relating to India "undeterred by any fear of the displeasure of authority or any anxiety for the applause of the multitude." Its sources of information were numerous and its mechanical "getting up" was equal to the best known London newspapers of the day. The *India Gazette* establishment, besides publishing the daily and tri-weekly editions, also published an *Annual*, a *Quarterly Register* and *Directory*, a *Monthly Journal* of local events of interest, a weekly account of the *Calcutta Market*, and a catalogue of the sales of Tulloch and Company, the Mackenzie Lyall of those days, which appeared four times a week, besides "job printing." The monthly expense, including editing, reporting, office-rent, Superintendent's services, readers, compositors, pressmen and peons is set down at Rs. 3,341 or about Rs. 40,092 a year. Other charges including postage, English newspapers, printing materials and paper brought the yearly cost up to Rs. 93,592. In those days 25 per cent. on gross receipts was deducted for non-payment of subscriptions and other losses.

Fifty years ago the leading paper in Bengal was undoubtedly the *Bengal Hurkaru*. The date of its origin is probably not later than 1793, when it appeared as a weekly. On the 29th of April 1819 it commenced its daily issue, a single royal quarto sheet, which was at that time the most that would be got up daily at an Indian press. A second sheet was added, and in July 1821 a third and, instead of Bengal material, European royal paper was used, the first ever used by a Bengal newspaper. After 1st February it was printed on a large super royal folio sheet. Up to 1818, when the censorship established by Lord Wellesley was abolished, Indian newspapers bore a family resemblance, and when they differed, it was in type and extracts rather than in composition. The abolition of the censorship saw the rise of the *Calcutta Journal*. Under the auspices of Mr. Samuel Smith, who became proprietor in 1821, the *Hurkaru* became a power. While the *John Bull* and the *Calcutta Journal* carried on controversies in a style of journalism which has no counterpart now-a-days, unless in some obscure American political prints, the *Hurkaru* went on consolidating its hold on the public; and when the *Scotsman in the East*, which rose after the death of the *Calcutta Journal* in 1824, became extinct, the *Hurkaru* became the advocate of free discussion, and "colonisation," the education of natives and other popular measures. It advocated the claims of the army and the Medical Service when the Government of Lord William Bentinck began the reduction of half-batta and other allowances. Its independence of tone, the

integrity of its motives and the increasing desire for news, raised the issue of the *Hurkaru*, including its tri-weekly, the *Chronicle*, to 934 subscribers, namely: 934 daily and 208 tri-weekly. Its subscribers were classed as follows:—Civil servants 136, military 308, legal 24, clerical 3, medical 51, mercantile 206, miscellaneous 154, and gratis, and exchange copies 52. The *Hurkaru* was thoroughly radical and adopted the maxim of the "Benthamites," as the Utilitarians were then called, "the greatest happiness of the greatest number." Its editorial department was conducted with ability, its sources of news extensive, and its "get up" not inferior to the English papers of the day. The establishment of the *Hurkaru* was the most extensive in Bengal. Besides the daily *Hurkaru* there was produced at the same press the tri-weekly *Chronicle*, the *Bengal Herald*, and the *Literary Gazette*, weekly papers, the *Quarterly Magazine and Review*, the *Bengal Annual*, the *Army List*, an *Annual Directory* and Price Currents, Shipping Lists, Souvenirs, Almanacs, and the usual job-work of a large press. Mr. Smith employed a staff of 166 persons, including compositors, pressmen, peons and sircars at a monthly cost of Rs. 4,374, contributors and reporters cost Rs. 10,000 a year, paper of all kinds cost Rs. 18,000 and office rent Rs. 5,160. The value of the advertisements is set down at Rs. 18,000 a year, and the sale of the various publications issued from the *Hurkaru* press realised Rs. 20,000 a year. The Office of the *Hurkaru* was in Hare Street, near the present abode of the *Englishman*. The *Hurkaru* Library, which was open to the public and lighted with gas, was a valuable one. There are men still alive who remember the library and its courteous proprietor.

The *Calcutta Courier*, up till the year 1831, bore the title of the *Calcutta Government Gazette* and enjoyed the exclusive privilege of publishing Government orders and notifications by authority. The appointment of editor was in the hands of the Military officers who regulated and managed the Military Orphan Asylum; and care was usually taken that the editorial chair should be filled by a man of some literary attainments who would avoid political discussion and endeavour to amuse. The order of the Court of Directors prohibiting their servants from connecting themselves with the press, placed the editorship of this journal, fifty years ago, in the hands of a Calcutta merchant. It was printed at the same press as the *Government Official Gazette*, and it thus had the advantage of reproducing every important official announcement and every item of Government news earlier than any of its contemporaries. The official advantage which it in this way enjoyed, and the Military patronage under which it was issued, made it a formidable rival to the other journals which had to depend for their existence

on private enterprise, unsupported by official assistance. The daily edition had a circulation of about 175 copies including exchange and gratis copies, and the half-weekly edition has been estimated at 225 numbers. The profits of the *Courier* went to aid in supporting the Military Orphan Asylum for boys and girls still in existence at Alipore.

*The Indian Register* was a short lived attempt on the part of East Indians to support a journal of their own. Derozio's attempt, the *East Indian*, to conduct a paper advocating the claims of the community, acquired a considerable amount of success and popularity, but on his death, in the hands of Mr. King, his executor, it died of inanition. The *Indian Register* was started shortly before the final appearance of the *East Indian*. It was issued thrice a week, and at one time had 200 subscribers. It had no special views on politics, a very large number of correspondents, "one-half only of whom write plain English," while the editors were distinguished by negative rather than positive qualities.

*The Philanthropist* was published on Thursday mornings at two rupees a month. It was devoted exclusively to the interests of Christianity and had 92 subscribers. Its existence seems to have been a short one.

*The Enquirer* was published on Sunday mornings, edited by Krishna Mohun Banerjee. It was originally the organ of the band of young natives so powerfully influenced by H. L. V. Derozio and the English teaching of the Hindoo College. By the year 1833, however, the *Enquirer* was practically an organ of the Church of England. It distributed 100 copies gratis.

*The Reformer* was also published on Sunday mornings at the same price. The founder, proprietor and reported Editor was Prosonno Coomar Tagore. It discussed local politics, literature, religion, metaphysics, jurisprudence and political economy. Its subscribers' list numbered 400, and its pages may be regarded as a historical record of the progress of the Hindoos in their knowledge of English.

The *Gyananneshan* had for its object the instruction of Hindoos in the science of government and jurisprudence. It was printed in English and Bengalee and circulated about 100 copies. It was edited by Russick Krishna Mullick, one of the most distinguished students of the Hindoo College, and Duckinarunjan Mookerjee. A note regarding Mullick may be found in the *Calcutta Review* for April 1881, in the Article *Henry Lewis Vivian Derozio*. One of the most accomplished editors and contributors to the *Gyananneshan* was Ramgopal Ghose, a short sketch of whose life is here appended.

Ram Gopal Ghose was born in the October of 1815, the son of Gobindo Chunder Ghose, a Mooktear of the Rajah of Cooch Behar, and an accountant, in a Calcutta mercantile house. He



received his earliest education in English at the School of Mr. Sherbourne an East Indian, who was amongst the earliest teachers of English to natives in Calcutta. Dwarkanath Tagore and other well known native gentlemen were also pupils of Sherbourne. At the age of nine he was sent to the Hindu College, where he was favourably noticed by David Hare, whose interest in all the lads, and anxiety for the success of the College was unremitting. Ram Gopal's father was subsequently unable to pay the fee of Rs. 5-5-3 a month for his schooling. David Hare had young Ghose placed on the free list. At the age of fourteen he came under the influence of Derozio, and besides doing the work of his class, engaged in the extra studies which Derozio voluntarily directed. The best preparation for public life, however, which Ram Gopal received was in the Academic Society founded by Derozio. At the age of 17, on the recommendation of David Hare, he became assistant banian to a Jewish merchant, named Joseph; but long after leaving the Hindu College he continued his studies, and for some years he took his seat in the first class, on the Saturday forenoons and took part in the work of the class. In private study and in intercourse with Derozio and his companions at the Academic and elsewhere, he broadened and deepened his knowledge and acquired a facility of expressing his views. He contributed a series of letters to the *Gyananneshan*, then edited by Russick Krishna Mullick, on the Inland Transit duties, which attracted the notice of Sir Charles Trevelyan, and which aided considerably in effecting their abolition. On the death of the *Gyananneshan* he started the *Bengal Spectator*, which Peary Chaud Mittra edited for some time. He also founded the Society for the acquisition of general knowledge, in which Duckinarunjan Mookerjee and Tara Chand Chuckerbutty were active members. This afterwards became the Bengal British India Society. Mr. Kelsall joined Mr. Joseph in the business in which Ram Gopal was now a valuable and trusted assistant, and on Mr. Joseph retiring, the firm afterwards became Kelsall, Ghose & Co. He remained partner in the firm till the commercial crisis of 1847 was bridged over, and then retired from the business with two lakhs. Shortly after he was offered a judgeship in the Calcutta Small Cause Court, which he declined. He then began business on his own account, and the firm of R. G. Ghose & Co. was one of the best known in its day. On the Bengal Indian Association ceasing to exist, he, in conjunction with others, founded the British Indian Association, which exists to this day. He was appointed a member of the Council of Education, and took an active interest in many educational institutions in Calcutta. There was scarcely a society of any eminence, social, political or literary, with which he was not associated, and he was appointed

to nearly every Government Committee to conduct enquiries regarding every subject of public importance.

In 1853 when the renewal of the Company's Charter was being discussed in Parliament, Ram Gopal called a meeting at the Town Hall to advocate the admission of educated natives into the covenanted service. The meeting was one of the largest that had ever been gathered in Calcutta, and the speech which he made on the occasion was one of his greatest efforts. Some time afterwards, at the instance of the Government of Bengal, the Justices proposed removing the Burning Ghâts from the position they had occupied since the founding of Calcutta, to the banks of the Salt Lake or Tolly's Nallah. Orthodox Hindus received the news of this proposal with consternation, and Ram Gopal, being appealed to by his countrymen, threw the whole weight of his influence against the proposal, and was able to defeat the Government. In grateful acknowledgment of his services, the Hindus of Calcutta, after his death, raised a suitable memorial of his worth.

Ram Gopal Ghose, who began life a poor lad, whose father was unable to pay for his school fees, died leaving property amounting to three lakhs. A few days before his death “ he cancelled all the debts which his friends owed him to the extent of Rs. 40,000. He made ample provision for his widow and relatives, and bequeathed Rs. 20,000 to the District Charitable Society of Calcutta, and Rs. 40,000 to the Calcutta University.”

*The Samachar Durpan* was a bi-weekly Journal published in English and Bengalee at the Mission Press of Serampore. The *Durpan* was a “ diligent chronicle of news interesting to the natives.”

The following extract from a letter to the *India Gazette* of April 5th, 1830, will give a good idea of the spirit of the native newspapers of fifty years ago. At any rate it is the view of a contemporary.

The writer says:—“ The end and aim of all periodical writers should be to reform the manners and customs of their countrymen, and to recommend the Government to adopt such measures as may eventually conduce to the public welfare. With regard to these points, however, we are sorry to say, the native editors are quite mistaken. They think they have done their duty if they can fill their papers with the recital of some pleasant stories, or of some news that is already in the mouth of every individual. Nay, they think it beyond their business to interfere with matters that concern the welfare of the community; and if they do sometimes enter into such discussions, we are generally sure to find them advocating the worst side. In making this remark we do

not mean to include all the native papers ; on the contrary, we are glad to say, that some of them give us as enlightened and liberal sentiments as can elsewhere be found. It will be proper, therefore, to give a separate account of each of these papers, pointing out their merits and defects.

The *Samachar Chundrika* is considered by the natives as the first standard of prose writing, and the best paper which we at present have. But of this, we believe, our readers may doubt, when they are made acquainted with its character. We cannot, however, blame the ignorant Hindoos for setting so high a value on this paper ; since their passions are nowhere else flattered in so servile a manner. It is an odd characteristic of this paper to flatter and slander in one breath. While on the one hand, it panders to the passions of the wealthy Hindoos to gain their favour, it abuses, on the other, men of the most profound learning and morality, merely because these men do not agree with it in some abstract points of religion. The editor of this paper thinks he writes according to the spirit of the *Spectator* ; but he may rest satisfied, abuse was never the language of that inimitable paper. We may also inform him, that his slander against persons of the first character is not construed by the intelligent into wit and satire ; on the contrary it raises the disgust and contempt of every man of liberal principles. We recommend him to abandon the supposition that abuse is argument.

Of the periodical named the "*Teemeer Nausuck*" (the destroyer of darkness), we have very little to say. It is a servile imitation of the spirit of the *Chundrika*, and, therefore, contains gross and absurd writing. What else can be expected from the disciple of such a master ? It is said to be written in a neat style. We may observe that it has taken a very high name beneath which to shelter itself, but that it by no means deserves the designation it has adopted.

The *Samachar Durpan* is an excellent paper, making its appearance every Saturday. It gives us, in the first and third columns, original articles in Bengallee, and in those next to them, translations of those articles in English. We cannot refrain from observing that the *Samachar Durpan* is not written in pure Bengallee, frequently containing English sentences dressed up in Bengallee words. In fact, we cannot deny that it is written in what is usually denominated Serampore Bengallee. It would be desirable that the editor should submit the Bengallee part of his labours to a learned pundit before he sends it to the press. We may, however, add that we have no objection to his Serampore Bengallee, provided his sentiments are liberal.

Of the *Bungo Doot* we cannot but speak in high terms. The style in which it is written is correct, classical and elegant, and it

professes liberality of opinion. But the journal that principally attracts our attention is the *Sumbad Cowmoody*, a newspaper which we firmly believe may stand in competition with many of the English papers of the present day. The sentiments it inculcates, we are sure, will astonish many Europeans, who but twenty years ago thought the minds of the Hindoos unsusceptible of improvement or of cultivation. Like all earthly works, however, the *Sumbad Cowmoody* is not void of faults. While it rouses its countrymen from their lethargy to look upon their deplorable state, it is led sometimes to defame the writers of the *Chundrika*. This is indeed below the dignity of such a paper. It would be more becoming to convince opponents by arguments, and if it fails, to remain silent.

It would be unpardonable in us not to notice a periodical that has but lately been published. We allude to the *Surbo-tutto-Dypica*.

All these native papers deal in the marvellous. There is not a month passes but we see them bringing to light wonderful stories of children one day old walking about, and of a woman who bore a monkey; and these, we are sorry to add, our countrymen are ever ready to believe. We suggest to the editors of these papers not to continue imposing such ridiculous tales on the credulous and ignorant Hindoos. We should have them discuss political questions and all others involving the happiness of the community. That the natives are susceptible of every degree of improvement is a fact which we have the pleasing satisfaction every day to witness. The editors should, therefore, ever make it their object not to let a single subject pass unnoticed by which they may attempt a reformation in the customs and morals of their countrymen."

The *Calcutta Literary Gazette* was published on Sundays, the annual subscription to it being sixteen rupees. It was conducted by Mr. David Lester Richardson with great ability.

The *Oriental Observer* came out on Saturday evenings, and the annual subscription was twenty-four rupees a year. It was a compound of the *Literary Gazette* and the *Bengal Herald*, and published at the *John Bull Press*. English and local extracts, an occasional editorial, and a summary of the week was the circle within which it restricted itself. It was to the pages of this weekly that Miss Emma Roberts contributed original papers and verses of considerable merit. She appears to have left India before 1832. The *Oriental Observer* was then conducted for the benefit of the widow of Mr. Pritchard, up to his death printer of the *John Bull*.

The *Sporting Magazine*, "India's only sporting paper" fifty years ago, was conducted by the editor of the *John Bull*, and

issued once a month for sixteen rupees a year. It was “the most popular periodical ever issued from the Calcutta Press, although its subscribers never numbered more than 300.” Of the *Sporting Magazine*, it was said, “No tiger dies, but his fall is here registered. No boar is speared, but the event is here detailed,—no jackal yields his brush, but *MAGA* screams the Tally ho ! ”

The *Calcutta Monthly Journal* was a collection of the best articles which appeared in the *India Gazette* and was published at that office.

The *Christian Intelligencer* and the *Christian Observer* were, the first the organs of the Church of England, the latter the organ of Alexander Duff and the dissenters. Each copy cost twelve annas, and it was distributed freely among the poorer classes of Europeans and Eurasians.

The *Journal of the Asiatic Society* had its origin in a publication called *The Gleanings in Science*, and was enlarged so as to embrace the proceedings of the Society.

The *East India United Service Journal* was, at the time we are writing of, the property of the editor of the *John Bull*. It was issued every alternate month for eight rupees a year, two rupees a number. It was exclusively intended for the members of the Military profession. Its first number appeared in 1883.

The *Quarterly Magazine and Review* had a sale of about 200 copies and was inferior in many respects to the British Quarterlies.

Fifty years ago, then, Calcutta had four daily papers, namely, the *Hurkaru and Okronicle*, the *India Gazette*, the *Calcutta Courier* and the *John Bull*, with an estimated total subscription list of 1,580. The first three, issued thrice a week editions. There were seven weekly papers, namely, the *Bengal Herald*, the *Philanthropist*, the *Enquirer*, the *Reformer* the *Gyananneshan*, the *Calcutta Literary Gazette* and the *Oriental Observer* : four tri-weekly, the *Indian Register*, and the tri-weekly edition of the *Hurkaru*, the *India Gazette* and the *Courier* : two monthly, the *Sporting Magazine*, and the *Calcutta Monthly Journal*, and if the *Christian Intelligencer* and the *Christian Observer* be included, then the number of monthly publications amounted to four. The *Quarterly Magazine and Review*, the *Journal of the Asiatic Society* were the two Quarterlies. The *East Indian Service Journal* appeared every second month and the *Bengal Annual* once a year. The total circulation of all the Journals enumerated was reckoned by the editor of the *John Bull* to be not less than 9,053.

Fifty years ago the Press of Calcutta, in the number and frequency of its publications, not only was the first in India, but in

the British dominions it ranked second in importance to London. While Calcutta could boast of such a variety and number of periodicals, Madras had three papers published thrice a week, the *Government Gazette*, *The Courier* and the *Madras Gazette*. In Madras the press censorship was rigorously enforced. All attempts at independent expression of opinion regarding Government measures, either in India or England, were suppressed, and their place in the editorial columns supplied by stars. Laudation, however, might be copiously indulged in. Bombay had two Journals, the *Courier*, the official organ, and the *Gazette*. Sir John Malcolm allowed them to copy freely the bold articles of Calcutta papers, but if any Bombay editor ventured to express strong opinions of his own, he did so under the prospect of speedy banishment to England.

Of all the Calcutta dailies the *Hurkaru* was the ablest, and it continued its existence unbroken from 1793 up to 1866, under a long line of able editors, Sutherland, Kaye, D. L. Richardson, Mr. McPherson, Dr. Moor, James Hutton, Henry Mead, and Alexander Forbes. The proprietors were Samuel Smith, Sims, Gordon Stewart, Mr. Mendes and Mr. S. E. J. Clarke. In the year 1864 Mr. S. E. J. Clarke became editor and proprietor, and conducted it till the commercial crash of 1866, when twelve Calcutta banks failed, and a large section of the Calcutta community were ruined. In a single month the receipts of the *Hurkaru* fell from Rs. 8,000 to Rs. 2,000. Under this condition of affairs Mr. Clarke found it impossible to go on. The *Hurkaru*, which had previously absorbed the *India Gazette*, became the property of a company, and appeared on the 30th December 1866, as the *Indian Daily News*.

THOMAS EDWARDS.

---

#### ART. IV.—RESULTS OF PRIMARY EDUCATION IN THE NORTH-WEST AND OUDH.

(Continued from the "*Calcutta Review*" for April 1883.)

##### No. II.

THE object of this second article is to describe the results of the enquiries made in the autumn of 1882 at thirteen selected village schools in the Lucknow district. The purpose for which these investigations were made was to discover as far as possible what the actual effects of primary education have been in these thirteen schools, and thus to establish some grounds for inference as to what its probable effects have been throughout the North-West and Oudh generally.

To have called for statistics from the teachers themselves would have been an easier, but a less useful, task. The plan upon which I acted was to go myself \* to the villages selected, and in each place to scrutinize the school records for the last 15 years, to examine the ex-students themselves one by one, and, whenever the necessity arose, to question the parents and other inhabitants. It took about three days to examine each school and village after this fashion. When all the particulars for which I was in search had been collected, the task of comparing, generalizing, and arranging them in proper form was one of no little drudgery and labour; for they comprised the individual history of over three thousand ex-students. I mention this fact with a view to shewing that the results, which I am about to exhibit, are as accurate and exhaustive as I could make them.

To those, who have not gone through a similar experience, it would be difficult to realize how much caution and patience are required for getting at the exact truth in an Indian village. When you ask a man a question, the first kind of answer that he gives you is to say the first thing that comes into his head, without taking the trouble to think or weigh his words. Afterwards, when he sees that you are in earnest, his plan is to guess at the motive which he supposes you to have in view, and shape his answer accordingly, taking care to say what he thinks will please you best or appear most creditable to himself. At last, when it has fully dawned upon his mind that there is more to

---

\* I must, however, once for all acknowledge in this place the very great assistance afforded me by M. Ambika Prosad, the Dy. Inspector of Schools in the Lucknow District, both in collecting the facts and in compiling them after they were collected.

be gained by stating the facts than by concealing them, he begins to weigh his words more carefully and describe things as they are. For example, many of the ex-students, on being asked whether they used the Nagri or the Kaithi character in their private accounts, declared that they invariably wrote Nagri, when an inspection of their books showed that they invariably wrote Kaithi or Mahajani. \* This they then frankly admitted to be the case, but without betraying the slightest sense of shame at having stultified their previous statement. Many others declared that they could still read and write fluently, when upon examination it was proved that they could do neither. From the vagueness, inaccuracy, and sometimes intentional untruthfulness of the answers given, it would appear that the education imparted in boyhood had not had much effect in strengthening their regard for truth. It would not be reasonable, however, to expect that a meagre intellectual training can produce such an effect anywhere, unless it is accompanied with parental discipline and enforced by social penalties.

It will be best to begin with describing the locality of the villages at which these investigations were made. Of Europe it has been said that all roads lead to Rome. Of Oudh it may be said that all roads (south of the Gogra) lead to Lucknow. From this city, as from a centre, 5 great lines of communication radiate to the different parts of the Oudh province. One, due east, leads to Fyzabad, (the first capital of the late kingdom of Oudh, and now the head-quarters of the north-east Division) and passes three important towns on the way, (Nawabganj, Daryabad, and Radauli), besides many villages. There is not only a railway uniting these places, but a metalled road, which is largely used for local traffic, and runs nearly parallel to the line of rail. The next great thoroughfare goes towards the south-east, and leads at last to Sultanpur, after passing many villages and towns on the way. The third goes due south and leads at last to Rae Bareilly, the head-quarters of the south-east Division. Mail carts pass daily between Lucknow and Rae Bareilly on this metalled and much

\* The only Hindi character which is allowed to be taught in the Government schools of the North-West, and the only one which is encouraged in Oudh, is Nagri; but the character which the people themselves use is Kaithi, or (which is the same thing in a less legible form) Mahajani. Almost all the ex-students declared that since leaving school they had been using Nagri, thinking that I should be vexed on finding that they had neglected the instruction imparted to them at school, or that such neglect would not seem creditable

to themselves. As soon as they perceived that they had nothing to fear, and that, if they spoke the truth, no evil consequences would ensue, they admitted that they used only Kaithi or Mahajani, and voluntarily brought me their shop books and private accounts for inspection. If I had been content with the first answer that they gave me, and had taken no trouble to enquire further, I should have carried away a totally false impression of the real facts of the case.



frequented road. The fourth goes south-west towards Unao and Cawnpore. Many villages and small towns lie in the way; and these are connected not only by a line of rail, but by a metalled road, the first, and in fact the only metalled road which the late kings of Oudh caused to be made while their dominion lasted. The fifth and last goes due north towards Sitapur, the head-quarters of the north-west Division, and thence to Sháhjáhpúr in the North-Western Provinces, where it meets the line of rail. Thus all districts and divisions of the Oudh province, (except the two districts north of the Gogra), are connected with their capital, Lucknow, by means of roads, railways, or both.

The programme which I followed was to draw a circle as it were round this central city, cutting the five great thoroughfares just described at a distance of about 20 miles from the capital, and within that area to examine the ex-students of those primary schools, which were the oldest and best established, and which might therefore be taken as favourable types of primary schools in general. I know of no area of the same size in any other part of the North-West or Oudh, which would appear to offer a more promising field for sowing the seeds of elementary knowledge. In the thirteen villages selected for investigation, (the names of which are given below, \*) all castes, classes, and interests are represented in adequate proportions. Here are post-offices, police-stations, Taluqdari mansions, tradesmen's stalls, agricultural bazars, and artisans' workshops. The schools established here are among the oldest and best of their kind in Oudh. Three of them, (Mahoua, Mohanlalganj, and Amethi), have, during the greater part of their career, been something more than mere village schools; for they have at different times had classes learning up to what is called the middle standard, that is, a standard higher by one or two years than that laid down for the primary curriculum. Within the whole of this area there has been no competition at any time with Anglo-vernacular schools; and thus vernacular schools have here had the whole field to themselves.

---

\* The names are as follows :—(a) On the Fyzabad road, Chintah, which has a post-office and a small police force; Ujarison, which is an old Mahamedan settlement; Juggaur, which has a railway station; (b) On the Cawnpore road, Amousi, which is near a railway station, and is inhabited by many Brahmin and Chattri families; (c) On the Sultanpur road, Bakás; Goshayengunj, which, out of Lucknow, is the largest trade centre in the district; Amethi, where two

Taluqdars reside, and where Bandagi Mir, the tutor of Aurangzib, was born and buried; Salempore, where a Taluqdar resides; (d) Etaunja, where there is a Taluqdar and a large Brahmin population; Mahona, which is an old seat of learning like Amethi; (e) On the Rai Bareli road, Kalli Pascham; Mohanlalgunj, the head-quarters of the Tahsil and the residence of a Taluqdar; Mow, where there is a weekly bazar.

The total number of ex-students whose names are borne on the books of the thirteen schools examined, amounts to 3,327. But 303 of the names could not be identified after the most careful search, and were therefore set down as fictitious. Respecting the fictitious students some explanation will be given presently. When these are deducted, the total number of genuine ex-students whose case we have to consider and describe comes to 3,024.

In making these investigations there were three great questions which I proposed to myself to answer :—(1) What are the castes, Hindu and Mahomedan, by which the schools have been attended? (2) What are the occupations, agricultural or otherwise, which the students have followed, or have desired to follow, after leaving school? (3) What amount of knowledge have they retained since leaving school, or in other words, of what use has education been to them in the work of life?

*Sec. II :—Castes attending village schools.*

The answer to the first of the three questions just noted is summed up in tabular form in the statement given in the next page. The reader is requested, however, to attend to the top-headings only and not to the side-headings: for the former describe the castes of the students, while the latter relate to their occupations, which is an entirely distinct question. For the present we are concerned only with the question of caste :—

Particulars as to the present occupation, condition, or status of the ex-students.	High caste Mahomedans.		Brahmins.	Chattris.	Kayasths.	TRADING CASTES.		ARTIZAN CASTES.		CULTIVATING CASTES.	PASTORAL CASTES.	CASTES IN SERVICES OF PROFESSION.		MISCELLANEOUS CASTES.	TOTAL.
	1	2				3	4	5	6			7	8		
Landlords ..	27	6	27	7	0	0	0	0	0	4	4	0	0	0	73
Tenants ..	59	161	123	31	1	2	1	7	4	3	33	3	3	18	518
Field Labourers ..	13	3	3	1	3	11	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	49
Shop-keepers ..	22	41	5	0	177	132	3	85	0	0	0	0	0	0	383
Artizans ..	0	0	0	0	2	3	77	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	167
Religion ..	6	77	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	85
Service or Profession ..	76	31	12	118	2	2	0	0	0	2	0	3	4	5	248
Non-Literary ..	163	81	13	56	8	4	1	0	1	7	4	4	1	1	417
Literary ..	61	13	4	21	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	115
Studying at schools ..	44	60	17	28	13	10	3	12	2	2	1	0	3	7	240
Govt. Year ..	10	0	2	15	0	1	0	1	1	1	0	0	0	1	31
English ..	17	12	0	2	5	4	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	68
Miscellaneous occupations ..	70	93	16	75	13	6	3	3	3	3	0	2	2	12	296
No occupation ..	33	30	9	22	15	9	3	3	5	3	3	2	4	4	137
Occupation not known ..	36	48	17	35	22	33	2	6	5	4	4	6	2	2	196
Dead ..															
Real Total ..	637	668	248	461	263	198	92	214	215	56	70	82			3,024
Fictitious Registration ..	54	89	28	41	39	15	5	5	7	6	6	7			303
Registered Total ..	691	757	276	502	302	213	97	219	222	62	76	89			327

The top-headings to this statement are based upon the great caste divisions, of which the native population of Upper India consists, and which have prevailed for many centuries past in these provinces. The first heading applies to high caste Mahomedans, that is, to Mahomedans of the Syud, Mogul, Pathan, or Shaik clans, and to those Mahomedan clans who have been converted to the creed of Islam from the high caste Hindus.\* The second heading applies to Brahmins or men of the priestly caste; the third to Chattris or men of the warrior and landlord caste; and the fourth to Kayasths or men of the writing and literary caste. Among these, as I need scarcely add, no Mahomedans are to be found. All the remaining headings apply to castes, in which Hindus and Mahomedans are mixed, though Hindus greatly preponderate. The fifth and sixth headings relate to the trading castes, amongst whom Banyas (with Katris) are set apart in the fifth column as being a large and influential caste by themselves, while the less important trading castes, (Halwais, Bhunjas, Kalwars, Tamolis, &c.), are placed collectively in the sixth column. The seventh and eighth headings describe the artizan castes. It was found convenient to distribute these under two distinct sub-heads,—the metal workers under one and the non-metal workers under the other. The former (consisting of Sunars, Lohars, Thateras, &c.) stand decidedly higher in the social scale than the latter who consist chiefly of Kumhars (potters), Telis (oil pressers) Koris (weavers), Chamárs (tanners), &c., and whose status in the eyes of Hindus is very low. The ninth heading describes the great cultivating castes, (Muraos, Kacchis, Kurmis, Lodhas, Mális, &c.), of whom the four first are engaged in tilling fields, and the last in tilling gardens. Amongst these, Mahomedans are seldom, if ever, found. The tenth heading relates to the great pastoral castes or tribes,—Ahirs, Gareriyas, Gaddis, Goshis, Gujars, Játs, &c. Under this heading the Goshis are all Mahomedans, (the Goshi caste being the Mahomedan counterpart of the Hindu Gaddi), and there are a few Mahomedans among the Gujars and Játs. The eleventh heading relates to those castes which are engaged in domestic service or in the practice of the corresponding professions. These are chiefly Nais (or barber-surgeons), Darzis (tailors, and dress-makers), Kahars (water-men, palankin-bearers, and general house-servants), and Dhobis (or washermen). Amongst all of

---

\* The distinction here drawn between Mohamedans of high caste (namely, those of the great Mohamedan clans, and those who have been converted from high caste Hindus), and Mohamedans of low caste, (namely, those who have been converted from the low and mixed caste of Hindus), is observed by Mr. Williams in the Oudh Census of 1869, *See* Vol. II. Table IV, pp. 2, 3.

these, under the same or different names, Mahomedans are to be found, and in numbers more equally matched with Hindus than in the case of the preceding castes. The thirteenth and last heading comprises an unclassified residuum of miscellaneous castes, none of whom were considered of sufficient importance individually to require a column to themselves. These are chiefly the Bháts or minstrel caste, the Gosháyens or so-called hermit caste, the Pásis or caste of pig rearers and watchmen, the Kasais or butcher caste, the Maha Bráhmans or caste of funeral priests, the Báris or caste of leaf-plate-makers, the Luniyas, once the salt-making, but now the road-making and navvy caste, and many more. Among the minstrels one, and among the butchers several, Mahomedans were found. All the rest are Hindus.

Out of the 3,024 ex-students, whose case we are considering, the total number of Hindus of all castes is 2,322, and of Mahomedans of all castes 702. Now, according to the Ondh census of 1869, the total male population of Hindus at the thirteen villages described was 14,852; and the total male population of Mahomedans was 4,152. On comparing the proportions, we find that the percentage of Hindu ex-students to the total Hindu male population at the said villages is 15·76, and the percentage of Mahomedan ex-students to the Mahomedan male population is 16·91. This proves that Mahomedans as a whole are as much, if not more, ready to attend Government Vernacular schools than Hindus are. It has been more than once demonstrated by myself on previous occasions, that the same fact holds good in English schools also. The report on the last census of the North-West and Oudh (compiled by Mr. White, C. S., and published in 1882), contains the following remark, p. 92:—"There are 2,644,135 Hindu boys between the ages of 5 and 10, of whom 232,055 or 8·7 per cent are learning to read and write. Among the Mahomedans there are 410,946 boys in this age group, and of these the 57,850 returned as scholars are in the proportion of 14·1 per cent. Thus the Mahomedans have a larger proportion of their boys under instruction than the Hindus." There seems to be no need, then, (as has been so often asserted) of special provision for the education of Mahomedans in these provinces.

An examination of the totals at the foot of the above statement will shew in what proportions the different castes are represented at our primary vernacular schools. Out of the 3,024 ex-students, high caste Mahomedans contribute 637, Brahmins 668, Chattris 248, Kayasths 461, Banyas (with Katris who, however, are very few in number) 263, the other trading castes 198, the metal-working artizan castes 92, the non-metal workers—

134, the cultivating castes 115, the pastoral castes 56, the serving or professional castes 70, and the remaining castes (not included in the above) 82. Now if we calculate the proportions which these several items bear to the total number of ex-students, and if we exhibit in a parallel column the proportions which these several castes bear to the total population of Oudh,\* the result is as follows :—

	Percentage to total number of ex-stu- dents.		Percentage to total population of Oudh.
High caste Mahomedans	21.1	...	4.0
Brahmins ...	22.1	...	12.5
Chattris ...	15.3	...	5.9
Kayasths ...	8.2	...	1.3
Katris and Banyas	8.7	...	2.3
Other trading castes	6.5	...	3.8
Artizan castes { Metal workers	3.0	...	7.9
Non-metal workers	4.4	...	19.5
Cultivating castes	3.0	...	14.2
Pastoral castes ..	1.8	..	13.4
Serving and Professional castes	2.3	...	7.3
Castes not included in the above ...	2.7	...	13.9
	100		100

The first conclusion to be drawn from an examination of the above figures is, that the bulk of the school-goers are of the high castes, while the bulk of the population are of the low and inferior castes. Thus, high caste Mahomedans constitute only 4 per cent. of the total population of Oudh, but contribute 21 per cent. of the school-goers. Brahmins constitute only 12 per cent. of the total population of Oudh, but contribute 22 per cent. of the school-goers. Chattris constitute only 5 per cent. of the total population, but contribute 15 per cent. of the school-goers. Kayasths make up only 1.3 per cent. of the total population, but contribute 8.7 per cent. of the school-goers. Banyas make up 2.3 per cent. of the population, but contribute 8.7 per cent. of the school-goers. Traders of other castes make up 3.8 per cent. of the population, but contribute 6.5 per cent. of the

\* The population of Oudh *caste-wise* is given in Mr. William's Census Report for 1869, in Vol. II. Table IV., pp. 1—7. His enumeration of castes is much more elaborate than that given by myself. But I have carefully grouped every caste men-

tioned by Mr. Williams under one or other of the 12 fundamental divisions selected by myself; and his enumeration is so clear and explicit, that I felt no doubt whatever as to the division or group to which each of the castes should belong.

school-goers. If we take these 6 caste-divisions together, we find that they constitute collectively only 30 per cent. of the total population, but contribute no less than 82 per cent. of the school-goers. On the other hand, if we take the 6 last and remaining caste-divisions together, it will be seen that they constitute collectively no less than 70 per cent. of the total population, but contribute only 18 per cent. of the school-goers.

Now there are three ways in which this marked disproportion might be accounted for. It might be supposed, *firstly*, that low caste boys do not attend our schools, because the high castes will not allow them to sit in the same class with themselves. Or it might be maintained, *secondly*, that the upper castes attend our schools, because education in some form or other has always been traditional within their ranks, and that the inferior castes stand aloof, because they have been illiterate from the beginning of their existence, and have no ambition to be anything better. Or it might be urged, *thirdly*, that, as education is incompatible with extreme poverty, and as almost all the wealth of the country is concentrated in the hands of the upper castes, the inferior castes are too ill-fed, too severely pressed for the bare necessities of life, to be able to give a thought for any higher aim.

There seems to be much less truth in the first of these suppositions than in either of the other two, though this is the explanation which has not unfrequently been given. In fact, it appears to me, that there is scarcely any truth in it at all. If the reader will again refer to the tabular statement shown above, he will observe that among the 134 ex-students in column eight, who come under the heading of artizan castes, non-metallic, there are some who rank almost or quite as low as Pásis; such, for example, are Kumhárs or potters, Telis or oil-pressers, Chamárs or hide-workers, and Koris or weavers. Yet, when we compare these non-metal-workers shown in column eight with the metal-workers shown in column seven, we find that the former exceed the latter by 42, in spite of the fact that they stand very much lower in the social scale. Among the serving and professional castes in column 11, there is not only the respected Náí or barber-surgeon, but the impure and despised Dhobi or washerman, who ranks not less low than the castes already named. Among the miscellaneous castes, (see column 12,) we have not only the respected Bhát or minstrel, and the Gosháyen or hermit, but the Pási or pig-rearer, whose diet is swine's flesh, is abhorred by all consistent Hindus, the Kasái or butcher, whose trade in beef involves the slaughter of the sacred cow, and the Mahá-Bráhman or funeral priest, the degenerate and despised descendant

of the highest caste in India, whose very touch is considered a pollution. Lower still than any caste that has been named, a Dóm was found in one school, sitting a little by himself, but present nevertheless,—the caste of scavengers and corpse-burners, the very lowest of the Hindu castes, “the most degraded of mortals, contemned even by the contemptible.” Now the very low castes contribute (roughly speaking) 5 per cent. of the 3,024 ex-students, whose names were verified on the rolls, and the castes of a rank between the very low and the upper contribute about 15 per cent., while the upper castes contribute about 80 per cent. If the upper castes had wished to exclude the lower or the lowest ones, it would have been easy for this large majority of 80 per cent. to expel such a small minority as that of 15 or 5 per cent., and thus keep the whole of the field to themselves. At indigenous schools, that is, at schools raised and maintained on a purely private and purely native basis, the case would be, and in fact is, altogether different. Into these schools low caste pupils are not admitted, (except occasionally into the ‘Kaithi schools,) and do not expect to be. But at Government or public schools the equality of all castes and classes is recognized, much to the same extent that it is in railway carriages or in the public courts. The natives of India, so far as I am able to interpret their sentiments, are impressed with the idea, that all castes and classes are regarded as equal in the eyes of the British Government, and must therefore be so treated by themselves at Government schools. The prevalence of this conviction has given to our primary schools a democratic and levelling character, such as is not to be found in England: for I have never yet heard of the son of a squire taking his seat in the same class or school with the sons of a grave-digger, scavenger, chimney-sweeper, or butcher. Yet this is a thing of common occurrence in the Government Primary schools of Upper India.

There seems to be much truth, however, in the other two suppositions alluded to above. It is a fact that education, in some form or other, has always been more or less traditional among the upper castes, and ignorance among the inferior ones. It is also a fact that the upper castes alone, and these not by any means universally, possess that degree of material comfort and prosperity without which no demand for education, even of the rudest kind, can exist. Either of these facts would alone suffice to account for the disproportion between population and attendance on the part of the upper and the inferior castes respectively. But in this part of India the two facts generally run in parallel lines; and thus the result is the more assured.



In India, education, (that is vernacular education as distinct from English), is invariably sought for from one or other of the two following motives;—either because it is necessary to the practice of that calling to which a youth is attached by caste or the traditions of his caste, or because it is necessary to the study and practice of the religion to which he was born. In all countries these two motives,—wordliness and piety,—are prominent among others more or less powerful. In this part of India they are, I am persuaded, the only two motives that exist; and I feel sure that the problem of vernacular education would be better understood, if this fact were recognized. The only Hindu castes, then, who value education in some form or other, are Banyas (including Katris and a few other trading castes), Brahmins, Kāyasths, and, to a less extent, Chattris, or the landlord-class. Baniyas and Katris value it, because, without being able to write and count, they could not carry on their business as traders, bankers, and money lenders. Brahmins value it, because, without studying their particular books, they cannot exercise the functions of family priest, reciter of Purānas, or astrologer. Kāyasths value it, because the hereditary tradition of this caste is to abjure manual labour and to earn their livelihood as writers, village accountants, pleaders, agents, estate-managers, &c. Chattris value it (but to a less general extent than any of the preceding), because it helps them in the management of their estates, if they happen to be landlords, and because they are glad to read the *Ramāyana* at their houses, if they happen to have the leisure and taste for such recreations. To these we might add a few of the more prosperous members of the higher artizan castes, that is, Sunārs and Thateras, who, like Baniyas, keep shop-accounts, or, like Chattris, might have some taste for reading religious books at home. We might also add the small and decayed caste of Bhats or bards, who, though they have fallen irreparably from the high and honored estate they once held in the courts of Chattri princes, still look to education with the lingering hope of recovering through its means the privileges which they have long since lost. Thus much for the Hindus. Among the Mahomedan community the demand for education is more general than among the Hindus, owing to the fact that their religion contains no privileged priestly caste like Brahmins, and is not less democratic in this respect than Christianity. But even amongst Mahomedans the demand for education is chiefly felt among that class of men who are by profession Moharrirs, Hakims, Moulvies, or religious teachers, or aspire to become so. Thus, in every instance that can be named, whether we look to Hindus or Mahomedans, the incentives to education are to be found either in the demands of religion

or in the demand of some secular calling, to the practice of which instruction in some form or other is indispensable; and it is only those castes or classes, upon whom one or both of these motives operate, that attach any value at all to education. The said castes and classes had established schools of their own several centuries before the Government came into the field as an educating agency. These are the indigenous schools. Baniyas, Katris, and Kayasths of a certain class, had established their Kaithi and Mahajani schools; and from the curriculum of these schools every study that is not directly conducive to the purposes of trade and account-keeping, is carefully excluded. Kayasths of another class, and the Mahomedans, to whose fortunes they had linked their own, had established their Maktabas or Persian schools; and the managers of these schools are not less careful to exclude all irrelevant matter than are those of the Kaithi schools. Mahomedans of the specially religious class had established their Quráni schools. Brahmins had established their pátshálás, in which Sanskrit is not merely the chief but the exclusive study. The more prosperous Chattris had entertained private tutors to teach their sons the *Ramáyana*. The Government schools have not succeeded (except to a very small degree) in reaching any castes or classes but those for whom, and by whom, these indigenous schools had been brought into existence several centuries before. This has been clearly proved by the statistics shewn above. The castes and classes named are the only portion of the Indian population, whether Hindu or Mahomedan, whose attachment to education is genuine and sincere; and even these castes and classes usually prefer the indigenous curriculum, with its exclusive studies and simple appliances, to that prevailing at Government schools, but generally accept the latter as an alternative to the former, because the Government schools cost them little or nothing in comparison with the expense of paying for their own teachers, and bear the prestige of the Government name,—to which name a mysterious importance is attached, which no one would be able to define, if he were asked. All the other castes and classes attend the Government schools either by compulsion or by an illusion. Sometimes they are compelled to attend by the landlords or other men of influence in the village, or by the nearest local official, or by the schoolmaster himself; all of whom (and especially the one last named) are interested in securing an attendance sufficient to justify the cost. Sometimes they attend of their own accord in the vague hope that after leaving the Government school they may, by some lucky stroke of fortune, obtain a Government appointment. Were it not for the pressure

exercised by neighbours, local officials, and teachers, and for the illusory notion spontaneously entertained by the students themselves,—a notion of which every one concerned takes good care not to undeceive them—I believe that all the low and inferior castes would stand as much aloof from the Government schools as they do and always have done from the indigenous ones. Their attachment to our schools, if it can be called by such a name, is neither sincere nor deep-seated, and their attendance, as the statistics show, is precarious and temporary. Education does not help them to earn their bread, and therefore it is regarded with indifference, if not with aversion. To suppose that such men can desire knowledge for its own sake, and apart from the vain hope of its improving their material condition, is inconceivable. The parents cannot afford to sacrifice the petty earnings, which their children can make in the fields or bazaars, for the sake of a primary education which from sheer disuse they at once begin to forget after leaving school: and the children themselves are much too ill-fed in body to feel any anxiety about food to the mind. These castes have been illiterate from the beginning of their existence, and I think they are destined to remain so, until some radical improvement takes place in their material status, so as to give rise to new tastes and aspirations and new capacities for appreciating the dignity of knowledge and making use of its advantages. Until this much-desired change has become an accomplished fact, (and there are no signs of its approach at the present time), the attempt to extend education among them is (I think) as vain as to build a house upon sand.

It seems, then, that there is no demand in this country for what is called mass-education. The explanations which I have offered may be accepted or not. But there is no denying the fact, (whatever explanation may be made of it), that the inferior castes, who make up the mass of the population, stand aloof from our schools, even in places where the said schools have been lying open at their doors for one whole generation. In the thirteen villages at which these investigations were made, the inferior castes far outnumber the upper ones; and yet almost all the students have come from the latter. The lower castes have been encouraged in every possible way to attend our schools; but with few exceptions (and these chiefly under pressure or illusion) they have declined the offer. The horse has been brought to the water; but it has refused to drink. Even among the upper castes the demand for education is very far from being universal. Among Brahmins and Chattris there is a large proportion.

(not less than one half, and probably much more) who have, from time immemorial, sunk to the level of Sudras in point of intellectual aims, and who as labourers, carriers, petty-tenants, &c., have as little desire or need for education as men of the lowest castes. Among the trading castes, there are several (such as Tamolis, Bhunjas, Kujras, &c.) whose trade is too petty to require even that slender amount of education which is patronised by Banyas and Katris, and who therefore keep no written accounts of what they buy and sell. But all the trading castes put together, literate and illiterate combined, contribute only 6 per cent. of the total population of Oudh; and hence the males of a school-going age make up only about 0·5 per cent.; and of these about one-half (for the reasons just given) are content to remain illiterate. Among the high caste Mahomedans there is a considerable proportion whose intellectual aims are no higher than those of the depressed Brahmins and Chattris amongst Hindus. Probably the Kayasth or writing caste is the only caste in India, amongst whom the demand for education can be considered universal. But all the Kayasths of Oudh put together, male and female, young and old, make up only 1·3 per cent. of the total population, and hence the males of a school-going age make up the merest fraction. All things considered, the demand for vernacular education, even among the upper castes, is qualified by many limitations, and among the inferior castes it cannot be said to exist.

Allusion was made a few pages back to 303 entries in the school registers which were found to be fictitious. This is not the place to enter into a minute explanation as to why and how such entries came to be made. The truth is, an Inspector or Deputy Inspector can no more prevent false entries being occasionally made in school registers, than a Magistrate can prevent false evidence being given in his court. In both cases self-interest, (or rather what is supposed to be self interest), is the motive which leads to the practice; and in both cases the officer in charge does what he can to prevent or discover it. The teacher, being an ill-paid man, and having many persons depending on him for support, thinks very seriously about his pay. His salary, as he knows, depends partially, though by no means chiefly, on the attendance which he is able to shew in his books, and so, when persuasion fails, he is tempted to resort to fiction. In the attempts made by the inspecting officer to check this practice, no assistance is rendered by the inhabitants of the village, unless there happens to be some private enmity between the teacher and one of his neighbours, and in this case the neighbour will turn informant. It would appear that, as a general rule, the villagers do not think

much the worse of a teacher, if he employs a little strategy ;\* and it is well known that they will sometimes give him warning of the inspecting officer's approach, if he (the teacher) has not heard of it already. Fictitious registration at the Government village schools is one of the normal conditions of their being. The practice has been admitted in almost every annual report that has ever been published in the North-West and Oudh. For example, in the report for 1881-82, para 240, the following remark is made by the Director :—"The returns shew a decrease of more than 1,000 students in Government 'lower schools,' &c. \* \* \* The decrease may be attributed to a "great extent, at least to stricter registration," &c. There is, therefore, nothing strange in the discovery of 303 fictitious names out of a total of 3,327.

The practice of fictitious registration appears to warrant three inferences : (1) It would be obviously impossible for such a practice to prevail or continue, if the boys were not in league with the teachers, and if public opinion outside the school house did not consider it excusable. Hence, there is not much ground for hoping that our primary schools can be the means of raising the moral tone of village society. (2) The prevalence of this practice is only another indication of what has been already proved from the returns of caste and population, namely, that the schools in question do not meet any general want, and are not appreciated by the masses of the people. If the schools were really wanted by the community at large, there would be no occasion for the persuasion and pressure which are now so frequently employed, and which, when they fail, are discarded in favour of fiction. (3) The proportions of fictitious names castwise to the total fictitious

\* There are four different kinds of stratagem which have come within my own experience, and there may be many more :—(1) Sometimes a boy has two names ; one being the name pronounced over him by the purohit or family priest with the usual ceremonies about six days after birth ; and the other a nick name or pet name, by which his parents and others habitually call him. In such a case, two names can be made to do duty for one student. (2) Sometimes the same name is borne by several different boys in the village. In this case any ex-student, who happens to bear this name, can be brought in for examination, and be made to personate a fictitious

student entered under the same name in the attendance list. (3) Sometimes a boy who is in regular attendance at some indigenous *maktab* near at hand, is persuaded to have his name entered as a student of the Government school, and is presented as such for examination. (4) Sometimes the name entered in the register is a pure invention on the teacher's part, and answers to no person in the world.

No doubt this is a very imperfect list of the ways and devices of Hal-quabandi strategy, but it may serve to show how difficult it is to eradicate the practice.

enrolment correspond very nearly with the proportions of real names castewise to the total real enrolment :—

		Real.	Fictitious.
		21.06 per cent.	17.86 per cent
Mahomedans	...	21.06	29.41
Brahmins	...	22.10	13.57
Kayasths	...	15.28	9.34
Chattris	...	8.22	17.86
Trading castes	...	15.23	3.33
Artizan castes	...	7.46	2.34
Cultivating castes	...	3.81	1.97
Pastoral castes	...	1.84	1.97
Serving and Professional castes	...	2.30	2.35
Miscellaneous castes	...	2.70	
		100	100

The teachers have evidently been guided by a wise instinct as to the best way of not exciting suspicion. Knowing, as they naturally would, the castes which are most likely to attend school and would therefore be most expected to do so, they have assigned most of their fictitious students to the five castes standing at the head of the list, namely, Mahomedans, Brahmins, Kayasths, Chattris, and the trading castes. The correspondence is so close that it cannot have been the result of accident. It is, in fact the result of a laborious tabulation of over 3,000 names, the outcome of which was altogether unforeseen by those by whom the tabulation was made.

### *Sec. III.—Occupations of ex-students.*

The reader's attention is now invited to the *side-headings* of the statement given several pages back, near the commencement of the preceding section. These side-headings describe the occupations of the ex-students, as distinct from the castes of their parents, and it is to the consideration of this question, (the occupations, &c., of the ex-students), that the present section is devoted.

If the original intention of caste were strictly acted out, the occupation of a son and the caste of his father would be convertible terms. But this has long ceased to be the case in India.

From the analogies afforded by other nations in past and present times, it seems most probable that the distinctions of Indian caste were primarily based upon the distribution of hereditary functions. Functions were made hereditary to ensure that they should be efficiently performed, since, in the early stages of industry, the only mode in which skill could be acquired and transmitted was by filial imitation and paternal influence; and this mode of transmission has by no means become obsolete in the most advanced types of modern industry, nor will it ever become so. In order to give the fullest effect to the hereditary principle, certain safeguards

were added. Families exercising the same craft or trade, wherever their place of residence might happen to be among the towns and villages of India, became gradually united into distinct clans or tribes; and each of these established for itself certain peculiarities of worship, tradition, and marriage rites, to which members of other clans were not admitted.\* Hence intermarriage between clans exercising different functions was prohibited, and even intercourse in the matter of eating from the same dish was treated as an offence against society. Thus caste, in the full sense of the word, implied three sets of restrictions,—restrictions on occupation, restrictions on marriage, and restrictions on social intercourse,—the first being the essential purpose of caste, and the other two merely its safeguards and accessories. But in India the fundamental principle, transmission of functions, has long lost much of its original power, while the sentiment of clan-ship or tribal isolation has retained its old vigor undiminished. Thus caste is now determined by limitations of marriage and social intercourse much more than by limitations of function. The original purpose is falling more and more into the background; and the accessory elements have come prominently to the front.

Among the 3,024 ex-students, whose case we investigated, the most curious discrepancies between caste and function were found to exist. Those of the Brahmin caste were found in almost every shade of employment, from family priests, river-priests, Purán-readers, fortune-tellers, religious mendicants, &c.,—(all of which functions come well within the original status of the caste), to landlords, tenants, field-labourers, warriors, shop-keepers, bankers, writers, grass-cutters, cattle-grazers, cart-drivers, watchmen, cooks, &c., anything in short but what would entail ceremonial pollution with the consequent liability to loss of caste. The occupations of those ex-students, who belong to the Chattri caste, are equally various and mixed, though Chattris still retain their original prominence as the landlord caste. Kayasths have begun to give up the pen,—the once exclusive function of this caste,—and are now

---

\* The highest of all the Indian castes—the model on which the others were formed—was at first merely a body of men distinguished by profession or calling. The word *Brahma* simply meant hymn, prayer, devotional exercise: and *Brahman* originally meant one who composes such hymns, &c. Afterwards it came to mean the superintending priest at a sacrifice, as distinct from the three other orders of priests. Finally it came to stand for all varieties

of the priestly caste. The Hindu Scriptures admit in several places that *Brahman* originally signified not a difference of blood, but of functions. For example, see Muir's Texts, vol. I, p. 140. "Bhrigu replies:—There is no difference of 'castes. This world having been at first created by Brahma, purely 'Brahmanic, became afterwards separated into castes in consequence 'of works,' &c.

taking to agriculture, in which capacity some appear as landlords and others as tenants. One even appears in the humble and laborious capacity of a field-labourer, (the ordinary status of a Chamár or Pási); and another has emigrated as a coolie to Mauritius. There is scarcely any caste which does not now appear as a tenant-agriculturist, however incongruous such employment may be with its original functions. In this category I found members of the Pási or pig-rearing caste, of the Luniya or salt-making caste, of the Bári or caste of leaf-plate-makers, of the Bhát or minstrel caste, of the Goshayen or hermit caste, of the Ahir or pastoral caste, of the Baniya or trading caste, of the Behná or thread-making caste, of the Nái or barber caste, and many others, not to speak of the Brahmans, Kayasths, and Chattris already alluded to. The castes whose proper function it is to cultivate the land (namely, Muráo, Káclá, Kurmi, Lodhia, Máli, &c.) contribute only 80 out of the 518 ex-students now engaged as tenant-farmers, or less than sixteen per cent: they are thus far outnumbered, within their own speciality, by castes whose original function had no connection with theirs. To crown the confusion, we have Baniyas, Halwais, and other castes of shop-keepers working as agricultural labourers, a Tamoli (betelnut seller) attempting to learn English, Bháts (or bards) driving carts and holding the plough for hire, a Bhunja (or seller of parched grain) labouring in the fields, a Darzi (tailor) who has turned school-master, a Halwai (confectioner) who has risen or fallen to the same status, Kurmis who have turned native doctors, a Nái (barber) who has become a clerk in a public office, a Kalwár (spirit-seller) who has turned carpenter, another Kalwár who has descended to a field-labourer, an intellectual Kasí or butcher, an English-learning Pási or swineherd, dancing Mahomedans, wrestling Brahmins, and a singing Baniya. To what extent these discrepancies are the result of education, or of the struggle for existence, or of inheritance from parents, I could not determine. Each of these causes has no doubt contributed its quota to the general medley.

Most of the parents of our ex-students, to whatever caste they may belong or belonged, are or were engaged in agriculture. But most of their sons have taken to other callings. As the Government village-schools were established chiefly for the benefit of the agricultural classes, and indirectly for the improvement of agriculture itself, the aversion to agriculture displayed by our ex-students is a fact that deserves special notice.

Under the head of "Agriculturist" I include all, who either till the soil with their own hands or employ labour to do so. The term applies, therefore, to three different classes of men ;



landlords, tenants, and hired labourers. There are few men in Upper India, whatever caste they may belong to, who are not connected with the land in one or other of these senses, or in two of them combined; and there is a large number of men, who though their main occupation is non-agricultural, are yet engaged in agriculture (in one sense or another) as a secondary pursuit. Mr. Williams, in his Oudh Census Report for 1869, remarks as follows:—"Of the total Hindu population in Oudh, 61·1 per cent. are agriculturists, and 38·9 per cent. follow other professions and trades; as against 61·96 per cent. of agriculturists to 38·04 per cent of non-agriculturists in the North-Western Provinces. Again, of the total Mahomedan population in Oudh, 36·1 per cent. are agriculturists and 63·9 per cent. are non-agriculturists; while in the North-Western Provinces the figures are 39·6 per cent. and 60·4 per cent. respectively."\* These two results, elicited quite independently of each other, by different men and in different years, show how closely the economic and industrial condition of the people in the North-West resembles that of the people of Oudh; and how large a proportion of the inhabitants in both provinces is engaged in agriculture.

It should be observed, however, that the figures just quoted from the Oudh Census include the inhabitants of cities as well as those of villages and small market towns, whereas the places about which I am writing come under the latter denomination only. Moreover, it is not quite clear whether by "agriculturist" Mr. Williams meant one whose sole occupation is agriculture, or whether he included under that term one who combines agriculture with other forms of industry. Probably, too, during the 13 years which have passed since the Census Report of 1869 was written, the population of the North-West and Oudh has been growing more agricultural than it was then: † for it is generally believed that the native industries, other than agriculture, have continued to decay, and that the pressure of population on the land has gone on increasing. I believe that in the thirteen villages, in which my enquiries were made, and in almost all other villages of the North-West and Oudh, the percentage of men engaged in agriculture, either exclusively

---

\* Oudh Census Report for 1869, Vol. I, page 35, paras 130, 131.

† Since the above remarks were written, the Report of the new Census of the North-West and Oudh, by Mr. Edmond White, has been

published. In Section XIX, p. 117, he writes: "Of the males returned with occupations, 69 per cent. belong to the agricultural class." The percentage shewn by Mr. Williams was smaller by 8.

er in combination with some other calling, is not less than 80 per cent. of the total rural population. \*

Now the avowed object, as we have already remarked, for which the Government village schools were established in the North West and Oudh, was the education of agriculturists. It was for the maintenance of these schools, that the "school-cess," (called in Oudh the "rural cess,") consisting of a local tax proportioned to the rent of landed properties, was levied; and it is for this reason that tuition fees have not been charged to the sons of agriculturists, while it has been considered just to charge them to the sons of shop-keepers, artizans, and others.† The education thus provided was not intended to make men abandon the pursuit of agriculture, but rather to make them more efficient and more intelligent within that calling, and to enable them to protect their rights and interests as landlords, or tenants, or labourers for hire. The best result that a teacher could show, (to adopt the language of Mr. Growse), "would be a long list of boys, who after learning "to read, write and cypher, had settled down contentedly to "their hereditary occupations, and had proved the value of their "education, by turning out their work in a more intelligent style "than their fathers had done before them".

It would appear, however, from the statistics shewn in the tabular statement given above, that this is not the end which is actually attained as the result of village education. The first three side-headings of that statement show that, of 3,024 ex-students, 75 are now engaged as proprietors or part-proprietors of land, 518 as tenants, and 49 as field-labourers,—which gives a total of only 642 ex-students engaged in agriculture. It was clearly ascertained that none of the remaining ex-students, 2,386 in number, have any connexion with agriculture either as a main or as a secondary calling, but are either doing nothing or are engaged in some pursuit or pursuits, of which agriculture forms no part §

\* Mr. H. C. Irwin, in his *Garden of India*, Chap. II., p 31, says:—"The "land of Oudh, the cultivation of "which affords their *only* means of "subsistence to nearly three-fourths "of the people," &c. This implies that nearly 75 per cent. are engaged in agriculture only.

† This is true of the North-West Provinces. In Oudh, however, tuition fees are levied from agriculturists also, so far as they can afford to pay them.

‡ Extract from a minute on the

Education question by Mr. F. S. Growse, C. I. E., Collector and Magistrate of Bulandshahr, Meerut division. This minute was placed before the Education Commission during their tour through the North-West Provinces.

§ The total balance, after deducting the 642 agriculturists, is 2,582. But from this we have still to deduct the 196 ex-students, who have died. This leaves the balance of 2,386 shewn in the text.

The proportions, then, between the ex-students and their parents, if we compare them profession-wise, are as follows :—

	<i>Agriculturists.</i>	<i>Non-Agriculturists.</i>
Parents.	... 61 per cent.	39 per cent.
Their sons.	... 21 per cent.	79 per cent.

Thus, if the son of an agriculturist goes to school, the chances are about 3 to 1, that after leaving school, he will not take to agriculture, but either do nothing or seek for some other kind of work. Even this estimate is probably below the mark; for (as I have explained already) there is reason to think that in the villages of the North-West and Oudh, not less than 80 per cent. of the total village population is partially or wholly engaged in agriculture. I am certain, too, that many, probably more than half, of those 642 ex-students who are now engaged in that pursuit, would leave it if they could, and accept of any kind of light work or service which would bring them in a steady salary of from Rs. 6 to 8 per mensem.

The rest of the side-headings show the present occupation or condition of those 2,286 ex-students who have no connexion with agriculture. Three hundred and eighty-three, (or 12·6 per cent.) are keeping shops; 167 (or 5·6 per cent.) are practising some kind of handicraft; 85 (or 2·6 per cent.), most of whom are Brahmins, are engaged in the administration of religious rites; 248 (or 8·3 per cent.) are engaged in some form of literary service, as accountants, salesmen, mohurrirs, teachers at Government schools, teachers at indigenous schools, &c.; 417 (or 13·9 per cent.) are engaged in some of the many forms of non-literary service as peons, watchmen, house servants, cart drivers, camel keepers, washermen, tailors, &c.; 115 (or 3·9 per cent.) have gone off to indigenous schools to study Sanskrit, Persian, or Kuthbi, or the native system of arithmetic, after having acquired all that they could learn or all that they cared to learn at the Government school; 240 (or 8 per cent.) are still studying at Government vernacular schools either in their own or in some other village; 31 (or 1 per cent.) are studying or attempting to study English; 68 (or 2 per cent.) are earning their bread in various kinds of occupations not already named, such as dancing, singing, wrestling, cattle-grazing, &c.; 296 (or 9·8 per cent.) are doing nothing, but are living on the labours of others; 137 (or 4·6 per cent.) may possibly be doing something, but their occupation or present condition was not known to any one in the village. One hundred and ninety-six (or 6·5 per cent.) are known to have died.

It must not be supposed that all of these have remained in their native villages after leaving school. No less than 859,

or more than 28 per cent. have gone away ; and particulars as to their present occupation or status could only be learnt from persons in the villages. There has certainly not been much inclination on the part of our ex-students "to settle down contentedly to their hereditary callings,"—one of the main results that village education (according to Mr. Growse) is intended to produce. A few of the ex-students are now in prison ; but it is only those of the Brahmin caste that enjoy this bad distinction.

Another fact to be noticed is, that school-attendance has in many cases not been continuous, but has been interrupted, once or more than once, by intervals of several months' absence, and then renewed again. No less than 912, or more than 30 per cent. of the ex-students about whom I am writing, belong to this category. Some have rejoined as many as six times in the course of their educational career : and, on comparing the class registers of one year with those of another, I found that some students at the time of finally leaving school belonged to a class lower than that in which they had studied at a former period. Sickness is no doubt one cause, on account of which a student's name might be withdrawn for a time and then re-entered. But this alone will not explain the facts to which I have just alluded. The other causes at work are the following :—( 1 ) If the attendance of the student is voluntary, that is, if he aspires to obtain some kind of literate employment, (for this is the only motive for which secular instruction is sought for in these provinces), he rejoins school again and again, as often as he can, in order to keep up his knowledge. For from the moment that he leaves school, he becomes aware of the fact, that outside the school-house he has nothing to read, nothing to write, and nothing to count, and finding that he is rapidly forgetting everything that he learnt,—the inevitable result of living in a state of society where there is scarcely any scope for the utilization of knowledge,—he returns to school and rejoins the ranks of students. (2) The other case is that of a student whose attendance was not really voluntary from the first. Such students (and their number is by no means small,) do not attend because they desire to do so, but because, (as I explained several pages ago), they are pressed by the influential men of the village, or by the nearest local official, or by the school master himself. They leave the school whenever their presence can be spared, and only rejoin it when their presence has again become necessary, that is, when the total attendance has become so slack as to threaten the existence of the school, or damage the credit of those who are interested in maintaining it. It is not to be wondered at that such students pay as little attention as possible to their studies,

and sometimes finally leave the school from a class lower than that in which they had been enrolled at a former period.

The number of ex-students, who, instead of returning to the plough or the workshop, are at this very time continuing their studies at other schools—indigenous, Government vernacular, or English—is another indication of the aversion, with which manual labour is regarded by a man who considers himself educated. These amount altogether to 386, or 12·8 per cent. of the whole. This, at the present time only. If we could discover the number who, in all the years preceding the present, continued their education, or attempted to continue it, after leaving their village school, the percentage would be very much higher. If to this percentage we could add those who remained idle, neither working with their hands nor continuing their studies, the percentage would be larger still. Even at the present time, the number of ex-students who are following no occupation is 296 or 9·8 per cent. Does not this give some countenance to the opinion expressed by the Tahsildar at Talimabad? “*Eas ; Kharāb ko jāte hain.*” Does it not justify the impression formed by Major Grigg respecting the young Kurmi at Bachiāwan? “It struck me at the time that it had been far better, had the youth never seen the inside of the vernacular school.”\*

This disinclination to physical labour on the part of educated men is usually ascribed to a semi-barbarous Eastern prejudice, to which no consideration should be shown. I am informed, however, by natives on whose intelligence and accuracy I can rely, that field labour under an Indian sun is very exhausting for most months of the year to those who have not been inured to it from childhood, and that a youth, whose boyhood has been spent under the shelter of a school-house, and whose muscles have been relaxed by study, does not possess the physical strength and endurance which field labour (if it is to be remunerative) demands, and, in short, that an educated man is not able to compete as a tiller of the soil with his illiterate neighbours. If this is the case, we ought to feel pity rather than contempt for the young Kurmi who, after completing the curriculum at school, was forced “to mortgage his estate to obtain the wherewithal to pay the labourers employed to till the ancestral lands.” The tropical sun is perhaps the physical explanation of the curse pronounced on labour in the book of Genesis, and of the deeply-rooted conviction as to the antagonism between labour and learning, which has prevailed from the earliest times in

---

\* These two cases were described in detail in the previous article, as the reader will probably remember.

all countries of Southern Asia, from Palestine to China. The compatibility of manual labour *in manhood* with the cultivation of the mind in *boyhood* is one of the greatest blessings, which our own temperate climate affords; but this should not lead us to misjudge the peasantry of tropical countries like India, which in this respect are far less favourably situated. In the East the faculties of the mind and body ripen at a much earlier age than in the West: and hence a boy, after leaving school, cannot take to the plough with the same physical energy or with the same mental inclination as one who has never seen the inside of a school-house.

Even in England, however, although the physical energies of the boy-student are not impaired by a few years' study at the village school, and although the sun is invariably the friend and not the enemy of the working man,—yet even there the taste for farm labour has been considerably weakened of late years by the spread of education among the agricultural classes. "The farmers complain much," as my informant writes, "of the compulsory system established by the Board Schools: it has greatly affected the labour market: farm labourers have become scarce, and they have not the same skill that they used to have; and, as a rule, they have no liking for work." My attention has also been drawn to an extract from the XVIIIth Volume of the "Journal of the Royal Agricultural Society" of England published in 1882,\* which runs as follows:—"There is a very general complaint among farmers that the present system of education operates prejudicially to the interests of agriculture. Boys, it is said, are kept at school at an age at which they might be usefully employed upon the farm, and be thus acquiring habits and tastes which would fit them for farm service. As it is, the standard of education is so fixed that not only are the first years of industrial training lost before a boy can attain it; but when he does attain it, he acquires with it a desire for what he regards as more suitable occupation; so that the class which was formerly trained into farm service is now gradually absorbed into other industries. Farmers very naturally complain of this; as in districts, where there are school boards, they have to pay for education which not only deprives them for the present of the labour of boys and obliges them to pay men's wages for boys' work, but tends to drain from the land the sources of future labour."

---

\* This volume records "the abstract conclusions arrived at by the Royal Commission on Agriculture."

The most natural remedy for this state of things would be to apply "the half-time principle" to the instruction of the sons of farm labourers, and by thus shortening the time to lower the standard and confine it to a strictly elementary course in reading, writing, and cyphering. By this means half the day would be given to farm work and the other half to schooling. But, admitting the expediency of such a compromise in a country like ours, it is not easy to see how the same rule could be usefully applied to the agricultural classes in India. For here, in India, the irrepressible question still crops up,—of what use is a strictly primary education to the tenant farmer or farm labourer, even when he has acquired it? The English cultivator, if he learns to read only a little, can take part in public worship on Sunday; but in India there is no literate worship in vogue. He can read the Bible at home (the easiest book in the language); but in India the books which answer nearest to the Bible (the Purāns, &c.), are written in a difficult and almost obsolete style, which none but well educated natives can understand. He can read the newspaper at the village clubs; but in India there are no such clubs or reading-rooms, and no newspapers are ever seen in villages. He can read his grocer's bill, or see the shop-keeper's name on the door; but in India tradesmen do not write bills for village-customers or put their names on shop-doors, and farm-labourers are to a large extent paid in kind, not in cash. He can read notices on matters affecting the parish in which he lives; but in India no notices are ever seen in villages except those which come from the Government court, and these are expressed in terms which only a well educated man can interpret; moreover, it is not tenants and labourers, but landlords, who are concerned in such notices. He can read the announcements put forth by rival candidates at the time of a general election; but in India no such announcements appear for there is no political life. He can read a letter received from a distance, if it is written legibly in a simple style; but in India villager, whose status is below that of a landlord or tradesman, seldom or never receives a letter throughout his whole life. In England, for the last two or three centuries at least, there has been a leaven of intelligence and enlightenment permeating the whole structure of society and making its way downwards more and more from the thinking classes above to the working classes below; but in India, (at least in Upper India), there has been

---

\* This is the remedy suggested *Fortnightly Review* for November 1882, p. 617, in article on "British Agriculture in 1882." by Hon. G. C. Brodrick, in his comments on the above extract, in the

nothing of the kind. \* In England the most elementary books available to the working classes are of the richest, most varied, useful, and attractive description, written (as they often are) by the best men of the age, the leaders of modern thought and research; † but in India there is no primary literature, but what is of the most meagre and paltry kind, and no vernacular literature above it, but what is difficult, fantastic, antiquated, and (so far as modern research is concerned) obsolete and useless to the last degree. In short, in England, a very elementary degree of instruction will carry a man a long way and through a great variety of paths, if he chooses to use it; while in India, it will carry him nowhere. Of

\* I have been obliged to qualify this remark by adding the words *in Upper India*, because in Bengal (or as it is called the Lower Provinces) the case is somewhat different. Here there *has* been a leaven of intelligence working downwards from the upper to the lower classes for the last 50 years or more. The extraordinary spread of English education has given a great impetus to vernacular literature, not only raising its tone and giving it new directions, but adding greatly to its quantity. The Educational Department in Bengal used at one time to be blamed for having begun with colleges and high schools and neglected the masses, while that of the North-West was eulogized for commencing with elementary schools. Time, however, has now decided which course was the right one. Primary education in Bengal is now far a-head of that in the North-West. There are more primary schools, more books, better books, and more readers. The leaven of intelligence which began from the top is steadily working its way down, as it did in England, and a general spread of intelligence is the result. One of the best things that English colleges and schools did in Bengal was to oust Urdu from the Government courts, and substitute Bengali, the language of the people, in its place. Thus, in the Lower Provinces the instruction which the son of a peasant can acquire in a village school, opens out to him the language of the courts, besides giving him a respectable literature in addition. Things are on a very different footing in Upper India. Here English education has made no impression; vernacular literature is stationary; Urdu still reigns in the courts; and Kaithi, the character chiefly used by the people, is thrust aside.

There are other causes, however, which have contributed to the spread of primary education in Bengal. The working classes are not so poor as they are in Upper India. The soil is more fertile: and the extremes of heat and cold are less severe.

† This remark has been borrowed from the evidence given by Dr. French, the Bishop of Lahore, before the Educational Commission. He says:—  
“When a man like Dr. Whately devoted his original and transcendent powers to write books for little children, bringing down fragments at least of the deepest truth to the level of the most popular and childish comprehension, and men like Thirlwall and Whewell (not to speak of Faraday and Huxley) delighted to cause science to talk intelligently and charmingly to children, we seem to have indications supplied us, and high hopes advanced and inspired, of what may yet be accomplished by the Governments taking advantage of the new devotion and enthusiasm which has taken possession of the leading young aspirants to honors in our English Universities,” &c.



what use, then, is a strictly primary education to a working man in India, even when he has gained it? This is the question that lies at the root of all schemes for extending mass education in this country. Let those answer it who can.

Agriculture is the chief, but not the only, industry in which the working classes in this part of India are engaged. Next to agriculture we should place the various kinds of handicrafts,—rope-making, weaving, oil-making, pottery, carpentry, masonry, basket-making, shoe-making, the arts of the tinman, the brazier, the ironsmith, and the goldsmith. All of these are more or less represented at the villages and market towns in which Government vernacular schools have been established. Education is not less detrimental to the successful practice of these arts than it is to agricultural labour. In both cases the acquired disinclination to manual work is the same ; but in the case of the handicrafts it is not the tropical sun which acts as the chief deterrent, (for most of the handicrafts are practised under shelter), but the want of manual skill. Dr. Birdwood has pointed out that in India every thing is handwrought ; \* and in his chapter on “the master handicrafts of India,” he draws attention to the contrast between the *manual* skill of the Indian artizan and the constantly increasing use of *machinery* in the arts and industries of Europe. If a child is taken out of his father’s workshop, and is made to spend the best years of his boyhood in mastering the school curriculum, he loses the only chance that he ever had, or ever can have, of acquiring his father’s skill. The capacity for imitation is much stronger in early boyhood than in after years ; and this (as every one must have observed) is especially the case in India, where the tastes and faculties of a child, physical as well as mental, are formed for life at a much earlier age than in the temperate zone. Early and rapid development, followed by a long period of stagnation, is the law of nature in the East ; and this is as true of the individual to-day as it has been in times past of eastern nations generally.

The best and largest workshops in Oudh are those of the Oudh and Rohilcund Railway at Lucknow. In these there is abundant scope for intelligent workmanship, combined with artistic skill. In order to find out what part, if any, education has played in adding to the intelligence and forming the characters of the best workmen employed, I went through the several departments of these workshops, and had personal conversations with the men, under the guidance of one of the chief European officers of the Company. The following are a few particulars, which I noted down

---

\* Part II, “Industrial Arts of India,” page 1.

with his assistance, respecting the best workmen under his control :—

Mahomed Ali, a Shaik of the Sunni sect. Jamadar of coolies. Totally illiterate, but intelligent and trustworthy.

Chedi, a Lohár by caste. His work is that of a fitter. A "first-class leading hand" (to use the phrase of the Railway work-hops); has about forty-five men working under his orders, he himself (like the other leading hands) receiving his orders from the European foreman or superintendent. Has never been at school. He can read nothing; but he can jot down the technical terms of his art in the Kaithi character, and he did not learn this little at school, but picked it up by self-study and private tuition.

Raghu Nath, a Brahmin by caste, perfectly illiterate. Has been in the workshops since he was eight years of age: a fitter,—not a leading hand like the preceding, but a first-rate workman.

Ram-ud-Din, Lohár by caste. Boiler-maker. A first-class leading hand, and has about ninety men working under him. He informed us that he had never been at school, but had once commenced learning the Hindi character with his father. He cannot now read or write anything, and is totally illiterate.

Laltá, a boiler-maker like preceding;—not a leading hand, but an excellent workman. Totally illiterate. Has been employed for about fifteen years continuously in the workshops.

Sheo Din, a fitter. A first-class leading hand, with some 70 men under him. Has been some 10 years in the workshops. Was never at school in his life. Totally illiterate, except that he can scribble a little Kaithi, the knowledge of which he picked up by himself.

Bulli, another fitter. A first-class leading hand, with about 20 men under him at the present time. Has now the repairs of four engines in hand. Could once write a little Kaithi which he learnt at home, but has now forgotten even that, and is totally illiterate.

Khirode, a Muráo (or cultivator) by caste, and his father is cultivating the fields to this day. A first-class leading hand, with fourteen men under him at this time. A native of the Lower Provinces. Was never at school in his life, but picked up a little Bengali by himself, just as the natives of Upper India pick up Kaithi, if they care to know it.

Ram Khilál, a turner, and by caste a Lohár. A first-class leading hand, with about 150 men under him. Was never at school, but has taught himself a little Kaithi, in which character he can transliterate the technical terms of his art, and take shorthand memos of orders, &c., which he wishes to record.

Sohodar, a blacksmith, and of the Lohár caste. A first-class leading hand, with from 350 to 400 men under him. Is totally illiterate, and cannot even write his name.

Ram Kissen, of the same caste and function as the preceding. A very good workman. Totally illiterate.

Nizam-ud-din, a Shaik of the Sunni sect. A brass-moulder. A first-class leading hand, with 25 men at present under him. Totally illiterate.

Lodi, a Brahmin by caste. A bolt machineman. Commenced his service with the Railway Company as a supplier of drinking water to the workmen of the various castes. Now, a first rate workman. Totally illiterate.

Kedi Ram, iron moulder, a Kayasth by caste. A first-class leading hand, with a large number of men under him. A native of Moorshedabad. Left school at a very early age on account of the death of his father, but can still write the vernacular neatly,—the only man in the workshops who was found able to do so.

**Karim, a Pathan.** A moulder of ten years' training in the workshops. Was never at school in his life, but a good workman.

**Santu, a Barhai by caste.** Pattern-maker. A first-class leading hand, with some 15 or 20 men under him. He not only makes patterns in wood, but draws models in first rate style on paper. In the art of drawing he was purely self-taught. Was never at school in his life. A native of Fyzabad, Oudh.

**Mehi Lal, another Barhai, a native of Mahona, in the Lucknow district,** where there is one of the best Vernacular schools in Oudh. Was never at school in his life. Has been ten years in the Railway workshops. A first-class leading hand in carriage-building, and has some 80 men under him.

It would be unnecessary to add to the list : for I have already described all the "leading hands" that are employed in these workshops. These are the most intelligent, the most skilful, and the most trustworthy workmen in the Company's service. Not one of them (with the exception of the Kayasth, who left school in early boyhood) has ever seen the inside of a school-house. My guide and I could not discover a single man or boy in the workshops, who had studied at a vernacular school in any part of these provinces, or elsewhere. Men are employed and paid, as he explained, according to their intelligence, honesty, and skill ; and the question as to whether a man has been educated or not, is never raised or considered to be worth raising. \*

A number of little boys varying from eighty to a hundred are employed in light work in the same workshops, and are receiving two or three pice a day each. Not one of them has seen the inside of a school-house. Professor Huxley has somewhere expressed the opinion, that the most illiterate man, whose work has taught him something of the laws of nature, is more educated in fact, and has a keener appreciation of truth, than one who has merely learnt to read and write at an elementary school. Probably, if the professor were now in Lucknow, he would affirm that the railway workshops, which are employing some 80 boys and some 2,000 men a day, are doing more to educate the masses of this city than the municipal schools. He would be still more convinced of this, if he looked to the good which these workshops are doing, in teaching punctuality, application to details, thoroughness of workmanship—in short, in forming the character, which after all is the main result that education is intended to secure.

---

\* He explained to me, however, that the Company attach considerable value to a knowledge of English, as all their rules and regulations, and

all their technical terms are on the basis of this language. I actually found two men who knew English.

*Sec. IV.—Examination of ex-students.*

The third, and perhaps the most important question, to which I endeavoured to find an answer, was :—"What amount of knowledge have the students retained since leaving school?"

The only way to obtain a definite answer to this question was to call together at each of the 13 villages as many of the ex-students as were willing or able to come, and to examine them one by one in certain standards specially prepared for the purpose. This was accordingly done.

It has been already shewn that the total number of ex-students from these 13 schools was 3,024, and that 859 of these, or nearly one-third, had left their homes in search of employment, or for further education. This left 2,165 ex-students within reach of the proposed examination. Out of this number 1,037 came to be examined, leaving 1,028 who declined or were unable to appear. The examinations which were held included, therefore, a little more than half of all the ex-students who were still living at their own villages. It is to be regretted that so many as half remained unexamined; but one thing is certain. Those who consented to undergo the test were, as a rule, much more likely to pass it, than those who declined; for the chief reason that led them to decline was the dislike to having their ignorance exposed. The results, therefore, which I shall have to record respecting the better half who were examined, are decidedly more favourable than they would have been, had the inferior half been examined with them.

To expect that a village schoolboy would retain, after he has left school, a recollection of the events and dates which he learned in history, or remember the names of distant places and countries which lie entirely outside the range of his ordinary thoughts, would have been unreasonable. The chief use, which the elementary study of history and geography can be said to possess to a village student, is that it helps to open his mind and contributes something to the material on which his intellectual faculties are trained. The strength thus imparted to his reasoning powers can be, and is, retained, even if the material upon which they were strengthened has been forgotten,—just as the muscles of the body retain the strength that they have acquired by use, although the process of acquiring it is not remembered in after years. I therefore excluded these subjects altogether from the examination, and reserved only those which (to use the language of the late Mr. Mill) constitute the "instruments" of knowledge, as distinct from knowledge itself,—namely, reading, writing, and arithmetic. The object was to find to what extent these instruments of knowledge had been retained: for if even these are lost, it cannot be

said that anything in the shape of knowledge has survived. A man who has so far forgotten what he learnt at school that he can neither read, nor write, nor cypher, has in fact become as illiterate as if he had never seen the inside of a school house.

The standards, then, which I selected for the examination were the following :

*A. Reading*—1st. or lowest standard : to read one or two sentences from a newspaper printed in the examinee's own vernacular.

2nd Standard : to read a short letter written in ordinarily good style and in the Nagri or Urdu characters.

3rd Standard : to read a business paper, written in a legible hand, such as a kabuliyat (agreement or lease given by a tenant-cultivator to a landlord), or a pattā (the counterpart to the preceding), or a tamassuk (mortgage), or a baināma (deed of sale), &c.

*B. Writing* : three standards, of a graduated scale of difficulty, corresponding to the above ; the first being dictation from a newspaper ; the second, the composition of a short letter to a friend ; the third, the composition of a business paper or letter.

*C. Arithmetic.* 1st standard : to work out a question in Simple Long Division.

2nd Standard : to work out a question in Compound Long Division.

3rd Standard : to work out a question in Simple Rule of Three, or Simple Interest, or Partnership ; the question to involve the use of a Vulgar Fraction.

In explanation of this scheme of standards it should be pointed out that Primary Vernacular schools in the North-West and Oudh have from the first been divided into five classes, of which the three lower ones constitute the "Lower Section," and the two remaining ones the "Upper Section." Before leaving the Lower Section a boy finishes the four Simple and Compound Rules, reads and practises a letter-writer adapted to ordinary use, and writes to dictation from this book, or from such easy colloquial prose as may be found in a newspaper. This course, therefore, covers the ground of the 1st and 2nd standards just described. In the Upper Section a boy finishes the remaining rules of arithmetic, reads two or three books containing collections of court papers and letters of business, and practises the composition of such letters. This course, therefore, covers the ground of the 3rd and highest of the three standards. All other subjects that are taught in the Upper Section (such as history of India, general geography, grammar, poetry, and mensuration of surfaces), were, for the reasons already given, excluded from the scope of the examination.

It must be further explained that the examination in writing was confined to the Nagri and Persian characters. The other vernacular characters, Kaithi and Mahajani, (both of which are much in vogue in these provinces), were excluded altogether from the scheme. The Nagri character for Hindi students and the Persian character for Urdu students are the only forms of the Vernacular which our schools are allowed to teach ;\* and as the object, for which this examination was held, was to test the value of the teaching given at Government schools as distinct from that given at indigenous ones, it was necessary to restrict the examination accordingly.

On the same grounds the examination in Arithmetic was restricted to Simple Long Division in the lowest standard, and to Compound Long Division in the second standard. Neither of these rules is taught in indigenous schools or by private tuition ;† and the inclusion of these two rules in the Government curriculum is considered, (like the exclusion of Kaithi), to be a mark of the superiority of Government schools over indigenous ones. Even Multiplication is not taught in native schools on precisely the same plan as in our own : and the only two rules, in which the two systems entirely tally, are Addition and Subtraction.

Such, then, was the scheme of standards prepared for the examination ; and the result was as follows :—Out of 1,037 examinees, 172 (or 16 per cent.) passed in one or more of the three subjects, (reading, writing, and cyphering), and in one or other of the three grades of difficulty. All the remaining examinees, 869 in number (or 84 per cent. of the whole) failed to pass in any one subject or in any one standard of difficulty. The degrees of failure, as I need scarcely add, were not uniformly equal. Some could read really nothing, others could read a little, but not without making two or three blunders in every line. The same in writing, and dictation.

The number, who passed in reading and writing respectively, was almost equal, as might be expected,—163 in the one, and 166 in the other. The number who passed in Arithmetic was 123, or about 40 less than those who passed in reading and writing.

---

\* In the schools of the North-West, the teaching of Kaithi has never been allowed from the first. In the Oudh schools, it was not allowed at all in the early days of the department, and lately only in the lowest classes.

† Multiplication and Division are

taught conjointly by means of Fractional parts, and the Multiplication Table by whole numbers is carried up as far as 40 times 40, and in some cases much higher. The tables are committed to memory ; and the calculation of any given problem is made very rapidly.

Details as to the castes of the pupils who passed are shown in tabular form as follows:—

•	Reading in standards.			Writing in standards.			Arithmetic in standards.			Total number of passed examinees.
	I. II. III.			I. II. III.			I. II. III.			
	I.	II.	III.	I.	II.	III.	I.	II.	III.	
Mahomedans of high caste ...	20	20	16	19	26	17	22	18	6	62
Brahmins ...	8	7	9	6	9	9	2	5	6	26
Chattris ...	5	2	5	5	3	4	4	5	1	12
Kayasths ...	9	9	9	10	10	9	12	7	6	29
Trading castes ...	13	8	4	11	8	4	7	11	4	26
Artizan castes ...	5	3	0	5	3	0	3	1	0	11
Cultivating castes ...	0	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1
Pastoral castes ...	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Serving castes ...	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous castes ...	2	1	1	4	1	0	2	1	0	5
Total	62	57	44	61	62	43	52	48	23	172

In this statement the same system of caste-divisions has been observed as that employed in the preceding pages. The first five consist of the upper castes, (namely, Mahomedans of a certain stamp, Brahmins, Chattris, Kayasths, and the trading castes, chiefly Baniyas) : while the last five consist of the lower castes, (namely, the artizan castes of all kinds, the cultivating castes, the pastoral castes, the serving castes, and miscellaneous castes not included in any of these). It will be observed that the first five contribute no less than 155 pass-men, or 90 per cent. of the whole : while the remaining five contribute only 17 pass-men, or 10 per cent. of the whole. This corroborates the conclusion which was established by the statistics previously shown,—that it is only the upper castes, and only particular members of these, who attach any real value to education, and that all the remaining castes are indifferent to it, and only attend school, if they attend it at all, either by compulsion or by an illusion. The statement given in section II showed that the higher castes contribute 82 per cent. of the school-goers and the lower 18 per cent. The statement now given shews that the higher castes contribute 90 per cent. of the passed examinees, and the lower castes 10 per cent. In other words, very few boys of the inferior castes ever go to school at all ; and of these few, fewer still remember anything after they have left it. Only one student of the cultivating castes passed an examination in reading and writing.

The total number of pass-men from the inferior and upper castes combined was, as we have shown already, only 172, or 16 per cent. of all the 1,037 ex-students who were examined. The real result, however, was a good deal worse ; firstly because the 1,037 who underwent the examination were more likely to pass than the 1,028 who held aloof from it ; and secondly, because the number 172 includes those who left school recently, as well as those who left it long ago. The former should of course be deducted : for until a man's knowledge has been submitted to the test of time, we cannot assume that he would be able to read or cypher six or eight years hence.

If, then, we distinguished the pass-men from each other by the different dates at which they left school, the result is as follows :—

Pass-men who left in 1873 or previously	...	...	...	75
" " 1874-76	...	...	...	20
" " 1877-79	...	...	...	37
" " 1880, and since	...	...	...	40
Total.				172

Deducting the 40 pass-men who left school in 1880 or since, the total is reduced to 132. If we further deduct the 37 who left



school in 1877 or since, the total is reduced to 95. Ninety-five pass-men out of 1,037 examinees gives only about 9 per cent ; and this can hardly be considered a satisfactory return for all the trouble and expense incurred in producing it.

In point of fact it is not possible that any student can permanently retain what he learns at school, unless he is either engaged in some kind of occupation which keeps him in constant practice, or studies of his own accord some religious book at home. In the absence of one or other of these conditions, the question of his retaining what he learnt is merely a question of time. There are very few of our ex-students who belong to either category ; and hence it should be no matter of surprise that 865 out of 1,037 could neither read, nor write, nor cypher even in the lowest and easiest standard prepared for the examination. I made a note of every ex-student, who (so far as I could learn) had either obtained some kind of literate employment since leaving school, or practised the study of religious books privately at home : and it was found that the total number of men so engaged almost coincided with the number of pass-men. The result is herewith exhibited in the following form :—

			Pass-men,
Those who left in 1873 or previously	Literary service or occupation...	54	
	Study of religious books	16	
Total.		70	... 75
Those who left in 1874-76.	Literary service or occupation	11	
	Study of religious books	5	
Total.		16	20
Those who left in 1877-79	Literary service or occupation	18	
	Study of religious books	6	
Total.		24	34

Thus in each of the three periods shown above, (for there was no need to take into account the fourth and most recent period, namely, 1880-82), almost every instance of passing is accounted for either by the occupation of the ex-student, or by private reading at home. Cases to the contrary do sometimes occur, as the above figures show ; but these are so rare and exceptional, that they do not affect the validity of the general rule ; \* and

\* The following examples may be quoted as instances of men, who passed the examination, in spite of the fact that they neither had any literate employment nor studied religious books at home. At Goshayanganj

there was a Tamoli (seller of betel-nut) who practised nothing but the simplest account-keeping in his shop, and who studied no Puran at home, and yet this man passed high in reading, writing and cyphering.

(it will be observed) they chiefly occur among the pass-men who left school in 1877-79, and not among those who left at an earlier date. I enquired of many of the ex-students who failed, how it was that they had so completely forgotten the instruction they had received at school; and the almost invariable answer was:—*Kam nahin parta*, "We have had no occasion to use it": which is good as saying that to persons situated, as most of the villagers in this country are, education is useless.

With one exception there is not a single newspaper that ever finds its way to any of the 13 villages at which these enquiries were made. Particular care was taken to investigate this point. The one exception noted is Amethi, and here newspapers are sometimes seen, not because any one goes to the expense of subscribing for them, but because one of the residents happens to be nearly related to the proprietor of the *Oudh Punch*, who receives several newspapers *gratis* in exchange for his own. Perhaps it is not generally known how very small and unimportant the vernacular press is. In the North-West, Oudh, and the Punjab the number of vernacular papers of all kinds is 81, with an aggregate of only 20,500 subscribers; while the total population of the three provinces named exceeds 60,000,000. Of these 81 papers 67 are published weekly or bi-weekly. There are altogether only two daily newspapers, and these count only 1,700 subscribers between them.\* The best newspaper in Oudh (the *Oudh Akhbār*) does not pay its expenses, as the proprietor has informed me: such is the dearth of readers in Upper India. At the close of the year 1882, the total number of vernacular newspapers published in the whole length and breadth of India, was only about 270, with an aggregate of only 110,000 subscribers,—an insignificant number for a country which is said to possess a population of over 250,000,000 souls. Those persons, who are inclined to measure the educational wants of India by those of England, would do well to compare the above figures with the statistics of the cheap daily press in our own country. "The daily circulation of the *Daily Telegraph*,

It turned out that his shop was next door, and in fact contiguous, to the school house, and that he had been in the habit, ever since he left school, of taking his place among the boys, whenever he had the leisure, and keeping up his old studies. Another singular case was that of a Mahomedan butcher at Amethi, who astonished the audience by passing well in reading and writing. This man must either have an extra-

ordinarily retentive memory, or he must have had opportunities of private reading, which he did not care to disclose.

\* These figures are taken from a notice on the "circulation and influence of the native press," which appeared originally in the *Englishman*, Calcutta, and which was reprinted in the *Pioneer*, Allahabad, on 28th February 1883.

"recently certified by public accountants, averages over 260,000. The weight of paper used each morning is 21 tons, which laid out in one long line would reach 260 miles." \* \* \*

"The amount of paper used during the year 1880 for the *Morning Standard* was 3,412 tons, equal to a length of 36,609 miles, and for the *Evening Standard* 865 tons, equal to a length of 13,377 miles,—the two quantities making a total of 4,277 tons and 46,986 miles of paper in the year, or an average of 13 tons and 160 miles a day." \* \* \*

"The circulation of the *Daily News* rose in a single week from 50,000 to 150,000 per diem, and its present sale must be about 200,000 a day, if not more.\*" Quotations to this effect might be multiplied to almost any extent. It is not only in the metropolis and the large provincial towns that cheap newspapers abound, but almost every small town has its own local organ, and almost every village has its reading room, to which the farmer and farm-labourer can resort. To this state of things India presents no parallel; nor can she be expected to do so for centuries to come, perhaps never.

What, then, is the *raison d'être* of the Government village schools. The avowed object of their establishment (as we explained above) was the education of the agricultural classes who pay the local rate or cess; for it is by this cess that the schools are maintained. But when we inquire as to the precise nature of the benefit intended to be conferred, it is not so easy to find a distinct answer. The only definite exposition, which I have myself been able to discover in all that has been written on the subject, is that which was given by Raja Siva Prasad, C. S. I., late Inspector of Schools in the Benares Division:—"The Baboo would convince his readers that our schools have not answered their avowed object of educating the agricultural classes. The Government has made great exertions to protect the rights in the land by defining their nature and extent, and by devising a system for their complete registration. The efficiency of this system depends on the ability of the people to comprehend it, and to take precautions that whatever affects themselves is correctly shown in the registers: and hence the need of village-schools. I can assure the Baboo, that if he will only take the trouble to examine these registers (the village jamabandis) he will find every one of the 28,312 agriculturists mentioned in the Inspector's report borne on them, either in his own name or in that of his father or guardian." (Quoted from para. 6 of

---

\* Extracts from *Journalistic London*: by Mr. J. Hutton, published by Sampson, Low & Co.

the reply, dated Benares, 20th January 1869, given by Raja Siva Prasad, then Inspector of the Benares Division, to the Report on the village schools of the North-Western-Provinces, by Baboo Bhudeb Mookerjee, published in Calcutta, 1868.)

Now, no one has ever doubted that the name of every tenant is borne on the registers kept by the Patwari ; for this functionary is compelled to register *all* such names in virtue of his office ; and he will accordingly do this for educated and uneducated tenants alike. But is it true that "the efficiency of the system," that is, (I presume), the correctness of the registers, depends upon the tenants being able to read them ? I think not ; and for the following reasons : (a) The Patwari's registers are not shewn to the tenants, before they are filed in the Tahsil office : so the tenants have no opportunity of reading the registers, to see whether their respective holdings have been correctly represented there or not. (b) Men who have studied no further than to what is called the Lower Primary Standard, (and these constitute more than 80 per cent. of all our village-students), would not be sufficiently educated to understand the registers, even if they saw them ; and even then, the form of the vernacular, in which the registers are kept, might not happen to be the same as that which the tenant was taught at school : for in these provinces the two forms of the vernacular are as different as Chinese and Greek, and the Patwari may write whichever he likes best. (c) A man, who has studied to what is called the Upper Primary Standard might be trusted to test a Patwari's registers, provided, firstly, that he could get a chance of seeing them, and provided, secondly, that they were kept in that form of the vernacular which happened to be known to himself. But such men almost invariably renounce agriculture as soon as they leave school ; so the argument does not apply. (d) Lastly, an officer (called the Qanungo, has been especially appointed by Government to see that the Patwari's registers are correctly kept. The special function of this officer is to take the registers to the fields and consult the villagers, and see with his own eyes that no false entries have been made. The Qanungo in his turn is supervised by the Tahsildâr, and the Tahsildar by the Deputy Collector or extra Assistant Commissioner. In the face of these facts it is rather startling to be told that the efficiency of the registration system depends upon the tenant, and not upon the machinery provided by the State.

The Educational Committees in the North-West Provinces have expressed their opinions very freely for the last 10 years or more as to the status and objects of the village-schools which they have been called upon to administer ; and these are published annually in the Director's reports. All kinds of propositions are put

forward by the different writers in reference to agricultural primers, sanitary primers, &c., &c. But I do not recollect to have ever once seen even a passing allusion to the subject of a Patwari primer or the testing of a Patwari's register. If the testing of these registers is the one great object for which village-schools were established, it is strange that no mention has been made of the fact for the last 10 years by the revenue officials who direct the educational committees.

The village-schools have indeed been a most conspicuous failure, if (as is alleged) the avowed object of their establishment was to put the Patwari in the power of the cultivator. I proved in Section II. that the cultivating castes proper, who make up 14·2 per cent. of the total population, contribute only 3·9 per cent. of the school-goers. I proved in Section III. that agriculture is the last occupation that our best village students, (those who alone would be able to test a Patwari's register), desire to enter or retain. I have proved in the present section (see statement a few pages back) that only *one* out of all the ex-students from the cultivating castes is at the present time able to read and write. These cultivating castes supply by far the best tenants to be found in Upper India: and yet they are unquestionably among the most illiterate. They are the backbone of the country,—the source from which the greater part of its wealth is produced; and I cannot but regard it as a fortunate circumstance, that they have remained steadfast to the useful traditions of their race, and have not been de-industrialized, as they certainly would have been, if they had come within contact of scholastic influences.

#### *Sec. V.—North-West and Oudh compared.*

In the preceding pages it has been assumed that what is true of Oudh is true of the North-West Provinces also. I cannot speak from much personal knowledge of the latter province. But the extracts, which I am about to quote from the published reports of District School Committees, will shew that the assumption was not unfounded. For there is no proposition of mine in reference to the village schools of Oudh, which does not find an echo in the reports of these North-West committees. The authors of these reports are revenue officials of local knowledge and experiences, who are eye-witnesses of what they relate, and whose descriptions of their respective districts are given quite independently of each other. The value of their testimony is therefore beyond question.

In saying this, however, I do not wish to imply that the gentlemen, from whose reports I am about to quote, have thought

out the entire subject of primary education from the same point of view as myself, or come to the same conclusions. But this raises rather than lowers the value of their testimony: for writers are seldom so instructive, as when they are writing without bias and throw out remarks incidentally, from which others may draw inferences not intended by themselves. To avoid prolixity, I shall quote exclusively from the reports of 1881-82, the last that have been published. It will be seen from these quotations that the District officers of the North-West have expressed the same views as myself on almost every question of importance, such as the castes attending school, the ephemeral character of many of the schools, fictitious registration and its causes, the proportion of students enrolled in the lower and upper classes respectively, the general indifference of the people, the passion for service as the chief motive for attending school, &c. It will thus be seen that under a widely different system of control, (the control in Oudh having been purely departmental, and that in the North-West by committees), the results in the two provinces are practically the same. This was only to be expected: for whatever system of control may be applied, it stands to reason that primary schools founded by the State cannot be made to run in any groove other than that which the intellectual wants and economic capacities of the community compel them to accept.

I. The following extracts describe the experiences of district officers in the North-Western Provinces on the subject of caste.

*Saharanpur*.—"I spent a considerable part of the cold weather in Nakur, and inspected most of the schools in the Tahsil. I was struck by the fewness of the schools. This is no doubt chiefly due to the apathy of the pupils, who are for the most part Gujars,\* and this caste is always backward in availing itself of education." (p. 2. B. of Report for 1881-82.)

*Muttra*.—"Brahmin and Baniya children reap most benefit from the Government schools. Kayasths and Mahomedans, too, are well represented. Chamars have not a single boy at school. So there is a large field for the new district committee to cover in the matter of extending rudimentary education downwards." (p. 8. B.)

*Agra*.—"There are several causes which stand in the way of the improvement of our schools. The chief of them are the following:—First, caste prejudice, which excludes the majority of children from education: second, the difference of the court

---

\* The Gujars, like the Jats, Gaddis, Ahirs, &c., were originally a purely pastoral clan; but they are now taking largely to agriculture, like many other castes whose original functions were different.

"language and the country language; and, third, the poverty of the people." (p. 8. B.)

On this the Magistrate of the district writes as follows to the Commissioner: "I need not remind you that hitherto the castes who care to send their children to school are but few in number, and there are other physical and economical conditions, some of them referred to in the report, which retard education here as elsewhere." (p. 9. B.)

*Bareilly*.—"The Baheri Tahsili school is only a primary school. I visited it in November last, and found it very backward. The village is principally inhabited by Banjāras, a class of traders that does not take any interest in education." (p. 21 B.) This shews how easily trade can be carried on, by those who are used to it, without the help of reading and writing.

*Gorakhpur*.—"Gorakhpur is a purely agricultural district, and the children are required to assist in the fields. *It is only in the towns, or where a few zemindars, Baniyas, and Kayasths are congregated together, that a school can flourish.*" (p. 38. B.) (This is tantamount to an admission that the object for which village schools were established,—the education of the agricultural classes,—has been a conspicuous failure.)

The following is a tabular statement of the villages in the North-West and Oudh, which either have never had a school, or have one still, or had one once, but have it now no longer. The statistics relating to the North-West were sent me by the Inspectors of Schools in that province:—

Population.	Province.			Villages which never had a school.	Villages which still have a school.	Villages which once had a school, but have none now.	
Below 1,000	.. {	North-West	..	77,808	1,805	1,744	
		Oudh	... ..	4,159	507	313	
Between 1,000 and 1,500	... {	North-West	...	1,269	805	474	
		Oudh	... ..	866	250	126	
Between 1,500 and 2,000	... {	North-West	...	329	458	144	
		Oudh	... ..	280	136	76	
Between 2,000 and 3,000	... {	North-West	...	117	427	87	
		Oudh	... ..	91	137	32	
Above 3,000	... {	North-West	...	76	333	21	
		Oudh	... ..	22	63	7	
Total	... {	North-West	...	79,599	3,828	2,470	
		Oudh	... ..	5,418	1,093	553	
Grand Total				...	85,017	4,921	3,022



It will be seen from these statistics that it is not population, but caste, which determines the possibility of opening and maintaining schools. Out of the 3,828 village-schools existing in the North-West at the present time, 1,805 or nearly half are in villages with less than 1,000 inhabitants, male and female; while the other half are in villages, the population of which ranges from 1,000 to over 3,000. In the same province there are 1,791 villages with a population ranging from 1,000 to over 3,000 that have never had a school or asked for one; while no fewer than 726 villages with the same amount of population have been unable to maintain the schools which they once had, the supply of students having been insufficient to justify its continuance. The corresponding figures for Oudh are not dissimilar in proportion to the smaller area of the province.

No statistics are given in the Director's annual reports as to the castes attending the primary schools in the North-West Provinces. But careful statistics were collected by Babu Bhudeb Mookerjee in 1868 at the 80 village-schools which he visited and examined in the Meerut Division. The result which he published was the following:—\*

Number of schools visited.	Number of scholars attending.	NAMES OF CASTES.					
		Brahmins.	Chattris.	Kayasths.	Banyas.	Muhammedans.	Other castes.
80	1,849	544	828	135	224	357	261

In this statement the Babu has mentioned the five upper castes separately. In doing this he has adopted exactly the same method as myself. But all the remaining castes, which were classified by me under five separate main heads, he has grouped together under one general head as "other castes." The reader will observe that the proportion of these five upper caste pupils to the whole is 86 per cent. which very nearly coincides with the percentage discovered by myself at the thirteen schools which I examined in the Lucknow district, namely 82.

\* See page 17 of his report, published in Calcutta in 1868.

II. The next point proposed for comparison is the shifting character of many of the village schools. When schools of this kind were first opened in the North-West, the theory, upon which their location was determined, was that of equal distribution. Each Tahsil, or revenue sub-division, was parcelled out into Halquas or circles, and in or near the centre of each of these a primary school was established for the enlightenment of its own and the surrounding villages. The schools thus established were therefore called Halquabandi, and this is the name which they have 'retained to this day.' The plan upon which the Visitor-General acted has been thus described by Mr. Cann, who was Inspector of Schools in the Meerut Division in 1869: "The Visitor-General's plan of distributing the schools over a newly settled district was to call together the zemindars of each Pergannah and spread before them a map of their Pergannah. Upon this, after explaining to them the amount of school cess available, and the number of schools which might be supported by it, he placed at equal distances the proper number of pice; then seeing what villages likely to be suitable were near these, and taking the advice of the assembly as to any change they might show to be advisable, he located his schools."

But after the first few years of trial, the theory of equal distribution completely collapsed. The following figures are taken from the same report by Mr. Cann, dated 21st January 1869:—

Pergannahs.	Number of Halquabandi Schools.	
	1860-61.	1866-67.
Iqlas ... ..	16	15
Sardhana ... ..	27	17
Basuli ... ..	28	18
Gunaur .. ..	21	10
	92	60 *

Thus in the course of 6 years, 32 schools out of 92 had failed; and even these figures (as Mr. Cann points out) do not shew the

\* Mr. Cann's tabular statement included figures for 3 more Pergannahs, namely, Rurki, Nakur, and Moradabad. I have omitted them, because

Mr. Cann explains that the vast discrepancies between 1860 and 1866 were owing to the recent collection of the local cess.

full extent of the changes which took place within this brief space of time ; for "changes in the position of schools may and do take place without creating any difference in the number." In fact, it was as impossible then, as it is now, to maintain schools in places where there is a marked absence of Brahmins, Kayasths, Katris, Chattris, high caste Mahomedans, and Baniyas.

The Circle theory has long since been abandoned in the North-West, and was never attempted in Oudh from the first. In some parts of districts large tracts may be found without any trace of a school in them ; in others, schools may be found in clusters of four or five together, with only two or three miles' interval between them. The schools, however, still pass by the name of Halqua-bandi,—a misnomer, which, as it cannot be admired on grounds of euphony, must have been retained on the well known Ciceronian principle of *lucus a non lucendo*. We must suppose, then, that they are now called circle schools, because they don't go in circles. Even now, in spite of the abandonment of the circle theory, and in spite of all the experience gained since the first experiments were made, a considerable number of the schools have not been able to obtain a firm footing, but are shifting about from place to place, like unclean spirits "seeking rest and finding none." The following statement shows the extent, to which schools have been moved from one locality to another in both provinces within the last ten years :—

PROVINCE.	Number of Halqua Schools existing in 1872.	Number of Halqua Schools closed since 1872	Number which have survived since 1872.	Number of new schools added since 1872.	Number of Halqua schools existing in 1882.
North-West ...	3,545	1,220	2,325	1,503	3,828
Oudh ..	1,076	367	709	384	1,093
Total ...	4,621	1587	3,034	1,887	4,921

Thus in the North-Western Provinces there were altogether 3,545 village schools in the year 1872. Of these 1,220 (or 34 per cent) have been abolished since that year on account of insufficient attendance, leaving only 2,325 (or 66 per cent) which have survived. One thousand five hundred and three new schools have been opened since then, which gives a net increase of 301 in the number of schools since 1872. In Oudh out of 1,076 schools existing in 1872, three hundred and sixty-seven (or 34 per cent.) have had to be closed ; and 709 (or 66 per cent) have been able to hold their ground. The equality of the result is another

indication, among the many already mentioned, of the extent to which the intellectual wants and economic condition of the two provinces coincide.

The following are a few extracts from the reports of the North-West committees of 1881-82. These will shew that mobility, and not permanence, is still the characteristic of many of the village-schools under their control :—

*Saharanpur*.—"Four Halquabandi schools have been transferred from places, where the attendance was poor, to villages where it seemed likely they would be better appreciated."

*Muzaffernagar*.—"Of the 111 Halquabandi schools which were in existence at the beginning of the year, six have been closed, and two new ones have been opened."

*Meerut*.—"The principal question discussed was the late President's new scheme for reducing the number of schools. His proposals were communicated to the Director of Public Instruction, who however declined to sanction the radical revolution suggested. As he sanctioned the reduction of schools found notably useless, four schools have been closed in this cold weather."

*Bulandshahr*.—"Three schools have been closed and set up elsewhere."

*Aligarh*.—"During the year there were six schools done away with entirely, and eleven had to be transferred to other villages owing to the paucity of scholars." (This implies that seventeen schools were abolished within that year only).

*Muttra*.—"It was found necessary to transfer 26 teachers owing to local disagreements or other reasons necessitating their removal."

*Agra*.—"The number of schools in Agra is, I think, sufficient for the area of the district. A very important branch of the committee's duty has been the proper location of the schools."

*Mainpuri*.—"There are 123 Halquabandi schools with 3,767 boys on the rolls, as against 129 with 3,792 last year. Thus, with six schools less, there are only 25 scholars less."

*Etawah*. "It was found necessary to close eight Halquabandi schools during the year, as the attendance was very poor and the progress made unsatisfactory. \* \* \* \* With proper management and judicious location, a hundred Halquabandi schools would seem to be ample for the requirements of this district, and I do not think the number should be increased at any time unless under exceptional circumstances."

At this day, then, after thirty years' experience, "the proper location of schools" is declared to be one of the most important of a committee's duties. In contrast with this picture I

would ask the reader to compare the facts announced in the Report on Primary Education in England and Wales for 1881-82:—"It is a somewhat remarkable proof of the *bona fide* character of the great efforts which have been made "under the voluntary system to meet educational deficiencies, and of the strong hold which that system has upon the "country, to find that of the 7,237 schools established with the "aid of Government grants in the course of the last 50 years, "not more than 153 have ceased to exist."\* In England, then, out of 7,237 primary schools maintained by private enterprise, only 2 per cent. have ceased to exist within 50 years. In the North-Western Provinces out of 3,545 primary schools established by the State, maintained entirely by public funds, and inspected and controlled by the most influential officers in the district, 34 per cent have ceased to exist within 10 years. The extent to which the demand for primary education differs in India and England respectively, may be gauged by this remarkable contrast.

III. The next point, in which a comparison may be drawn, is the standard to which instruction is carried in the village-schools of the North-West and Oudh respectively. The following statement shews the number of students enrolled in the different classes at the close of the year 1881-82, according to the official report last published for the united provinces:—

	Lower Sec- tion (classes VII, VI, V) (1)	Upper Sec- tion (classes IV, III) (2)	Total of classes (3)	Percentage of (1.) to (3.)	Percentage of (2.) to (3.)	
North West.	118,738	23,061	141,799	83.7	16.3	100
Oudh.	37,299	8,026	45,255	82.4	17.6	100
Total.	156,037	31,087	187,054	83.3	16.7	100

Thus, in the North-West, the number of students in the Lower Section is 83.7 per cent. of the whole, and in Oudh 82.4 per cent. The equality of the proportions is again remarkable. Considering what a very meagre course the Lower Primary is, the result is one of which neither the department nor the committees have any reason to boast.

But out of the 83 per cent. who never enter the Upper Section, it is only a small proportion that enter the highest class even of the

\* Report of the Committee of Council on Education, 1881-82, p. viii.

**Lower Section.** In the lowest or alphabet class the proportion of students is usually 45 per cent. of the total enrolment, in the next lowest, about 23 per cent, and in the last (that is the highest class of the Lower Section), about 15 per cent. Now it is only in the class last named that a student completes the four Compound Rules of Arithmetic. All the rest, numbering about 68 per cent. of the whole, are mere beginners, and their knowledge, if it stops there, is worth nothing. Yet this is the proportion in which our students leave the Halabquaudi schools year after year.

The following extract from the report by Mr. Darrali, Secretary of the Badaun District School Committee, North-Western Provinces, explains the high percentage in the alphabet class:—

“It was, and I fear is still, but too common a custom for a teacher to gather together all the little children of a village and enter them in his lowest class, notwithstanding the fact that they are often too young to learn any thing. The parents are often glad for a child to be looked after for a part of the day; and the teacher benefits by having an additional name in his roll.” (p. 17 B.)

Mr. Thornton, the Secretary of the Moradabad Committee, North-Western Provinces, explains the preponderance of students in the Lower Section, and the impossibility of preventing it, in the following terms:—“Nearly a year ago we were informed by the Inspector that no school could be considered up to the mark which did not possess a third class: \* I had a list of schools not teaching up to that class made out, and the teachers were enjoined to start a third class whenever possible. But subsequently there appeared great difficulties in the way of enforcing any hard-and-fast rule on the subject. At many schools I found it unquestionably true that parents remove their children to do practical work after a certain age; so that it was not the teacher's fault that there was no third class. At others the level of intelligence is so low, or causes operate to break the regularity of attendance, so that the teacher can scarcely keep up even a respectable fourth class,” (p. 17 B.) These remarks entirely bear out my own experience. The value of the small earnings of child-labour among a very poor population is one proof out of many others, that among such a people the improvement of primary schools is as impossible as their extension.

The Secretary of the Meerut Committee writes as follows:—“To make education popular I should drop history and geography teaching, usually bad and in any case useless, and insist on a

---

\* The third class is the highest to which village or Halabquaudi schools are expected or allowed to teach.

"more thorough practical acquaintance with Arithmetic. The future cultivator ought to be able to tot up the rent of his small holding, or the price of a load of grain readily." (p. 5 B.) This is as good as saying that Government village-schools are not wanted at all. For every tenant can, by natural instinct and by tradition, that is, without the help of school instruction, tot up the rent of his holding, &c. But if school instruction is required at all for such a purpose, it can be obtained at the Indigenous Kaithi patshálás, where elementary Arithmetic is taught upon a shorter and quicker method than at Government schools.

IV. In both provinces the fictitious registration of students by the teacher is a practice which no one has ever yet succeeded in putting down entirely.

*Moradabad.*—"The decrease (in the number of students) arises, in all probability, from the rectification of the school registers which has been attempted to be effected. Formerly the teachers used to enter in the register numbers of boys who never attended at all, not to speak of those who had left off attendance, or attended with the greatest rarity. Efforts have been made to check this, but I do not suppose they have been attended with more than partial success. It must be acknowledged that the village teacher's register forms a very poor criterion of the local taste for education." (p. 17 B.)

*Budaun.*—"The Deputy Inspector explains the decrease by saying that he made the teachers strike off the names of a large number of pupils whose attendance was merely nominal. Either they did not come at all, except at long intervals, or else they came and merely sat in the school without attempting to learn anything." (p. 17 B.)

*Shahjahanpur.*—"In the past cold weather, when schools were examined, it was found that in the Halquabandi schools generally the attendance registers are not accurately kept up, and the teachers were repeatedly punished and warned. The attendance statistics must, I fear, be accepted with caution." (p. 22 B.)

Fictitious registration is not unfrequently accompanied with absenteeism on the part of the teacher:—

*Banda.*—"The teachers are much given to the practice of absentsing themselves without leave, and are punished when they happen to be detected." (p. 28 B.)

*Agra.*—"Although absenteeism among the teachers has greatly decreased as compared with previous years, yet it is here and there occasionally found. The Tahsildars were requested last year to render their help in the removal of this evil, but have been unable to do so. Hence the appointment of another Sub-Deputy is recommended." (p. 9 B.)

If there were anything like an earnest or general demand for village schools, neither absenteeism on the part of teachers nor fictitious registration would be tolerated by the villagers; and the work would go on spontaneously without the help required from Tahsildars or other district officials.

V. In Oudh the attitude of influential natives towards the spread of primary education is one of almost total indifference. If a native gentleman sets up a vernacular school at all, it is invariably one on the indigenous model,—a *maktab* for teaching Persian, or a *pātsāla* for teaching Kaithi. Instances of this kind are very numerous to this day. But in the whole history of education in Oudh, there are only three cases in which natives of influence have set up vernacular schools on the Government model; and of these only one has survived. The late Maharajah of Bulrampur set up ten village schools on his estates in the Gonda district; but there was no vitality in the work, and the schools died out after a few years. The late Taluqdar of Baragaon, Sitapur district, established one school at Baragaon on a larger scale; but after it had existed for about ten years, he closed it on finding (as he officially reported to me) that most of the ex-students had forgotten how to read and write a few years after leaving. The only native aided school in Oudh still surviving is that at Mohanlalung in the Lucknow district.

The indifference displayed by the native community in the North-Western Provinces has been a subject of frequent complaint, as the following extracts shew:—

*Meerut.*—"Mr. Davis has furnished some notes of his inspection. \* \* \* \* \* He points out that the carelessness of parents "is a great cause of inefficiency. The President proposed to "remedy this by appointing committees in each village, who would "inspect the school regularly. This may do some good, but no "mechanical devices will create an interest where it does not "exist. I have seen villages where the Government teacher complained that he could not get children to attend, and the "indigenous school was crowded." (p. 5 B.)

*Manipuri.*—"It remains to be seen whether the increased "power given to the (native) members of the district committee "by the new decentralization scheme will infuse in them any vigor; "but knowing the people here from a residence among them "of over two years, I am afraid that the scheme, so far as education is concerned, will fall dead." (p. 12 B.)

*Etawah.*—"I am glad to say that the Tahsildars seem to have "been aroused to their sense of duty (in the work of inspection.) "\*\*\*\*\* Constant supervision like this must have the very best "effect in maintaining the efficiency of schools. As for the



"non-official members of the committee, I regret to say, no help of any kind has ever been received, nor do they, as a rule, evince any real interest in the matter. They would seem to care no more for the welfare of village schools than they do for Greek." (p. 13 B.)

*Badaun*.—"Mr. Whish in his report last year remarked that the native members of the committee were beginning to take an interest in the subject, and to exert themselves in examining schools and encouraging education. I regret to have to notice that the interest displayed before the late Secretary proved evanescent. A few members ordinarily attended the meetings of the committee, but not one of them seemed to care in the least what became of the schools, or to know whether one teacher was better or worse than another." (p. 19 B.)

In 1879-80, owing to an extraordinary outbreak of fever in the autumn and winter months, the total attendance at village schools in the North-West and Oudh fell off by 20,000. Since then, though there has been no unusual sickness or scarcity, the numbers have not recovered, as they would have done long ago, had there been any earnest demand for education on the part of the people.

VI. In both provinces it is not the interests of agriculture, but the passion for service, which gives to our Primary schools such vitality as they possess: \* I have already said so much on this point in connection with Oudh, that I need only now quote from gentlemen acquainted with the North-West:—

*Muzaffernagar*.—"In the number of pupils borne on the rolls, in their average attendance, and in the amount of fees

---

\* Babu Bhudeb Mookerjee gave the following remarks on this point in p. 53 of his Report on the Village Schools of the North-Western Provinces, published in Calcutta on 1868:—

"The simple interests of the agricultural classes, on which the educational system was designed to be established, appeared on trial to be too weak for the purpose. For it may be easily imagined that, rude and primitive as the village people were, they could not readily understand the connection that subsisted as cause and sequence between a knowledge of letters and the defence of their rights in land. To simple and unsophisticated people, to be able to defend his rights does not seem to require any long or roundabout preparation. It is left by them invariably to common sense, to traditional instructions handed down from parents to children, and to the example and advice of friends and neighbours. Very few men, even in the higher circles of society, study the laws of their country simply to have a clear knowledge thereby of their duties and rights. Every human effort is made with a view to some positive good. The defence of one's rights is but a negative one. The acquisition of knowledge, especially at the rudimentary stage, is a very great effort; and in the eyes of the unlettered masses, knowledge, as power or accomplishment, has no value whatever."

"realized, there has been during the year under report a distinct and satisfactory advance. The Deputy Inspector attributes the improvement to the impetus which has been given to it by the appointment during the year of 57 ex-pupils to posts in the public service. In so far as the fact indicates that education is valued rather as a means than an end, it is not altogether a satisfactory symptom of progress."—(p. 3. B. of Report for 1881-82.)

"The system of Primary instruction aims at converting all the rising generation into mere office clerks. \* \* \* \* \* At present the only attendants at our village schools are boys whose parents hope to secure for them some kind of Government employment. \* \* \* \* \* What Primary instruction is given is regarded not as an end in itself, but only as a preparation to higher studies. A little reflection must shew that this is precisely what is not wanted," &c. (Extract from remarks sent to the Educational Commission by Mr. Growse, Collector and Magistrate of Bulandshahr.)

Proof of the correctness of the above view might be drawn from the irrepressible tendency of village school-masters in the North-West to teach above the Primary or Halquabandi standard. This tendency had reached such a pitch in 1874-75, that the Secretary of the Badaun Committee reported in that year that "the difference between these (Tahsili and Pergannah schools) and Halquabandi schools was merely nominal." Accordingly very stringent orders were issued by the (then) Lieutenant-Governor for keeping the two classes of schools distinct. Yet to this day there is a large number of Halquabandi schools in the North-West teaching up to the middle class examination, and Inspectors and Committees have failed alike to repress them. Every annual report that is published draws attention to the evil, and declares that it is being gradually overcome. There must be some strong reason why this extra-educational tendency should have ever sprung up, and why it has been so tenaciously adhered to: and it is not difficult to see what the cause has been. The middle class examination is the great passport to employment in the public service; and the teachers at Primary schools have made this examination their aim, in obedience to the clamour of students and parents.

VII. Whatever opinions may be held as to the good which these Primary schools may have done, there can be no difference of opinion as to what they have cost. What the expenditure was in the North-Western Provinces prior to the year 1865, I have no means of knowing. From April 1865 to March 1882, the combined expenditure in both provinces, as shewn

in the annual reports, has exceeded 92 lakhs of Rupees, or in English money it has come up to nearly a million sterling.

From 1st April 1865 To 31st March 1882.	North-West Rs.	Oudh Rs.	Total Rs.
Primary Vernacular Schools	67,58,807	16,83,666	84,42,473
Normal Schools ... ..	5,70,545	2,11,261	7,81,806
Total ...	73,29,352	18,94,927	92,24,279

It has been customary to extol the cheapness of Vernacular schools as compared with English ones. But the comparison has not been as justly made as it is intended to be. In the first place, in reckoning the cost of Vernacular schools, we are bound to take account of Normal schools: for without these no Vernacular schools could be opened or maintained by the State. The expenditure on Normal schools alone since 1865, (in the North-West and Oudh), has come to over 7 lakhs of Rupees. No such item, however, can be debited to the cost of English schools; for these supply their own teachers, or are supplied with them on the results of the University examinations. Again, in calculating the average cost per pupil at Vernacular schools, we ought to deduct at least 60 per cent. of the enrolment or attendance; for (as I have recently shewn) at least 60 per cent., and generally more, learn practically nothing. The same cannot be said of English schools. Then, again, even among the 40 per cent. that remain, a very large majority (as I proved in section IV of this article,) become illiterate within a few years after leaving school; and so their education counts for nothing. Relapses into ignorance occur very rarely, or at least with much less frequency, so far as I have seen, among the alumni of English schools. Fictitious registration is practised to a considerable extent at Vernacular schools, and in reckoning the average cost per pupil fictitious students are counted with real ones; but I have seen nothing of this practise at English schools. And lastly, fees are either not collected at all at village schools, or (if they are) they make up a merely nominal item: but the fee receipts at English schools constitute a considerable and (I should add) a growing portion of their income, and this item tends to reduce the average cost per student to the State. If all

these facts are taken into account in calculating the average annual cost per pupil at village schools, Rupees 40 would be nearer the truth than Rs. 4 at which it is usually estimated.

If we take an exhaustive survey of all kinds of literate employment, that are open to men educated at Vernacular schools, it will be seen that there are very few requiring any kind of training, but what can be, and in fact has been, given at indigenous schools or by private tuition. The exceptions to which I refer are those marked with an asterisk in the statement given below; and even these, (if we except the Patwari), cannot learn all the mathematics that they require at a village or Primary schools but must go to a Secondary school, either Vernacular or English, for the purpose.

**I. Religious functions :—**

- (a). Brahmins among Hindus;
- (b). Moulvies among Mahomedans.

**II. Secular employments of the higher grade :—**

**A. Private :—**

- (a). Ziladars, rent-collectors and estate-managers in the service of rajas, taluqdars, and wealthy landlords generally;
- (b). Vakils, pleaders who hold a certificate entitling them to plead in the public courts;
- (c). Hakims, medical practitioners on the old or native system;
- (d). Mukhtars, pleaders of a lower status than vakils.

**B. Public :—**

- (a). Revenue and judicial officers of all kinds, police inspectors, &c.
- (b). Clerks in Vernacular offices, (such as sarishtadars and record keepers,) darogas in jails, &c.
- (c). Hospital assistants, compounders, dressers, &c.

**III. Secular employments of the lower grade :—**

**A. Private :—**

- (a). Merchants, money-lenders, and shopkeepers of all kinds;
- (b). Men employed by merchants and tradesmen; such as the Gumashta, who acts as salesman and local agent,—the Rokaria or cash-keeper,—the Charandar, who conveys merchandize from one place to another,—the Dallal or broker who brings customers to the shop,—the Arhatia, or commission agent,—the Manib, who supervises all the different Gumashtas and reports to his employer;
- (c). Mohurrirs or private clerks to zemindars or landlords;

- (d). \* Contractors, for the making of roads, construction of buildings, &c.
  - (e). Men connected with the Vernacular press, such as compositors, lithograph-writers, proof correctors, bookbinders, contributors to newspapers, &c.
  - (f). Petition-writers of all kinds.
- B. Public:—
- (a). Mohurrirs and Nazirs in Government offices of all kinds; "Literate Constables" in the police department, &c.
  - (b). \* Patwaris, or village accountants.
  - (c). \* Amins, or land-surveyors for settlement work; Qánungos for the supervision of Patwaris.

#### IV. Teachers at Vernacular Schools:—

- (a). Government schools;
- (b). Indigenous mukhtabs and patshálás.

The above list is, I believe, exhaustive. It is obvious that the teaching at Halquabandi or Government village schools is irrelevant to *I, Religious Functions*, and that it is not nearly high enough, for, *II, Secular employments of the higher grade*. It is obvious, too, that it is of no use for tradesmen, &c., under *III. Secular employments of the lower grade*, because all tradesmen and their employés in these provinces use Kaithi or Mahajani, which our schools do not teach. All the remaining men coming under heading III., write Urdu or Persian, and these languages and characters can be taught in the best of the *mukhtabs* not less perfectly than at Government village schools, and sometimes a good deal better. In point of fact, almost all the ziladars, mukhtars, tahsildars, darogas, mahurrirs, nazirs, &c., employed in these provinces, whether by private persons or by the State, have been educated in *mukhtabs*, and not in Government schools. The only classes of men, therefore, for whom the indigenous training is insufficient and in some respects unsuitable, are contractors, (those at least who take large contracts,) Patwaris or village accountants, Qánungos who supervise these accountants, and Amins or men temporarily employed for settlement purposes. These require more mathematics than a *mukhtab* can give them; and all except the Patwari require more than a village or Government Primary school can give them.

I hold, then, that if two or three good vernacular schools, teaching above the village or primary standard, had been established by the State in every Tahsil (or revenue sub-division,) they could have amply supplied all possible requirements of the above nature, and that every thing else in connection with vernacular education could have been left to private enterprise. Before the establishment

of British rule, the indigenous teachers of all kinds (Moulvies, Gurus, Lálajis, Pundits, &c.,) were able to provide, and did in fact provide, all that was required for the efficiency of trade, agriculture, religion, and the industrial arts; and as the conditions of native life have remained substantially what they were, it follows that the same teachers could still supply all possible requirements of this nature, if the field were left open to them again. A landlord, for example, who has been educated on the native system of *Sabák* (literature) and *Siyák* (computation or arithmetic) is quite as well able to keep his rentroll, watch his Patwari, and read a court paper, as one educated at a Government school. An artisan who sells his own wares, a grain dealer, and a general tradesman, can learn all that they require for the keeping of shop accounts better at a private Kaithi school than at a Government village school; and for making short reckonings, and bargaining with a customer *impromptu*, the native arithmetic is a more useful instrument than our own. It has been fully proved by experience that a Government Primary school can only exist in places where indigenous schools existed already, or would exist again, if the Government school were withdrawn.\* It is only among certain castes and classes that indigenous schools have

---

\* Probably it is not generally known to what an extent Government Primary schools interfere with private enterprise. Elaborate statistics regarding the locality of indigenous schools were collected in Oudh throughout the 12 districts in 1874; and it was then proved that 76·2 per cent. of the indigenous schools or private teacherships existing at the time were in the very same village or market town with Government schools; that 18·8 per cent. were in places only 2 miles distant; and that only 5 per cent. were in places entirely out of the reach of Government schools. The Government schools pursue the indigenous schools, as the shadow follows its substance.

I lately examined a village school at Bikapur in the Fyzabad district. The school had been opened nine months before. The progress made by many of the pupils would have been very remarkable, had it been the result of nine months' teaching. The schoolmaster of course set it down to his own hard work. But it turned out, on my making further enquiries, that prior to the establishment of this school there had been no less than four private *maktabs* in the place and neighbourhood, and that the most forward boys in the school had come from these *maktabs*. I then enquired what had become of the four Moulvies or tutors. They had all been dispensed with, and no one could say where they had gone to. The schoolmaster seemed rather proud of his achievement. "Ever since I came here, they have all had to go." The department, however, has little reason to be proud of defeating private enterprise by public money.

Instances of this kind are endless. There is an application in the Lucknow district, which is still pending. In this village the local zemindars and pattidars have hitherto kept a private tutor of their own, to whom they pay only Rupee 1 a month with board. If a village school is established, they will be saved even this.

sprung up ; and it is only among the same castes and classes that Government schools can be or have been maintained. The indigenous methods are no doubt extremely faulty from our own point of view as instruments of intellectual culture. But intellectual culture is precisely what the people do not want to have. They care for no education whatever, but what is necessary to religion or to success in wordly business : for it is upon the basis of these two sentiments that indigenous tuition has rested for the last 1,000 years or more. Interference with private enterprise, unless very decided advantages are to be gained thereby, (and these are by no means apparent in the present case), is the last principle to be adopted as the mainspring of an educational policy :\* and it appears that the founder of the Halquabandi schools in the North-West Provinces (the model of those founded in the Punjab and still later Oudh) was not fully satisfied as to the utility of the system, after sufficient time had been gained for contemplating the results of its working.

J. C. NESFIELD.

---

\* The educational programme, with which the North-West Government at first set out, was to aid and improve indigenous schools only. But too much was expected in the way of improving them after English models : the teachers did not wish to be improved ; and the success with which the revenue authorities collected the local rate, (called at first voluntary subscriptions), was a temptation too strong to be resisted. Hence Halquabandi schools were established. This was at the time when Mr. Stewart Reid, C. S., was Visitor-General,—a title since changed to that of Director of Public Instruction.

Mr. Reid, however, does not seem to have been thoroughly satisfied with the result. Several years afterwards when Govt. village schools were about to be opened in Oudh, in the middle of 1866, he wrote demi-officially to Mr. Handford, the then Director in Oudh, to the following effect :—"Were I to begin again, with ample funds at command, I would expend a goodly sum in aiding indigenous schools, making, of course, the adoption of our school-books and system of school discipline a *sine qua non* for the receipt of assistance from the State." (Dated Fyzabad, 12th July 1866.) It appears to me that the imposing of such conditions cannot but be destructive of all attempts to encourage private enterprise or conciliate indigenous teachers. It might have been possible to give them some kind of aid or reward for results adapted to their own methods of teaching. But we cannot, by the introduction of our grammars, readers, histories, and geographies, or by the application of our complicated grant-in-aid rules, change the foundation on which indigenous tuition has rested from time immemorial.

---

ART V.—ADAMOLI'S NOTES ON A JOURNEY FROM  
PERM TO TASHKEND.

(Continued from the "*Calcutta Review*," April 1883.)

ACCORDING to the opinion of Adamoli the Kirghizes are both physically and morally a primitive race and must be treated like children, with kindness or severity, according to circumstances, to obtain from them any possible thing required, but it is necessary to be long acquainted with them and to know them well, as Gorbakofski, the Governor at that time, did. He liked the Kirghizes very much, but occasionally treated them harshly, by which means he succeeded in obtaining their respect and love. When Semiretchenski was still a portion of the Omsk Government, the people of Kokand made constant raids, which made it necessary to restrain them by taking possession of the first fort on the boundary, which was Piskpek. After this had been done, the Khan of Kokand proclaimed a holy war against the Russians, sending an army of *Sarts* and of Persian slaves to attack them. At the news of the approach of these forces, 40,000 yurts of Kirghizes from the Semiretchenski hastened to Kokand to join the army of liberation. This happened in 1860. The Russians, who were only 700 in number, encountered this immense mob in the steppe adjoining Usmagask, and completely routed it. Nor could the result have been different, considering the arms used by the Kirghizes, and their manner of fighting. In spite of the great inferiority of their weapons, and in spite of the falling of their combatants on every side, the Kirghizes, however, approached the Russians to within a distance of fifty paces, but these last fifty paces they could never make; had they done so, their immense mass alone would have sufficed to destroy all their foes. The battalions of Persian slaves were somewhat organized, and had matchlocks, but fired them without taking aim. They discovered, however, one stratagem which nearly proved fatal to the Russians. They set the withered herbage of the steppe on fire and enveloped the enemy in flames. The ammunition wagons of the artillery galloped across this circle of fire with impunity, but it was a miracle. The victory having been gained, all the Kirghizes again returned as if nothing had happened, and their chiefs waited on Gorbakofski to make their submission. The General went alone to receive them and, as his first salutation, he boxed their ears most liberally and sonorously. After this



paternal admonition, he no longer molested them and abstained from all further enquiries. By this rough and primitive procedure he first inspired the Kirghizes with respect, and by not punishing them further, he gained their affection.

In Verno, as already observed, the Kalmucks and the Kirghizes were not numerous, but usually the most industrious and cunning people in the country. The Kalmuck boys were already manifesting their natural instinct for gain, by suspending a crucifix from the neck, assuming the airs of catechumens, and asking for alms by making the sign of the cross freely. The Kirghizes, on the other hand, simple and primitive as they were, asked for charity honourably, alighting from their cows, and prostrating themselves on the ground so as to touch it with the forehead, but not using any Jesuitic astuteness or rhetorical artifices. The Kirghizes also bear pain with heroic stoicism as appears from the case of one, narrated by the doctor of Verno, who had to amputate one of his legs and also one of his arms, injured by the explosion of a bombshell which the Kirghiz had found and set carelessly on fire.

In various houses Adamoli saw candlesticks and other objects cut out of a stone named *kalabush*, which can be worked into very elegant shapes, and would appear to be a kind of soap-stone. In the whole of Verno there was, however, not more than one man who knew how to work this stone. Our traveller was of opinion that besides this stone, many other wonderful discoveries could be made in the mountains, if they were only allowed to be explored.

At Verno the travellers separated, Tchaikofski being obliged to remain there in order to join his brother at the lake Issikol, and the two friends parted with regret. After leaving

To Tashkend.

Verno the road ran at a distance of four or five wersts from the foot of the mountains, which presented nearly the same aspect as those of Verno, and rose so steeply, that the eye could with a single glance embrace all the zones of the different vegetations. Numbers of rivulets were divided into channels or *ariks* for irrigating the fields; but, the soil not being porous, the water could not filter through it even in the slightest manner; accordingly the brooks were dammed up artificially, and then allowed to inundate the fields so as to promote the vegetation. The harvests of oats, wheat and millet were not yet ripe, but just beginning to get yellow; lastly, there were also fields of sunflower, the seeds of which the Russians like very much. In the neighbourhood of Verno could be seen poppy-fields cultivated by Chinese, for the manufacture of opium.

As far as Kastek the land was mostly occupied by Russian emigrants, and but few *yurts* could be seen. In a few villages there were Russian or Kozzak colonists. Having reached Kastek in the evening, Adamoli was compelled to stop, it being impossible to pass over the mountain in the night; and, there being nothing worth seeing, he lay down in his carriage, after taking a walk in the surrounding deserted country, and slept till morning. Then the ascent began through a rising valley on a rugged and most horrible road, no progress on which could have been made with five horses attached to the carriage, unless the soldiers who were working on it had every now and then assisted them. This portion had been made accessible for carts only a week ago, after freeing the road from the incumbrances which the rains of the last spring had lodged upon it: during which season the above named doctor of Verno had been compelled actually to travel three weeks round the mountains to reach Tashkend.

On the mountain, *hauks* of Kirghizes, all with their cattle, were often seen. Many were descending to change their pastures and their caravans always presented a picturesque sight. Their women ride on horseback with a kind of white, tube-like hood over their heads and shoulders, inclined to one side. They were horribly ugly; but their girls, with a mass of little tresses of hair protruding and dangling from their embroidered bonnets, would have looked amiable, if they had been only a little, very little more passable. The hair on the top of their heads under their bonnets is cut short, and their boots which reach half up the leg, have such high heels, that it appears almost impossible they can walk with them.

After passing Kastek, Kirghizes were met who had been under the dominion of Kokand, and their importance ceased in comparison to that of the Sarts, the inhabitants of the town. As far as Kastek, on the contrary, the Kirghizes were before the arrival of the Russians the only natives and absolute masters of the soil, roaming at large through the boundless steppe, paying homage sometimes to one, and sometimes to another *Khân*, always, however, nominally only, and constantly enjoying entire liberty. Their staple food is always milk, either in a pure form, or as a mixture of cow, sheep, and camel milk, or in the shape of cheese. With milk they also cook millet and barley, which they bruise with a wooden pestle of a peculiar form, resulting in a kind of much-liked porridge. They have large hemispherical cooking pots, to which the porringer of varnished wood already mentioned is added to constitute nearly all the utensils needed by a Kirghiz for his culinary operations,

As we have observed already, *Kumis*, is a luxury enjoyed only by possessors of large herds of horses, the mares of which are not ridden but kept for reproduction and for their milk only.

The chief feature of independent Kirghiz life was cattle lifting. Four or five men quietly approached during the night the cattle they desired to steal, and which were usually guarded by a single herdsman. One of the robbers remained standing alone in the direction which the stolen cattle were to take, whilst the others drove it towards him from a distance, howling and poking it with long staffs till it fled and blindly followed the first Kirghiz who galloped in front, in the direction of the *haul* to which the beasts were intended to be taken. If the herdsman succeeded by his shouts in attracting the owners of the stolen cattle, their chief aim was to break the line of the direction and to cause the cattle to follow their own. The Kirghizes have also a sport called *Baiga*, which consists in following each other on horseback and robbing a sheep; the man who is the last in catching the animal becomes the victor, but it is usually divided and each competitor obtains a piece of it.

At noon our traveller reached the top of the passage of Kastek, where the flora and the temperature reminded him that he was high above the level of the sea. Now the road began to descend on the other side of the mountain to the Fein valley, along its arid and gravelly bed; although but fifteen days ago it would have been impossible to cross the mountain torrent which then rushed through it. At Tokmak there was a Kozzak stauitza, said to have two years ago contained 200 Russian and Kozzak habitations, of which, however, our traveller saw very few, but on the contrary many *yurts*, and a new bazar, which belonged to the Sarts.

Tokmak was at that time the last place which Russian peasants had reached; further on, merely soldiers and merchants of that nationality could be found in the forts and towns, but the soil yet belonged to the natives. The post-stations were so constructed as to be able to resist an attack; consisting of a little square bastion, surrounded by a fosse, but manned only by two Kozzak soldiers, the rest being Tartars and Kirghizes.

Aulieh Ata is reached by coasting along the Alexandrova mountain at a distance of four or five wersts from it, constantly passing over the *ariks* or channels that irrigate the millet, corn, and panic fields of the Kirghizes, whose *yurts* peep out here and there on the plain at a good distance from the road, which was, however, more than hitherto dotted by Kirghiz cemeteries. There were tombs of every size, cylindrical turrets, but usually a simple heap of earth merely, although family tombs were surrounded by battlemented mud brick walls. Occasionally a

picturesque little chapel with a façade and cupola flanked by turrets could also be seen, to show how much the minds of the indifferent Kirghizes had been influenced by the neighbourhood of the Sarts who are fanatic Musalmans. These chapels were also constructed of bricks dried in the sun, or at the utmost scorched by fire made of withered herbs, and then plastered with mortar. Here the road became again somewhat rugged, and, after crossing a water-course, the fore wheels of the carriage struck with such force against the boulders, that it would certainly have been overturned if the travellers had not all jumped into the water and supported it on both sides. .

That whole day's journey was performed in an uncultivated lonely country, with scarcely a green field here and there. Two old *Sart* forts, namely Tchaudovar and Merke, were also passed near the road, but they consisted of nothing more than heaps of mud. A curious cart, with extremely high wheels very wide apart was seen in which Sarts conveyed some of their baggage, it was drawn by one horse on which the coachman rode. Bustards, storks and other enormous birds, hovered about at some distance. During the night the cart again stuck fast in an *arik* from which it was extricated by the Kirghizes of an adjoining *haul*. During the whole night only one post was made, and the next day the aspect of the country was the same as before, but the temperature was different, because the mountains along which the travellers coasted were much lower; the harvests were ripe and being cut. The first day was really warm, but never unpleasantly so, on account of the clouds as well as on account of the air coming from the mountains; the nights were, however, always rather cool and dry. Herds of camels and of horses were seen grazing in the arid steppe.

At one station the travellers (now apparently reduced to two, namely, Adamoli and Waller) had a visit from a rich Kirghiz whose pantaloons of embroidered leather they admired, and he in his turn wondered at their table and tea requisites, touching them all with his hands. At last Aulieh-Ata, an entirely *Sart* town, with nothing European in it, was reached. This was the first oasis of verdure after Verno, where the poplars and willows with their abundant foliage presented a delightful sight, especially in a country where, during a journey of several hundred wersts not a single tree can be seen. From the Irtysh to Verno the traveller had beheld nothing that could properly be called a tree. Then came a desert till a few poplars were perceived at Merke. Even at Aulieh Ata, the trees were not very numerous, but the site of the town was picturesque enough. On an elevation washed by the river, there is a rock with walls and battlements, relieved

by angles and towers, on the tops of which are umbrellas fixed to shade the sentries. In the plain, on the banks, and in the gravelly and very broad bed of the river, great numbers of Kirghiz *yurts*, with cattle of every species, could be seen; the willow groves on the flanks of the rock concealed the Sart town. The bazar where Adamoli went to purchase provisions was a broad, straight road with footpaths on both sides, along which little porticoes of plastered cane-work, supported by sticks of poplar, serving as columns, extended; and these porticoes give entrance to the small shops in which the wares, such as eggs, bread, vegetables, apples, melons, sacks of rice, various kinds of corn, dried fruits, the flesh of sheep, and garments, are displayed and openly exposed for sale. Barbers were shaving their customers in public, whilst the shopkeepers, dressed in white coats and little caps, but very few with turbans on their heads, were anxiously expecting customers, but never making the least sign to invite them.

Adamoli was delighted with the beautiful physiognomies of the Sarts of Aulieh Ata, but knew not whether they were *Uzbeks* or *Tajiks*; they had lively and deep eyes, black beards and shaved heads. All the streets of the bazar were covered with mats supported by horizontal and transverse poles, for shading the customers; but the other streets of the town consist only of bare walls on either side, with loop-holes here and there at long intervals; the doors have carved posts, but are always kept shut; inside, there are, however, little yards and gardens. Everything is of chalk-earth,—the bazar, the walls, the houses, the footpaths; and no other material can be seen. In a willow-grove in an *arik*, there are baths protected by mats, and carpets spread out for performing the genuflections after bathing.

After Aulieh Ata, stations were no longer met with for changing horses, but only *yurts*, which, however, often presented a new aspect. The Kirghizes had surrounded their tents with walls, either for defence, for their cattle, or for storing the produce of their fields. But they construct their habitations according to the fashion of the Sarts, that is to say, of sun-dried bricks and straw. These are no longer the Kirghizes of the steppe, but they still retain some traits of their original primitive character. After leaving Aulieh Ata, not more than one tree was met with on the road, and it was a poplar. At the station of Mashiaik a carriage was seen which belonged to a Mr. Davidoff, a Russian, who worked a Coal-mine which had been discovered at a short distance. He had it worked by Kirghizes and was sending the coals to the Sir Deria [Yaxartes] for the Government steamers.

The Russians use these coals also for household purposes from Tchemkend to Tashkend ; they contain much sulphur, but are after all much better than the fuel of the Sarts, who use the dried dung of animals for burning.

The village of Menkend announced itself from a distance by its trees and abundant vegetation, which covers the hill. The road led through fields of rice, of hemp, and of vegetables, protected by low walls. At last strong trees with tall trunks were reached, and the travellers passed between the high walls of the houses on both sides of the road, descending on the other side of the hill, after which they crossed the river with some trouble, and at last found the yurt of the station.

Late in the afternoon the journey was resumed and long files of camels were seen passing, with the bridles of those who followed tied to the tails of the animals that preceded. The undulation of their movement was such, that the mere sight of a camel with a man riding it, was according to the opinion of Adamoli, enough to make one sea-sick. He was delighted with the sunset he witnessed on this occasion, and calls it the most imposing and the most characteristic spectacle of that portion of Asia. The sun imparted a red tinge to the vapours, to the clouds, and to the dust scattered in the atmosphere ; the long file of camels was silently disappearing at a long distance on the horizon ; here and there columns of cow-dung smoke were rising from a few *yurts* with cattle around them, and the white ridges of the Tian-Shan spurs appeared in vague outlines on the eastern sky.

On the 1st August at 8 P. M. the travellers reached Tchemkend, where they heard to their great amazement that General Kaufmann (the same who died at St. Petersburg in May 1882) with his retinue had been expected for two days, but had not yet arrived on account of the bad state of the roads, and the immense difficulties of the journey. The natural consequence was that no horses could be had, because five or six carriages were already waiting to get some, and had the precedence ; hence nothing remained but resignation, getting one's supper, and going to bed. The next day Adamoli paid a visit to the military commandant, Colonel Terkoski, and his wife, to whom he had a letter of introduction. There he was kept to dinner, and after it, all started together to a *tamasha* given by Sadik Nazar, a Sart, to the Russian officers, for having received, through General Kaufmann, a diploma from the Emperor, exempting him from paying taxes, and conferring upon him a certain military grade. When Tchemkend was not yet under Russian dominion, Sadik Nazar occupied the highest post, represented the Khan, and had the right of

life and death over all the inhabitants. He was, moreover, extremely rich and possessed a splendid house. When the Russians approached, he sent all his magnificent furniture, carpets, dresses and vessels to Bokhara for security. When he afterwards demanded back his property, the Amir refused to restore it.

The party of guests, consisting of Adamoli, two ladies in *lineikas*, and various officers on horseback, passed in a real atmosphere of dust through the fort, went down to the Sart town, and, after traversing various streets of the bazar, reached at last the house of Sadik. The company first entered a yard shaded by poplars, watered by *ariks*, protected by high walls, and floored with mats; then, passing through a corridor, a second yard was reached, at the other extremity of which the dining table was laid out, on a dais resembling the stage of a theatre. This was reached by footpaths along the walls, the lower portion being a garden with common flowers, where also servants were standing around the *sumovar* (the gigantic Russian tea-pot). The trees around overshadowed with their branches the very high walls; and everything—the walls, the footpaths, the soil, being smooth with chunam, looked like stone. On the stage the carpets were soft, like those of Persia, and of the same kind. An *arik*, with a reservoir in which big vessels full of *kumis* and melons were immersed for cooling, imparted an air of freshness to the scene. On the table were laid out fresh grapes and raisins, dried plums, pistachios, walnuts, and certain large circular, thin cakes, intermixed with European articles, such as sardines, confectionery and liquors. The master of the house in his *khalat* and little bonnet, received his guests with a cordial *aman* and shook their hands. When he reached the carpets, he left his slippers, and appeared in Tartar boots without soles; this also his friends did who wore the same costume, as well as the servants. Adamoli was just about to ask the Colonel how the ladies could obtain a sight of the guests, when he discerned above the walls among the foliage, a number of little heads looking at the company with very big black eyes. A Russian lady who penetrated into the recesses of the harem, assured our traveller that these ladies are very beautiful indeed, but so insipid, that they become tiresome. They can say nothing more than *aman*, touch every article of *toilette* which they can see, and ask for it. The doctor's wife at Verno mentioned, however, to Adamoli, that some women were beginning to revolt, and going to the judge to demand permission to walk out without veils, like European females; but this is doubtful. A sudden shower of rain compelled the master of the house to take his guests into an inner garden, also rich in trees, flowers,

and *ariks*, but having a verandah supported by columns and carpets, in which they took comfortable shelter. In this garden bustards, like those at which Adamoli had shot in the steppe, were strutting about, but the falcon which had captured them kept proudly aloof, standing solitarily in a corner of the verandah. The ladies were at the extremity of the garden concealed by a mat, but their presence was betrayed by their laughter and chattering. On the table were European candles, or at least what had appearance of such, and the garden was illuminated by small earthen vessels with lights in them. The dinner of which the chief of the district, the doctor, various officers and a few ladies partook, consisted of a most abundant supply of pilmenia, pilaw, tea and European wines. A Tartar officer who served as interpreter did the honours of the table; the host himself neither ate nor spoke, but superintended his servants, and when the guests departed he shook hands with them; otherwise, however, he was as if non-existent. He had a scanty black beard, lively and deep eyes, beautiful hands, and was tall and lean, like all Sarts. The guests were, on their return home, preceded by a Kozzak with a lighted torch to guide them through the narrow and rugged Sart roads.

On the morning of the 3rd August our traveller rose early to have a look all round. The Sart town is situated on the banks of the little river that irrigates its gardens, and is dominated by the fort, an enclosure of walls with battlements and barracks, upon a barren, dusty and naked hill. The Russian town, being on the same level with the fort, was necessarily also full of dust. Near the town of Tchemkend there is a public garden with a spring of very limpid water in it, which, being very rare in the country, is much admired, and pitched there, were many tents of the Russians who flee from the burning hot town to pass the summer there under the shade of willows and poplar trees, and also a few bathing places in partly natural reservoirs, protected by mats, could be seen. As the commandant had issued an *ukaz* (written order) that our travellers should be given horses before everybody else, they departed, followed by the growls of their competitors who were obliged to wait.

It being the Emperor's festival, the travellers left Tchemkend with the booming of cannons ringing in their ears, and the post horses conveyed them through an uninterrupted desert to the first post-station which, although not finished,

Tashkend.

was elegantly constructed of the usual sun-dried-bricks, and intended to serve as a model for all the other post-stations in Turkestan. Meanwhile, the Kozzaks of the post lived in a wretched *yurt*. At the next station,



in front of a caravanserai, the travellers met a captain, with whom they had quarrelled at Tchemkend for horses, the axle of whose carriage was broken; accordingly they overtook him chuckling a little among themselves at his ill-luck. Near this station there is a spring of dirty and nauseous water, but which must be drunk for all that. Further on there was a tomb of a curious form, but on entering it, nothing could be seen except a sarcophagus of mud-bricks. Whilst the travellers were at the next station, just getting horses harnessed to their carriage, the abovenamed captain overtook them, and, having an imperial *padarosna* with him, enjoyed the right to a *troika*; they were considerably annoyed. This station, and that before reaching Tashkend, were the only two posts at which the travellers were compelled to wait long for want of horses. This pleasure had been reserved to them for the end of their journey. At this penultimate station, the travellers took another lunch for want of something better to do. They purchased from a Sart who happened to pass by on horseback, a fish which he had caught in one of the deepest and clearest *ariks*; and the peculiarity of which was said to be that its *caviar* was venomous.

Long before Tashkend can be reached, its vicinity is announced by gardens. From a long distance the horizon is limited by the tops of poplar trees arranged in lines, which look like so many files of soldiers. First a meagre little field, surrounded by a dwarf wall, but enjoying the last remnant of the water that irrigates the oasis of Tashkend, was passed. Gradually, however, the fields became greener and succeeded each other without interruption for several *vorsts*. They were planted with vines, maize, cotton, and mulberry, peach, apricot, nut, poplar and pomegranate trees, but all this vegetation appeared through clouds of dust which covered the road.

Then the travellers crossed the *Bosu* (blue water), which had excavated for itself a rugged bed among banks crowned with trees, and looked picturesque enough; they passed also awhile along the ancient walls of the town, where they encountered a guide sent by Struve to meet them, and arrived at 5 P. M., on the 4th of August, in the yard of the said diplomatic adjutant of General Kaufmann, where Adamoli left his carriage (*turantas*) which had served him as a house during one month and twelve days, and for which he had conceived a kind of affection. But he was soon consoled for his loss, for the little palace of Struve afforded comforts equal to those of civilized Europe. He had, in short, elegant apartments, a tent to sleep in in the garden under mulberry trees with most abundant foliage, with an *arik* running near, which fed a reservoir for bathing; servants, interpreters,

Kozzaks, a good horse, and the most exquisite fruits. Here our traveller donned a semi-Asiatic dress, and made acquaintances among the Sarts and Tartars.

At that time the Russian town was only two years old, but, being the capital of Turkestan and the residence of the Governor-General, had already assumed great importance. Life and death depended on the nod of the Governor-General, who would probably not be able to rule the population accustomed to the iron despotism of the Kháns without possessing such authority. According to the opinion of Adamoli, our theories about forms of Government and administrations based upon reason and morality ought entirely to be discarded, these two principles being in Turkistan supplanted by fanaticism, superstition, and obstinate adherence to old usages, against which reasoning is of no avail whatever. The great reason or argument there, is force, which must serve for introducing the first rudiments of civilization, and has so far been successful, that the people of the Khanates of Kokand, of Bokhara, &c., have become so convinced of the superiority of the Russians, as to make any opposition to their intentions chimerical.

The paucity of the Russian troops in comparison with the large tracts of country they have conquered, is perhaps the chief reason why they make no change in the local Governments, and leave them pretty nearly as they find them; Russians are only appointed to be chiefs of districts and commandants of towns, conforming themselves to the usages of the country and not introducing anything new. Among these officers there are all kinds of men, who, however, do nothing to improve the country. They may be divided into two classes, namely, ambitious men who come only to get promotion and to fight; and knaves who are sent to Turkestan as a punishment for more or less venial errors. It was rumoured that the whole conquest of Turkestan was due only to the ambition of Governors-General, who could find no better occupation for acquiring celebrity than to take towns and to conquer territories; thus, they surrounded their name with a halo of glory by pretending to have achieved wonderful exploits with few troops, whereas, in reality, they always marched only against flocks of sheep. For all that, however, the bravery of the Russian troops in Turkestan is not to be despised, and Adamoli is of opinion that they would prove excellent soldiers against foes of quite a different stamp; he saw them manœuvre near the town most beautifully in the presence of General Kaufmann, and the grandson of the Amir of Bokhara, who was going to St. Petersburg with a large retinue. He was pleased to see the troops in uniforms suitable

to the climate, namely, blouses of white cloth, wide pantaloons of the same, boots and caps.

The little prince of Bokhara was twelve years old, and expected to remain in St. Petersburg to complete his education. One day he displayed in the public square the elephants and horses intended as presents for the Emperor. His physiognomy appeared to be extremely intelligent under his immense turban, but could be seen only from a distance. The ambassadors from Bokhara who accompanied him, paid a visit to Struve, and were not different from all the other Sarts.

The Russian town of Tashkend consisted of elegant little brick houses with some architectural ornaments; all, however consisted only of a ground-floor, and were situated in extremely broad streets planted with avenues of yet slender poplars. It is also intersected by *ariks*, and has little gardens with stupendous elm and nut trees. It would be pleasant enough if it were not for the dust which spoils every thing; no idea can be formed of it; it penetrates everywhere, and sometimes covers whole portions of the town like dense clouds. The population consists entirely of military men with their families, and the civil element was represented only by a few retail traders.

The town touches on one side the walls of the ancient Kokand fort, and on the other loses itself in the arid steppe. The chief places of resort were the *café-restaurants* in which all the officers dined and got drunk on *champagne* as long as they had money. Country-wine and even country *champagne* also could be had at the *café*, but it was almost undrinkable, although sold at the exorbitant price of a rouble per bottle. The *minaruk* was another public place of resort. It consisted of a grove of immense apricot trees under which tables were arranged: it contained also a *restaurant*, journals, and a pavilion in which every Sunday evening a ball took place. It is on the outskirts of the town, and in the evening some persons are always found there. There was even a hotel at Tashkend, but only a miniature. Ladies were extremely scarce, and unmarried ones were more than sure of finding husbands.

On the evening of the 10th August our traveller was invited to dinner by the family of Massa-lat-hay, a Sart of much influence in the country, a great friend of General Tcherniaief,\* and therefore, disliked by his successors. His independent position allowed him, however, to disregard this and to maintain relations of friendship with all the Sarts, who repaid it with every kind of civility. The guests went accompanied by

---

\* The same who is at present Governor-General of Turkestan.

interpreters, and were received by the son, nephews, and other relatives of the host, who had gone to Mekka on pilgrimage, and was travelling to the fair of Nijni, whence he was not expected back for three months at least. They passed through two small yards, from which various lodges and cabins are entered. They then ascended by a staircase with immense steps, and were received in the apartment of one of the host's wives who could of course not be seen. Passing through a small room serving as ante-chamber, they entered a beautiful apartment with three windows, laid out with carpets of various colours. The ceiling was painted in brilliant red, blue, white and yellow colours, with sufficiently minute arabesque designs. The side wall, through the middle of which the door opened, was covered with tolerably good white stucco ornaments, the surface, however, being sky-blue as usual in Italy. Opposite to this was the wardrobe of the lady, contained in great chests of varnished tin, and placed in two square niches protected by curtains, between which there was a rude image representing the Kaabah of Mekka, with an Arabic inscription below. On a stretched rope a number of silk-dresses of every colour, and some of them very rich were suspended. Jewels, strings with tassels, and earrings, as well as other ornaments for the head, made of embroidered silk, hung about the room and made a fine show. Opposite to the windows, a number of small niches of elegant forms and coloured stuccoes, contained the whole tea and table service, with a small provision of fruits for the day. The dinner was served on a round table not more than a span and a half high. Around it were placed chests covered with pillows for the Europeans; but they found it more comfortable to squat on the carpets, and had all these encumbrances removed. The dinner began with all kinds of fruits of the country, such as grapes, apples, melons and cakes; then came a big dish with small pieces of chicken roasted in grease which were of course eaten with the fingers; then a soup of rice, flesh, vegetables and sour milk; lastly, a good dish of really excellent *pilaw*. The three Europeans were given wooden spoons for eating, but all the others, only with their hands ate, and between each course tea was drunk *ad libitum*.

After leaving this place they paid a visit to Muhammad Rasul, another most influential man, and at that time an elder of the town council of Tashkend. He also had invited them to dinner, which was a rather melancholy one, because they had already elsewhere performed that ceremony; but they were after all compelled to accept some fruits, a cup of tea, and *kumis*. It was rather difficult matter for Adamoli

to obtain information in this place, as it had to be filtered through two interpreters, a Russian and a Tartar, but his third companion prince Oronloff (an old acquaintance of his from Washington), asked a string of questions about the town, its expenses, &c., till Struvo requested him not to alarm the people by his too great inquisitiveness, because they would at once become shy and take him to be a spy of the governor. No information could be got about the expenses of the town, for fear it might serve as a pretence for enhancing the taxes. On taking leave of their kind host, they were obliged to promise him that they would come on another occasion to dine with him, in his garden outside the town.

The Russian town extends to the west of the Sart portion, and is on the opposite side bounded by the desert, whilst on the northern and southern side it is limited by groves and gardens. It was built on most arid soil, and, besides three or four isolated trees, and the group of apricot-trees of Minuruk, in its whole circuit no signs of previous vegetation occurred. This desert on the western side of the Sart town had been caused by an invasion from Kokand when Tashkend was independent. When, hostilities broke out between Tashkend and Kokand, the Khán, after having invaded the territory from the mountains in which rises the Tchirtchik river that divided the two States, marched upon Tashkend and pitched his tents just there to besiege the town. His troops then devastated the gardens, felled the trees, and destroyed the *ariks*, so that nothing was left except the grove of Minuruk, which contained the tents of the chiefs. Not only, however, when Tashkend was independent, but also under the dominion of Kokand, it happened that the troops of the Khan took up their position in that locality to levy some extraordinary tax. This is the reason why on this side, beyond the now ruined walls, nothing can be seen except an uncultivated plain. Neither is it known why the Russians selected this spot for building their town, but probably they would not have taken the trouble to purchase the garden of the Sarts and took possession of this abandoned locality without ousting anybody from his property. They were also protected by the fort which commands precisely this side. Afterwards, the town began to extend towards the north and the south, by the erection of houses in gardens purchased from the Sarts. Most people, however, contented themselves with buying or only renting a garden rich in trees, in order to pitch tents there in summer, and to return to head-quarters in winter. Among others the Governor-General himself resided in a garden south of the town, where an elegant pavilion had been built for him. A small palace was

being constructed for him on the banks of the Bosu, where also two gardeners were engaged in forming a kind of park among the rich vegetation, excavating grottoes, raising little mountains, constructing kiosks, and making little bridges in order to embellish the locality.

There were but few public monuments in Russian Tashkend. The little church, painted red and white, and rising from a platform, had a silver cross on the top, and was surrounded by a colonnade to shelter the faithful who could not find room inside. It stood alone in an immense Square.

The bells are suspended from a horizontal beam, supported by two posts erected on one side of the Square. There is also an extremely modest fountain, fed by the water of an *arık* which passes through a filter. Around the Square numerous saplings of poplars had been planted.

The club which superseded the Minuruk in winter, and served to give amateur theatrical representations, was inhabited by the son of the Amir of Bokhara during his sojourn at Tashkend.

Houses were built in Tashkend with enviable facility. Near the building site, a hole is dug, the earth taken from it is mixed with straw, and bricks are made which are laid out to dry in the sun. The bricks having become dry, walls are built of them, using diluted earth from the same hole instead of mortar. The roof which does not slant much, is supported by slender beams. It is formed of alternate layers of canes and mats, the whole being of the thickness of thirty centimètres, but the last layer is always of earth which becomes in spring covered with vegetation. The roofs are all repaired in autumn, but in spite of this precaution the water very often filters through in winter. A brick-kiln was in course of construction, and the small number of burnt bricks manufactured were used in exceptional cases, the majority of the people continuing to build according to the old system.

For the purpose of providing the town with eatables, a bazar was formed on the side of the Sart town where the two nationalities meet; this is called the little bazar, but another much larger one was being opened in the centre of the Russian town itself, and daily acquiring more and more importance; on Sundays great fairs were held in it, on which occasions the bazar of the Sart Tashkend was deserted.

The fort of Tashkend was nothing but an enclosure within which long barracks in straight lines were being built for the purpose of lodging the troops in winter. In summer they were encamped outside, on the banks of the Satar, in certain extremely long

huts covered with mats. The fort of Tashkend had, however, already assumed a European aspect with its bastions, fosses, slopes, counter-slopes, fascines, &c., which greatly detracted from its beauty, the ancient walls with battlements having been much more picturesque. At that time the Russian town contained not more than six hundred houses, belonging to as many civilian owners, who were partly in the employment of Government, and partly merchants, who deal in everything, but their supply of goods depended entirely upon the arrival of caravans. When Adamoli arrived, shoes were so scarce, that none could be purchased for a treasure; afterwards all the shops had a plentiful stock of them, but plates and tumblers could not be got.

E. RENATSEK.

---

## ART. VI.—SOME GHAZALS OF NAZIR AKBARABADI.

The Hindustani poet of modern times who has best succeeded in reaching the heart of the people is Sheikh Mir Wali Muhammad of Agra, better known by his *takhallus* or *nom de plume* of Nazir of Akbarabad. He died 30 years ago or so. After Kabir there is no one whose sayings and writings have such a widespread celebrity, or are so generally appreciated by the common folk. On the other hand, the *literati* profess not to understand him and affect to despise his poetry. All his compositions, however, are suggestive and original, and well worth study for the sterling good sense that underlies the poetical forms. The Nawal Kishor Press at Lucknow has issued a *Kuliat-i-Nazir*, or Complete Works of Nazir, and from this edition I give here free metrical renderings of a few of his *ghazals* by way of an introduction to him :—

### I.

#### PURE OF HEART.

One morn I chanced upon a maid so sweet  
That Love himself had fallen at her feet :  
Soft cheeks of peach and full lips ruby red,  
Teeth bright as pearls and laughter-loving eyes,  
A form to make men wish all virtue dead  
And angels long to bear her to the skies.  
"Thou fairest flower of all mine eyes have seen,  
O tell me where thy wayward feet would'st bend !  
That I awhile may be thy slave, my Queen,  
And thou awhile may'st know me for thy friend."  
She gazed with wonder in her wondrous eyes.  
"May be thy face is new, may be forgot,  
So thy desire is cause for my surprise,  
But if thou wouldest walk with me, why not ?"  
"I come," I said, "all things are right with thee,  
Too pure of heart to think impurity !"

### II.

#### LOVE THE TYRANT.

O fall not lightly at a stranger's feet !  
O be not eager for the lover's part !  
Young lips are soft and young hands prone to meet,  
And where hands go there follows soon the heart.  
Where dwells the glamour of enchanting eyes  
That is the place, mine heart, for thee to fear ;  
Fly thou thence, as the wild hart bounds and flies :  
To beard the hounds what boots it to the deer ?  
So strength to battle in what victim lies,  
While yet the magic tyrant, Love, is near ?



### III.

#### IF LOVE BE UNREQUITED.

When once love sees, and seeing love is glad,  
 His secret lives a secret but in name;  
 So in the moonlight, when the moon was sad  
 For her own beauty put to utter shame  
 At my love's coming in her beauty clad,  
 We stood love's shame-faced captives where she came.  
 We happy were, until a wrong chance led  
 Our headless feet adown wrath's foolish way  
 And she in anger at my anger said :  
 "Since then thou art not one with me, why stay?"  
 And so my lot is grief till love be slain.  
 O thou that seest truth where truth may be  
 And oft hast spoken truth, speak truth again,  
 And say, fair friend, what now is left to me?  
 "If thou must love, and loving her is pain,  
 Go, friend, elsewhere and take thy heart with thee."

### IV.

#### THE LOVER'S QUARREL.

"Oh say, my love, why dost thou drive me forth?"  
 "I drive thee forth, since strife doth weary me."  
 "But why a rival bring to fan my wrath?"  
 "Now, nay, thy foolish wrath is blinding thee."  
 "Ah, love, my heart is sad that this hath been."  
 "Thou sayest sooth," soft smiling said my sweet.  
 "But why thus hold thyself as very queen?"  
 "And should I not, when thou art at my feet?"  
 Bear with me, love, that I may show mine heart."  
 "What need for it, since I its secrets know?"  
 "Ah, why dost take my words in evil part?"  
 "The cause is this; thine heart thou dost not show."  
 "I go—I love not this," I said, and she,  
 "Go, but thine heart will bring thee back to me."

### V.

#### THE DIWALI FESTIVAL.

The full tale of her splendour and delight  
 And fair Diwālī's glory who shall tell?  
 When every street and busy lane is bright  
 As those emblazoned halls where riches dwell:  
 When every brimming cup is filled with wine  
 And sheen of myriad lamps fills every street,  
 When hearts are glowing with a joy divine  
 And all the ways are thronged with beauty's feet.  
 There lover to his mistress shyly saith,  
 "Now tell me, sweet, what thing thou would'st desire?"  
 But she false answer gives with faltering breath  
 And they twain war with words in playful ire.  
 Here rakes are gambling in the garish light  
 And losers frown and severed winners smile  
 That chance hath favored them for this one night  
 And fortune made them happy for a while.  
 So dwells Diwālī fairest in men's eyes  
 What though Dasahra strive to wrest the prize.

VI.

HOW LOVE IS WON.

Go seek thy love as oft as thou would'st seek,  
Not with bold speech, but shyly with thine eyes :  
Fools cry aloud when but the eyes should speak,  
And think, fond fools, that hearts are won by sighs.  
Go meet her so that she but guess thy will,  
Keep doubt afar by frank unconscious ways ;  
Soon will she thirst for speech,—be prudent still,  
That love unbidden lurk within thy praise :  
For this the elders in their wisdom teach,—  
Fair love is won by stealth and cunning speech.

VII.

SPRING.

O thou that mak'st sweet spring that sees thee glad  
For joyous envy of thy sweeter charms,  
Just as thou art, in golden splendour clad  
Come to me close and hide thee in mine arms.  
Just as thou art, they soft lips closer bring  
To grant the kisses that my lips will ask :  
Our one desire to revel in the spring,  
To cull the spring-tide flowers our only task.  
The vernal songsters trill their sweetest lay,  
The garden waits us and all life is bright,  
Where cooing ring-doves murmur to the day  
And nightingales sing blithely to the night.  
Then be thou happy that the spring is gay  
That I be happy for my love's delight.

R. C. T.

---

## ART. VII.—ABOUT INDIGO PLANTING AND INDIGO PLANTERS.

**I**T is an old story how the cultivation of indigo was commenced in India under the Honourable John Company's auspices, sometimes avowedly on its behalf, and sometimes indirectly, one or two of its servants being usually the largest shareholders in the factories that were first started. Usually these gentlemen held office in the districts in which these factories were situated: it was, indeed, mainly because of their official influence and power that it became possible to establish and maintain the factories. It is related of the oldest concern in Tirhoot that its vats and boiling and press-houses were demolished twice by a jealous zemindar, and his obedient, and, on these occasions, not at all unwilling following, and that at last sepoys were sent from Patna to coerce the refractory neighbourhood to submission, and to teach all and sundry implicated in the work of demolition a lesson, accompanied by a significant hint not to demolish any more. They did their work thoroughly and effectually, after the manner of that bygone time, and twelve months afterwards the building of number three factory was completed—and that triumph of perseverance under difficulties endured. Then, conceiving it now to be his turn, the ex-Parisian exquisite, Marquis of something or other, who had been driven from *la belle France*, and had drifted in some unexplained fashion to India, began to taste the sweets of revenge. He organized a troop of sepoys and *bud-mashes* of his own, and sent them forth to harry the neighbourhood and compel his neighbours to whatever seemed good to him; and his factory was a fortress in case of accidents. But there were no "accidents." The memory of the troops from Patna endured and availed much. Tradition has it that this old French Marquis built for himself a convenient nest in the topmost branches of a tall tree that grew not far from the entrance to his Indian castle, and arranged a staircase of ladders up to it. To this observatory he would repair almost daily, telescope in hand, hair duly powdered, ruffles on cravat and at wrist, coat silver-laced, and, thus gorgeously arrayed, watch the operations of his swashbuckling myrmidons, or admire the beauties of growing indigo, as far as his point of vantage gave him opportunity. After the building of his third factory he was never disturbed or opposed again, by neighbours, or by any body else. The raid of the troops established him firmly and permanently. Thereafter, all the days of his life, he lived and ruled an absolute monarch. In later years,

when the Hon'ble John Company's servants had at any rate no overt and direct connexion with indigo, there was an Englishman in lower Bengal who had somewhat similar experiences, followed somewhat similar courses, and prospered and accumulated a very handsome fortune, and secured for himself a very fine estate. He is said to have found the Soonderbuns a convenient part of the country to deport refractory ryots to. Yet again, within the memory of many old Anglo-Indians still living, there was a man up-country who made his very name a terror to the neighbourhood he lived in, and made himself, if not a terror, at least rather more than a nuisance, to unfortunate Magistrates and others of that ilk who were supposed to keep the peace and uphold the dignity of law and order in his part of the world. He was, all his life long, a law unto himself, and did pretty much as he pleased, the supremacy of the British Government, and all laws and regulations notwithstanding. He was the last of the old freebooting planters whose rule of conduct was:—

“That he shall take who has the power,  
And he shall keep who can.”

With marvellous talent—of a sort—he managed for many years to outlive his day and generation, ignoring the march of progress, and waging war very successfully against the reign of law, and the dispensation of latter day good government and orderliness that encompassed him, and that had established itself to more or less extent in the indigo districts everywhere, outside his territories. Death, however, proved too strong for him at last. After being more than once left for dead on the field of battle by *lattials* who supposed that they had battered all the life out of him, the old heathen really did one day go over to the majority, dying hard, but dying in his bed, more or less decently, much as more ordinary folk do. His like there has never been in India since; happily there is never likely to be.

The old heathen we have referred to above was a man who lived out of his time. He was exceptional altogether. He ought by rights to have been a buccaneer, two hundred years ago, and filled his cup full of atrocities at the expense of some bygone generation. He must not be considered the type of a class. But that such a life as he led should have been possible in British India in the last half of the 19th century is suggestive of many matters worth thinking about. Therefore we have made mention of it here. We return now to the men who immediately succeeded the old freebooting planters of the early years of the century. They inherited many of the traditions of the men who went before them, were inclined to be autocratic, *zubberdust*, self-assertive, not

disposed to brook interference whether on the part of Government officials, or breathless philanthropists, or ignorant politicians, or any body else for that matter. It seemed to them that, within their own domain (*dehat* they called it) they were sovereign lords, or at any rate liege lords very largely constituted indeed, and endued with almost plenary powers, and any attempt at interference with this sovereignty of theirs they were apt to resent bitterly, and with probably unpleasant results to the aggressor. But to their subjects, to the men who yielded willing obedience and homage, they were kindly disposed and considerate, careful always that they should be secured the due enjoyment of such comforts and blessings as pertained to their lot in life. They were able to see that a man called to be a king has duties, and lies under obligations of sorts, more than lesser men, and they carried this idea into practice, in the actual business of life, in a manner quite original, altogether their own. They expected and demanded from their vassals feudal service, assistance in the way of *lattials*, sometimes a general muster of all able bodied men subject to their dominion. That was when they had a big quarrel on hand with some rich and powerful zemindar, or when, by way of relieving the tedium of mofussil existence, they wanted to fix a quarrel on somebody else, somebody "worth the shot" as the homely saying is. Expecting ready, unquestioning service from their dependents they, for their part, were always willing and ready to espouse the cause of, and to fight for, all faithful followers if these were hurt in any way, or felt themselves aggrieved. They never allowed the men who did their duty by them to be put upon in any way by outsiders. Moreover, they were generous in remissions of rent in a bad season, in the assessment of rents always lenient. The relations between planter and ryot—between landlord and tenant that is to say in effect—were patriarchal, homely and genial in those old days. If the ryot found himself in any trouble he went naturally to the planter to be delivered, whether the trouble was police oppression, or debt to a bunniah, or want of money to marry his son or his daughter suitably; and the planter always helped him. On the other hand, if the planter felt himself aggrieved in any way, or found himself thwarted in his plans by anybody, he called his ryottee following to his assistance, and that following never disappointed him. It was a mutually helpful arrangement which doubtless very often proved inconvenient and worse, to people the planter had a grudge against, or wanted to get something out of, an arrangement opposed to the reign of law and order, and

what ought to have been the paramount authority of Government. But then Government was powerless in the far mofussil as to this matter of law and good order, quite unable to carry its legislative exactments into practical effect. It was for the planter a choice between helping himself, and being bullied and cheated. Naturally enough, he chose the former alternative. It was, with very few exceptions, an arrangement decidedly advantageous to the ryots in those old, unconsolidated days, when the civil service was undermined, when there were no sub-divisions, and not as many magisterial districts even, as there are now; when justice, as administered according to law, lay as far away from the poor man's reach as heaven does almost, and a venal, tyrannical police ruled the mofussil roost much as it suited their cupidity and their lust of oppression to rule. The interloper planter saw that his ryots were properly defended in the courts if they happened to get into trouble, and he either coerced the police of his district, or had that easily bribed conglomeration of all rascaldom in his pay, and so secured to his subjects peace and freedom from their dreaded inquisition. This in itself was no trifling boon to these English Government ruled people, was verily and truly a far reaching, and most real and appreciable benefit. How many of their descendants now-a-days would feel inclined to "jump for joy" if they could count upon as much, and as efficient protection; for now-a-days the police are all powerful, and the harpies who belong to the force are to the full as cruel and uncrupulous as their predecessors of an older generation were. Crying over spilt milk is, however, quite useless as far as mofussil policemen are concerned. If it were not so, all the crying about their iniquities would have been met with some adequate, some practical, response from the Government long ago. When the ryots of Bengal and Behar cry out, as they so often do about police spilt milk, do they ever remember, or consider, we wonder, for how much of it they have to thank themselves—their own, and idealists and grievance-mongers of sorts to whom they, in their ignorance and proneness to credulity, fell such an easy prey?

In the terrible mutiny time, indigo ryots, in lower Bengal and in Behar alike, held fast to the planters, brought them news of the mutineers' movements and doings, protected them, carried on the necessary factory work when their masters were obliged to seek safety in temporary flight, were in every way helpful and eager to show their good will and gratitude. Shahabad was the only notable exception. It certainly speaks well for the cordial relations that existed between planters and ryots in all the other indigo districts, that at such

a supreme crisis, they held fast by their old masters, and never seem to have thought even of trying to throw off their easy yoke, much as they were cajoled, and bullied, and threatened, with a view to that end. It must surely be presumed that they knew they had been well treated and were satisfied and grateful, or surely they would have taken advantage of the splendid seeming opportunity vouchsafed them, forced upon them almost, to upset the old order of things, to free themselves from all existing obligations whether of debt or service, and to start anew in life on thoroughly independent lines, with more or less modicum of *loot* to grease the wheels for the start.

They were tempted with such bait—bait which at that time it was very dangerous to refuse; but they do not seem to have had any inclination to rise to it. In spite of all temptations and manifold evil examples round and about them, they remained faithful to what was their salt, and in a most exemplary manner careful of the interests of the men who before the trouble began had been careful of their interests, who had always befriended them in their need, and to whom they had so long been accustomed to look for protection and guidance. Alas, in a short year or two, these kindly, comfortable, mutually helpful relations were sadly, ruinously altered. In Lower Bengal the very men who had withstood the blandishments of their own countrymen, and turned a deaf ear to suggestions of mutiny and plunder, succumbed without a second thought to what they deemed the desire of the victorious English Raj—a desire to ruin the planters, and stamp indigo out of the land, as they imagined it. Interested emissaries went about the country, telling the easily gulled villagers that Government wanted to do away with indigo cultivation in India altogether, and inciting them to repudiation of their contracts with the planters, and renunciation of the feudal service which, although it was now represented to them as a bondage grievous to be borne, they had certainly never before thought or dreamt of regarding from that point of view.

Further, they were urged by specious argumentation to declare a general hostility to the planters who had been for so many years their friends and benefactors. They were Orientals, and very ignorant and credulous, these village folk. They took not much thought of any thing beyond what they were led to believe was the wish of the all-powerful English Raj; and moreover by plausible tales and arguments, and promises of sorts, they were led to believe in all sorts of good things coming to them under the new dispensation—a sort of millennium for Bengalee peasants that was forthwith to be. Persuaded by fear of the great English Raj, by greed, by cunningly devised promises, they waxed contumacious,

repudiated their contracts, and refused to grow indigo and pay rent. The planters, for their part, tried to enforce performance of contracts, and payment of rents and dues, not always, or often, indeed in a strictly legal manner. To such manner they had never been used. It had seemed casier to them, and more convenient for all parties concerned, to dispense with it. So the contest began. Then came Mr. Ashley Eden's proclamation to the ryots that nobody need grow indigo who did not choose, a public notification which was of course held to mean that any body who chose might repudiate his contracts and debts to the planters, was, as a matter of fact, ordered by the *Sirkar* to repudiate all such obligations.

The results of this proclamation—of Sir John Peter Grant's grievance-mongering tour in Jessore and Krishnaghur, the inception of Act X of 1859, are matters of history well thumbed and discussed, and need not be dwelt upon here. It suffices to say that between them the ruin of the indigo interest in Lower Bengal was effected.

The wreck of the Bengal factories gave a great impetus to the cultivation of the dye in Behar, especially in Tirhoot, Chupra, and Chumparan. In these districts many new concerns were started, many old ones doubled and trebled the amount of land they had in cultivation. Some of them were worked on what is known as the *serat* system. Practically, they were all worked on the feudal system, much as factories in Lower Bengal had been worked, with just a few modifications and up-country adaptations. The Behar planter was more of a middleman than planters had been down country, and had to pay a very high price in order to secure the lease of villages suitable for his crop, to the zemindars; making advances to them instead of to the ryots, and paying them yearly in the way of rent more than he could ever hope to realize for himself, often very much more. He trusted to his far larger outturn of indigo, to high cultivation, and high prices to recover this initial loss. He could always afford to pay more for the lease of a suitable village than outsiders could, because the crop of which he had virtually a monopoly, was such a valuable one. It was to his interest to work on friendly terms with his ryots, because, if for no other reason, he was in the main dependent upon them for labour, and for the use of their ploughs and carts. He was willing, therefore, to let his ryots enjoy their holdings at very low rates of rent for this consideration, willing to advance money or seed-grain to them in their time of need, ready always to help and protect them, as long as they in their turn helped him in the way he wanted. In short, it was the



old feudal relation about which we have been discoursing, only changed in little matters of detail. This was at first, before competition grew keen and factories were built where there was really no room for them, and planters grew greedy and exacting, taking up more land for indigo cultivation than the village could afford to spare from food crops, and its own needs. Feudalism of a healthy, helpful, in any wise desirable sort, was obviously impossible under such conditions. The relations between planters and ryots in Behar at last grew to a condition of antagonism in some places, a more or less strained condition all over the province. Whilst this was ripening for mischief, and Sir George Campbell was devising possible remedies, there came the famine of 1874, and with it, and into the remotest parts of Behar, an influx of prying, open-eyed officials, and visitors of sorts, who saw, and sympathised, and duly reported to Government. Even Sir Richard Temple, fain although he was to see every thing rosy hued and to show gratitude and good will to the planter friends who helped him through his famine exaggeration, was obliged to take some notice of what these visitors of sorts reported, and when, soon afterwards, he became Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal, to give some heed to what his predecessor in office had left on record on the subject. He dropped a hint or two in the proper quarters, and some weak, half-hearted attempts at reform were made; but nothing much was really done; nothing much could have been expected from his half-heartedness, and content with superficiality—nothing, that is to say, beyond what is known in the vulgar Anglo-Indian tongue as “eyewash.” It was reserved for Sir Ashley Eden to revolutionize the indigo system of Behar, as years before he had set the ball of revolution rolling in Lower Bengal. Happily, however, in Behar, the needed reforms were effected without ruin to any body, but quietly, comfortably, and with considerable advantage ultimately to every body concerned. The planters, as soon as they heard that Sir Ashley Eden was to be ruler over them, bethought them that it was then high time to set their house in order really and thoroughly. They took counsel together, therefore, and one result of their deliberations was the establishment of the Behar Planters’ Association. It has been, and is, a great success, this Association. It lays down certain broad rules for the conduct of planters and the management of indigo factories, especially as to the relations between planters and ryots, which all who desire the advantages of membership, must agree to, and abide by, and if individual members are thereafter found contravening the rules, backsliding, or behaving in any way likely to make

occasion for scandal against planters, they are forthwith called to account, and dealt with by a jury of their fellows. This plan has proved most effectual in the prevention and cure of abuses. We are assured on the authority of Government officials and others that the working of the Behar factories is now every thing that could be desired, that the "commercial principles" Sir George Campbell wanted introduced into their management prevail now, and have quite superseded feudalism, and that the relations between planters and ryots, employers and employed, are as cordial as they can be expected to be in these latter days, when capital and labour are always more or less in opposition. In Behar now it is a law-abiding opposition, the sort of contrast many Englishmen consider wholesome for both parties, just as they think that, in the interests of good government in England, there ought always to be two parties, one "in," and one "out," one of them at any rate always in opposition. With politics in general, perhaps, we should rather say with party politics, the Behar Planters' Association does not greatly concern itself, if at all. It is a Planters' Association, pure and simple, not at all like so many of the etcetera associations now flourishing in India, and does not aspire to dictate to the Government about matters of State policy, of which it has no knowledge and with which it can have but very remote concern. Of course it has valuable suggestions to give about the proposed new Rent Bill; and it has forwarded to Government energetic protests against the Ripon-Ilbert Criminal Procedure Code Amendment Bill, a matter with which it has very great concern. It gave loyal support to the Local Self-Government Bill until it became manifest that the Beharlis did not want it, and that its introduction into the province was likely to prove mischievous. Its remonstrances and its counsels naturally carry weight with them, and cannot be ignored,—could not be ignored by the most perverse of English governments. That again points to one of the beauties and uses of the Association. A. B. C. and D. country gentlemen, let us say, may represent matters and memorialize, and complain to Government about something they want done, or something they want left undone; or they may air a grievance from this time till doomsday, and find their protests and their prayers quite unavailing—handed over to some pert secretary to dispose of as seems good to him. But let A. B. C. and D, those same country gentlemen, form themselves into an Association, give it some name, and assign to it some head-quarters, and their grievance will be forthwith enquired into; their complaints will be listened to respectfully; probably they will get what they want. Verily, as George Eliot

says somewhere—"the right word is a power." The Behar Planters' Association is a "right word," and a power from many points of view.

The Indigo Planter of to-day differs as much from the Indigo Planter of the olden time as does the new system from the old. It goes without saying that in these days of School Boards and high education everywhere, and more or less of æstheticism, more or less rampant all over the world, he is better educated, and a man of more culture than were those who went before him. Railways and steamboats and the Suez Canal, too, have brought him, in common with other Anglo-Indians of to-day, nearer to the old country, and renewal of the old ideas and gracious influences. He manages to take a run home now and again and renews himself, and he takes in English newspapers and reviews and periodicals, and makes a point of reading all the new books reported worth anything—at any rate, of reading as many as one man can in this age of many books. In the old, forgotten days of a four or five months tedious passage round the Cape, Indigo Planters came out here, for the most part, whether determinedly or undeterminedly at the outset, to spend their lives here. They made the best of those lives according to their lights, got what enjoyment they could out of them, that is to say, after the manner of Squire Western, and men of his stamp. They drank their country bottled beer, a dozen or more apiece at a sitting with as much impunity and satisfaction, as home-staying English Squires drank their three or four bottles of port after dinner. They were fond of sport, if it did not involve too violent exercise, fonder perhaps of a *hookah*. They were sad heathens it is to be feared, the older lot of them at any rate. They seem to have been very fond of practical jokes. Indeed, this fondness continued with their successors, long after their time. Men in Tirhoot still tell the story of Buggins and the ghostly black cat, a domestic animal carefully anointed with phosphorus, and let loose in his bed room at night with accompaniment of yells, screams, and the discordant notes of a brass *chillumchee* beaten with spoons and forks. Buggins was in his griffin-age, and was very much of a griffin at that time. He was persuaded at last that he was haunted by a demon in the shape of this black cat, and that the only way to get rid of his unwelcome visitor was to go and do *poop* under a peepul tree near the bungalow—which he did accordingly. "Billee Taylor" was a great hand at practical jokes. He it was who managed somehow to get a youngster's old mare upstairs one evening, tying her to the head of that unsuspecting one's bed. That too confiding unfortunate had complained of suffering from

nightmare; and "Billee" said he was determined that, for once, at least the youngster should not be left to the wiles of mere imagination. Billee it was, too, who on the night of a Race Ball at the station, managed, in conjunction with another Irishman, to upset a lot of hackeries—enough hackeries to block it up—along the only road the dancers had to go home by. The record of his practical jokes is endless. He was supposed to spend at least half his time in their concoction and elaboration. There were others too, with a reputation in this respect scarcely inferior to his. The story of all their exploits would fill a volume, or more probably a great many volumes. The men of to-day find the hard battle of life quite enough for their energies, and are very little given to such pranks. When they have any time to spare, they get up sky races, or a pigsticking party, or they organize a volunteer meet, or go to the Nepal terai, or to Purneah, for *shikar*. Or, failing any such large opportunities as these, they hunt the wily jackal within factory limits, or get up scratch polo matches with their nearest neighbours. Some of the best polo players in India are to be found in the indigo districts.

In one respect the planters of the new school differ not at all from the men who went before them, for they are exceedingly hospitable. Happy the stranger who manages to get an introduction to somebody in the indigo districts. He is then free of the guild; and it must be his own fault if he does not enjoy himself and his visit. Horses, traps, dogs, guns, polo ponies are at his disposal, parties of sorts are made up for his delectation; he is made welcome everywhere he goes. Cynics have been found to declare that this is a result of the lonely life the Indigo Planter is for the most part compelled to lead. They declare that he feels so very lonely, and is so tired of his own society, that he is only too glad to secure the society of some gentlemanly stranger. But, like most cynical sayings, this is a gross libel. The Indigo Planter is hospitable by nature as well as traditionally, and is never happier than he is when making strangers feel at home in his factory, and his happy hunting grounds. In many ways surely, the old order has changed, giving place to the new; but not in the matter of a large, open-handed hospitality. The Indigo Planter has a well defined and very well founded objection to loafers; but even to them he will grant such hospitable entertainment and aid as they stand in need of, as Sir George Campbell found out when he was on his way to Durbhungah in the famine time, and, presenting himself one morning at a factory on the way, quite unattended and ill-clad and unkempt as usual, was mistaken for a vagabond at first. But, all the same he was very hospitably treated.

ART. VIII.—FOLKLORE OF THE HEADLESS HORSEMAN IN NORTHERN INDIA.

BY R. C. TEMPLE.

MR. WILLIAM CROOKE, C.S., writing privately to me, on the 26th February 1883, from Awagarh near Jalesar, North-West Provinces, said : " that at about the close of 1882 there appeared an apparition in his neighbourhood, called Rúnd or Dúnd, which frightened and disturbed the native population a good deal. This apparition was a horseman who appeared at night, mounted, but without his head on his shoulders. He carried it before him instead on the pommel of his saddle, and in each hand he carried a sword. His habit was to stand before a man's door and call out to him by name. If he answered, he was sure to die of fever, or some other disease, before long."

The superstition caused so much terror about Awagarh, that the people would not answer the village watchman's challenge at night, as it was reported that several deaths had occurred from unwittingly answering the Dúnd.

An old Thákur told Mr. Crooke that he had known several previous instances of the appearance of the Dúnd, who was in fact generally to be found on the prowl. The Thakur also said, that in the old days these creatures, whom he supposed to be *Rákshasus*, or giants, always attended at battles, and were to be seen charging the enemy, headless as they were.

The proper way to get rid of a Dúnd, the people said, was to throw over him a piece of a particularly dirty cloth, and the idea suggested by a Muhammadan, that the whole story was concocted by the bad characters of the neighbourhood to facilitate thefts, was universally scouted.

Mr. Crooke subsequently ascertained two more facts about this headless horseman, viz., that he was connected with comets, and that in Calcutta a lane near Creek Row is called Gallá Kattá Kafirí Gali, or Headless Caffre (African) Lane, in which a headless negro is supposed to wander.

The notion of the headless horseman is very common in the Panjáb and all over Northern India ; and some more stories about him will now be given, and an attempt made to trace his mythological history.

I am told, that in the Granth, \* or Scripture of the tenth and

---

\* Framed in 1696 A. D., for political reasons in opposition to the original or Adí Granth. See Trumpp's

*Adi Granth*, p. 91. It has never been translated and is very difficult to read.

last Sikh Gurú, Gobind Singh, who flourished between 1675 and 1708 A. D., there is an account of one Kharak Singh, a warrior of Jarásandh of Magadh Des, who is there said to have fought for his lord against Kishn after his head was cut off. Now, classically speaking, Jarásandha was the son of Brihadratha, king of Magadh (South Bihár) and father-in-law of Kansa of Mathurá. He constantly fought with Krishna for killing Kansa, but was himself eventually killed by Bhíma. Who Gurú Gobind Singh's Kharak Singh represents I am unable to say.

Among the Sikhs there is another well-known instance of the headless horseman or warrior, from whom Sirdár Jíwan Singh Shahíd of Sháhzádpúr in the Ambálá District is descended, and from whom he gets his family (more properly clan) name of Shahíd. The origin of the Shahíd *misál*, or clan, is usually thus given.\*

Díp Singh and his pupil Sadá Singh, Jatt Sikhs, were attendants, or priests, at the well known Sikh shrine of Gurdwára, or Damdamá, at Talwandí near Bhattindá in the Patialá Territory. Díp Singh and Sadá Singh fought the Musalmáns and were both killed in fights against them. Among their followers were Karm Singh and Dharm Singh, two Siddhú Jatt warriors from the Máujhá in the train of Gurbakhsh Singh, who followed him into the Ambálá District, where they conquered a good deal of territory. The villages of Sháhzádpúr and Kesrí fell to Dharm Singh and Karm Singh respectively, but eventually they both came into the hands of one descendant, from whom springs the present Sirdár Jíwan Singh, Shahíd of Sháhzádpúr. The *misál* of which Karm Singh and Dharm Singh were leaders, got their *soubriquet* of Shahíd or Martyr, as being the followers of Sadá Singh, the Martyr, who was so called because he fell fighting against the Musalmáns, and was said to have fought for a mile after his head was cut off.

Sir Lepel Griffiu is more circumstantial.† He says that the Shahíd *misál* was one of the smaller Sikh confederacies, and obtained its name (*Shahíd*, martyr) and origin in the following manner:—Gurú Gobind Singh, flying from his enemies in the time of the Emperor Aurungzeb, took refuge in the little village of Talwandí, in the jungle to the south of Bhattindá. Here he remained ten days, and after the Gurú's death, a temple was raised in Talwandí to his memory, and the name changed to Damdamá, which signifies "a breathing place," (but?). The first *Mahant*, or priest put in charge of the shrine was Díp Singh, who was killed in action with the Governor of Láhor, and became a *Shahíd*, or

\* Wynyard's *Ambálá Settlement Report*, 1859, p. 19, sec. 83.

† *Rajus of the Panjáb*, 2nd Ed. 1873, pp. 42-3.

martyr. Sadá Singh, his *chela* or disciple, succeeded him at the shrine. He, however, like his predecessor was fonder of fighting than praying, and attacked the Muhammadan Governor of Jalandhar, and at Adlikolá was killed in a skirmish, his head being severed from his body. He is said neither to have fallen from his horse nor to have given up fighting, but to have galloped a long distance and cut down many of the enemy before he died. Hence the family, or rather the followers of the *Mahant* of Damdamá took the name of the martyrs. Karm Singh succeeded Sadá Singh and took possession of the country about Rannú and Damdamá, Khárl, Jarol, and Faizullapúr. He was the real founder of the *family*, for he was the first to marry, and left, on his death in 1784, two sons, Guláb Singh and Mahtáb Singh, the former of whom succeeded him, and was one of the first chiefs to offer assistance to the British, as a *sanad* of Sir D. Ochterlony, dated 4th January 1804, proves. Sirdár Guláb Singh died in 1844 and Shiv Kirpál Singh, then only six years old, succeeded. \* He has estates worth Rs. 30,000 a year, and is still the guardian of the Damdamá shrine, which brings in about Rs. 1,000 a year in offerings. Dharm Singh, the brother of Karm Singh, had a share in the original territory, but he died without issue, † and his widow was married by his brother.

However, Gurú Gobind Singh seems to have founded and built the Damdamá shrine himself before the death of Aurungzebe—which occurred in 1707; ‡ but, letting this pass, from Griffin's remarks, we get at a succession—Díp Singh, Sadá Singh, Karm Singh,—between the dates, 1707 and 1784 A. D. Another vernacular account § says that Díp Singh was killed in a fight with Ahmad Shah Durrání (? Griffin's Governor of Láhor), whom he went out to fight in his wrath at this Muhammadan leader's proceedings in the Punjáb. So his death must be placed about A. D. 1762, and Sadá Singh's somewhat later.

But the belief in this miraculous ancestor of the Shahíd Sirdárs is by no means universal, and the following accounts are given as to the origin of the name. || One Díp Singh, a Sikh convert, lived at Pohú near Jalandhar, and, joining Gurbakhsh Singh of Láhnagar and five (or seven) others, formed a *misál* of 12,000 Sikhs, and called themselves Shahíds, or the martyrs, in token of their disregard of death in the cause of religion. They occupied the country about Gurú Gobind Singh's shrine at Damdamá. Afterwards Ahmad Shah Durrání came and destroyed

\* Jiwan Singh is Shiv Kirpál Singh's son.

† According to long established Jat custom.

‡ *Adi Granth*, pp. 92-93.

§ *Pothí Sri Guru Panth Parkás*, by Bhai Gyán Singh Gyání, Delhi Murtaza Press, 1980, pp. 676-677 Gurumukhi Text.

|| *Ibid.*, loc. cit.

the shrines and temples at Amritsar, and this so incensed Dīp Singh that he went forth to battle with the Pathāns. This fight resulted in the death of Dīp Singh and all his party, since when their self-given title of Shahīd has been generally recognised. Dīp Singh was, succeeded by Sadā Singh, his cousin, from whom the Shāhzaḍpūr Sirdars are descended. Gurbakhsh Singh lived in the neighbourhood of Anandpūr\* in the Hoshiārpūr district near Rūpar, and met his death fighting the Musalmāns near Amritsar. He was succeeded by Sūbā Sing, whose descendants live at Pind Parkālī, near Anandpūr. This account, it will be observed, says nothing as to Sadā Singh's death and miraculous fighting without his head.

A local Ambālā account says that the Shahīds were a *misāl* of Akālīs† who settled at Damdamā. They had a fight with the Musalmāns at Amritsar, where their dead were buried in a pit over which a mound was made. On this mound an ancestor of Sirdār Jīwan Singh built a shrine, from which act of grace his family obtained the name of Shahīd. There is no mention in this account of Sadā Singh's martyrdom.

Yet other accounts of this *misāl* are to be found, which say nothing of Sadā Singh's fighting without his head. One‡ says that Gurbakhsh Singh and Karim Singh founded it with 8,000 followers, and were called Shahīds, simply because so many of them were killed in defence of their faith, and so they had made themselves more than usually remarkable as Sikh martyrs.

From all this it is pretty evident that some well-known legend has been fastened on Sadā Singh to account for his death, and the peculiar name borne by his followers or descendants. The fact of an exactly similar idea being found as far away as Jalesar from Ambālā shows that this legend is widely current.

I have thought it possible that these ideas of the headless Sikh warrior have originated in the story of the human sacrifice attributed to Gurū Gobind Singh, which with its attendant circumstances is thus related by Trumpp in his introduction to the *Adi Granth*§. As his mind (Gobind Singh's) was deeply tinged, owing to his early education by Hindū Pandits, with the superstitious notions of the Hindūs, he resolved, before embarking on his great enterprise, to secure to himself the aid of the Goddess Durgā, who was his special object of worship. After he had procured some Pandits from Benares he went with them to the hill of Nainā Debī||

\* The home of Gurū Gobind Singh.

† Worshipers of Akāl, the Timeless Being; a sect of zealots said to have been instituted by Gurū Gobind Singh. *Adi Granth*, p. cxviii.

‡ *Sikhān de Rāj dī Vithiā*; Gur-mukhī text: Lūṭhanā, 1863, p. 90.

§ Pp. xc, xci and foot-note 3 to p. xc.

|| Not far from Rūpar.



which is about eight miles (6 kos) distant from Anandpúr. There he began to practise the severest austerities according to the directions of the Pandits. When he had gone through the course of these austerities the Brahmans began to offer up his burnt-offerings, throwing hundreds of maunds of *ghí*, raw sugar and molasses into the fire. When the burnt-offering (*hom*) was completed, the Pandits told the Gurú that he should now, in order to make a powerful offering, cut off the head of his own son and put it before the Goddess. Gobind Singh had four sons, and when he asked their mothers to give him one, they flatly refused. The Gurú asked the Pandits what was to be done now, and when the Pandits answered that the head of some one else would do, five (others say twenty-five) disciples offered their heads, one of which was cut off and offered to the Goddess. And thus the burnt-offering was made complete. The story goes that thereupon Deví appeared and said, "Go, thy sect will prosper in the world,"—*Jáh, terá panth jagat vikhe tur pávevá.*

When the Gurú returned from the hills to Anandpúr, he assembled the societies of the disciples, and told them that he required the head of a disciple: he, who loved his Gurú, should give it. Most of them were terror-struck and fled, but five of them arose and resolutely offered their heads. Their names (which have been carefully recorded, whereas the name of the poor victim offered to the Naina Deví is not mentioned) were Dharm Singh, Sukkhá Singh, Dayá Singh, Himmat Singh and Mukkam Singh. These five he took into a room and told them, that, as he had found them true, he could give them the *Páhl*\* of the true religion (*sache dharm ki páhl*). He made them bathe and seated them side by side, dissolved purified sugar (*putáśá*) in water and stirred it with a two-edged dagger, and, having recited over it some verses which are written in the *Áká' Ustul*,† he made them drink some of the *sherbet* so mixed, pouring part of it on their

\* The initiatory rite of the Sikhs, elaborate rite was Gobind Singh's invention: *Adi Granth*, pp. xxxv, which originally consisted in drinking *sherbet* with two or three others, note 4 and xci, note 1. and saying *Wáh Gurú!* The more

† The *Ákál Ustul* or praise of the Timeless One, is in Gobind Singh's *Granth* and commences thus:—

*Ákál Purakh dī rachhā ham nai*

*Srab Loh dī rachhā ham nai:*

*Sarab Kālī dī rachhā ham nai*

*Sarab Lohī dī rachhā ham nai:*

The protection of the Timeless Being is on us:

The protection of the All-iron is on us:

The protection of the All-time is on us:—

The protection of the All-iron is on us. *Adi Granth*, p. xc.

heads and sprinkling the rest on their bodies. He then patted them with his hand, and cried with a loud voice, "Say, the *khálsá* of the *Wáh-Gurú*! Victory of (=to) the holy *Wáh-Gurú*!" (*Wáh-Gurú-Jí ká khálsá! Siri Wáh-Gurú-Jí ká fate!*) After he had given the *páhu* to these five in this manner, he took it likewise from them, and in this way all the rest of his disciples were initiated, to whom he gave the name of the *khálsá*, adding to the name of each the epithet Singh (lion.) Then he gave the order that whoever desired to be his disciple must always have five things with him, which all commence with the letter *kukká* (k), viz, the hair (*kes*) which must not be cut: a comb (*kanghí*): a knife (*kará*): a sword (*kirpán*): and breeches reaching to the knee (*kichchh*). Otherwise he would not consider him as his disciple.

Dr. Trumpp adds in a foot-note that there can be hardly any doubt that this bloody sacrifice was really offered, as all reports agree on this point. The Sikhs, who felt very much the atrocity of such an act, would never have ascribed any thing of this kind to their Gurú, if it had not really taken place. At the same time we may learn from this fact that the Bráhmans, even as late as the seventeenth century, did not scruple to offer up a human sacrifice.

For the present purpose the point to be deduced from the above is, that the notion of cutting off the head, and so making a martyr to faith is, as regards the Sikh religion, derived from the Hindu rites of Durgá or Deví, and is intimately connected with the history of the most sacred and popular portions of the creed of the Sikhs. It has been already seen from his story of Kharrak Singh, the soldier of Jarásandha, that Gobiud Singh borrowed the idea of the headless horseman from the old Bráhmanical fables, and there is no doubt that we must go to them for the origin of the notion, as will be seen more fully later on.

But, besides the above, there are several other modern legends of the headless horseman, or something like it, current both among Hindús and Musalmáns, and one which the Hindus tell about Battálá, an old and still populous town near Amritsar, is worth relating here.

There is in Battálá a shrine to one Bárá Chúdá Bhandári frequented by the members of that sept of the Panjábí Khattrís, who hold him in much reverence, coming from great distances to worship at his shrine, as they consider their saint to be a god. The ceremony of ear-piercing for luck\* is principally performed by them at this place. The origin of Bárá Chúdá's fame lies in the tale, that in some fight in the neigh-

bourhood he lost his head, that his headless trunk went on fighting, sword in hand, into the town, in the streets of which he fell, and that the people of the place raised the present tomb and shrine on the spot. The story is quite a modern one as Bábá Chúdá is stated to have met his death about 1730, probably during the irruption of Nádir Sháh in 1738.

But the idea of the headless warrior is far from being confined to the Hindús and Sikhs of the Panjáb. Ibbetson's *Karnál Settlement Report*, 1883, \* mentions the worship there of Mírán Sáhíb in the following terms, giving some new and very interesting information about the so-called Panjábí Sayyids and other shrines. The country is covered with small shrines to Musalmán martyrs, properly Shahíds,† but called Sayyids by the villagers, the story of which is this:—There was a Rájá Tharú, in the Nardak, after whom several villages are still called Tharúá, who dwelt in Hábrí, where he used to levy seigniorial rights from virgin brides, and one night the daughter of a Bráhmán suffered thus. Her father appealed for help to Mírán Sáhíb, a Sayyid, who collected an immense army of Sayyids, Mughals and Patháns, and vanquished the Rájá. The fight extended over the whole country to Delhi, and the Sayyid shrines are the graves of the Musalmáns who fell.

But a favorite prescription in sickness is to build a shrine to a Sayyid, whose name is often not even given, and when given, is almost always purely imaginary, so that Sayyid shrines are always being added to, and most of them are not connected with any actual person. Lamps are commonly lighted at the shrines on Thursdays, but offerings are seldom made except in illness or in fulfilment of a vow. These often take the form of a fowl, or a goat, or especially a goat's head (*síre*) and become the perquisite of Musalmán *faqírs*. One of the Imperial *kosminárs* or milestones, has thus been transferred into a Sayyid's shrine by the people of Karnál city, and every Thursday evening worshippers collect there, and so do *faqírs* who profit by them. The speciality of Sayyids is blue flags. They are said to be very malevolent, often causing illness and death. Boils are especially due to them, and they can make cattle to miscarry. One Sayyid, named Bhúrú, who has his shrine at Bári in Kaithal, shares with Mansá Deví of Mani Májrá, the honor of being the great patron of the thieves in this part of the Panjáb, and a share of the booty gained by these worthies is commonly given to his shrine.

\* P. 152, secs. 376 and 381.

† I would suggest *Sháhíd*, a common Panjábí expression for an up-  
right man "a true man and good."  
*E. g. tū Sháhíd hain kī chor?* Are you a true man or a scoundrel?

Mírán Sáhíb was a Sayyid of Baghdád of whom many wonderful stories are related. He is often said to be the same as Hazrat Pírán Pír of the Panjáb,\* but this seems very doubtful. He led the army, described above, and had his head carried off by a canon ball (!) during the battle, but he did not mind a bit and went on fighting. On this a woman in one of Rájá Thárú's villages called out, "Who is this fighting without his head?" No sooner had she spoken than the body said "*Haqq Haqq*," (my God, my God!), and fell down dead. But as it was falling, it said "What, are not these villages upside down yet?" And immediately every village belonging to and called after Rájá Thárú throughout the country was turned upside down, and all their inhabitants buried, except the Bráhman's daughter. The walls are still standing upside down to convince the unbeliever. Mírán Sáhíb was buried in Hábrí, and is commonly invoked and worshipped by the Nardak people, as also is his sister's son, Sayyid Kabír. They have a joint shrine called Mámúbhánjá (uncle and nephew) in Sunpat.

So much for popular legend: let us turn a while to sober history. Pírán Pír is Shekh Abdu'l-Qádir Gilání (or Jílání, or Gílí), † who was born in Gilán or Jílán in Persia ‡ in 1078 A. D., and died in 1166, aged 88, at Baghdád, where he is buried. He founded the well-known order of the Qádiríá saints or *faqírs*. His full name and titles were Pírán-i-Pír, Pír-i-Dastagír, Gháusu'l-Azim, Gháusu's-Samdáni, Mahbúb-i-Subhání, Mírán Muhayyu'd-dín, Sayyid 'Abdu'l-Qádir Jílání, Hassau'l-Hassání. § Now 'Abdu'l-Qádir Jílání's nephew (*bhánjá*) was Sayyid Ahmad Kabír Ra'áfí, who was the founder of the Ra'áfí or Gurzínár *faqírs*, || and there was another Sayyid Ahmad Kabír, father of the great Sayyid (or Shekh) Jalálu'd-dín (or Jalál) Makhdúm Jahámán Jahángasht of Multán, who flourished in 1308-1384 A. D., and of Sayyid Rájú Kattal, who died in 1403. All these are buried at Uchchá in Multán. This last Sayyid Ahmad Kabír was the son of Sayyid Jalál Bukhárí, who came to India, and followed the celebrated Shekh Baháu'd-dín Zakaríá of Multán, who flourished in 1170-1266 A. D. This Sayyid Jalál is always being mixed up with his grandson Shekh Jalál Makhdúm.

It is to be observed that Sayyid Ahmad Kabír Ra'áfí is, in the story, called nephew (*bhánjá*) of Pírán Pír of the Panjáb.

\* See below for an explanation of this.

† Beale's *Oriental Biog. Dict.* s. v.

‡ Properly Kil-o-Kilán. See *Fule's Marco Polo*, vol. i., pp. 51, f. f.

§ Herklot's *Qanoon-e-Islam*, Higinbotham's Ed., p. 155.

|| Herklot's *op. cit.*, pp. 157 and 193.

He was really the nephew of Pírán Pír 'Abdu'-l-Qádir Jílání, and so must have been living about 1150-1200 A. D., and, moreover, he never came to India. Whereas the Sayyid Ahmad Kabír, father of Makhdúm of Multán, flourished in the Panjáb a century later. I think these personages have been mixed up in the popular tradition, and that there is no doubt that the Mírán Sáhíb of the people is meant for 'Abdu'-l-Qádir Jílání, but, of course, neither he nor his nephew were ever in Hábrí, or indeed in India at all.

Besides these Kabírs there is a saint called Sayyid Ahmad Kabír, grandfather of quite another Sayyid Jalál Bukhárí, who was a noble under Sháh Jahán and flourished in 1594-1647. This saint lies buried at the Bijaimandal in Delhi. There was also a Sayyid Kabír, who was buried near Sultángańj at Agra in 1619, and, lastly, a Sheka Kabír, called also Báki Pír, who was buried at Chunár in 1644. One more point: the Manasá Deví mentioned by Mr. Ibbetson is a form of Deví or Durgá. She is represented as the sister of Sesha (Sesh Nág), and as counteracting the venom of snakes. She is also known as Jagadgaurí, Nityá and Padmávatí. Her shrine at Mani Májrá is not far from Káiká on the road to Simla.

To continue the tale as regards the Mussulmáns. At Páńspat the famous battle-field of Northern India, there is a well-known tale of a Biusirá, or headless man, which is usually told in this fashion. One Parjápat,\* a Kumbhár or Potter, began to build the modern town of Páńspat, but as fast as he built them the walls and buildings fell down again at night. At last the astrologers and Brahmans† told him, that until the head of a Sayyid was placed in the foundations there was no hope of the buildings standing.‡ It so happened that a Sayyid boy had lately arrived straight from Makká (Mecca). The people, therefore, killed him and placed his head under the foundations. This drew down on them the vengeance of his relatives, and it is said that the corpse of the murdered boy helped them against his murderers by fighting and doing much execution just as it was, without its head.

Muhammad Rafí, the brother of the celebrated Wakhábí rebel, Muhammad Shafí of Ambálá, who was tried at the State trials of 1864,§ told me a long story of a headless army at Bahraich in connection with the well-known saint of the North-West who is variously called Ghází Sálár, Bare Mán and Ghází

\* See *Indian Ant.*, vol. xi., p. 117. to the stability of a building.

† Alluding to the universal idea      ‡ Hunter, *Our Indian Mussalmáns*,  
that a human sacrifice is necessary pp. 84 ff.

Mián. He was really Sálár Mas'áud Ghází, nephew of Mahmúd of Ghazní, and son of Sálár Sálhú. He was killed at Bahraich in an outbreak of Hindu fanaticism, on 15th June 1033 A. D., when only 19 years of age, and there is a large tomb to him there. He is now one of the leading saints in Northern India and the patron saint of the British cantonments, worshipped by Hindús and Musalmáns alike. His father, too, has a shrine at Bahraich, and is considered a great saint.\* This Muhammad Rafí was always at great enmity with his infamous brother, and for many years was an official of some standing in the service of the kings of Oudh before the British occupation. In 1839-42 he was Kotwál of Bahraich and, while there, he met and kept in his service one Hakim Hassan 'Ali, who is the hero of the tale, the gist of which is as follows:—

"About 1837 there dwelt in Lucknow, in the Yahyaganj Mohalla, one Hakim Hassan 'Ali, an upright and honest man, sprung from a well-known family of *hakims* of the old days. He was a Suní. When only six or seven years old, he had the great misfortune to lose all his near relatives and guardians, and what money was left him was consequently dissipated by others, and he grew up to be a very poor man. However, he took earnestly to study and became a good physician, but owing to an unfortunate local superstition, that Suní physicians are powerless to cure ailments, and that only Shí'a practitioners are of any avail, he could get next to no practice. Meanwhile, he had married, and had two children, but was so badly off, that he could not even find them proper nourishment. His wife suggested that he should travel to some place where his knowledge would be of use to him. She gathered two or three rupees, and with this sum he started off and walked to Bahraich, where he put up at Ghází Sálár's tomb. There is an inn there where travellers are fed free of cost for three days, and there he stayed. At the end of that time the attendants asked him who he was, and he told them his sad tale. So they advised him to walk daily backwards and forwards from the tomb to the Shikárgáh of Ghází Sálár, which is about five miles out of Bahraich. This Shikárgáh, or hunting-box is situated on the high banks of a small stream running through an entirely deserted and uninhabited part of the country, and was built about 100 years ago, because it was said that the headless body of Ghází Sálár used to sit on that spot.

"Others have profited by doing this," said the attendants, "and so may you." The doctor accordingly for several days went to

---

\* Cf. Elliot, *Races of the North-West Oriental Biog. Dict. s. v. Mas'aud Provinces*, s. v. Ghází Sálár : Beales' Ghází.

and fro between the two places daily. One day he heard some one call to him "Hassan 'Ali," but could see no one. At last he saw a headless man (*Binsirá*) standing under a Banian tree, and being very frightened he ran away, but the man called after him, the voice coming from his chest, "Don't be afraid, and come back. I am only a man like you." So, plucking up courage, he went back, and the man asked him who he was, and what he wanted. So the doctor told his story over again, and explained that all he wanted was employment. On this the man asked, "How much do you want to live on?" And the *Hakím* replied, that a rupee a day would satisfy him. "Very well," said the headless man, "I will take you into my service and pay you a rupee a day," and, taking him by the hand, he led him to a hollow in the ground, caused by the rain, and told him to scratch the earth with his nail, and the doctor did so. He soon found a rupee. "Do this every day," said the headless man, "and you will get your rupee;" but there are conditions attached to my service which you must keep. If you fail, you will be worse off than you were before. The first condition is, that you must live under this tree, and I want here a good bed, good mats, carpets and good bedding. You must also cook here, and eat your food here, and I want cooking utensils and materials for eating here in abundance."

"All very well," said the doctor, "but where is the money to come from? It will all cost at least Rs. 25."

"Go to the hollow and scratch up your Rs 25," said the headless one.

The *Hakím* scratched up the money and they started off to the city together, and it was dark before they reached it. On the road the evening prayer-time arrived and they knelt together and prayed, and went on to Ghází Sálár's tomb. Arrived there, the headless one gave out his second condition which was that the doctor was to mention this to no one; whenever he did so, his pay would cease, and he would be poor all his life. And he said, "I am a *Shahíd*, (martyr) killed along with Ghází Sálár, and one of these days I will show him to you." He then went away.

Next day the *Hakím* brought every thing he wanted and reached the Banian tree in the afternoon. Arrived there, he dismissed and paid the coolies, and no sooner had he done this than the headless one turned up and saluted him. The doctor and the *Binsirá* then set to work together to sweep up the place, sprinkle it with water, spread the carpets, make the bed and get ready the dinner. It was now dark and they lighted lamps and sat down to eat. "You eat too," said the doctor to the headless one. "Oh, my dinner consists of watching you eat," said he. So the doctor ate his dinner

and began tying up the remainder in a bag to hang up to the tree to keep animals away. "You can leave it where it is," said the headless one, "nothing will touch it." After this the Binsirá lay on the bed awhile, and then went away. Next morning the Binsirá returned while he was saying his morning prayer. He told him that he had mentioned him to Ghází Sálár, who was very pleased to hear of all this and had sent him some money as a present, and he gave him about Rs. 200. This went on for some nine months, during which time he drew his pay daily and began to get rich, sending money home to his family through one Chluuná Mall Baniyá, of Bahraich. With this money they repaired and put in order the family property in Lakhnau.

Meanwhile the time for the great fair to Ghází Sálár had arrived,\* and the Binsirá said he would show the saint to the Hakím, saying "Stand before your carpet at the evening prayer, looking to the East, with folded arms." The doctor did as he was told, and presently he saw a headless horseman ride slowly past him, mounted on a beautiful horse, followed by a crowd of headless men on foot, and when they had passed, there came a splendidly caparisoned elephant whose saddle-cloth was borne by horsemen riding alongside, but neither the man on the elephant nor the horsemen had heads on their shoulders. And he on the elephant was Ghází Sálár himself. The Hakím saluted the cavalcade and the Binsirá, his friend, called out to the saint, "This is the man I spoke of." He and the doctor then followed the procession to the great tomb, and there it disappeared.

After a while the Baniyá said to the Hakím, "Where do you get your money from? who is it that pays you all this?" "You must never ask," said the doctor: "it will be neither good for you nor me that you should know."

But the trader was very persistent, and at last the doctor told him the whole story. That evening, when he returned, he found neither tree nor his friend, nor any of the things he had been using day by day for months, and he never saw them again.

It was soon after this that Muhammad Rafí became Kotwál of Bahraich and heard of the Hakím from the Baniyá Chluuná Mall. He found him wandering about, looking for his friend, a thin scarecrow of a man, clothed in rags, half starved and without a rupee to his name. Muhammad Rafí took him in hand and fed him and kept him while in Bahraich, and when, three years afterwards he was transferred to Lakhnau, he wished to take him with him, but the man would not go, saying, that he must find his friend. So, at last, in Bahraich he died. His wife was still

---

\* This falls on the 4th Sunday day in Jeth, Beale. *op. cit.*, *loc. cit.* after our Easter, and is the first Sun-



living in Lakhnau six years ago (1877) when Muhammad Rafi left that place.

Muhammad Rafi is an old man, and though he tells the story in all good faith, it is a memory of 40 years ago, and he was constantly forgetting portions of it. I think there is no doubt that the story told by his former servant, the Hakim, must be looked on as the hallucination of a disordered brain, worn out with misfortune and suffering, and rendered insane by a lonely life in the jungles.

In the Ambálá City is a tomb to one Lakkhe Sháh Darvesh, about whom two tales are told. The first is this:—Many years ago there was a great war in Multán in the course of which the saint, Lakkhe Sháh, lost his head, and by the will of God fought his way without it from Multán to Ambálá, to the spot where his shrine now stands. At this place there is now a dry well, but at that time it held plenty of water, and when Lakkhe Sháh arrived, the women were drawing water from it. The headless man called out to them for a drink, but they all ran away at once without giving him any water, and so Lakkhe Sháh fell down there and died. When the people saw him lying there, they were much astonished, and buried him with due honor and fenced in his tomb. As Lakkhe Sháh fell to the ground his headless body cried out with a loud voice—

*Ambálá Sháh dittha ;  
Andar Khārā, bahar mīttha.*

Ambálá City have I seen :  
Sweet without and salt within.

This was his curse on the city for not giving him water in his need, and from that day to this the water of that well has been dry, and if any one digs a well within the city, the water always turns out to be brackish and undrinkable, but the water outside is plentiful and sweet.

The second story is, that, after the English had taken possession of Ambálá, and Mr. Murray was appointed Magistrate, he wished to make a road from the city to the Fort.\* In making the road, the tomb and enclosure of Lakkhe Sháh's grave were destroyed. While the road was yet unfinished a man dressed in black came in the night and threw down the Magistrate's bed. But, being a plucky man, he put it right again, and lay down to sleep. Next night the black-coated man threw him off his bed on to the ground, but he came to no harm. However, this time he was very frightened, and, coming out of his house, sat outside all night. In the morning he told his people of what had happened, and they at once told him that it must have been Lakkhe Sháh,

---

\* Since completely dismantled.

who had visited him thus for destroying his tomb. Thinking that this might be true, he changed the line of the road, and made a fine new road to the Fort, and rebuilt the tomb with its four gateways. And for this reason Hindús and Musalmáns venerate the tomb to this day.

Similar appearances of saints to European officers on behalf of their tombs are common enough according to the common people. One case I have already recorded in the *Indian Antiquary*,\* in which Núr Sháh Wálí, the saint of the Ferozpúr city, appeared to Capt. (Sir Henry) Lawrence, tied him to his bed, and frightened him into re-building his tomb. Another case that I can quote is my own ! There is in the Paget Park Gardens in Ambálá Cantonments, an old tomb to one Khajúriá Pír, about whom I have in the *Folklore Record* † given another story connected with his doings to English officers. Growing out of his tomb is a date palm, whence, of course, his name Khajúriá Pír, which signifies "Saint Date-tree." Round this grave was a tumble-down railing, and the whole place had an untidy and dilapidated appearance, and as I had charge of the gardens, I felt more or less responsible for this state of things. Observing that, as is usual, several people, Hindús and Musalmáns, chiefly women of the lower sort, assembled at this tomb on Thursdays, it occurred to me that the local Musalmáns might be induced to put up a handsome building in place of the ugly one there in existence. They were delighted with the idea, and subscribed together some Rs. 900, which they handed over to me, and with which I rebuilt the tomb for them. Near this place was a tumble-down Shiválá, or Temple of Siva, on the bank of the main tank of the gardens, and in a similar way I got some Hindús to give me about Rs. 350 for its repair. As the buildings approached completion, the *mistrí* in charge asked me in the most confiding way if it was true, that the saint had appeared to me and ordered me to rebuild the tomb, as the people were saying so ! He also asked me what boon I had obtained from Mahádeo, since I had been induced to rebuild the Shiválá !

The folklore of the Saint and the Bed is almost deserving of a separate heading to itself in the investigation of the folktales of Northern India. Its general spread is well illustrated by the following story :—

At Battálá, in the Amritsar District, there is a tomb to a *Naugaza*, ‡ or Saint Nine-foot.§. One day a man called Deví Dás, was going home at night and passed the tomb. He found a

\* Vol. xi, p. 42.

† Vol. v, p. 158.

‡ Common every where. As to the supposed Buddhist origin of

their so-called tombs, see *J. R. A. S.* Vol. xiii, N. S., pp. 183.

§ *Ibid.*

large bedstead standing near it, covered over with a fine sheet. He stood looking at it for some time, and, seeing no one near it, he put the whole thing on his head and took it away home with him. Then he had his dinner and lay down on his new acquisition to sleep. As soon as he lay down, the whole house began to shake, but, thinking it an earthquake, he took no notice. However, the house went on shaking so violently and so long, that at last he called out, "What's the matter?" On this Naugaza cried out from the darkness, "You take back my bed to the place where you found it, or I'll shake your house down." So the man got up and put the bed back in its place, and then the Naugaza lay down on it and asked him to spread the sheet over him, but when he put it over his head his feet became bare, and when he put it on his feet, his head became bare. However, the man went on trying to cover the saint, having plenty of pluck, and the saint was so pleased at this that he said, "You may go this time and I let you off, but don't you do this again."

To return to the headless horseman. At Ládwa in the Ambálá District is a shrine to one Sirkap Sháh,\* or the headless saint, the story of whom is as follows:—Many years ago this holy *faqir* spent his time in prayer and fasting till he obtained the power of granting sons to the childless,† and thus made many women visit him. He would, however, never allow more than one woman into his hut at a time, which scandalized the people, so they tried to poison him, but the *faqir* quickly found out their secret attempts and frustrated them. However, he told the women not to visit him any more, as it offended their husbands. To this the women paid no attention, and in revenge their male relatives attacked the saint, killed him, and struck off his head. On this the head cried out, "My trunk will kill you all within a watch and a quarter," (*sarwá pahar ke bhútar merá dhar sab ko máregá*). And so it was, for the trunk got up, as it was, without its head, and fought all the murderers, and slew them all within the space of four hours. After this there were so many widows there, that the place was called Randwá Shahr, or the city of widows (*ránd*).

Of course, the derivation of Ládwa from Ránd, a widow, is all nonsense, and if the place was ever really called Rándwá, or Randhwá, it is much more likely that its name comes from the Randhwá Rájpúts of the Panjáb.‡

\* The name, however, of the famous Rájá Sirkap. (or Sirkat), King Beheader, was given him from his propensity for cutting off other people's heads.

† This is said of every saint. See *Ind. Ant.* vol. xi, p. 34: *Calcutta Review*, vol. lxxii, p. 254.

‡ See Griffin, *Panjáb Chiefs*; Lahore, 1865, p. 200 f. f.

Besides the above, there is a queer story about the death of Sher Sháh Súr. It is said that a Baniyá, named Dharm Datt, had two beautiful daughters, of whom the king was informed, and he demanded them of him. The Baniyá, like a stout Hindú, refused to give them up, saying, "You may strike off my head, but my headless trunk will still kill you." The king thereon had him beheaded with a sword, but the hand of the headless trunk seized the sword, and with it slew the king.

Now this remarkable tale is rendered all the more so by the fact, that Sher Sháh Súr was not only a great Indian ruler, but also a very well known one of comparatively modern date. The real cause of his death, the blowing up of a battery, in which he was standing at the taking of Kalinjar, in the moment of victory, on the 24th May 1545 A. D., was, one would have supposed, a sufficiently romantic end to have been well remembered. Sher Sháh Súr came from Hissár and songs are still sung in the Panjáb about the wars of his son Salím Sháh Súr with the great Khawás Khán, who is now looked on as a Muhammadan saint. Salím Sháh, who reigned from 1545 to 1554, is confounded in the songs with his father, Sher Sháh.

Herklot,\* in his description of the mountebanks so common during the *Muharram*, gives an account of the *Tan-i-besir* (or *Sir-i-betan*), or headless trunk (or bodiless head). This is a trick in which one man conceals his head under ground, or under a bedstead (*chárpáe*), and only displays his body, while another buries his body, and makes his head appear above ground, to represent a decapitated corpse. Between these they place a bloody sword, and sprinkle the spot with a red dye to imitate blood. Sometimes two persons in the semblance of robbers are seen there, and a man, acting in the character of a woman, sits crying and saying, "Robbers have murdered my brother (or husband). Give me something to go and bury him."

Perhaps the readiness with which the Muhammadans have taken up and adopted the Hindu idea, for such I believe it to be, of the headless warrior, may arise from the miraculous tales of Hussain's head and its doings after his murder.†

It is to be observed that the headless horseman of Awá is called *Dúnd* or *Rúnd*, which obviously means lopped or shorn. Elliot's, *Supplementary Glossary*, s.v. *Dúndá*,‡ says it means a bullock with one horn. Fallon, *New Hindustáni Dictionary*,

\* *Qanoon-e-Islam*, p. 136.

† Herklot's *Op. cit.*, p. iii.

‡ Elliot's *Races of the N.-W. P.*,

Beames' Ed., s. v.: and Carnegie's *Kachahri Technicalities*, s.v.

s.v., says *dúndá* means a bullock with a bent, broken, or one horn. He also gives *tútá*, *tontá*, *tuntá*, and *tundá* as meaning damaged, broken; and besides these *totá*, *túlá*, loss, damage, deficiency. He further quotes the proverb:

*Tút ki bútt nahín,*  
There is no cure for death.

And lastly there are the well-known and common words *tútuá* to be broken, and *torná* to break. Bate, *Hindí Dict.*, s.v.v., says *tund* is a lopped hand or branch; and *tundá* is headless, either from birth, or from maiming. The *Lúdiáúá Punjábí Dict.* has *dúnd*, headless body or trunk, lopped trunk of a tree, and *túnd*, a headless or bare trunk. All these words take their rise from the roots *trut* or *tud*.\*

The consideration of the derivation of this word leads us to the origin and the cause for its present popularity. *Tunda*, *Tundaka* and *Tundadeva*,† the shorn, are names for Siva, and also for a well-known *Rákshasa*, or enemy, of the Aryan heroes. *Tunda* was killed by *Nahusha*, the early progenitor of the Lunar Race, and *Vitunda* his son by *Durgá*. *Deví* or *Durgá*, under her various names, had many fights with the *Rákshasas*, such as *Tundá*, *Vitunda*, *Sumbha*, *Nisumbha*, *Sundá*, *Chanda* and *Mundá*, *Mahisha*, or *Mahishásura*, and so on, who are all more or less mixed up in legend.‡ The *Chandí Māhātmya*, usually called shortly the *Chandí*, a portion of the *Mārkundeya Purāna*, § still much read, details all these victories, and on these stories is based the well-known modern festival of the *Durgá Pújá*. One of the most famous of *Deví's* victories is that over *Nishumbha*, which she effected in her character of *Chhinnamastaká*, or the headless.|| It is to the widespread celebrity of this legend that I attribute all the modern stories of the headless horsemen, warriors and saints.

At the *Durgá Pújá* festival one of the most important things is the construction of the images of *Durgá*,¶ and among the most prominent is the representation of *Chhinnamastaká*, who is "a reddish-brown, naked, headless goddess. She stands upon a human couple, and in one hand holds a gory scimitar, and in the other her own severed head, which drinks the warm blood gushing forth from her headless trunk."

\* Monier William's *Sansk. Dict.*, s.v.v. *trut*, *tud*.

† *Ibid*, s.v.v.

‡ Dowson's *Classical Dict of Hindu Mythology*, s.v.v., *Tundá*, *Deví*, *Chá-mundá*.

§ *Durgá Pújá*, by P. O. Ghosha, Calcutta, 1871, Hindu Patriot Press, p. xi. (27).

|| Wilkin's *Hindu Mythology*, pp. 252 and 264.

¶ *Durgá Pújá*, p. 9.

Wilkins' \* following Ward, † says that the *Mārkaṇḍeya Purāṇa*, describes the incarnations assumed by Devī in order to destroy the Rākshasas; which were as follows:—

(1.) Durgā, the inaccessible, to receive Chanda and Munda who came to see her on behalf of Sumbha.

(2.) Dasabhuja, the ten armed, to destroy Dhamlochana, the general of Sumbha, and his army sent to capture her.

(3.) Sinhavahini, the lion-rider, to destroy Chanda and Munda.

(4.) Mahishamārdini, the buffalo-slayer, to destroy Sunda, Sumbha's general.

(5.) Jagaddhātṛi, the world-mother, to destroy the army of Sumbha and Nisumbha.

(6.) Kālī (with Chanda, the terrible), the black, to destroy Ruktaviṣa, Sumbha's chief general.

(7.) Muktakesi, the dishevelled, to destroy another army.

(8.) Tārā, the saviour, to destroy Sumbha.

(9.) Chhinnamastakā, the headless, to destroy Nisumbha.

(10.) Jagadgurī, the world's beauty, to receive the thanks of gods and men for the deliverance she had wrought.

Mr. Wilkins says regarding Chhinnamastakā, that it is evident from her appearance that she found her task rather difficult, for her head is half severed from her body. She is painted as a fair woman, naked, and wearing a garland of skulls, standing on the body of her husband.

The wide popularity of the worship of Durgā must make the idea of the headless warrior familiar to the ignorant and vulgar, and hence, most probably, the numerous legends about the Dūnd, the Binsirā, the Tan-i-besir, the Sirburidā, and other forms of the headless one.

The widespread of these legends may be further illustrated by an extract from the Rāwul Pinḍī version of the Legend of Rasālū, ‡ which runs as follows:—

Rājā Rasālū gave up his kingdom and started for the city of Rājā Sirkap. Before he had gone very far, he came upon a cemetery, where he found a headless corpse lying, and he said to it—

*Bāre andar piā karanglā;*

*Na is sis na pās:*

*Je Maullā is nūn zindā kare,*

*Do bātān kare hamāre pās.*

The corpse is fallen under the hedge;

Nor breath in him, nor any one near!

If God grant him life,

He may talk a little with me.

\* *Op. cit.*, pp. 257 f f.

‡ See *Ind. Ant.*, vol. xi, pp.

† *View of Hist of Rel. and Lit. of* 348 f. f.

*Hindus*, Serampore, 1818, pp. 88 f.f.

## 176 *Folklore of the Headless Horseman*

And God restored him to life at once, as Rájá Rasálú wished, and the Rájá said to the man—

*Laihdion chorhí badali,  
Háthán páia zor;  
Kehe 'amal kamáio,  
Je jhaldí naktín gor?*

The clouds rose in the West,  
The storm was very fierce;  
What deed hast thou done,  
That the grave contains thee not?

And the man answered—

*Asín bhí kadín duniyán te in hán the :  
Rájá wal degrián pagún banhde,  
Tárde pagún bhar :  
Aunde tara, nachúnde tara,  
Hánke sawár.  
Zara na miltí jhaldí, Rájá ;  
Hun sav manán áá bhár.*

I, too, was once on the earth thus :  
Fastening my turban awfy like a king.  
Walking erect :  
Coming proudly, taunting proudly,  
Driving off the horsemen.  
The grave does not hold me at all, Rájá ;  
Now am I a great sinner.

Meanwhile the night passed, and in the morning the restored corpse asked Rájá Rasálú, who he was, and where he had come from, and the Rájá replied, that he had come from Siálkot and was going to play at *chaupur* with Rájá Sárkap.

"You had better not," replied the restored corpse, "I was his brother, and I know him. Every day before he has his breakfast he cuts off the heads of two or three men. One day he could not get a convenient head, so he cut off mine, and he will be sure to take off yours. However, if you really want to go, take some bones from here and have your dice made from them, and then the enchanted dice he plays with will have no effect, otherwise he will never lose." So the Rájá did as he was advised, and, taking some bones from the cemetery, he started off.

It is to be observed, that the headless horseman of Awagarh stands before his victims' doors and calls to them by name, and that if they answer, they suffer for it. This is a very common notion, and in fact may be called the leading feature of the modern Indian ghost story. I have already alluded to it in the account of the Yech, or Yách, of Kashmir,\* the imp who calls out to people in the night by name, and if they answer, burns them with their

---

\* *Ind. Ant.*, vol. xi, pp. 260-261.

own *kāgrī*, or bowl for heating the stomach in the winter frosts. It arises, of course, in the common hallucination that a well known voice is calling to one by name, or speaking to one.

The following are additional instances of communication with ghosts followed by death or illness. They are related as being every day occurrences in recent times.

A man named Ramzān Khān, living in the Sadar Bazar, Ambālā Cantonments, a *chuprāsī* in the employ of Gaueshī Lal, Commissariat Gomāshatā, relates the following story of himself:—

In 1868 I was servant to Muli Manohar, Commissariat Gomāshatā, and was ordered by him to take Rs. 200 in cash to a Regiment on the march from Ambālā to Chakrautā, which was then encamped at Munānā. This money was required for the feeding of some elephants, which accompanied the Regiment. I got on my camel, and took the money safely to Mulānā. On my way back, I was riding my camel near Chhabīānā, close to the Cantonment boundaries, when I saw a very pretty, well dressed woman sitting under a tree. She called out to me to give her a lift. I said I would, but my camel would not go to her, but kept trembling and starting whenever he got near her. So I told her to follow behind, and that I would get the beast to sit down at the Police Station close by, and in this way we went on, she following close at my heels. It was about 7 P. M. and dusk at the time, and when we reached the Police Station the sentry called out, "Who goes there." I said, "A camel-rider of the Commissariat," and then he called out, "Who's that with you?" I said, "Only a woman." While we were talking like this the creature gave a great jump and disappeared "into a tree" standing by, and we saw her no more. I had a severe fever for many a day after this.

The above tale belongs to the class of the "Beautiful Woman Ghost," of which the following are instances:—

"There was a cultivator of Jahāngīrpūr in the Bulandshahr district, whose fields were some three miles from the town, and he used to go at all hours of the night to and from them. One dark night, when a slight rain was falling, he was going to his fields about 11 P. M., and on the road he found a beautiful, well-dressed girl sitting by the road side and calling out, "Oh, where can my husband have gone?" The cultivator sat and talked with her and suggested that she should go home with him. She agreed to go with him to his fields, and there they began to make mutual love. While there was still an hour† of the night left, the woman

\* Very common notion. See below and story of Khajūriā Pīr. † *Chār ghari*: a *ghari* is 24 minutes, 4 *gharis* are therefore really 1 hour  
*Folklore Record*, vol. v, pp. 158-159, and 36 minute.



went away, saying, "Mind, you tell this to no one. If you do, it will be the worse for you: indeed, it will kill you." The cultivator promised to say nothing about it, and she went away, promising to come again every night. Next night she returned, and so it went on night after night, till the end of it was that the woman became pregnant, and the cultivator took her to live with him, and she bore him a daughter. But day by day the cultivator began to grow thinner and thinner, \* and never would explain the reason. But at last his relatives questioned him so, that he told his secret. At the same moment the woman disappeared, whereon he became very ill, and before long he died."

Here is another story. About the year 1830 a man was wandering along the Mall at Merath (Mecrut) one night in the hot weather, and saw a lovely woman leaning up against the gate of an empty house, who called out to him: "I have something to tell you." So he went up to her and talked, and ended in making love to her, but he saw that her feet were turned backwards. † However, he was so taken with her beauty that, nevertheless, he took her to live with him. She made him grow thinner and thinner every day, but he was so frightened of her, that he never divulged his secret, and at last he died.

At Ambálá one Qualandar Khán, a trooper of the 6th Troop in the XIth Bengal Lancers, a Pathán, tells the following tale:—

"I was sleeping in my hut in the lines, ‡ and went outside for a call of nature. About 200 yards from the lines under a mango tree I saw two women sitting. They called out to me in Pushto that they wanted to go with me, but I said nothing and went home to my hut. When I got inside it, I found the women outside, and they said again in Pushto, "You are a nice sort of a man not to notice us! we came with you all the way from Kábul and want to live with you." Saying this, they came and lay down on my bed. I asked them where they had been living, and they said, "On your parade § ground at a deserted well, some 400 yards from here to the east. There are three of us women in it. Ourselves and our mother, for we two are own sisters." After this we all went to sleep and I remained in a trance till 8 A. M., when my comrades came and poured water over my head and roused me.

From Mungir (Moughyr) comes the following as having happened in 1883. ¶ A wealthy Brahman of the town was on

\* Compare the story of Ali Mardán Khán and the Snake Woman: *Ind. Ant.*, vol. xi, pp. 23<sup>n</sup> ff.

† I. e., she was a *churel*; see below.

‡ The English *laine* was used.

§ English again; *parade*.

¶ *Pioneer*, 17th April 1883.

three successive occasions taken by three women at night and transported bodily to different places at a distance from his house. During two of these trips they drove nails into his body, and on the third occasion they gave him money.\* Each time the Brahman was found at the place of his transportation by the police. This story looks as if some clever rogue were trading on the superstitions of the people, but the ideas contained in it are so exactly those of the Panjābīs, as to show that they are current, too, at any rate, as far as Northern Bengal.

The next ghost tale dates as late as October 1882, and is told in all good faith by one Hanumān Tambolī of the Ambālā cantonments, who deals in horses and as a broker in the betel-leaf trade. He is a man of some position, and his tale is this—

I and my servant, Mirā, and a butcher, were going on a dark night with some money from the Sadar Bazar to the railway station. We went along the road that leads by the big drain near the 'Idgāh and Masjid, and as we were walking along, the butcher cried out, "Look! there's a devil dancing in front of us!" I had a lantern † in my hand, and so I had a good look, and sure enough there was a man dancing wildly in front of us with his arms over his head, and while we were looking at him he disappeared into a tree. And from the tree a voice called out to the butcher, "*Shaitān ko Shaitān dikhlaī detā hai*, a devil appears only to devils!" After this we all ran away home as fast as we could and have never used that road at night since, but the butcher was very ill for a long while. I fear the Tambolī and his friends were the victims of a hoax on this occasion. As likely as not some thief was concealed in the drain and jumped out like this to frighten the inconvenient visitors away.

There is yet another similar tale in Ambālā, that a bearer to Mr. Buckner, Inspector of Post-offices, named Lodhe Khān, was going to his house in the Royal Horse Artillery Bazar past a large tank (*diggi*), well-known to be haunted at midnight. It was midnight when he passed and just as he reached it a man stopped him, and asked him who he was, whereon he ran away without answering. But the ghost, assuming the form of a cat, ran before him, and, on seeing this, the bearer became so frightened, that he sat down. After a while, however, he plucked up courage and ran off again to the bazar, and from the darkness behind him a voice called out, "If you come this way again at this hour, I will not leave you alive."

\* A common sequel to such tales. There is a tale, very marvellous in its way, told at Kasaulī of the local saint, Banne Shāh, in which he cures a girl of leprosy and ends by

giving her a lot of money.

† English used, and the word spelt لعل *la'ul ten*. A very interesting corruption.

Sometimes these notions take a very practical shape, as may be seen from the following instance, which has occurred during this very month in which I am writing, *viz.*, May 1883:—During the last financial year a new bridge over the main stream in the Ambálá Cantonment was completed. It is situated at the North-East corner of the station cemetery and near a large *kikar* (*acacia arabica*) tree. Under this tree lies a European suicide, a soldier, buried there some years ago. In the neighbourhood are the British Cavalry Grass-cutters' lines, and the women living there will never pass the spot at night, as they say, the soldier has been seen to leave his grave and ask for bread (*rotí*), and, as usual, to answer him is death. Now the contractor who had the building of the bridge, is one Káñ Charan, and he says that the soldier appeared to him in a dream and told him to repair his tomb, and that unless he did so, he would take care that his bridge should never stand. Káñ Charan a Hindu as his name indicates, has accordingly repaired the Christian's grave to the best of his ability, and there it stands a monument to the living faith of this man in the reality of his vision.

Now at Ferozpúr there is near the Arsenal Fort an old dis-used brick-kiln in which a *churel* is said to live\* and many natives have told me that in passing it they have been called by name, and that those answering the call have been struck down with fever after it. I have no doubt that the part of the Awagath headless horseman's tale, which relates to the calling by name, takes its rise in the very widely spread and common belief in the *churel* and her doings.

Most writers of Indian Dictionaries and on Indian Folklore have noticed the *churel*, and always in very similar terms.† With variations within narrow limits the *churel* may be called the malignant ghost of a woman that has died in child-bed. She is variously called *churel*, *chural*, *churaili*, *churailí*, *churárál*, *chuddo*, *chuddá*, *chiddo*. The best description of the *churel* I have yet seen is, that procured for me by Mrs. F. A. Steel some three years ago, in which she mentioned as a proof of the liveliness of the belief in it that the natives at Ferozpúr told her that three cases of injury by a *churel* had occurred there within a month. Besides these I have already noticed several as occurring there,‡ and wherever I have been in the Panjáb I have found these malignant spirits equally active:—at Simlá§ and

\* See *Ind. Ant.* Vol. x. p. 229, note.

† *Ind. Ant.* Vol. viii., p. 210. Falcon's *New Hind. Dict.*; Bate's *Hind. Dict.*; *Ládláná Panj. Dict.* s.v.o. : Herriot, *op. cit.*, p. 224.

‡ See *Ind. Ant.* Vol. x. p. 229 note.

§ On the Mall at Simla, towards

Chhota Simla, is a deserted well (or *báolí*) now closed, called Chhota Kūā or Churel Báolí, in which a *chuprásí*, some years ago, met his death, it is said, at the hands of the haunting spirit.

Ambálá, at Marhi (Murree) and Ráwal Pindí, at Dharmśálá, at Ferozpúr and at Multán. The constant mention of them in the various works of reference in the many Aryan languages of India shows the universal belief in them, and this being so, it is curious (as will be seen later on) that no attempt seems to have been hitherto made to trace this universal and remarkable superstition to its origin, or at least back to its earlier forms.

Mrs. Steel defines the *churel* as the ghost of a woman who has died in pregnancy, or on the day of child-birth, or during the first 40 days of her defilement. She is usually described as the ghost of a woman who has died within the first twelve days after child-birth; and regarding children who die within these twelve days the natives have a queer custom of burying them *inside* the house, or just outside the threshold, with the object of preventing similar deaths in the future. Mrs. Steel goes on to say that the worst and most malignant *churel* is that of a pregnant woman, who dies on the night of the Dēwālī festival, and that, though properly confined to the limits above mentioned, the term is frequently extended to mean any *female ghost*. Hindú or Musalmán. The superstition is essentially Hindú, and though believed in by Musalmáns, it is not admitted, as a rule, that a Musalmán could become a *churel*.

The popular idea of the proper form of a *churel* may be gathered from a rough picture of one in my possession, accompanied by some verses. The figure is drawn as that of a very black, ugly woman, without breasts and naked, except as to a *phinná*, or loin-cloth worn by children. She has a starved appearance generally, and her attitude is a threatening one. Her hair is lanky, her stomach and navel protrude, her hands are large, long and lean, her thin arms are outstretched before her, her mouth is wide open, showing a long and bright-red tongue protruding, and her feet are turned backwards. She wears the usual female gold and silver ornaments of *gala* costume, *viz.*, *churis*, or bracelets, on her wrists; *bará málá* and *málá*, or beaded necklaces, and *jugná*, or gold necklet, round her neck; *bálián*, or earrings, in her ears; and *tungní*, or chaplet, in her hair.

The verses are these:—

*Ái churel khánc ek nagar ná: ko :*  
*Dekhá jo murke, baúl gae ghar kí sár ko !*  
*Bál haai bare, wa pet bará, háth haai bare,*  
*Munh khole, páne ulte chale, khánc tén khare.*

And may be freely rendered thus:—

The long lean hands, the lanky hair,  
 The foul black skin, the tongue aflame,  
 The feet turned back, the hungry air,  
 Too surely the *churel* proclaim.  
 Screams with pale fear the town-bred maid,  
 Affrighted at that sight of dread.

The *churel* is essentially a malignant spirit, and especially so to the members of her own family. She waylays men returning from the fields late in the evening, and, assuming the shape of a beautiful woman, calls her victims by name. If the call be answered, sickness and death ensue, but even if no answer be given, the event is a most untoward one, for no one can ever really survive the sight or voice of the *churel*. Sooner or later come misfortune, sickness and death.

The means employed to prevent dead women from becoming *churels* are these: Small round-headed nails of iron are made for the purpose, and driven into the nails of the forefinger and thumbs, and the great toes are fastened together by iron rings passed round them. The surface of the ground on which the woman has died is carefully scraped and removed, and the spot sown with mustard seed. Mustard seed is also sprinkled along the road, traversed by the corpse to interment or to cremation, and on the grave when there is one. The reasons for this are two-fold. *Firstly*, the mustard plant blooms in the world of the dead and, its sweet smell is peculiarly grateful to the spirit and keeps her content. *Secondly*, whenever she rises from her grave at nightfall, she makes straight for her former home, and, seeing the mustard seeds scattered about, she stoops to pick them up. Now this is a long job, and occupies her till cock-crow, and then she is no longer able to roam, but is forced back into her grave.

In default of a better explanation, I suggest that the origin of the idea of the *churel* lies, like that of the headless horseman, in the legends of Durgā, or Devī, particularly in that one in which one of her many forms, *Chandī*, the Terrible, helps her in her other form of *Kālī*, the Black, to slay the self-multiplying giant *Rúktavija*, the leader of the army of the Titans against the gods. \*

I must wind up my paper with a story about the Headless horseman of an unexpected nature. It is from an entirely new source, and from a most unlikely person, *viz*, a District Engineer of the Sind, Panjab and Delhi Railway who has seen the headless horseman himself in Ambálá and that not very long ago. The adventure is so remarkable, that I must let him tell it in his own words. Mr. T. A. Cox says, "In the hot weather of 1870 or 1871 I was one day riding out, after a long day in office, to dine with the 72nd Highlanders. My bungalow was in the Native Infantry lines at Ambálá, nearly opposite the present Mess-house of the 32nd Pioneers. It was about 7-30 p. m., and quite dusk. I was riding at a foot's pace. When I got to the turn of the road opposite General Gott's house (now Dovedell Hotel), I noted a

---

\* Wilkin's *Op. cit.*, pp. 248, 255, 98 ff.  
267. Ward's *Op. cit.* Vol ii, pp. 88,

black horse, with a horseman draped in black, without a head, by my side on the off-side. I did not speak, but rode quietly to the turn leading to the Railway crossing. At this point the apparition disappeared and vanished. I rode on to the British Infantry mess house and mentioned to two or three men what I had seen. The sight of the apparition had no effect on my nervous system, for I made a very good dinner and played a rubber of Whist afterwards, was in perfect health, as plenty of people could have testified. I am still fully persuaded (as I was at the time) that the apparition was subjective and had no objective reality."

Here is a "good and true" ghost story for the Theosophical and Psychical Societies to discuss, though it is a pity for them that the ghost-seer declines to believe in the reality of his vision.

R. C. TEMPLE.

The subject of the headless horsemen seems an endless one, and even after the above was in type I found him in Macgregor's *History of the Sikhs*, vol. 1, pp. 72-3, in connection with Gurú Gobind Singu's doings as above detailed, and also at page 100 of Sirdár Atar Singh's *Sikhi Book*, when one of the Gurú's followers is made to fight the Musaman's without his head at a place called Ghanaulá in the Ambala District, soon after the Gurú's flight from Anandpur to his final resting place at Makatsar in the Ferozpur District.

R. C. T

---

## THE QUARTER.

**P**UBLIC attention since the above date has continued to be almost entirely engrossed by the question of the Jurisdiction Bill and by the outburst of hostility to the ruling race for which the discussion arising out of it has proved the signal. While the views of the European and Anglo-Indian community regarding the policy of the Bill and their determination to use every legitimate effort to avert the calamity of its enactment, have undergone no change, their attitude has been sensibly modified by the circumstances of the hour. As the time approaches for the Government of India to reconsider its policy in the light of the opinions of its own officers, watchful and anxious expectancy has generally taken the place of indignant protest. The knowledge that the officials consulted have condemned the Bill almost to a man, and, in the great majority of cases, in the most emphatic terms, has largely contributed to this change. On the one hand, it is felt that it would be not merely an act of inconceivable folly, but an unwarrantable breach of faith, if, after having staked the question on the result of an appeal to official opinion, the Government, on finding that opinion to be against its preconceived views, were to refuse to redeem its promise and to pass the Bill in the teeth of a verdict deliberately challenged and deliberately given.—On the other hand, there is a wise disinclination to give the Government of India even the shadow of an excuse for setting aside the unanimous verdict of the public on the ground that their attitude is that of menace. The Government has called for certain opinions and promised to abide by them. The public concerned are quite content that it should keep its promise; and, such being the case, they are resolved that, as far as in their power lies, no disturbing element shall enter into the question. They feel, moreover, that, if the Government is determined to break its promise, it is best that it should do so entirely on its own responsibility; that at all events they should give it no opportunity of saddling any portion of the guilt of so fatal a course on their shoulders.

In the meanwhile the Native community, on their side, or rather the knot of frothy politicians who, under the influence of a one-sided and half-digested English education, have developed the falsetto voice of the demagogue, have done all that lay in their power to justify the worst predictions of the opponents of the Government policy, by their abuse of English rule and their scornful refusal to accept the Bill as anything but a small instalment of a policy destined to culminate in a unified India, governed by themselves.

The real motive of these men has been placed beyond all doubt, and a startling example at the same time given of the unscrupulousness of their methods, by the late libel against Mr. Justice Norris and the agitation of which the just sentence passed on the offender has been made the occasion. A more signal proof of political incapacity could hardly have been given than that furnished by the men who, in raising the false cry of injured religion over Mr. Norris's action in the Saligram case, and using it as a lever to stir up their ignorant fellow countrymen against the Government, have exposed their hand at so critical a moment, and thus furnished the opponents of the Jurisdiction Bill with a practical demonstration of the justice of their opposition. Had the acumen of these men been at all proportionate to their malice, they would have seen that the very last thing they ought to do at such a moment was to foster a cry which, coming from such a quarter as this did, and being so obviously factitious as this was, must inevitably lead to the conclusion that they were influenced by ulterior motives.

The incident which gave rise to this extraordinary exhibition of combined wickedness and folly, happened in this wise. In a case between Hindus which was being tried before Mr. Justice Norris, a question arose as to the identity of a certain idol, which has been variously described as a *saligram* stone and a *bigraka*. In order to determine this point, it became necessary to ascertain whether a particular idol in the custody of a certain Pandit in the Burra Bazar was the family idol of certain of the parties in the suit. With the view of determining this question it was suggested by the counsel on both sides that the idol should be brought into Court for the purpose of identification. The Judge, however, hesitated to pass an order for this purpose until he had ascertained from the attorneys on both sides, who were Hindus, that there was no objection to such a course from a religious point of view. He therefore made enquiries from them on the subject and was informed, in reply, that there was no such objection to the proposed proceeding. Still Mr. Justice Norris was not satisfied, and, in order to remove all possibility of doubt,



he further enquired from one Gouri Kanta, the agent of the plaintiff, a Brahmin, who was in Court, and his answer was that the idol could not be brought without objection into the Court itself, owing to the coir-matting, but that it might unobjectionably be brought into the corridor of the Court.

So anxious, however, was Mr. Justice Norris to make no mistake that he then sent for the Court interpreter, also a high caste Brahmin, and consulted him in the matter; and, like Gouri Kanta, he replied that, though the idol could not be brought into the Court, on account of the coir matting, it might unobjectionably be brought into the corridor.

Thereupon Mr. Justice Norris made an order, granting the application, and the custodian of the idol was directed to produce it, the interpreter himself being deputed to go with the officer entrusted with the execution of the subpoena and see that it was conveyed to the Court in a proper manner. In accordance with this order the idol was thereupon conveyed into the corridor of the Court by its custodian, in company with the Brahmin interpreter, and there inspected by the Judge.

Now, setting aside entirely the question whether, as a matter of fact the idol was an object which, according to Hindu custom, might unobjectionably be brought into the corridor of the Court, or not, it is perfectly clear from the above circumstances that the utmost care was taken by the Court to guard against the risk of sanctioning anything that could offend against such custom, and that, if what was done did so offend, the responsibility for the error rests, not with the Court, but with parties in the case themselves, and the other high caste Hindus consulted. Whether there was anything in the proceeding calculated to wound Hindu religious feelings or not, it is, therefore, quite unnecessary to decide, in order to arrive at a verdict on the conduct of the Court, or on the justice of the subsequent agitation in the matter. It will be observed, however, that the result of Mr. Justice Norris's enquiries, to go no further, creates the very strongest presumption that the action of the Court was, in fact, wholly unobjectionable. Not only was there a consensus of opinion on the part of the experts consulted that the idol might properly be brought into the corridor, but the replies of those experts justify the inference that it might have been brought into the Court itself, but for the accident of the room being matted with coir-matting. There was no hint whatever that the nature of the building, or the fact of its being frequented by Mlechhas, constituted any objection. Still less was there any hint that the idol could not properly be inspected by the Judge.

In spite of all this, and of a mass of other well-known facts connected with the treatment of such idols, which point to the same conclusion, but which were not brought forward in the proceedings, the incident was at once seized upon by the Native Press as a proof of the tyrannical conduct of the Judge and of his determination to trample on the religious feelings of the natives.

A paper called *Brahmo Public Opinion*, which is the organ of a section of the native population who profess to be superior to idol worship and the superstition implied in it, immediately published an article in which the following passage occurred :—

“What are we to think of a Judge who is so ignorant of the feelings of the people and so disrespectful to their cherished convictions, as to drag into Court, and then to inspect, an object of worship, which only Brahmans are allowed to approach, after having purified themselves, according to the forms of their religion? Will the Government of India take no notice of such a proceeding? The religious feelings of the people have always been an object of tender care with the Supreme Government. Here, however, we have a Judge who, in the name of Justice, sets these feelings at defiance and commits what amounts to an act of sacrilege in the estimation of pious Hindus. We venture to call the attention of the Government to the facts here stated; and we have no doubt due notice will be taken of the conduct of the Judge.”

This unfounded libel served as the signal for the following scurrilous and unscrupulous attack on Mr. Justice Norris and the High Court in the columns of the *Bengalce*, another organ of the advanced Hindus :—

“The Judges of the High Court have hitherto commanded the universal respect of the community. Of course, they have often erred, and have often previously failed in the performance of their duties. But their errors have never been due to impulsiveness or to the neglect of the commonest considerations of prudence or decency. We have now, however, amongst us a Judge, who, if he does not actually recall to mind the days of Jeffreys and Scroggs, has certainly done enough, within the short time that he has filled the High Court Bench, to show how unworthy he is of his high office, and how by nature he is unfitted to maintain those traditions of dignity which are inseparable from the office of the Judge of the highest Court in the land. From time to time, we have, in these columns, adverted to the proceedings of Mr. Justice Norris. But the climax has now been reached, and we venture to call attention to the facts, as they have been reported in the columns of a contemporary. The *Brahmo Public Opinion* is our authority, and the facts stated are as follows :—‘Mr. Justice Norris is determined to set the Hugli on fire. The last act of *Zubberdusti* on his Lordship’s part was the bringing of a *Saligram*, a stone idol, into Court for identification. There have been very many cases both in the late Supreme Court and

the present High Court of Calcutta regarding the custody of Hindu idols, but the presiding deity of a Hindu household has never before this had the honor of being dragged into Court. Our Calcutta Daniel looked at the idol and said it could not be a hundred years old. So Mr. Justice Norris is not only versed in Law and Medicine, but it is also a *connoisseur* of Hindu idols. It is difficult to say what he is not. Whether the orthodox Hindus of Calcutta will tamely submit to their family-idols being dragged into Court, is a matter for them to decide, but it does seem to us that some public steps should be taken to put a quietus to the wild eccentricities of this young and raw Dispenser of Justice.

"What are we to think of a Judge who is so ignorant of the feelings of the people and so disrespectful to their most cherished convictions, as to drag into Court, and then to inspect an object of worship, which only Brahmins are allowed to approach, after having purified themselves, according to the forms of their religion? Will the Government of India take no notice of such a proceeding? The religious feelings of the people have always been an object of tender care with the Supreme Government. Here, however, we have a Judge who, in the name of justice, sets these feelings at defiance, and commits what amounts to an act of sacrilege in the estimation of pious Hindus. We venture to call the attention of the Government to the facts here stated, and we have no doubt due notice will be taken of the conduct of the Judge."

It was impossible for the Court to overlook so gross and daring an attack on one of its members without permanently lowering itself in the eyes of a community who see no magnanimity in forbearance.

A consultation of the Judges having been held, Mr. Justice Norris, on the 2nd ultimo, directed a rule to issue against Ram Coomar Dey, the Publisher, and Babu Surendronath Bannerjee, the Proprietor and Editor of the *Benguler*, calling on them to show cause why they should not be committed for contempt.

The rule came on for hearing on the 5th, when Mr. Bonnerjee, on behalf of the defendants, submitted the following affidavits:—

"I, Ram Coomar Dey, of No. 33, Neoghee Pookur's Lane, in the town of Calcutta, contractor, solemnly affirm and say as follows:—

1st.—That for the last two or three years I have, under a contract with the abovenamed Surendronath Bannerjee, by myself, and others employed by me, composed, set up, and printed the periodical work called the *Bengalee* of which I am known as the Printer and Publisher.

2nd.—That I have no concern with any matter which appears in the said periodical work, and that I have no power to prevent any such matter passed by the said Surendronath Bannerjee appearing in the said periodical work.

3rd.—That I am imperfectly acquainted with the English language, and, though able to compose and set up works in English, I do not readily understand the sense and meaning of what I do compose and set up.

4th.—That while composing and setting up the issue of the 28th day of April 1883 of the said periodical work, I had no knowledge whatsoever that it contained any matter contemptuous or defamatory of, or concerning, the Hon'ble John Freeman Norris, one of the Judges of this Honorable Court, or of any person or persons whomsoever, and I say that, even had I had such knowledge, I could not have prevented the same being published in

the said periodical work, and all that I could have done would have been to sever my connexion with the said periodical work.

5th.—That I am extremely sorry that any matter deemed by this Honorable Court to be contemptuous and defamatory of, and concerning, the said Hon'ble John Freeman Norris should have appeared in the said periodical work, and so far as I had any hand in the publication thereof, I apologize to the said learned Judge and to this Honorable Court.

That under the circumstances aforesaid, I submit myself to the favorable consideration of this Honorable Court.

The affidavit of Surendronath Bannerjee is as follows :—

I, Surendronath Bannerjee, of No. 33, Neogee Pookur East Lane, in the town of Calcutta, at present residing at Monirampore in the district of the Twenty-four Pargunnahs, inhabitant, solemnly affirm and say as follows :—

1st.—That on Thursday the 3rd day of May instant, I was served with a rule issued by this Honorable Court in this matter on the day previous, calling upon the abovenamed Ram Coomar Dey, as the Printer and Publisher, and myself as the Editor of the periodical work, the *Bengalee*, to show cause before this Honorable Court, on Friday the 4th day of May instant, at the sitting of the Court, why we should not be committed, or otherwise dealt with according to law, for contempt of Court alleged to have been committed by us in having unlawfully published a certain article in the said periodical work, the *Bengalee*, of the 28th day of April last, containing certain contemptuous and defamatory matters of, and concerning, the Hon'ble John Freeman Norris, one of the Judges of this Honorable Court.

2nd.—That upon being served with the said rule, I bespoke and thereupon obtained office copies of the grounds upon which the said rule is based which grounds I have perused.

3rd.—That I admit that, as is stated in the affidavit of Mr. Henry Adam Adkins, Officiating Solicitor to the Government of India, the abovenamed Ram Coomar Dey is the Printer and Publisher of the said periodical work, the *Bengalee*, and I am the Proprietor and Editor thereof.

4th.—That the said periodical work is made up entirely under my superintendence, and that the said Ram Coomar Dey, who is but indifferently acquainted with the English language, has no authority over any editorial matter appearing in the said periodical work, and further he could not, if he wished so to do, prevent any article or paragraph appearing therein.

5th.—That the issue of the said periodical work of the said 28th day of April 1883 was made up and published entirely on my responsibility, and to the best of my knowledge, information and belief, the said Ram Coomar Dey did not read anything contained therein in the editorial columns before the publication thereof.

6th.—I further say that, except as an Hon'ble and learned Judge of this Honorable Court, I have no knowledge whatsoever of the said Hon'ble John Freeman Norris, and that, in writing and publishing what I did in connexion with his Lordship, I acted entirely *bonâ fide*, and, as I believed, in the interests of the public good.

7th.—That there appeared in the said issue of the 28th day of April 1883 two paragraphs in connexion with the said Hon'ble John Freeman Norris, one at page 194 under the heading of "News and Notes" of Tuesday the 24th day of April 1883, and the other at page 199 amongst the editorial notes. The said two paragraphs are as follows : [Here followed the articles previously quoted and on which the rule was issued.]

8th.—That the *Brahmo Public Opinion* referred to in the said paragraph

is a periodical work published in Calcutta every Thursday, and is believed by the public, and I believe it to be under the editorship of a gentleman practising as an attorney of this Honorable Court.

9th.—That the matter of complaint made in the said first paragraph appeared in the said *Brahmo Public Opinion*, to the best of my knowledge, information and belief, in its issue of Thursday the 19th day of April 1883, and no contradiction thereof, nor any explanation thereof appeared either in the said *Brahmo Public Opinion*, or, to the best of my knowledge, information and belief, in any other newspaper.

10th. That the matter of complaint made in the said second paragraph appeared in the said *Brahmo Public Opinion* in its issue of the 26th day of April 1883, and no explanation or contradiction thereof appeared in that paper, or in any other newspaper, before the publication of the said issue of the said periodical work.

11th. That I honestly believed the statements in the said *Brahmo Public Opinion* to be true, and the paragraphs aforesaid, which were both written by me, were so written under such belief and under a sense of public duty, that conduct such as was imputed to the said Hon'ble John Freeman Norris should be brought to the notice of the public and censured.

12th. That from the affidavits of Mr. William Robert Fink, the Assistant Registrar, and the officiating Chief Clerk of this Hon'ble Court, and of Baboo Banneymadhub Mookerjee, one of the interpreters of this Hon'ble Court, the truth of which I entirely and unhesitatingly accept, I now find that the statements contained in the said *Brahmo Public Opinion* relating to the production of the said Sahgram in Court were inaccurate and misleading, and that the said Hon'ble John Freeman Norris, instead of acting in a *subdurst* manner as alleged, acted under pressure from the parties, who are both Hindus, apparently against his own inclination.

13th. That I have received contradictory statements with regard to the statements contained in the said first paragraph, some asserting that they are inaccurate and misleading, others maintaining the contrary; and I have not been able to ascertain which of these contradictory statements represent the truth.

14th. I say most emphatically that if I had known, or had any reason to believe that the statements of the *Brahmo Public Opinion* aforesaid were in any respect inaccurate, I would not have made the observations I have, and I am truly sorry that I was misled into making them, and I withdraw them unreservedly; but I repeat that my observations were made perfectly *bona fide*, and without any motive of any description whatsoever other than the motive to promote public good.

15. That the circumstances of British India are such that this Honorable Court and the other High Courts in the other Presidencies are looked upon, and I believe justly looked upon, as the staunchest, the most upright, and the most impartial upholders of the just rights and privileges of all sections of the community, and any action on the part of any Hon'ble and learned Judge of these Honorable Courts tending to show the least disregard of such rights and privileges, is viewed with great alarm by the community, and I conceive that it is the duty of all journalists to maintain that no such disregard is shown.

16. That I express my deep regret at having unwittingly endeavoured to cast an undeserved slur upon the said Hon'ble John Freeman Norris, and I place myself unreservedly in the hands of this Honorable Court, being satisfied that the apology which is hereinbefore contained, is, under the circumstances, due from me to the said Hon'ble John Freeman Norris and this Honorable Court, and I further submit myself to the favorable and indulgent consideration of this Honorable Court.

17th. That I am advised that this Hon'ble Court has no jurisdiction to issue the said rule, or to deal with me or the said Ram Coomar Dey summarily; but the question, I am also advised, is one of extreme difficulty, and I know it to be one of great public importance, and will require much time and attention to be dealt with as, in my judgment, it should be dealt with.

18th. That the said rule was served upon me at half-past eleven o'clock, and I received the said grounds at about a quarter after 2 P.M., and though my attorney and I have made our best endeavours to secure the services of Counsel learned in the law to appear for me and argue the said question, I have not succeeded in getting one prepared to do so this morning, and I humbly pray that time may be granted to me sufficient to enable me to have the said question argued; and I make this prayer entirely subject to the apology which I have made, and without in any way detracting from or weakening the same in any particular whatever. Solemnly affirmed.

As regards the objection to the Court's jurisdiction contained in the 17th paragraph of the above affidavit, and the prayer for time to argue the question thus raised, Mr. Bonnerjee said he would read it, and leave it without further comment, as he was not prepared to support it.

After the affidavits had been read, the following conversation took place between the Court and defendant's counsel:—

*The Chief Justice.*—As I understand it, your client is prepared to make no defence, and has asked you to make this affidavit in extenuation of the contempt. He is not prepared to make any defence, and is now asking for an adjournment.

*Mr. Bonnerjee.*—I am not asking for an adjournment, As I have said, I am not prepared to support that prayer, nor, if the prayer were granted, should I be in a position to argue it, and if I were in a position to argue it, I should not do so.

*The Chief Justice.*—I consider you the mouthpiece of these gentlemen, and the last portion of the affidavit shows that the defendants intended to dispute the jurisdiction of the Court if they had not been advised by you not to do so.

*Mr. Bonnerjee.*—The matter stands precisely as in the affidavit. But as I said before, I am not prepared to support the prayer in that portion of the affidavit, and even if time were granted by your Lordships, I should not be in a position to argue the question, and even if I were in a position to do so, I should not. But on the first part of the matter, as your Lordships have heard, my client places himself unreservedly in the hands of the Court. I admit that there is, as your Lordships will perceive, some distinction—perhaps it is no defence in law—between the two cases, the case of Coomar Dey and that of Surendronath Bannerjee. Ram Coomar Dey has erred in ignorance, and is a subordinate agent; and even if he had wished he could not possibly have prevented the appearance of these matters in the newspaper. Therefore, I shall ask your Lordships to deal with him as leniently as may appear to your Lordships just and proper. Baboo Surendronath Bannerjee has no doubt written the article, and he has taken upon himself the entire responsibility of having done so. But, as he states, and I have no hesitation in asking your Lordships to believe, it was written in all honesty and in the belief that what was contained in the *Brahmo Public Opinion* was true and could be relied upon.

*Mr. Justice Norris.*—But there could be no necessity in all honesty to liken any Judge of this Court to Scroggs and Jeffreys. There is no

extenuation in the affidavit for having made any reference of that sort, and no expression of regret for having done so.

*Mr. Bonnerjee.*—I beg your Lordships to remember that the affidavits were prepared in a great hurry. They have been drafted and engrossed by the attorney himself, and there has been no time to deal with the case with that feeling which a matter of this sort certainly deserved; and I would therefore ask your Lordships to deal with the whole matter leniently. Baboo Surendronath Bannerjee regrets extremely that he was betrayed into saying anything which no doubt would justly wound the feelings and sensibilities of any person, and particularly one of your Lordships, sitting as one of the Judges of this Court.

*Mr. Justice Norris.*—I desire to remove the apprehension that any action has been taken because my feelings were wounded; action was taken because the whole Court was brought into contempt.

*Mr. Bonnerjee.*—I do not mean that action was taken because your Lordship's feelings were wounded, but because in the opinion of your Lordships the Court was brought into contempt. My client is extremely sorry for having made that allusion, and has done, under the circumstances, all that lies in his power, namely, to place himself unreservedly in your Lordships' hands, and to express his regret and submit his apology for what he had done. He holds a very prominent position in Calcutta; he is an Honorary Magistrate and a Municipal Commissioner, and is connected with various educational institutions in this city. Under these circumstances I leave the matter in your Lordships' hands, praying your Lordships to deal as leniently as, under the circumstances, your Lordships may think proper.

*The Chief Justice.*—We will consider the affidavits and give judgment in this matter to-morrow morning at 11 A. M.; but in the meantime Baboo Surendronath Bannerjee and Ram Coomarr Dey must find security for their appearance to-morrow in the sum of Rs. 5,000 each.

*Mr. Bonnerjee.*—In considering these affidavits I trust your Lordships will not lose sight of the fact of the great hurry with which the affidavits have been prepared, and your Lordships will be pleased to supplement the affidavits with what I have openly and publicly avowed on behalf of my clients.

It will be thus seen that the plea of want of jurisdiction was deliberately abandoned by the defendant, not because there was no time to argue it, but because he was unprepared to argue it, even if time were allowed. In other words, it was abandoned on its merits, and the inference from Mr. Bonnerjee's statement on the subject is, that it would have been eliminated from the affidavit, but for the hurry with which that document had been prepared and filed.

In delivering judgment, the Chief Justice, on behalf of himself and Justices Cunningham, McDonnell and Norris, after reciting the facts of the case, went on to say—

It seems, therefore, impossible for any one, however strict his religious views on such subjects may be, to say that Mr. Justice Norris did not take the utmost pains, in the first place, to ascertain whether the Thakur ought to be brought to the Court at all, and, in the next place, to provide that it should be brought with all due respect and propriety.

It may be perfectly true that European Judges, and more especially Barrister-Judges, are often imperfectly acquainted with the religious views

and feelings of the Hindu community; and the utmost they can do, when occasion arises, is to consult those who are best informed upon the subject, and to be guided by their advice.

But we now understand from your own affidavit, as well as from your Counsel, Mr. Bonnerji, that you admit that the learned Judge did every thing in his power to ascertain the truth of the matter, and to avoid giving the least offence to the religious feelings of your countrymen.

It, therefore, only remains for us to consider what punishment we ought to inflict upon you.

It is, indeed, a very lamentable thing, and I trust that your own countrymen will also be of that opinion, to find a gentleman of your position and attainments, who was once a member of the Covenanted Civil Service, and is now an Honorary Magistrate of this city, making use of his influence as a newspaper Editor to vilify and bring into public contempt, without any justification whatever, a Judge of the High Court.

If the offence had been committed by any young, inexperienced man, of no education or knowledge of the world, or by a person in the position of Rani Kumar Dey, who stands beside you, we might ascribe it, in some degree at least, to ignorance or want of consideration. But you have had great educational advantages. You know, or should know, as well as any one, the duties and responsibilities of gentlemen connected with the Press. You profess in your affidavit to justify your offence by putting forward as the basis of your false charges against Mr. Justice Norris, a statement in the *Brahmo Public Opinion*, which you say you believed to be true, and upon which you considered yourself at liberty to enlarge and comment with extreme severity.

Moreover, whilst you profess to admit that your charges were totally false and unfounded, and made without any sort of enquiry on your part, you still maintain that you have made them "in perfect good faith, and in the interests of the public good."

Further more, you have made mention in your affidavit of another article extracted from the *Brahmo Public Opinion*, which is also apparently intended to reflect upon Mr. Justice Norris, and the subject of which has nothing to do with the present proceeding. Your Counsel, though invited to do so, has wholly failed to explain to the satisfaction of the Court, why that article was inserted, and you must have known perfectly well, that the affidavits, upon which the rule was issued, were not directed to the subject of that article.

These matters in your affidavit, so far from extenuating your offence, appear to the Court to be an aggravation of it.

The Judges are at a loss to understand how a libel so gross could possibly have been inserted in your paper in good faith, and they find great difficulty in believing that a gentleman of your education and a newspaper Editor could be so utterly ignorant of the law of libel as to suppose that you were at liberty to publish these attacks upon the conduct and character of a High Court Judge merely because you found them, though in a less virulent form, in another Native newspaper.

The Court is quite willing to make some allowance for your affidavit having been drawn, as your Counsel informed us was the case, in a hurry and without consideration. But they cannot look upon it, for the reason which I have just mentioned, as any extenuation of your offence.

We feel that it is absolutely necessary to vindicate and maintain the authority of the Court, and to guard against a repetition of the grave offence which you have committed, by imposing upon you, not a fine, which in your case would be a mere nominal penalty, but such substantial punishment as may serve as a wholesome warning to yourself and others.



The Court's order is that you be imprisoned on the Civil Side of the Presidency Jail, for the space of two months.

The majority of the Court regret that in determining the award of punishment my brother Mitter's view should not be in accordance with theirs. We are, of course, fully aware of the precedents to which that learned Judge refers, but, in the first place, we think the facts of those cases are very different from the present; and, in the next place, we find ample precedent in England, in cases of gross libel, where a more severe punishment has been awarded.

We fail to see why persons charged with contempt of Court for libel in a proceeding of this nature should be subjected to a less severe punishment, than if the proceeding had been by criminal information, or by the more ordinary process at the criminal sessions.

Had your affidavit disclosed a more honest and candid avowal of your guilt, without making mention of those matters which the Court cannot find to have been introduced for any useful purpose, or from any proper motive, they might have considered it sufficient, for the ends of justice, to have visited you with a more lenient punishment.

Mr. Justice Mitter, dissenting from his colleagues as regards the punishment to be inflicted, delivered a separate judgment as follows :—

I concur in the finding that both Ram Kumar Dey and Surendro Nath Bannerji are guilty of contempt of Court. But after giving my best consideration to the question of the punishment that should be inflicted, I am unable to agree in the view of the majority of the Court. There have been in this Court two cases of a similar nature since its establishment. One is reported at page 79 of Hyde's Reports. The other case was not reported in any authorized report, but is well-known as 'Tayler's case'. In both these cases, at the first hearing of them, the persons charged with contempt did not admit the guilt. The matter was discussed fully, and it was only after the Court had pronounced its decision that they were guilty, that suitable apologies were made.

In the case before us, the persons charged with contempt have at once admitted their guilt, and have expressed their deep regret at having unwillingly cast an undeserved slur upon a learned Judge of this Court.

In the first-mentioned case, Sir Barnes Peacock, C. J., in delivering the judgment said :—"Although the majority of the Judges were of opinion that both these gentlemen," *i. e.*, the persons charged with contempt, had acted in contempt of Court, they did not wish to visit the offence with any punishment. "The Court would be content with an apology, nor need the apology be an abject one, but simply such as would convey the expression of their sorrow at having committed that which the Court considered to be contempt." In accordance with this expression of opinion, a suitable apology was made, and no punishment was inflicted.

In the other case, the sentence of the Court was that Mr. Tayler should stand committed for one month to the Civil Side of the Presidency Jail, and that he should pay a fine of Rs. 500, and that he should be further imprisoned till the fine was paid.

Then Sir Barnes Peacock, C. J., referring to an apology which had been published by Mr. Tayler before the sentence was passed, said :—

"If you think fit to add to the apology which you have already published (and it is for you to decide whether you can conscientiously do so or not) the Court is willing to mitigate the sentence. If, after what you have heard, you state that upon reflection you find that the charges which

you made against Mr. Justice Dwarka Nath Mitter were unwarranted and wholly without foundation, and that you are sorry for having made them, you may do so ; and you may add, if you wish it, either that you did not intend to cast any reflection upon any of the other Judges, or that the reflection cast was unfounded, and if you publish that apology in the *Englishman*, you may apply on Monday the 3rd of May next, for your discharge on payment of the fine."

This sentence was passed on Saturday the 24th April 1869, and on the 27th April following, Mr. Tayler, having made a suitable apology, was released, the remaining term of his imprisonment having been remitted.

I have gone into these details, because it seems to me that in determining the amount of punishment to be inflicted on Surendro Nath Bannerji, we should take these cases as our guide. The complexion of guilt in the case of Mr. Tayler is certainly not of a lighter character than that of Surendro Nath Bannerji.

On the question of punishment, therefore, I should have been inclined to adopt the course which was adopted in these cases.

The hearing of the case was the occasion of an amount of excitement among the native community which has probably not been equalled in Calcutta since the trial of the notorious Nand Kumar, and found expression in acts of overt violence to which we believe no parallel is to be found in the history of our Courts in India.

On the first day a large and noisy crowd assembled in and about the High Court, to the serious inconvenience of the Judges and Officers of the Court, and, when it became necessary to exclude them, they assumed an attitude of open and violent defiance of the police and the Officers of the Court, not only hooting at them, but pelting them with bricks and stones. On some of the offenders being arrested by the police, the more daring among the crowd boldly attacked their custodians and effected a rescue of one of them, followed, however, by the recapture of the prisoner concerned, and a yelling and menacing crowd accompanied the police all the way to the station.

On the second day, the authorities, warned by these occurrences, adopted extraordinary precautions, and an imposing array of police, European and native, prevented any further demonstration.

The sentence passed on the principal defendant was followed by a chorus of execration in which the entire native press, English and Vernacular, with one or two exceptions, joined. In spite of the defendant's absolute repudiation of the belief that Mr. Justice Norris had acted with any intention of wounding Hindu religious feeling ; in spite of his admission, and that of the *Bengalee*, that the statements on which the original article in the *Bengalee* was based, were unfounded, and that, if any wrong had been done, it had been done at the instance of one, and with the acquiescence of the other, party in the suit, and after the Judge had consulted experts, and been assured by them that the proceeding was harmless ;

in spite of the fact that the so-called *Saligram* produced had been proved to be no family idol at all, the Court was accused on all sides, not only of having aimed an unjustifiable blow at the liberty of the Press, but of having recklessly trampled on the religious feelings of the Hindus, and so destroyed the confidence of the people of the country in itself and the British Government in India. At the same time the severity of the sentence was appealed to as a proof that the Court had been influenced by race antagonism in its decision, the comparatively lenient treatment of Mr. Tayler in a case of a totally different complexion being brought forward in support of this view.

The fact that the native Judge was in favour of letting the defendant off with a fine was appealed to as a proof that, had the Court been composed of natives, he would not have been sentenced to imprisonment, an argument which in the view of most unbiased people will point to a conclusion very different from that which the agitators would draw from it. In token of their sympathy with the prisoner, a large number of the students of the various Metropolitan Colleges donned bands of crape upon their arms, and at more than one place, the counsel who defended him was burnt in effigy, on the ground that he had betrayed his trust, and proved false to his country, by refusing to argue the jurisdiction plea. The agitation in Calcutta reached its climax in four monster meetings which were held simultaneously in different parts of the native town, on Friday the 11th ultimo, after being extensively advertised by hand-bills and placards in which their object was stated to be "to protest against outrage to the religious feelings of Hindus by the removal of an idol." Not less than ten thousand people, including Rajputs, Marwarees and Sikhs, as well as Bengalees, and a considerable number of Muhammadans are said to have joined in this demonstration. At the principal meeting, the following Resolutions were carried by acclamation :—

I. That this meeting is firmly of opinion that the production of a Hindu god in the High Court, even with the consent of the parties, and in spite of the opinion of the Brahmin Interpreter in favor of such production, has outraged the religious feelings of the entire Hindu community.

II. That in the opinion of this meeting the attitude which Mr. Justice Norris has assumed towards the people of the country, and the offensive observations reported to have been publicly made by him regarding them on various occasions, are seriously calculated to shake the respect and the confidence which the country ought to have in a Judge of the High Court, and this meeting, therefore, is of opinion that steps should be taken to draw up a Memorial to Her Majesty the Empress of India on the subject.

III. That this meeting views with alarm the assumption by the High

Court of undefined and indefinite powers to punish persons for alleged contempt committed outside the Court premises, and this meeting is of opinion that the assumption of the functions of both Prosecutor, Judge, and Jury, beyond the extent laid down in the Code of Criminal Procedure, is contrary to all sound principles of jurisprudence, and is calculated seriously to affect the liberty of the Press and the freedom of speech.

IV. That this meeting wishes to record its deep sympathy with Babu Surendranath Banerjee in the sentence of imprisonment which has been passed on him by a majority of the Judges of the High Court, and to express its warm sense of appreciation of his labors in the cause of the political advancement of the country.

Another meeting was advertised to take place at the Town Hall on the following Wednesday, but, owing to some cause which has been variously explained, it was subsequently determined to hold it in the native part of the town. It accordingly took place on that date. The proceedings appear to have been conducted in an orderly manner, and the following Resolution was passed :—

That, inasmuch as the question of the summary jurisdiction of the High Court in cases of contempt committed out of its view was not argued or considered in the recent proceedings against Babu Surendro Nath Banerjee, this meeting resolves that a committee be formed to take all necessary and proper steps to procure an authoritative decision on the point, and to collect and receive subscriptions for the purpose.

Similar meetings have been held not only at various places in Bengal, but even in the North-West Provinces and the Panjab. They appear, however, to have excited little interest outside Lower Bengal. A petition is currently reported to have been submitted to the Viceroy praying him to set aside the order of the High Court. If such an appeal was made it was ineffectual. An appeal to the Privy Council is also said to be contemplated, for the purpose of furthering which Babu Lal Mohun Ghose has been deputed to England.

During the last week or two the agitation regarding the case has shown a tendency to die out, a result which is, we suspect, in a great measure due to the unanimity with which the defendant's conduct has been condemned, and the action of the High Court supported by the Press in England.

The character of the chief agitators, who, as we have already remarked, entertain no superstitious reverence for idols, if they can be called Hindus at all, and the transparently factitious nature of the grounds of their appeal to their less enlightened fellow-country-men, leave no room for doubt that their sole object is to stir up a feeling of hostility to the Government, and to Europeans in India generally, among a class of the population whom there was no hope of moving by a purely political cry of such remote practical interest as the Jurisdiction question.

While the advanced section of the educated middle class have been thus endeavouring for political purposes to foment a spurious

agitation regarding the action of the High Court in the contempt case, the leading members of the landed aristocracy of Bengal and Behar have been taking effective steps to make known their views regarding the much more practical question of the new Rent Law for those Provinces now pending in the Council. Meetings attended by all the most influential of the Behar zemindars have been held at Bankipore, Chuppra, Gya, and elsewhere, to protest against the contemplated invasion of the rights guaranteed them under the famous Permanent Settlement.

At the meeting held at Bankipore, the following pertinent Resolutions were passed:—

That the Tenancy Bill, by giving all facilities to ordinary ryots for acquiring the status of settled ryots against the will of the landlord, and by giving occupancy rights to all settled ryots with respect to all ryoti lands they may come in possession of, immediately on their coming into such possession, will virtually vest the property in estates in the ryots. That by making occupancy rights transferable, and limiting the maximum of the zemindar's claim to a-fifth of the annual value of the gross produce in occupancy tenancies, the Bill, if it becomes law, will virtually reduce the zemindars to mere annuitants, while vesting the substantial interest in a new class, who will nominally be known as ryots. That all these changes virtually affect the proprietary rights of zemindars, as guaranteed by the Permanent Settlement. That in Bhowli tenures the Bill reduces existing rates; that the effect of fixing a lower statutory maximum than the rates prevalent will be to bring existing higher rates down to the lower standard; that the several restrictions on the ryot's power of contract with the landlord are perfectly inconsistent with the freedom which the Bill proposes to give him in his dealings with the world around. That, as there is nothing to prevent either an indigo planter, thikadar, haradar of share estate, or even part owner, every body, excepting the sole proprietor of the entire estate, from acquiring the status of a settled ryot, restrictions quite unnecessary, the combined effect of the restrictions on the one side and freedom on the other will be, it is seriously apprehended, the utter destruction of the present body of tenantry and the usurpation of their place by a new class whose dealings with the under-ryots, under power of subletting, will be worse than that of the much condemned zemindar in relation to the tenants. That the provisions respecting the survey and register of Khamar land, and those relating to improvements and records of rights, will lead to unnecessary and costly litigation, the effect of which will be the impoverishment and ruin of both landlords and tenants. That it is unwise to unsettle customary tenures prevalent from time immemorial, and the meeting looks with serious apprehension on the proposal for a commutation of Bhowali tenures into Nakdi as calculated to affect agriculture. That the Bill proposes a redistribution of property without justifiable necessity, and that its provisions do not fall within the power reserved to Government by the permanent settlement to enact laws for the protection and welfare of ryots. That a sub-committee of the Mahārājas of Durbhungah, Huttwa, Doomraon, Syed Lotfari Khan and Raja Rām Chunder and Hon'ble Hurbans Sahai, with power to add to their number, be formed to draw up a memorial stating all the objections to the provisions of the Tenancy Bill and submit it to the Government of India, to Parliament and to Her Gracious Majesty the Queen.

*June 20th, 1883.*

## POSTSCRIPT.

**D**URING the ten days that have elapsed since the above retrospect was written, the political aspect has undergone little or no change. In the matter of the Native Jurisdiction Bill, the Government of India has given no indication of its intentions, though the reports of the local authorities have, it is understood, all been received, and the weight of opinion against the Bill is said to be overwhelming, many even of the native officials consulted concurring in its condemnation. The course which the Government may adopt will, in all probability, depend on the verdict arrived at by the Secretary of State and his colleagues, and some time must, in that case, elapse before the result can be known.

In the meanwhile the hands of the opposition have been materially strengthened by the movement that has been set on foot by their supporters in London, where a crowded and enthusiastic meeting was held on the 25th instant at St. James' Hall. The meeting was attended by all classes of Anglo-Indians, the official, as well as the non-official element being largely and influentially represented, and Resolutions were passed unanimously condemning the Bill and appointing a deputation to wait on the Secretary of State and lay before him the views of the community.

An opposition meeting, under the appropriate auspices of Mr. John Bright, is announced for Wednesday next.

An important debate on the Central Provinces Land Bill took place at the meeting of the Legislative Council held at Simla, on the 20th instant, the most noteworthy feature of which was the declaration of Lord Ripon, in opposition to his previous utterances and to the principles on which his Indian policy has hitherto been based, that it is beyond the functions of the Legislature to anticipate the facts of the future.

*June 30th, 1883.*

---

## CRITICAL NOTICES.

### GENERAL LITERATURE.

*A Grammar of the Classical Arabic Language, translated and compiled from the Works of the most approved Native or Naturalised Authorities.* By Mortimer Sloper Howell, H. M.'s Bengal Civil Service, etc. Published under the Authority of the Government, N.-W. Provinces. In an Introduction and four Parts. The Introduction and Part I. The Noun: Allahabad. Printed at the North-Western Provinces and Oudh Government Press, 1883.

“THIS Grammar,” says the author ‘is designed in conformity with the Prophet’s injunction, ‘seek help in arts from their masters,’ which, as applied to the study of Arabic grammar, may be interpreted to mean that the learner should have recourse to the teaching of the native Grammarians, and eschew the unauthorized conjectures of foreign scholars. This method possesses three obvious advantages:—the native teachers are more likely to be safe guides than their foreign rivals; \* their works form a better introduction to the commentaries and glosses indispensable for the study of many works in Arabic literature; and their system of grammar must be adopted as the basis of communication with contemporary scholars of Eastern race.”

The peculiarity of the author’s design, however, depends less on the source of his information than on the form in which it is presented to the reader, which is that of a series of dicta of Arabic grammarians of repute on the laws of the language, with accompanying illustrative quotations, arranged according to a certain order, instead of the usual synthetic process.

The research implied in Mr. Howell’s work, which is of great bulk in comparison with ordinary grammars, is immense. His plan possesses the advantage of at once placing the student *en rapport* with the original sources. The responsibility of the author being confined entirely to the selection, translation and arrangement of the dicta and examples. But it is attended with

---

\* I readily admit that we neither now, nor ever, can equal them in quantity [and, he might have added, quality] of knowledge (Ahl. Pref. 1X).



the disadvantage of imposing on the student the greatest possible amount of labour for the attainment of the result in view, supposing that, as in the case of most students, that result is merely a knowledge of the rules of the grammar and the art of applying them in practice.

For beginners Mr. Howell's grammar is obviously unsuited, and, we presume, is not intended. For the advanced scholar it will prove a mine of corroborative evidence and pregnant illustration, besides supplying a great deal of detail which no ordinary grammar can be expected to contain.

Bulky as the work is, it would have been much more so, but for the unusually liberal use of abbreviations. But the fact cannot be ignored that this extensive use of abbreviations, while diminishing the labour of the printer and the cost and size of the work, must tend rather to lengthen than curtail the labour of the student in using it.

In his Preface Mr. Howell gives an interesting account of the principal authorities used in the body of the work.

Part II. of the grammar, which was published some years ago, has already been noticed in this *Review*.

*A Year of Life. The Price of the Bishop, and other Poems.* By John Cameron Grant. (Author of "Songs from the Sunny South," etc.) London: Longmans, Green & Co. 1883.

THE plan of the principal Poem in this work is thus described by the author:—

The stream upon whose banks I stand and write has a two-fold meaning, symbolizing at once the flood of Time and the river of Life. Some strange warm Sun thaws the frozen waters and ourselves into being and consciousness from the Past. Like the river, we rush away from our young years; like it, we both form and are as frequently formed by, our surroundings; like it, we reach the larger ocean, only to sigh back ever on our morning shores. All things seem so full of Fate, so vast, so unchangeable, that we are inclined to the belief that Fate is everything, when the distant roaring of a Fall *grows* upon our ear. There is no *development* in Fate,—we are certain of that,—and so it comes that the mind seeks something else.

In XI. and the few following stanzas various attempts to grasp that "something" are briefly glanced at and rejected; all, as far as I can see, appearing empty and puerile when faced with the fearful facts of existence. We are torn and tossed about of various beliefs and misbeliefs, till in the Eternal nature of things we begin to see hope. The "Ereos Moment" shines out upon us and we take heart: the Magnets are two that attract us, Spirit as well as Flesh, the Future as well as the Present, and tho' at times almost compelled to cry, "*Been and will be* in all we dare to know," yet somehow we are so organized, that we cannot shut out the feeling "That the thought

of us is older than the sea." From XXVIII. I try to picture a Creation, a Rising, an Origin—call it what one will—under the cold stony clay-blue eyes of the past Saurians and vast Creatures of the early swarming seas, keeping, too, before me "The still-eyed faces of our silent Dead." Starting from the fiery Star-dust, the Cooling Nebulæ, the Chaotic Elements hidden by the darkness that was upon the face of the Deep, I strive to imagine, on the lifting of the misty curtain, the warm still steamy seas, the fitful rise of flame from their broad bosom, the bursting forth from their breast of the old organic rocks and their Titanic mountain ridges, followed on by each successive course of several and independent creation. Throughout is seen "The impress of some mighty Hand," but the very vastness of the design, and the necessary Omnipotent universality of the sweep and stretch of His Presence thro' the distant words and spheres, fill with fear; until we are brought to learn also that "His are the marvels of the microscope," and the full meaning of the truth that size is only a relative term. From XLIX. onwards I have put on paper thoughts upon a subject of the deepest interest to some minds, and surely of vast importance to us all—Life, or Mechanism! XCI. begins the next division, Boyhood, which, perhaps, for most will be the true beginning of the Poem, seeing that many, as I expect, will not care to follow me out thro' the first ninety stanzas. CLXXXII. begins the next division, Manhood, and CCXXXIV. the last, Old Age.

It is needless to say that the author's subject is a grand one and full of opportunity for poetical treatment, for it embraces all that is grand and all that is poetical. "A Year of Life," in the sense of the title, is the sum of conscious being, so far as it lends itself to human comprehension.

For its treatment no finer form than the sonnet could have been selected; for its nobility and beauty are equalled only by the difficulty of handling it worthily. In overcoming that difficulty the author has achieved a rare degree of success. In the views which find expression in these charming sonnets, there is much from which we dissent; but they are full of the spirit of true poetry, as well as of exalted sentiment and grace of expression. The key-note of the whole is to be found in the two following examples:—

## CCLXXXIII.

Mid jars and discords Earth is working out,  
 I deem it, to a higher state of things  
 This weary struggle, Life : tho' oft her wings  
 Would seem to flag, with earnest heart and stout  
 Humanity strives up ; tho' all about  
 The blindfold path she wanders, closing clings  
 The heavy mist of wrong, a clear note rings,  
 Heard from the mountain tops, to aid the doubt  
 In those nigh fainting thro' the strain and stress  
 Of the world-warfare ; low of voice, but sure,  
 It points to this one end without digress,  
 Prophetic of the thing that must endure,  
 A nobler manhood of more manliness.  
 A nobler womanhood more purely pure.—

## LXXVIII.

'Twere cruel, bitter cruel to be born  
 Created with an instinct of the Home  
 The Future holds within it, that will come  
 For all of us, if it were placed in scorn  
 There by our Maker ; so that over-worn  
 And letting this life from us, in the tomb  
 We should lie down and find an endless doom  
 Of nothingness, extinction. O hearts torn  
 And racked with doubt, not so, not so He works,  
 He asks but fairness in your judgment here,  
 From the known to the unknown, what conclusion lurks  
 In the love displayed in finger, flower, or Sphere ?  
 Those clouds that hide it, from the nether murks,  
 Let lightnings touch them and they disappear !

## LXXIX.

Who made the wing made too the needful air :  
 Who made the fish made water where to swim :  
 Who made the land and made the shapely limb :  
 And made the eye to gaze upon the fair  
 And all the beautiful of nature there :  
 Who is all truth in all things made of Him :  
 Who, when the evening waxes gray and dim,  
 Made the moth's eye to meet the twilight, ere  
 The Owl swoops out for his appointed night  
 With eyeballs for the darkness framed and cast :  
 It cannot be that he who worked aright  
 So well and wondrously throughout the Past,  
 Who made for each and all an apposite,  
 Made without mate this greatest and this last !

## LXXX.

The grand design for good in all we see  
 Points to a God and Future, the desire  
 For that far Home is placed to lead us higher  
 To that Home's Maker, both will granted be  
 In the long lights of that Eternity  
 That daily broadens on us, drawing nigher  
 As every moment sinks the little fire  
 Of vital life away before it. We  
 Have but to open Nature's book wherein,  
 First stooping down from his more secret state,  
 He with his finger writes, despite the din  
 Of questioners round, " For like, I like create."  
 Then fear not more than heart can dream to win,  
 Take hold upon his skirts, stand fast, and wait !

That "'twere cruel \* \* to be born \* \* if \* \* in the tomb we should lie down and find an endless doom of nothingness, extinction," is a sentiment natural to all humanity, but it is impossible to bring it to the test of logic without feelings that its expression involves something very like a bull. To "find" an endless doom of nothingness, extinction, is a contradiction in terms,

seeing that to find anything at all implies conscious being. It is man's mental incapacity to realise extinction that lies at the bottom, both of his disinclination to believe in it, and of his faith in a future life. He cannot think of extinction without associating with it the consciousness of having been and ceased to be.

There would be no poetry, however, if either the facts of life, or the aspirations created by it, were reduced to the test of logic, and such a test few of the readers of "A Year of Life" will be disposed to apply to the high thoughts of its author.

---

*Indian Snake Poisons, their Nature and Effects.* By A. J. Wall, M. D. (Lond.) Fellow of the Royal College of Surgeons of England; of the Medical Staff, H. M.'s Indian Army. London: W. H. Allen & Co., 13, Waterloo Place, Pall Mall. S. W. 1883.

THE conditions on which the mortality from snake-bite in India depends; the physiological nature of the poisoning process; the differences in the effects of the various poisons; the best method of treatment of snake-bite, are the principal points discussed in this excellent little book, which is based on a series of observations made by the author in India under the auspices of the Government.

The conclusions arrived at, briefly stated, are that cases of poisoning commonly occurring in the fields or in remote villages, far away from hospital treatment or medical aid, and recovery depending on immediate action, the mode of treatment, to be of use, must be such as can be applied under these conditions. That none of the various remedies that have been proposed is of any use in treating the constitutional effects of the poison. That where a certain quantity of the poison has once entered the circulation, no known means of averting a fatal result exists. That consequently the only hope of saving life lies in preventing the absorption of the poison, and that the most effectual, and, indeed, the only trustworthy way of doing this is by immediate and complete isolation, and ultimate excision, of the part affected.

Dr. Wall gives a very clear and careful account of the nature of the wound inflicted by a snake.

"When a snake obtains a fair hold of his victim," he says "both fangs—one on each side of the upper jaw—pierce the skin, and the poison is injected through each. There are thus, beneath the skin, two separate deposits of venom from which absorption takes place simultaneously. Death, therefore, as a rule, is quicker in cases of the natural bite, than after the artificial injection of the poison in one place. In the case of the cobra, if the bite has

been inflicted on a fairly plane surface, as the ball of the thumb, or the dorsum of the foot, the distance between the punctures will be, as a rule, seventeen millimetres, rarely exceeding twenty or going below fifteen millimetres; or, roughly, about seven-tenths of an inch, and varying from three-fifths to four-fifths of an inch. As the skin is movable, and penetration by both fangs may not occur simultaneously, there may be a difference in the distance between the two punctures, due to this cause. The punctures may or may not be visible to the naked eye. Sometimes their site is marked by a few drops of blood or serum exuding; or there may be a scratch, if the victim has withdrawn the part rapidly. Should the snake not have been interrupted, on examining the part with a lens, the punctures will be seen. They may be either short, straight cuts, gaping slightly at the centre, or triangular punctures, the area of the triangle being the pit into which the fang has been forced. The difference seems to depend on whether the snake has made a hasty dart and rapid withdrawal, or whether it was a deliberate and prolonged bite.

The poison is deposited at a depth below the punctures of about three or four millimetres; it may be more if the fang is able to depress the skin at the spot. The poison, also, is not deposited in the skin itself, but in the areolar tissue beneath; and this is a point of importance, for, as the skin is freely movable over the parts below, especially on the back of the hands and feet, the fang may have dragged the skin away from its proper position before injecting the poison, so that the poison deposit may not be immediately beneath the punctures."

To prevent absorption of the poison the only effectual means is the application of a thick India rubber cord, which "should be firmly and tightly bound round the extremity above the seat of the injury, and should encircle the limb several times." The cord accommodates itself accurately to the form of the member, and thus cause complete stoppage of the circulation where a less elastic material would be useless; and we quite agree with Dr. Wall that every thana, as well as every dispensary,—indeed, he might have said the headman of every village—should be supplied with so inexpensive and valuable a means of saving human life from an accident of such common occurrence in this country as snake-bite.

The patient being secured by its proper application against further absorption of the poison, time is obtained for treatment, even though it should involve the necessity of removal to a distance.

On the subject of the proper mode of treatment, the author says :—

The surgeon's first care should be to ascertain if the patient has been really poisoned; for the most venomous snakes may bite, and yet, from their poison-apparatus having been exhausted on some object previously, they may not inject one particle of poison. Symptoms are almost useless as an indication, as the most profound collapse may be caused by the fear of impending death, when the reptile causing the dread has not been in the least poisonous; and the victim not seldom does not see his assailant at all. Amputations, ending fatally, have even been performed on persons who have thus apparently had symptoms of snakes-poisoning, though it has been proved afterwards that the snake was a harmless one. Moreover, when the time for symptoms has come, the time for treatment has passed. It will be seen, therefore, of how great importance it is to ascertain whether the person has been poisoned as well as bitten.

It was pointed out in the chapter on cobra-poisoning that snake-poison produces at once inflammation at the spot where it has been injected. The degree of inflammation may vary greatly, depending partly on the species of snake, partly on the amount of poison injected and the time it has remained in the tissues, and partly on the position where it has been injected. Of Indian snakes the *daboia* produces the greatest amount of inflammation, and the *Bungarus cœruleus* or *krait*, I think, the least. Now this inflammation is not at all perceptible on the surface of the skin. After applying the band, the first thing to be done by the surgeon is to make a free incision through the skin at the site of the bite, and reflect back the skin on each side, so as to get a complete view of the underlying tissue. Now, it is clear that if no venom has been injected by a poisonous snake, or if the bite has been given by a harmless reptile or mammal, no subjacent inflammation can be present. A bite by a mongoose or *Lycodon* can produce nothing but a mechanical puncture. But if inflammation is present, it is evident that there must be some reason for it, and the only cause that can produce such rapid inflammation of the subcutaneous areolar tissue under these circumstances, is snake-poison. There are, of course, wide differences in the appearances to be seen in the areolar tissue under the skin, in the neighbourhood of the bite. In the case of the *daboia* a deep purple patch will be found at the spot, whereas the *Bungarus cœruleus* or *krait* will only cause a pale slight watery exudation, not much in quantity, and of a faint pink hue. The cobra, which is the snake that chiefly concerns us, always leaves decided marks of its poison, unless the venom has been thrown directly into a vein, when, of course, treatment is useless if sufficient to kill has been injected. It must be borne in mind that if any change whatever is found in the areolar tissue we must conclude that poison is present, and act accordingly; for we can only find out by leaving the patient alone and seeing if death supervene, if sufficient poison to kill has been injected; and this, of course, in an utterly unjustifiable proceeding. Every opportunity should be taken to become thoroughly acquainted with the appearance of areolar tissue, both in health and under the influence of the presence of snake-poison, as mistakes may easily be made from ignorance of the appearances presented.

The next step is to remove the whole of the deposited poison. Many proposals have been made from time to time on this subject. Suction, burning, igniting gunpowder on the spot, excision, &c., &c., have been recommended. But practically, all methods must yield to the careful dissection out with a knife of all the parts likely to contain the poison. It

is not of the least use pinching up the skin and excising it, as the skin never contains the poison at all, and the areolar tissue holding the poison would retract before the knife and be left behind. The following is the only efficient way:—An incision at least an inch and a half long should be made through the site of the bite; the skin should then be excised on each side for three-quarters of an inch. This will freely expose the parts below. The skin should be reflected back in every direction by the scalpel, and with a forceps the whole of the areolar tissue underneath should be thoroughly and completely dissected out, going freely up the limb in the direction of the returning blood-current. On the ball of the thumb, not only the areolar tissue, but the deep fascia and some of the muscle beneath should be removed, as the fang is capable of sinking in especially deeply here. On the fingers and toes all the tissues should be cut away at the site of the bite till the bone is reached, and, if necessary, on the back of the hand or foot, tendon and every structure may be cleared right down to the bone. Every part that may contain the poison must be removed. Life is not to be saved by a haphazard cutting away of anything that comes first, but by an intelligent and careful dissecting away of the parts holding the poison, bearing in mind the anatomical peculiarities of each region. On the surface of the limbs it will be enough, as a rule, to remove freely the subcutaneous tissue, especially if this be thick. The skin should in all cases be removed over an area of an inch and a half square. It need scarcely be remarked that amputation is totally unnecessary, as excision answers every purpose; but if it is found requisite to remove all the soft parts from one of the less prominent fingers or toes, it may be perhaps to the patient's advantage to remove that finger or toe completely. Careful but free excision, guided by the appearance of the parts, is all that is necessary; but it should be remembered that any shortcoming in carrying out the excision may result in the death of the patient. It would be cruel leniency to leave any tissue, however important, that served as a receptacle for the poison. After the whole of the suspected parts have been thoroughly dissected out, the India-rubber band may be removed, but not till then, the part having first been freely washed with a solution of caustic potash or potassic permanganate.

On the subject of prevention he says:—

Closely connected with the subject of treatment is the nature of the means that can be employed to prevent loss of life in India from snake-poisoning. Foremost stands the possibility of destroying the noxious reptiles themselves, and the use of rewards in aiding this process; and as different opinions are held on this subject, it may be advisable to review the arguments that may be employed. Against the system of granting rewards it may be urged—(1) That the number of poisonous snakes in the country is so enormous that it is practically impossible to lessen them if the whole revenue of India be used for the purpose. (2.) That the snakes chiefly inhabit the jungles, where it is very difficult to attack them, and that it is only when natives go into out-of-the-way places that they incur the risk of being bitten. (3.) That the practice of giving rewards for capturing snakes, instead of diminishing the number of snakes would tend to increase them, as men would take to breeding snakes for the rewards instead of catching them.

The number of snakes in India must, in truth, be enormous, but we have no grounds for forming the slightest idea as to what their number may be, and therefore there is no evidence, one way or the other, whether they can be exterminated or not. Large sums have been disbursed in certain districts with little effect, but in other cases a distinct diminution

in mortality has occurred. But it should be stated that often large amounts have been disbursed without any safeguard as to whether the reward was given for poisonous snakes only. I have known rewards in large numbers paid in a district for the harmless *Lycodon*, and I am by no means sure that the disbursing official was, in the end, convinced that the object of his persecution was harmless. Still, in another district, where a perfectly competent officer supervised the distribution, the snakes were brought in in undiminished numbers while the reward was given. It is, of course, likely that they were brought in from greater distances, as no reward was given in the surrounding districts. On this subject, therefore, there is not sufficient evidence. But universal experience shows us that when man has earnestly striven to extirpate a noxious animal he has always succeeded. Deaths from snake-bite used to be common in Europe, they are almost unknown at present; and the same thing may be said of North America. Wolves are now exceedingly rare in Southern and Eastern Europe, where they used to constitute a public danger. It is only amidst a passive population that pests of this kind are tolerated.

That snakes are most frequently found in jungles and similar places is of course accurate, but that natives are bitten there is certainly not true. The most striking feature in the statistics of death from snake-bite is the exceeding frequency with which women are bitten. Thus, in Bengal, in the last year for which I have the detailed statistics, 2,155 women were killed, for 2,040 men, and no less than sixteen per cent. of the deaths were of children under ten years of age. In other words, the home-staying portion of the population suffered as heavily as those going abroad. But nearly twice as many persons were bitten during the night as during the day, showing still more clearly that the calamity takes place, not in the jungle, but actually in the home. The mortality from snake-bite in India does not depend upon the snakes in the jungle, but the presence of these reptiles amongst the very people, who take not even the most ordinary precautions against being bitten. It is the indifference of the people to the presence of these enemies in their very midst that produces the fearful loss of life in India. The toleration accorded to snakes is simply incredible. A native, to my knowledge, has allowed a poisonous reptile to escape that had fatally bitten a member of his family. The attitude of the Indian peasant towards poisonous snakes may be described as that of passive toleration to avoid their active enmity. Sometimes, indeed, it even goes further than this, and snakes are offered food to propitiate them. On this ground alone it would seem wise to follow up a policy that would tend to rouse in the native mind an idea of resistance and hostility.

But may not the reward stimulate the inhabitants to breed snakes, and not to catch them? Means, as far as possible, have been taken to obtain information on this subject. I have bred cobras, and have found it a work of great difficulty. If the eggs become too dry, development is suspended; if they are made too moist, it is stopped altogether. They require, therefore, great attention. When the young cobra is hatched it is very small, very irritable, and exceedingly dangerous. A full-grown cobra can be handled with perfect safety, but a young one, ten or eleven inches long, is so active, and its body is so small, that it can be scarcely touched with impunity. I have seen hundreds of cobras brought in for rewards, but yearlings have been very few amongst them. The reason is that when the snake's hole is dug out, the cobra with the long body can be readily seized; but the young one, which can turn round in the smallest space with the greatest ease, is generally allowed to escape. The fact that yearlings are seldom brought in for the reward is conclusive evidence that it does



not answer to breed them, for no one would seriously urge that the breeder would keep them for a long time before producing them.

Taken altogether, then, it would seem wise to adopt a moderate system of rewards; but attention, of course, should be paid to every detail that can add efficiency to the scheme, and lessen its cost. In no case should a reward be given except for a poisonous snake, and the officer in charge of the distribution should, in all cases, be thoroughly competent to identify all common snakes, both poisonous and non-poisonous; a knowledge that can be acquired with ease in a few days, or even hours, if opportunities of inspecting the snakes themselves be afforded. It is doubtful, also, whether rewards should be given for all poisonous snakes. The *Trimeresuri*, for instance, are not very dangerous to life, and perhaps no advantage would be gained by including them. The snakes in the front rank of those offending, probably in the order of their danger, are the Cobra, the *Bungarus ceruleus*, the *Echis carinata*, the *Daboia russellii*, the *Bungarus fasciatus*, and the *Ophiophagus elaps*. and rewards should only be given for these. The above arrangement is, of course, one of probability only, as statistics throw little or no light on the matter.

Great attention should be paid to the conservancy of small towns and villages. In large towns public opinion is already awake to the injury inflicted by jungle being allowed to grow up around dwellings; but in villages, naturally, but little attention is given to a detail of this kind. A few holes stopped, and a few bushes cut down in every village, would diminish immensely the hiding-places of these pests, and exactly at the spots where they do most harm.

That municipalities have in many cases undertaken to give rewards for the destruction of snakes is a sign of great hopefulness.

The most stringent system that has yet been devised to exterminate pests is undoubtedly that of requiring the inhabitants of an infested district either to present a certain number of the proscribed animals each year or to pay a sum instead, the amount thus obtained being devoted to the purposes of extermination. It is difficult to see how any animal, however prolific, could withstand a persecution of this kind. But, of course, a scheme like this presupposes that the inhabitants should clearly see that it is their real advantage that is being consulted, and that they have no reluctance to destroy their foes.

Another consideration to be regarded is, whether there is any special season in which snakes can be destroyed with advantage. In the cold weather the reptiles are torpid, and do little or no injury; but from March to September the loss of human life steadily increases. The rainy season, commencing at the end of June, driving them from their holes, naturally increases the mortality greatly. It might, therefore, be assumed that the rainy season is the period when they should be chiefly attacked. But if we study the natural history of the cobra, we shall find that the female usually lays her eggs in July. The great aim, therefore, should be to destroy as many of the reptiles as possible before the eggs are laid, remembering that every female captured then is equal to very many later on, and that vipers, which, of course, bring forth their young alive, are even much more prolific. The months, therefore, of May and June and part of July are those in which the destruction of snakes is likely to be attended with the greatest results. This would, in fact, be inverting the policy of a "close season," which has been found so successful all over the world in favouring the production of game.

A large portion of Dr. Wall's book is occupied with accounts

of experiments on the physiological effects of the poisons of various Indian snakes. These appear to have been most carefully conducted and are recorded with great clearness and precision, and accompanied in several instances by tracings of the respiratory movements under the influence of the poison.

---

VERNACULAR LITERATURE.

*Nisitha Chintā. Book 1.* Translated by Nimai Charan Gangopādhyāya. Printed by Bama Charan Majumdar at the Barat Press, 12, Pataldāngā Street, Calcutta. 1882.

YOUNG'S *Night Thoughts* is one of those poems which are not much read in these days. The reason why they are not read is, that they are not so much poems as essays of a moral or didactic nature. Passages of true poetic excellence they undoubtedly contain ; but they consist principally of moral, philosophical and religious reflections, like the following :—

যড়িতে বাজিল এক। আমরা সময়,  
গণনা করি না কত না হইলে ক্ষয়।  
ও শব্দকে উপদেশ সমভাবে যেই,  
মনুষ্যের মধ্যে জ্ঞানীরূপে গণ্য সেই।  
অগণ্য দূতের বাক্য যেমন গভীর,  
সেই মত উহা আমি অনুমানি স্থির।

For this reason, works like the *Night Thoughts* have never been able to take a high rank among English poems. We must therefore say that if Babu Nimai Charan's object in translating Young's work is to give such of his countrymen as do not know English, an idea of what English poetry is like, he has made an unhappy selection. But it must be freely admitted at the same time that works like the *Night Thoughts*, though they do not possess high poetic merits, are exceedingly useful and respectable compositions on account of their matter, their manner, and their spirit. For their orthodoxy, their perfect geniality and their benevolent spirit, they deserve careful study ; and it is found, as a matter of fact, that, when they are read in the sober, earnest and genial spirit in which they are written, they prove exceedingly wholesome and delightful reading. Babu Nimai Charan has therefore done well in selecting for translation into the language of his country an eminently useful and respectable English work. We wish, however, that he had translated it into Bengali prose and not into verse. Translation is, under all circumstances, a very difficult work, and except in the hand of a

first-rate expert, fails of its purpose. It becomes, however, still more defective when verse instead of prose is adopted as its medium. Take the following extract from the work under notice, and say whether Bengalis, who know not English and are utterly unacquainted with English modes of thought and English forms of expressing thought and feeling, would be able to make anything out of it :—

প্রত্যেক বিভিন্ন স্থান কাল অবস্থায়,  
 শুভ চিন্তা করিলেও অশুভ ঘটায়।  
 ব্যস্ত চিন্তা অতি ব্যস্ত শূন্য অবসর,  
 মম শাস্তি হওয়া তাতে অতি সুহৃৎকর।  
 বহুদিন গত যেই অতীত সময়,  
 বাহার স্মরণ দ্বার গুহ্য তমোময়।  
 তাহাতে প্রবেশে মন্দ মন্দ পদে যায়,  
 রজনীর স্থিরতায় ঘাতকের প্রায়।

It would have been better, therefore, if Babu Nimai Charan had presented his translation in Bengali prose ; and as he has not yet proceeded beyond the first book, we sincerely hope that he will yet alter his plan, and substitute prose for verse. A metrical translation of the kind he has begun will be a perfectly unintelligible, and therefore useless thing, will gain no readers, and may have to be, therefore, abandoned before it is finished. We warmly approve of Babu Nimai Charan's undertaking. We only wish that he may execute it, in a manner calculated to ensure its success.

*Himálaya.* Printed by Sarachchandra Deb at 37, Meehuabazar Street, and published by Kedareshwar Sanyál at Shikdárpará, Calcutta, 1803, Sakábdá.

**T**HE following remarks were made on current Bengali poetry in the Bengal Administration Report for 1879-80 :—

“The characteristics of Bengali poetry of the present day are want of depth and excess of ornamentation. It is essentially false and artificial in style, and concerns itself chiefly with two things,—love and the political condition of India. No attempt is made to draw inspiration from nature or the incidents of human life, apart from sexual passion. A certain amount of success in the adaptation of European models has been shown by some writers, but there is at present in Bengali no first-class Indian poet.”

The author of the poems before us expresses his concurrence in these remarks and says, that his object and endeavour in this

work have been to forsake the beaten path of Bengali poetry and draw his inspiration from nature. We are sorry to say, however, that his endeavour has not been very successful. Some of his subjects are no doubt taken from nature, such as a mountain, a mountain-spring, &c. But even in dealing with such subjects, he has displayed the characteristics which are condemned in the report of the Government of Bengal. Addressing the Himalayas our poet says :—

দিবা নাই-রাতি নাই-নাহিক বিজ্ঞান,  
ঢালিতেছ অশ্রু-শ্রোত শুধু অবিরাম ।  
ভারতের দশাহেরে বুঝিবা এ অশ্রুনীরে  
ভাসাই'ছ বন্ধ তব, অহ কি মহৎ !  
এ মহত্ত্ব তব কাছে শিখুক জগৎ ।  
ভারত-সন্তান হ'য়ে মোরা মৃঢ় জন  
বিনা বাক্যে মা'র দশা করি'ছি দর্শন ।  
বিন্দু ও নয়ন বারি কভু বরষিতে নারি,  
কিস্তু ধন্য তুমি, দেব ! পয়ের কারণ  
দিবানিশি সমভাবে করি'ছ ক্রন্দন ।

This is certainly false and verbose and artificial, and is full of that empty and untrue spirit of patriotism which finds expression in the sort of Bengali poetry which is commented upon in the report of the Bengal Government. All the poems in this collection, however, are not bad. Some of them are really very good, such as the pieces entitled *Lepchālakṣṇā* and *Pather Bāluk*. There is much pathos in those two pieces. The remaining pieces are characterised by verbosity, conceit, and a fervor of sentiment which appears, from the vehemence and wordiness of the manner of its expression, to be the very opposite of genuine. The author's versification is good.

*Bichitra Paush-pārban.* By Nehāl Chánd. Published by Jogendra Nāth Bandyopādhyāya, Calcutta. .

THIS is a very curious poem. It does not belong to the class of poems which now predominates in Bengali literature. It is not a lyric poem, as most Bengali poems now are. It is a humorous poem describing the great cake festival of the Hindus of Bengal in the end of the month of Paush. Competent scholars, like Professor Wilson, consider that festival to have had an astronomical origin; but it appears from the practices which are observed for its celebration that, whatever it may have originally

been, it is now performed decidedly as an agricultural festival would be. The time for its performance is the conclusion of the great rice harvest in Bengal; and the religious element contained in it consists of the worship of the Hindu goddess of Fortune, represented by a few measures of paddy, the worship of the rice-threshing machine and a somewhat public worship performed on the field from which the last harvest of rice has been just removed. This is not, however, the place to discuss the nature and origin of the cake festival, and we must therefore pass on to the immediate subject of this notice. The cake festival is described at great length in *Paush Pârbān*, a whole canto being devoted to each important incident and ceremony comprised in it. The description is throughout vivid and forcible, and is particularly interesting in those portions which contain *mantras* and incantations. The author seems to be a disciple of the well-known author of *Bhârut Uddhâr*, and his mastery over words and Bengali blank verse is really admirable. The ease and skill with which he manipulates colloquial words, as well as words of Sanskrit origin, and the fluency of his verses, deserve great praise. As a humorous and even satirical writer, we cannot help regarding him as a valuable accession to the ranks of Bengali literature. He has, however, some very serious faults. His humour is often of a very strained and conceited kind, which seems to us to be the result of his habit of spinning out his descriptions. The artistic effect of such strainings is always bad; and we accordingly find that in many places, our author is perfectly unintelligible and remarkably odd. His humour is often also very coarse. Take the following extract :—

—বাহ-দেশ, গাঢ় গোবরিত  
 তার,—অকার্ণিষ; ঝরি ঘুঁটের খাতিরে!  
 বহে যবে গন্ধবহ মন্দ মন্দ গতি,  
 ফুল বৃন্দ গন্ধ লম, গন্ধ বহি তার,—  
 (কিষ্ণা, পরিমল পুরা মল!)—ইতস্ততঃ,  
 উঠে অন্নশন অন্ন, নাড়ী শুদ্ধ, হায়,  
 সে সৌরভে বিদেশীর! হায় রে যেমতি,  
 তাইনাম ইপীকাক ওপিগ্নাম কেশে!

This is not humour, but filth, which the author had no need to introduce into his description, and which, considering the nature of several other passages in his poem, he appears to have introduced in consequence of a very mistaken notion of what true humour is. That mistake has also affected the very plan of the work

as a whole. The Bengali cake festival is a national festival in the strictest sense of the word, and in its social aspects it is in the highest degree interesting. A festival of this kind, possessing so much humanising influence on society, is exactly a subject for humorous description, but not one to be treated as our author has treated it, in a spirit of banter and ridicule. That this is a correct characterisation of the poem will be clear to all who take note of the fact, that the author's style of composition is one of vicious imitation and irreverent caricature. Nehál Chand has imitated Rámdás's style of ridicule in *Bhárat Uddhár* and caricatured the solemn style of Michael Madhúsudan Datta. In spite, however, of all these faults, *Paush Párbán* is a work of great merit, and constitutes a really agreeable variety in Bengali poetry.

---

*Ráj Jibani.* By Gopál Chandra Mukhopádhya. Printed by Hara Chandra Dás at the Eden Press, 34, Nilmani Mitra's Street, Calcutta, 1289, B. S.

**B**ABU GOPAL CHANDRA MUKHERJI is a very industrious man. It is not very long ago that he published a big book in Bengali, giving an account of the Imperial Assemblage at Delhi. As a Bengali book, the work under notice is also a big one, for it consists of 204 closely printed pages. It contains a memoir of the late Prince Consort, based on Mr. Martin's English work. The late Prince Consort was certainly a very good man; but we doubt whether even his English biography has been read by many Bengalis. It would be therefore folly to expect that a Bengali memoir of the Prince will be of use to any native of this country, or that it will ever acquire a position in Bengali literature. It would be well if Babu Gopál Chandra Mukherji would therefore devote his time and industry to the composition of works which may be of use to his countrymen. Both his *Victoria Rajsuya* and his *Raj-Jibani* are so much labor lost. As a proof, however, of Native loyalty to the British Crown they are really acceptable.

---

*Ayurbardhan, Part I.* By Dr. Annadá Charan Khástgir. Printed and published by B. L. Chakrabarti at the New School Book Press, 8, Dixon's Lane, Calcutta, 1882.

**T**HE following extract from the preface will explain the nature and scope of this work :—

"This work, in two parts, embraces all subjects which affect

human longevity in the plains of India. Facts adduced therein are in keeping with the latest discoveries in the science of the Laws of Health, modified by circumstances of the climate, diseases, and mode of living, peculiar to this country, such as one born and bred among them, with the additional advantages of a liberal English and scientific education, and medical and surgical practice extending over 28 years, is able to collect, and reproduce for the benefit of the community in Bengal.

Subjects treated therein are : (1) food (aerial, liquid and solid) suited to the people, place and climate ; (2) exercise (physical and mental), repose and recreation ; (3) occupation suited to place, and constitutional peculiarity ; (4) dress in its triple aspect, *i. e.*, preservation of bodily warmth, enhancement of personal beauty, and concealment of nudity ; (5) cleanliness of body, dress, of the air breathed, and of the house dwelt in, &c. ; (6) sexual intercourse, and its excesses indirectly curtailing life ; (7) prevention and domestic treatment of wide-spreading diseases (climatic or non-contagious, as well as contagious) ; (8) domestic management of accidents ; (9) easy management of some rapidly supervening diseases by simple drugs, and (10), lastly, means of preserving health at different epochs of life to the full extent of human longevity allotted by our Creator."

This is a very long and important programme, and, considering Dr. Khástgir's experience and standing in his profession, we may be sure that he has worked it out with great ability. We are afraid, however, that there are many inaccuracies in his work. He opens his very first chapter with an inaccurate statement, which is, that people consider food to be more necessary than air for the maintenance of life. Everybody, not excepting the rudest peasant, knows that men can live for days without food, but cannot live without air even for a few minutes. In almost the next page the Doctor makes many Bengali cooks die of consumption in this country in order to illustrate his theory of the generation of disease by injurious respiration. Our own experience is, that Bengali cooks, whether male or female, seldom die of consumption or are attacked with that disease. And we might go still further and say that the class of Bengali females who engage themselves as cooks for hire in Hindu families in Calcutta are found to be remarkably healthy, certainly not less strong or healthy than those Hindu ladies for whom they cook and inhale the smoke of the kitchen. Altogether, *Ayurbardhan* is a work of great value and interest ; but we cannot say that it has been composed carefully or with a strict regard to accuracy.

*Bibidha Prabandha. Part I.* By Rájnaráyan Basu. Printed by Adhar Náth Chattopádhyaýa at the Kar Press, 167, Cornwallis Street, and Published by Sinha and Banerji Friends, at the Oriental Publishing Establishment, Calcutta, 1289, B. S.

**B**ABU RAJNARAYAN BASU, one of the leading members of the Adi Brahma Samaj, is known to the readers of this *Review* as a veteran Bengali writer. He has served his country eminently by his devotion to its growing literature. He is not a frivolous writer. He does not court the muse of poetry. He hates obscene writing. In the field of Bengali literature he occupies an elevated platform. He writes on religion, on the social institutions of his country, on the literature of his country, on the history of his Aryan ancestors, on subjects possessing interest for his country, and for men in general. He is not indeed an original writer. But he is a very genial writer. He is a man of much information, and he has acquired by his years, experience and knowledge an authority on such subjects as the history of modern Bengali literature and English Education in Bengal. He is a sober thinker, and a tone of patriotism pervades his writings. Though a Brahma, he is not a radical, but a moderate liberal in his treatment of social questions. He is altogether a very respectable writer; and his papers, collected in the volume before us, ought to command the respect and attention of his countrymen.

---





THE  
*CALCUTTA REVIEW.*

VOLUME LXXVII.

1883.

---

*No man who hath tasted learning but will confess the many ways of prepting by those who, not contented with stale receipts, are able to manage and set forth new positions to the world: and, were they but as the dust and cinders of our feet, so long as in that action they may yet serve to polish and brighten the armoury of truth, even for that respect they were not utterly to be cast away.—MILTON.*

---

CALCUTTA :

PRINTED & PUBLISHED BY

THOMAS S. SMITH, CITY PRESS, 12, BENTINCK STREET,  
BOMBAY. MESSRS. THACKER & CO., "LIMITED."

MADRAS: MESSRS. HIGGINBOTHAM & Co.

LONDON: MESSRS. TRUBNER & CO., 57 & 59, LUDGATE HILL.

052.

— E. —

17

# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

No. CLIV.

## CONTENTS.

	PAGE.
ART. I.—OLD LAMPS FOR NEW ONES ... ..	201
„ II.—CAPELLO AND IVENS; THEIR EXPLORATIONS IN AFRICA—1877-1880 ... ..	209
„ III.—LANDED PROPRIETORSHIP, LAND-TENURES, AND THE VESTIGES OF LOCAL SELF-GOV- ERNMENT UNDER NATIVE RULE IN ORISSA ... ..	236
„ IV.—TRANSMIGRATION OF SOULS : 1.—Solidarity and Continuity... ..	264
„ V.—ENGLISH SPELLING AND THE SPELLING RE- FORM ... ..	277
„ VI.—THE SANKHYA PHILOSOPHY ... ..	302
„ VII.—SUFISM ... ..	324
„ VIII.—BULANDSHAHR : A District Sketch... ..	348
„ IX.—KANJARS IN UPPER INDIA... ..	364
THE QUARTER ... ..	399

### CRITICAL NOTICES :—

#### 1.—GENERAL LITERATURE.

- 1.—Circulars of Information of the Bureau of Education. Washington : Government Printing Office, 1883... .. i
- 2.—History of Burmah, including Burmah Proper, Pegu, Toungu, Tenasserim and Arakan. From the Earliest Time to the End of the first War with British India. By Lieutenant-General Sir Arthur P. Phayre, K.C.M.G., K.C.S.I., and C.B. Membre Correspondant de la Société Académique Indo-Chinoise de France. London : Trübner & Co., Ludgate Hill, 1883 ... .. *ib.*
- 3.—Colonies and Dependencies. Part I.—India. By J. S. Cotton, Late Fellow of Queen's College, Oxford. Part II.—The Colonies. By E. J. Payne, Fellow of University College, Oxford. London : Macmillan & Co., 1883... .. ii
- 4.—Esoteric Buddhism. By A. G. Sinnett, President of the Simla Eclectic Theosophical Society, Author of "The Occult World." London : Trübner & Co., Ludgate Hill, 1883 ... .. x

- 5.—**The Legends of the Punjab.** By Captain R. C. PAGE  
Temple, Bengal Staff Corps, Fellow of the  
Royal Geographical Society, Member of the  
Royal Asiatic, Philological, and Folklore So-  
cieties, the Anthropological Institute, and the  
Asiatic Society of Bengal. No. 1. August 1883,  
Bombay : Education Society's Press, London :  
Trübner & Co. ... .. xii
- 6 — **Across Chryse, being the Narrative of a Journey  
of Exploration through the South China Border  
Lands from Canton to Mandalay.** By Archi-  
bald R. Colquhoun, Executive Engineer, Indian  
Public Works, F.R.G.S., A. M. Inst. C. E. In  
Two Volumes, London : Sampson, Low, Marston,  
Searle, and Rivington, 1883 ... .. xiii

## 2.—**VERNACULAR LITERATURE.—**

- 7 — 1. **Bhārat-Kāhinī.** By Rajani Kanta Gupta.  
Printed by Bhubon Mohan Ghose at the  
Victoria Press, 21 -1, Cornwallis Street, and  
published by Gurnudas Chattopadhyaya, at the  
Bengal Medical Library, 97, College Street,  
Calcutta, 1883 ... .. xiv
2. **Arya-kirtī.** By Rajani Kanta Gupta.  
Second Edition. Printed by Sarach Chandra  
Deb, at the Binā Press, 37, M. chuanbazar Street,  
and published by Gurnudas Chattopadhyaya, at  
the Bengal Medical Library, 97, College Street,  
Calcutta, 1883 ... .. ib.
- 8 — **Upanyas-ratnābali.** Part I—Nos. 1, 2 and 3.  
By Dāmodar Mukhopadhyaya. Printed and  
published by H. M. Mukharji & Co., at the  
New<sup>e</sup> Sanskrit Press, 11, Simla Street, Calcutta. ... xv
- 9 — **Manabatattwa, or a Treatise on the Social, Moral  
and Intellectual Position of Man.** By Bireswar  
Pande. Printed and published by H. M.  
Mukharji & Co., at the New Sanskrit Press,  
11, Simla Street, Calcutta, 1883 ... .. xvi
- 10.—**Astādas Bidyā.** Part I. By Rāya Gobinda  
Mohan Bidyābinodbaridhi. Printed by I. C.  
Dasu & Co., at the Stanhope Press, 249, Bow-  
Bazar Street, Calcutta, and published by the  
Author at Kākinā, 1883 ... .. xvii
- 11.—**Balyasakhā.** Part I. Printed and published by  
Ramsurbasya Bhatrāchārya, at the Bidhān Press,  
No. 6, Collego Square, Sakabla, 1805 ... .. ib.



# THE CALCUTTA REVIEW.

NO. CLIV.

## ART. I.—OLD LAMPS FOR NEW ONES.

R. ILBERT'S proposed Amendment of the Criminal Procedure Code has led to the discovery of not a few anomalies in our Indian body politic, and also to a certain amount of plain speaking about them which has been acceptable to such of us as are not inclined to think conventionality an embodiment and essence of all the virtues.

Even the debate in the usually starched and staid Viceregal Council on the introduction of this ill-judged measure was a real one.

Incidentally, upon one of the anomalies, one of the dark corners of the house we Anglo-Indians have to live in, some unaccustomed light has been thrown by this debate, and the criticisms it has called forth. We refer to the habit of perjury which, in this country, vitiates, and so often renders of no effect all our learnedly devised legal machinery for the administration of justice, the protection of the weak, and the punishment of evil-doers. Everybody in India (with the exception of the Viceroy, perhaps) knows of its existence. Every Englishman in India is ready to deplore and to denounce it—in the abstract. But just because everybody knows, and is more or less concerned about, it from a moral point of view, it is assumed that it is nobody's business to try and do away with the iniquity—not even the business of the missionaries, who are, as a rule, so commendably ready to concern themselves with iniquities, and never seem to tire of anathematising the opium trade, or the excise laws, or the toleration by Government of religious opinions not based on Christianity. It is, in short, an anomaly that has been allowed to arrogate to itself

privileges and exemptions that are in direct opposition to the existing criminal law, that must always, we may venture to say, be opposed to any possible criminal law even of Mr. Ilbert's drafting, an anomaly really dangerous to the commonwealth, and mischievous exceedingly in scope and practice. Incidentally, as we have said, the debate in the Viceregal Council brought prominently to notice the existence and the power for mischief of this anomaly, and showed it to be worthy of more attention than has been hitherto bestowed upon it by the public, and surely entitled to some consideration at the hands of a Government with pronounced hankerings after ideal justice and righteousness.

Sir Steuart Bayley, a man who, by dint of some power of sympathy and an official experience extending over many years, has become well acquainted with the circumstances and habits of the people of Bengal and Behar, referred to "the real danger" Europeans living in the mofussil are exposed to, because of false cases trumped up against them. Mr. Thomas, another official of long standing in the Civil Service, a man who, being a diligent sportsman as well as a painstaking Judge, has had exceptional opportunities of getting at real conditions of life in the Madras Presidency, gave it as his opinion that "false complaints are every-day circumstances of mofussil life." Mr. Robert Miller, a Calcutta merchant, with a large knowledge of business in India, and many friends amongst natives with whom he has been associated in business-matters, said, with reference to the contention that the Ilbert Bill is only a trifle:—"It is not a trifle, for one of the most common crimes, I will not say one of the ingrained customs, of this country is the fabrication of false evidence in the courts of Law." And, again, further on in his speech: "False evidence is cheap." Mr. Evans referred to notable instances of perjury coming within his own cognizance as a practising Barrister in India, and also to the well known Meares and Stevens cases. Here is an extract from his speech as reported in the newspapers:—

"In this country criminal trials almost entirely depend upon oral evidence in nine cases out of ten, and, depending upon oral evidence, we have to consider what are the conditions of oral evidence in India. I will not read passages, for I do not wish to give unnecessary offence. I will not read those passages to the Council which are to be found in every digest of Privy Council cases as to the lamentable state of things in regard to oral evidence in the mofussil in India. We all know it; we all regret it."

In the Viceroy's Council, indeed, even amongst the supporters of the Ilbert Bill, there was no attempt made to repudiate the charge of wholesale, persistent perjury, brought against the natives of India. All their arguments were based on a ground either of sentimentality,

or supposed convenience. Even Dr. Hunter fought shy of what we may perhaps be allowed to call the perjury side of the argument, although the worthy Doctor, in a book entitled "Our Indian Mussulmans" which was published not many years ago, wrote thus:—"The Bengalee, whether rich or poor, wreaks his malice on a rival, and seeks his revenge against an enemy not by inconsiderate violence, but by due course of law. He uses the courts for the same purpose for which an Englishman employs a horse-whip, or a Californian his bowie knife. A criminal prosecution is the correct form for inflicting personal chastisement, and a general suspension in India of what corresponds to the *Habeas Corpus* Act would place every man at the mercy of his enemies. The Police returns in India disclose an overwhelming proportion of false complaints to true ones, and the Bengali has reduced the rather perilous business of making out a *prima facie* case to an exact science. A formal interference with the right of *Habeas Corpus* would give the signal for a paroxysm of perjury. The innocent would live in constant fear of being thrown into prison, and kept there on false charges of treason, the revengeful and malicious, would enjoy a perpetual triumph."

By the way, there used to be a story current in Anglo-Indian society some forty years ago of a gentleman, a rabbit fancier, who one day asked the man in charge of his rabbits, what had become of a handsome black buck for which he felt a particular regard. The man pointed to a wretched looking white doe in the hutch usually occupied by the black buck and swore by all the Gods and Ganges waters that the sun's effulgence had translated his master's favourite from black to white, and effected a change of sex into the bargain. The full glare and glory of a viceregal sun seems to have had a similar effect upon Mr. Quinton, and converted what was black with him at Allahabad into white in Calcutta. But this is a digression.

Lord Macaulay, although the period of his stay in India was comparatively short, yet felt himself obliged to use very strong language about the prevalence and superfluity of perjury in India—in Bengal especially. From time to time other men, some of whom have lived in India in an official capacity, some as interlopers, men anxious to promote good-will and good-feeling between natives and Europeans, have lamented this unfortunate national habit, and the quiet acquiescence of the educated classes in it. We need not repeat what they have said. It would be work of supererogation, the more's the pity. It is a sad, stern, fact that perjury is rampant in India. As Mr. Evans said in his speech in the Viceregal Council Chamber, "we all know it." Some of us, whose lot in life it has been to dwell in the mofussil,



amongst the people, speaking their language and hearing always about their joys and troubles, know, too, know, only too well, what a curse, what a fruitful mother of wrongs, oppressions and disgraces to humanity, the prevalence of perjury in India is. Nevertheless, all of us, in greater or less degree aid and abet the iniquity, for we do nothing, and try to do nothing, to stamp it out from our midst. Magistrates and Judges shrug their shoulders when they are asked why they do not try; make a mountain of the legal difficulties in the way of convictions for perjury; say, probably in so many words, that if they allowed a criminal prosecution to follow all cases of manifest perjury coming under their official ken, the courts would be swamped with trials for perjury, that there would ensue a most inconvenient, impossible to be seriously thought of, deadlock in the administration of justice—chaos come again; and, in short, they aver that they are helpless in the matter. Non-officials shrug their shoulders, too, and content themselves with doing what they can to safeguard themselves, deeming it mere waste of energy to kick against official pricks in India, knowing probably of their interloper experience that it is usually often dangerous to kick.

In the early days of British rule in India, different opinions prevailed. There was not this slothful tendency to collusion and the condonation of crime. Perjury was held to be an offence against the law, a crime dangerous to society, and, therefore, to be prevented and punished. In Mr. Seton Karr's *Selections from old Calcutta Gazettes*, we find Sir William Jones in his charge to the Grand Jury at Calcutta in 1787, referring to the untrustworthiness of the evidence given by natives of the lower orders, and urging upon all and sundry concerned that perjury ought to be most severely punished, "as an example to others." He also commented on the prevalence of the crime, as evidenced in the frequency of committals for perjury by Subordinate Courts, and he urged all Magistrates and Judges to exert themselves actively in the repression and punishment of a wickedness so foul, and fraught with such perils to the cause of law and good order. Again, the next year, in his charge to the Grand Jury at the half-yearly sessions, at which four persons stood committed for perjury, or subornation of perjury, he said, that "if the laws were to be thus openly disregarded all hope of administering justice must be abandoned, and the public must abandon all hope of security to their persons and property: to this there can be no other check, but just and exemplary punishment."

Sir William Jones, indeed, was so convinced of the evil effect and the danger attending a proneness to perjury in a people, that he was willing even to strain the law with a view to stamping out

the mischief. At least he hunted up an old, obsolete statute of Queen Elizabeth's which enacts as a punishment proper for a perjurer the infliction upon him of an indelible mark, "to the utter loss of his credit and reputation." It is therefore my wish, said the learned Judge, after citing this bit of rusty law, "It is therefore my wish that the indictments should be grounded on this statute, for though the proof should fall short of conviction within the terms of it, the punishment by the common law may still be awarded."

Nor was perjury regarded as a venial offence on the other side of India, in the early days of English rule. Here is an extract from a later volume of Mr. Seton-Karr's *Selections* under date the 16th December 1802:—"Ramsdooner Sircar, for perjury before the Court of Commissioners for the recovery of small debts, to be transported for seven years." Again, here is a clipping taken from the *Bombay Courier* of the 27th April 1805:—

*"Proceedings of the Court of Oyer and Terminer.*

"The Jury in the case of Jacob Petruse, Armenian, having returned a verdict, finding the prisoner guilty of wilful and corrupt perjury \* \* \*

"The Hon'ble the Recorder, in his judgment said, that the crime of wilful and corrupt perjury had been made out in the clearest and most convincing manner, and the Court was bound to pronounce an exemplary sentence on the prisoner. That sentence was, that he stand in the pillory four times within the ensuing week, and one hour each time, and be transported to Pulo Penang for seven years; that he be put into the pillory once before the Armenian Church, during the time of divine service, once in the most conspicuous part of the bazar, once at Mazagon, and once at Mahim; and each time to have a label on his breast and back on which is to be written:—*An infamous false swearer; he perjured himself to cheat the poor of his own religion and nation. He is transported for seven years, to work as a slave at Pulo Penang. Such is the punishment of perjury.*"

Other instances might be adduced; but a multiplication of them might prove wearisome. We have brought forward a sufficient number to show that, in the olden time, Indian officials were bidden and encouraged to look upon perjury as a crime, and that the superior courts helped their endeavours to stamp it out. Now-a-days, the lower courts, judged by the evidence of their own records, do not regard perjury as a crime, make no attempts to check its paramount authority in all legal processes, do, indeed, because of their apathy, aid and abet those malversations of justice which the employers of perjured evidence desire. The superior courts for

their part, look on unconcernedly, and are as supine as they well can be.

Englishmen pride themselves on the improvements effected in the administration of law and justice since the early days of England's rule in India—on the introduction of a reign of law, it might well be said. They have reason. But as to this matter of perjury, (naturally and necessarily one of the main hinges, or pivots, upon which the administration of the law turns) is our latter day, 19th century system of *laissez faire* better than the old 18th century system of repression and prevention? Are our new lamps better than their old ones? We think not. As to this matter of perjury and its punishment, we should like to see a return to the old order of control. It is notorious that more than half the criminal cases brought before the courts in this country, are either false cases from beginning to end, manufactured out of no fact, out of nothing beyond depraved imagination, greed, and ill-will. Or they are very trivial cases, enlarged and fraudulently improved upon by the same agency. In civil suits, although there are not usually so many opportunities for the profitable employment of suborned witnesses as there are in criminal cases, yet there are too many opportunities, and the perjury market is not depressed therefore. Probably more than half the convicts now working out their sentences in Indian jails are not guilty of the crimes for which they are being punished. There are some cynically inclined people in India who are prepared to admit this frankly enough, but then they seek to excuse the injustice on the plea that, if these convicts are not actually guilty of the crimes for which they are suffering punishment, they have surely been guilty at some period of their existence of similar crimes of which they do not happen to have been formally accused, and, therefore, they richly deserve their imprisonment. Too many people who ought to know better are not ashamed to argue thus. But is theirs a worthy argument, a tolerable one even? Would the Englishmen who make use of it in India care to maintain it before their countrymen in England? The eye sees only what it brings the power to see, Mr. Carlyle says. If they could be brought to *see*, to realize, the greatness of the injustice, the tale of the misery, a sentence of imprisonment so often entails, not only on the man imprisoned, but also on his helpless family, we do not think they would talk so glibly and unfeelingly about the uses and results of perjury, even when talking to Anglo-Indians. It should be remembered in this connexion that, over and above filling our jails with innocent people, it is the prevalence of perjury that goes far towards making our Indian police force the terror and scourge it is to peaceable, law-abiding village folk,

and for the matter of that town folk, too, all over the country. The rich man who has a grudge against his poor neighbour, and desires to ruin him, has only to bribe the police, and the police will forthwith get up a false case, and by means of suborned witnesses manage probably to secure a conviction against the victim—of theft, or grievous hurt, what not that may be desired—murder even, if bribe-money is forthcoming in sufficient quantities. When the police are in the perjury market, it soon gets glutted, and a man's evidence goes for an old song, goes just with a hope of securing the good-will of the *Darogajee* and very often without money-payment of any sort. Or, if money is in demand, four annas will go a long way. Were it not for practically unlimited supplies of perjury, the Mofussil police would have not a tithe of the power they wield now, and use so arbitrarily and cruelly, so much to the disadvantage of the people for whose protection they are ideally supposed to exist.

We have referred to the notion that Magistrates dare not sanction prosecutions for perjury, lest the Courts all over the country should be swamped and overwhelmed with an avalanche of perjury cases, and the machinery available for the administration of justice be brought to a standstill. We are not inclined to attach much weight to this contention. If Magistrates and Judges could make up their minds to administer the law of the land with regard to perjury as the law enjoins, and as they must know it is their bounden duty to administer it, some difficulties and inconveniences, a seemingly overwhelming press of business would, it is likely enough, have to be encountered at first. But, this once tided over, the courts would have far less work to do, and far less dirty work than they have now. And even if some congestion of business did occur in the beginning of the new dispensation, it could not last long. If manifest perjurers and the traffickers in perjured evidence were made clearly to understand, by dint of unsparing examples and prompt punishments, that the giving of false evidence, or the procuration of other people to give false evidence, is an offence against the law which the administrators of that law are determined to punish, a check would very soon be put upon the habit of wholesale perjury which disgraces our courts now. The risk the perjurer would have to run then, would be real and appreciable, and if not actually deterred from the exercise of his talent by fear of punishment, the man of oaths would at least demand payment in proportion to the hazard of his undertaking. His selling price would so rise in the market, that the said market would be closed to all but wealthy patrons, and they again would be afraid to indulge largely in a luxury likely enough to land them in prison. As

things go now, the man who perjures himself runs no appreciable risk at all, and is content with a fee of four annas, or even less than that. A habit of perjury does not militate against his caste, and he is not thought any the worse of amongst his fellows because of it. Nor is his employer worse thought of amongst the men who are his equals and associates.

It would be well for men of light and leading in the native community to devote some attention to this habit of perjury, and to strive for reform, for a rooting out from their midst of the loathsome, cankered sore that has eaten into the very heart of their social life, preventing and hindering moral growth, and making that life unlovely, and of ill repute. Local Self-Government is a very good thing in its way ; but ability for Local Self-Government is a better. Such ability seems to us quite incompatible with a toleration of wholesale perjury. Until, at any rate, the leading men, and the well educated natives of this country, cease to regard perjury as a very venial sin, if a sin at all ; until they heartily denounce it, and give proof of their sincerity by making vigorous fight against it, we do not think that in all the radical gamut of breathless political reforms there is one at all likely to be of the least use to India.

JNO. HOOLEY.

---

## ART. II.—CAPELLO AND IVENS; THEIR EXPLORATIONS IN AFRICA.—1877-1880.

**T**HE names of these two officers of the Portuguese Navy have been placed at the head of this article, because they adhered to the orders issued by the Government to the "so-called African Portuguese Expedition" to make the Cu-ango, a great river which flows from south to north between the 17th and 19th degree of

east longitude, Greenwich, into the Congo-Zaire, their chief object of investigation, as well as to determine all the geographical relations existing between the Cu-ango and the western coast. It would no doubt have produced a greater effect in Europe to have crossed the Continent, but the distance travelled by the two explorers was above four thousand kilometres, and consequently greater than that between Benguela on the west and Sofala on the east coast in a straight line. This task has been performed by others and also by Major Serpa Pinto, whose work is well known and has appeared in English. He was a member of this "African Portuguese Expedition," but thought proper to separate himself therefrom and to continue his journey alone. H. Capello and R. Ivens only once allude to him in their work,\* but as he had thought proper to state in his first volume, in the chapter headed, "Twenty Days of Agony" that they had abandoned him at Caconda in a dangerous and hostile country, they found it necessary to exculpate themselves by explaining the whole matter in a prefatory note consisting of several pages, from which it would appear that the separation had at least outwardly taken place in an amicable manner, and that they had given him not only a number of carriers with goods to barter for victuals, but also various instruments for taking observations.

In September 1877, when the explorers were at Luanda, the capital of the Portuguese province of Angola, they began their preparations, and the questions how much money, goods, muskets

---

\*De Benguela as terras de Jácça, descripção de uma viagem na Africa central e occidental. Por H. Capello e R. Ivens, officiaes da-armada real. Expedição organizada nos annos de 1877-1880. Edição illustrada. Lisboa, 1881, 2 vols.

After finishing this article I was informed that an English edition of

the Portuguese work had just appeared. Not having seen it, I can say nothing about it; but still believe my article to be useful, as it embodies in a small compass all the chief results attained by the explorers and narrated by them in two bulky volumes, containing a great deal of gossip and irrelevant matter.

and men to carry them were required, presented themselves for solution. The blacks near the coast, who consider themselves civilized, were unwilling to enter the service of mere explorers who merely wished to satisfy their curiosity and not to trade, but to march along unknown tracks. Moreover, cannibalism is so much dreaded, that the people are under the impression that they will incur the danger not only of being attacked but of being devoured. The information given by the latest travellers, regarding the manner of practically organizing African caravans of carriers is very scanty, as Stanley has well observed in his work "How I found Livingstone," and they say nothing about the value, quality, or quantity of the goods most necessary for a traveller to take, or the burden for each carrier. All these difficulties had to be dealt with, but the greatest was the engaging of carriers, and this having proved insurmountable, a further stay at Luanda was considered useless. The explorers accordingly sailed to Novo Redondo where they made contracts with the greater portion of the men they required, and thence to Benguela, the port where the illustrious Cameron had terminated his journey, and whence theirs, which lasted six hundred days, began.

Benguela is situated in 12° 34' 17" S. Lat. and 13° 22' 30" E. Long Greenwich, on the western coast of Africa. It is the capital of a vast district, divided into the *concelhos* of Domba Grande and Pequeno, Egito, Novo Redondo, Catumbella, Quillengues, Caconda, &c., embracing a territory of about 15,000 square miles. Although Benguela is a dependency of the Central Government, the seat of which is in Luanda, the official who administers it can be appointed from Lisbon only. The most important structures are the public buildings, such as the Place (residence of the Governor), the barracks, custom-house, and the hospital. The fort on the sea shore is a resort for inhaling the evening breeze. These edifices are not elegant, but spacious, clean, and arranged in regular streets well planted with trees. Here and there numerous mercantile establishments, in which the most important business of Benguela is transacted, are scattered about, but their architecture is even more simple and antiquated. The native streets are narrow, tortuous, full of stinking thatched huts, but have also here and there enclosures of high walls, which intercept the air and contain hundreds of blacks from the interior, many of whom are in a state of almost perfect nudity. Scenes of riot and drunkenness occur nightly.

The life of Europeans in Benguela is entirely absorbed by commercial transactions. They are constantly on the alert for the

Departure from Benguela.  
Domba, Quillengues.—N'gola,  
Habitations of termites.—  
Receiving an African chief.—  
Portuguese station of Caconda.—Excursion to the river  
Cunene and return to Caconda.

caravans which enter, the news which arrive, the produce that is brought, the ruling prices, and trade with the natives. In the trade of Benguela, which is still in the hands of the Portuguese, nearly all the important products of the interior are included, namely, ivory, wax, rhinoceros' horns, resins, *licombe*,\* skins, feathers, caoutchouc and canes, which are generally bartered for such articles, as arms, gunpowder, cloth, &c. Commercial houses were in the habit of sending agents into the interior, but as some died and others ran away, goods are at present brought in exclusively by natives who trade on their own account.

The explorers started on their march towards the sources of the river Cu-ango on the 12th of November 1877, and reached their destination more than six months after that date. From the track of the journey on the large map appended to their work, it appears that, far from taking the nearest direction, they travelled as much as possible in the vicinity of rivers. Taking first a south-east course as far as Nangola  $14^{\circ}, 16', 46''$  S. Lat, and then marching north-east, they reached the Cu-ango, as will be described. The littoral portion of the Continent about Benguela was found to be of little importance and arid, but in the vicinity of Dombe ( $12^{\circ}, 55', 11''$  S. Lat,  $13^{\circ}, 47', 44''$  E. Long. Greenwich) extensive plantations of sugar-cane were encountered, and several agriculturists possess factories, in one of which the explorers were hospitably entertained by the proprietor Sr. J. Reis; but the natives who are dispersed in the small hamlets of the district, appear to be in a wretched state of poverty; their whole dress consists of a dirty rag suspended by a rope from the waist and of a hollow wooden ring on the right leg, or brass wristlet. The ring contains some grains which produce a peculiar noise when a man walks. The females are generally ugly, but the streaks of white and red paint which they apply to their faces, and the loam with which they charge their hair, makes them repulsive. Here the explorers were prostrated by fever and detained till the 4th December, when they started again, and met the next day one of the ordinary hamlets of the district, and called *senzala* or *binza*. It was enclosed by a stockade about 50 metres long, and as many broad; in this square a dozen dark huts made of mud-covered poles, with conical roofs of grass, could be seen. A number of half-naked women, surrounded by hens and pigs, sat near the huts, and the headman, called *soba*, a man of advanced age, approaching the travellers, asked them through their interpreter, whence they were coming, where going, what they did, or traded in, and many other questions. The interview

---

\* Fibres of the *Alstonia digitata*.



terminated with the offer of a lean hen, and a gourd of *garapa* (native beer made of maize) for which the old man received four yards of striped cloth. On the 12th December the explorers arrived at Quillengues, and, astronomically determining its position, found it to be  $14^{\circ}, 03', 10''$  S. Lat. and  $14^{\circ}, 05', 03''$  E. Long. from Greenwich. This region constitutes, as a *concelho*, a portion of the vast district of Benguela. It is bounded on the north by Dombe, on the north-east by Caconda, on the south-east by Quipungo and Umputa, and on the south by Huilla and Jau. Its area is about 4,000 square miles and its population not less than 10,000 persons, living in 5,000 habitations, calculating on an average two individuals per habitation or square mile, or at 300 *senzalas*, each having 25 or 30 huts. The climate may be considered bearable, and but little injurious to a careful European. Maize, *massumbula* (sorghum,) manioc, potatoes, *inhame* (which appears to be the *Discorea alata*,) *ginguba* (*Arachis hypogea*,) the sugar-cane, various indigenous fruits, and others, such as melons and potherbs, all grow there in abundance. The habitation of the chief of the *concelho* consists of a large rectangular stockade, the longer side of which is about 200 metres long, with a small fort, having on each side a gun, and 15 habitations inside. Quillengues is situated on the left bank of the river Calunga, the sources of which are to the south, on the spurs of a great chain of mountains, and it is well provided with water from this river.

Having started on the 1st January 1878 from Quillengues, the caravan reached, on the 4th, the great *banza* of N'gola, belonging to the *soba* Tchimbarandungo, and situated on the brook of Cu-tota. Here the aspect of the soil was singular; covered in all directions with habitations of termites, from 2 to 3 metres high, it resembled during the day a vast encampment of an army, and in the night an extensive cemetery full of graves. Here the explorers had for the first time occasion to meet an African chief with formality in their camp; for, Tchimbarandungo paid them a visit. After considering whether he ought to be received in a standing or sitting posture, the latter was adopted, the explorers buttoned their coats, put on their helmets, assumed an air of great importance, and waited for his arrival. He soon made his appearance, wearing a dress of striped cloth, a bonnet woven of palm leaves on his head, a leopard skin over his shoulders, and holding a javelin in his hand. He approached the travellers smiling frankly, shaking them by the hand entirely according to the European fashion in the friendliest manner; his aspect was, however repugnant, and his suspicious glances, with his bedaubed tresses, augured

badly of future visits from *sobas* yet more distant from contact with Europeans.

The chief, surrounded by his followers, having seated himself, began the conversation, which turned principally on the subject and intention of the journey. After a while he appeared to be expecting something, and some one having suggested that a certain liquor, for which the *soba* was said to entertain special predilection should be produced, a keg was brought forth, the appearance of which suddenly exhilarated the countenances of all present. Tchimbarandungo, although burning with the desire to gulp down a cup at once, was obliged to submit to the usages of his country, and, passing it to the interpreter, requested him to taste it, in order to convince himself that the beverage offered contained no poison. This demand having been complied with, he swallowed the contents of the vessel at one draught. Then the cups passed round several times, and he appeared to enjoy a right of percentage over them, because no one was allowed to have a drink before the master had first tasted it. The guns and revolvers, which were also passed from hand to hand, excited the astonishment of all. To give the explorers a proof of his confidence, the chief then rose and went to his habitation to bring his wife and daughters, whom he desired to introduce to them, but asked a flagon more for the journey. Half an hour afterwards he returned with the said ladies, and an ox as a gift, which he desired to be slaughtered in his presence. Tchimbarandungo was already drunk. His comic antics and attempts at dancing, considerably lowered the dignity of the chief in the opinion of the explorers, but not of his courtiers, who, being accustomed to such scenes, attached no importance whatever to them. His wife, a strange creature, far from beautiful, had long tresses hanging down to her sides, and her neck adorned with an enormous collar in which every kind of beads and shells to be met with in the establishments on the coast, was displayed with horns of antelopes, and other not less extraordinary objects; she was completely wrapped up in a cloth of dubious colour, and looked about bewildered, apparently unable to form any connected ideas about her surroundings, and expressing her astonishment by the interjections: *eh! eh! oah!*

The sky having become overcast and a shower of rain having begun, it was necessary to admit Tchimbarandungo into the tent, where he perceived the keg, and forthwith proposed to his family to partake of its contents. The lady manifested the highest satisfaction at the invitation of her august spouse, and sipping

a social cup with her daughters, prepared another which they accepted with extreme alacrity.

The rain continued, and was said to be a real blessing long expected in the country, which the *soba* attributed to the arrival of the Europeans, in honour of whom, he said, he would order the sacrifice of a man, to show them his power. "A man! by no means!" exclaimed the travellers, "we renounce the honour of marking our passage through your country by the shedding of human blood." Representations having been made to him regarding the iniquity of such a proceeding, he muttered something which the interpreter explained to mean, that such a discussion was inconvenient to the *soba* in the presence of his own people, but that tyrannical acts of that kind maintained the necessary terror. Meanwhile the amiable daughters of the chief persistently continued to ask for needles and thread, and at last obtained enough to establish a little shop. Then the visitors were taken out of the encampment to see the death of the ox, and when they been made to squat at a proper distance, a shot was fired at the animal which killed it instantly.

Tchimbaraudungo was delirious with joy, and desired to explain to his courtiers the terrible effects of a musket-ball; but his intoxication did not allow him to speak. At last this chief with his family and courtiers departed.

On the 8th the explorers reached the Portuguese station of Caconda, the road to which was flanked by plantations of manioc, maize, sugar-cane, potatoes, &c. Caconda is even now one of the most interesting localities of the vast province of Angola. Being the seat of a *concelho* and subject to the district of Benguela, it has a commander who resides in a fort with a frontage of 60 metres and situated 1,642 metres above the level of the sea. Its position, having been astronomically determined, was found to be 13°, 44' S. Lat. and 15°, 2', 35" E. Long. from Greenwich. The altitude, moderate temperature, suavity of the climate, beauty of the fields, profusion of fruitful plants, the freshness of its water, and transparency of its brooks promised for this district a reputation of superiority over others in the interior, but its population does not exceed 8,000 inhabitants, giving only two per square mile.

Caconda is not altogether inhabited by Africans, but contains an admixture of Europeans who possess houses there, and trade. In a commercial point of view the place is far from what it was in former times; it is nevertheless still the point of transit of the Ganguela caravans which bring ivory and wax from the east to the market of Benguela, marching to the coast by the direct road, that is to say, through the region of Caluquembe and Dombe

Pequeno. When agriculture becomes developed, and as soon as Caconda shall be connected by a regular road with Benguela, it may hope for a rich future, considering that sugar-cane, cotton, and rice can be produced in abundance. In this place the explorers had the pleasure of meeting the Portuguese naturalist, José de Anchieta, who had been already twelve years in Africa, and published several works.

From Caconda an excursion was made to the river Cu-nene, which flows towards the coast and discharges itself into the ocean under Lat.  $17^{\circ}$ ,  $25'$  S. Along the banks of this river the explorers marched 30 kilometres and found it to contain several islands. Its bed was granitic and its breadth nearly 50 metres; great numbers of hippopotamuses and crocodiles were observed in the water. In this picturesque region flocks of antelopes were encountered, especially the *Oryx gazella*, with long straight antlers, the *Hippotragus niger*, with enormous crooked ones; also herds of buffaloes, stags and zebras. An African land proprietor, bearing however the Portuguese name, Matheus Gomes Pereira, accompanied the explorers in this excursion, with four dozen men and women, all of whom were in the service of his house, and this following increased gradually to an alarming extent; their noisy music and dances at every halting-place excited the disgust of the Europeans. Their monotonous dances are accompanied by horrible yellings as well as disgusting postures.

Two days after leaving the banks of the Cu-nene, the residence of the Portuguese commandant was again reached on the 11th February.

When the expedition left Caconda, ninety-four days had elapsed since its departure from Benguela. The explorers marched eastwards from Caconda with the intention of passing through the district of Ruigolo, parallel to the Ulondo mountains, which stretch out about 150 miles, and the abundant rivulets flowing southwards across the route afforded the carriers of the baggage, who were about fifty in number, each loaded with a weight of seventy pounds, plenty of opportunities of quenching their thirst.

On the 26th February the explorers reached Cassanhe  $9^{\circ}$   $35'$ ,  $20''$  S. Lat.,  $17^{\circ}$ ,  $56'$ ,  $30''$  E. Long. The most important fact concerning this locality is, that, when a chief dies, his body must be exposed to the public till his successor is elected. The corpse is wrapped up in a piece of cloth and suspended on a tree, near which also a grave is dug to receive it as soon as the new chief has been acclaimed. After a troublesome march in rainy weather, the

Cassanhe.—Beimonte in the Biho district.—Sufferings from fever.—Watershed between the great river systems of the Congo-Zaire and the Zambezi.—The people, and their character.—Cangombe the residence of Quilemo.—The interview.—Sources of the Cu-anza determined.—Difficulties in hiring baggage-carriers.—Departure.

## 216 *Capello and Ivens; their Explorations*

explorers arrived on the 8th March in the Bihe district and were received at Belmonte  $12^{\circ} 21', 49''$  S. Lat.,  $16^{\circ} 42', 30''$  E. Long. in the habitation of the Portuguese merchant, Silva Porto, whose *sanzala*, here called *libata*, consisted of a rectangular stockade, the interior of which contained various habitations protected by the shade of numerous sycamore trees from the rays of the sun, as well as a garden with lemons, oranges, and a variety of European potherbs.

Forced to make a prolonged stay in the Bihe district, the explorers erected a habitation for the purpose of giving shelter to their followers, at a distance of 2 miles from Belmonte, in a high position covered by a dense forest on the right bank of the Cu-ito, and the whole structure was finished in the brief space of four days. Fever here seized both the explorers with desperate energy, attacking alternately the one or the other of them daily from eight till nine o'clock in the morning. An unpleasant sensation of cold was the first symptom, which gradually became more intense and prostrated the patient, who soon afterwards began to vomit, and lastly perspired abundantly after being extremely dry. In the afternoon relief generally ensued and refreshments were taken, but the weakness which gradually overtook the victims was such, that, after suffering thus for several weeks, they were unable to walk. Meanwhile the rains continued, and long hours were whiled away by the fireside whilst the storm raged outside.

During their enforced sojourn the two travellers employed themselves in collecting various kinds of information:—Bihe is the chief point of departure of caravans marching to the interior, and one of the commercial centres best known to the western districts, whence travellers desirous to penetrate into the eastern regions; Cassongo, Telioboco, Garauganja, Catanga, Canunguessa, Gengi, and Bucusso being all connected by commercial tracks with the district of Bihe.

These districts undoubtedly constitute the extreme west of the extensive and high region of the watershed line of the great river-systems of the Congo-Zaire and the Zambeze, which, extending towards the north-east, has on the one side the Cu-anza, the Cu-ango, the Tchicapa, the Cassoi and the Lu-alaba, and on the other the Cu-bungo, the Cu-ito, Cu-ando, the Liba, &c. Passing at last to the south of Bengueolo, or Penba, it terminates in the east on the table-land of Lubiza. The general configuration is a system of plains, intersected by valleys of slender depth. The mean height is 4,570 metres. Supposing this watershed to extend 80 miles from east to west, and 100 from north to south, we obtain a surface of 8,000, and taking two inhabitants as the minimum per square mile, we obtain a population of 16,000 unequally distributed, as on the rest of the great Continent.

Here the original traits and the special physiognomy of savage life begin to manifest themselves in a particular manner. The people of Bihe, who are great wanderers, have adopted many customs of distant tribes, and constitute a strange medley. As they are extremely cunning and avaricious, travellers in these parts must be on their guard; having, moreover, for a long time been in contact with white men, they are addicted to intoxication and thieving, the two first-fruits to the Negro of the advent of civilisation. In every district a European is always well received by the chiefs, but he must use the greatest circumspection, or he will lose everything he possesses. It must, however, not be imagined that this assertion implies the idea of violent robbery; on the contrary, they pilfer a stranger with great delicacy and caution till he is reduced to misery.

It would be impossible to give an idea of the moral and physical degradation of the population, for which the climate seems to be responsible. The weather being neither very hot nor very cold, the negro needs no shelter against its inclemency; accordingly he "requires a house and clothes more as luxuries than necessities, and the fertility of the soil easily satisfies the cravings of his stomach. Slavery, from which they suffered in former times, also accustomed them to vagabondage, and extinguished family-life, so that the nearest relations separate and do not even recognize themselves afterwards. The women are more active and laborious than the men, but shame is far from existing among them; thus, for instance, one of the baggage-carriers of the explorers had fallen a victim to the allurements of a nymph who often visited the encampment for the purpose of enticing him; afterwards she received him in her own house where she had posted witnesses to take cognizance of the interview, the chief of them being her own husband. The tribunal condemned the carrier to pay the husband four pieces of cloth, and it appears that such a proceeding is quite usual among them. In this instance it served to relieve the married couple from a little financial embarrassment. Religious ideas, strictly so-called, have no existence; the summary of all of them being Fetishes and Fetichism everywhere on the whole continent. This assertion is borne out by Schweinfurth (*Au Cœur de l' Afrique*), by Sir S. Baker (*Lake Albert*), and by Speke (*Source of the Nile*).

Cangombe is the capital of Bihe, and the residence of its chief, whose name is Quilemo. It being the fatal custom of Africa not to sell anything to a European, but to present him with all he requires, and to expect in return other presents, he has often refused to accept any and given offence; but as the explorers desired to engage carriers, and a guide to conduct them to the

sources of the Cu-ango, they considered it best to gain the favour of the chief by coming to his presence with gifts, which consisted of the following articles:—two pieces of cotton-cloth, two of striped cloth, two of blue cotton-cloth, one package of handkerchiefs, one soldier's uniform, one umbrella, one donkey, and several flasks of alcoholic beverages. When the *libata* of Cangombe was reached, it was found to be a thousand mètres broad, and one of the largest the explorers had seen in Africa. The great enclosure is surrounded by numerous sycamore trees, the bark of whose knotty trunks was carved with strange figures, and the plantations extend to the banks of the Cu-quaima. Further on herds of cattle were grazing. After the explorers had been admitted into the interior, and passed through a labyrinth between the grass-covered huts, they halted in the shade of a large sycamore, and, sitting down among about two hundred curious spectators, were made to wait for a quarter-of-an-hour till Quilemo made his appearance. Apparently he required time to finish his *toilette*.

At last they were introduced.

Quilemo, an old man, of no agreeable aspect, dressed in a simple long coat, with trousers of a dubious colour, and an enormous hat, was sitting on a stool near the hut which served as his bedroom. The interview began with the presentation of letters which the explorers had brought from the coast, explaining their plan of investigating the sources of the Cu-ango, with a demand for assistance. He expressed satisfaction at the arrival of white men, with whom he would be highly pleased to enter into relations, and who would in his dominions find an abundance of everything. He promised them his powerful aid, as his people were much accustomed to travelling, but assured them that for so long a journey plenty of guns and powder would be required. Lastly, he requested them to present him with a gun, if they had one to spare.

Now the moment for offering the presents had arrived. They were taken one by one and passed to Quilemo, who pretended not to admire them, and in his turn handed them to an attendant, but could scarcely disguise his pleasure. The seriousness of this meeting was broken by a ridiculous incident; when the liquor flasks were presented to Quilemo, a negro fled with one of them, and the cries of "Catch him" resounded everywhere, but he escaped nevertheless.

After this preliminary visit, daily botanical and zoological excursions were made, the results of which the explorers have embodied in the appendix to their work.

As one of the problems of the expedition was to explore the sources of the Cu-anza, an excursion to them was made on the 24th April, and on the 28th the *libata* of a chief called N'gando

was reached, who refused to allow the Cu-anza to be crossed without consulting the Fetishes, for fear some misfortune might befall him. This obstacle having been overcome, and good terms restored, Capello offered some presents to N'gando, in return for which he generously presented him with an ox. Here various specimens of the Flora were collected. Having lost the 29th in consultations, and been obliged to treat two dozen sick persons, he started for the river on the 30th and reached its banks at 10 o'clock.

In this place the Cu-anza flows northwards, and its course is tortuous enough. Its sandy banks are covered with low bushes. Its average depth is 1 to 5 mètres, breadth from 30 to 40 mètres, and velocity 1 to 5 miles. Towards the east the elevated tracts named Cutupo, which constitute the watershed between the Cutito and the Cu-anza, extend. In the undulating plain beyond the banks of the river a herd of white antelopes with black spots and straight horns, were perceived. The natives called them *ma-tchobo*, a kind of shaggy goat living near rivers; the binocular, however, rectified the mistake and showed the *Oryx capensis*.

The sources of the river were found to be in 13°, 3', 57" S. Lat. and 17°, 17', 19" E. Long.

On returning from this excursion to Cangombe the greatest difficulty was to get the chief Quilemo to give orders to his subjects for hiring themselves out as baggage-carriers to the explorers, and his repeated promises to do so resulted in nothing. Accordingly presents were made, not only to the chief, but also to his officials; all were, however, indolent, preferring to negotiate for ever, and it was but a poor consolation to the explorers that their predecessors, Livingstone, Cameron and Stanley, had been similarly victimized by the wily Africans. At last the required number of carriers were hired and the explorers departed.

The expedition started on the 19th May, reaching the Cu-anza in 11°, 54', 50" S. Lat. and 17°, 34', 30" E. Long. on the 1st of June. Having encamped on the banks of the river, scientific operations for approximately determining its course were undertaken; and the next care of the explorers was to provide themselves with victuals in order to march rapidly through the district of

Banks of Cu-anza.—Food required for carriers.—Crossing the Lu-anda near Mongoa, and departure to the sources of the Cu-ango.

Luimbe which was in front. The chief of the adjoining *sensala* was in bad circumstances, as he had to ransom a good many of his relatives who had been captured in the last war with Bihe, so that he could furnish neither provisions on a large scale, nor carriers. The provisions of an African traveller and of his people usually consist of manioc-meal, and flesh, or dried river-fish, which is not very savoury, but is much appreciated when nothing better can



## 220 *Capello and Ivens; their Explorations*

be had; and, as every man on the march daily consumes from 2 to 3 litres of meal, and for the support of eighty during six days, twenty carriers are necessary to bear a total weight of 1,500 pounds, a traveller is subject to constant embarrassments and delays.

In the abovenamed latitude the Cu-anza is from 50 to 60 metres broad, and from 4 to 5 deep, having at the utmost a velocity of one mile; the water is muddy and dark. The course is tortuous enough, but free from cataracts. The land on the left bank is high, and covered with vegetation, but on the right low, and probably inundated during the great rains. This river is navigable almost from its sources to its confluence with the Lu-ando, where the first cataract occurs. The water of the river is augmented by numerous affluents on both sides of it.

After procuring the necessary provisions the expedition again started on the 6th of June, crossed the Bandua hills, passed, after a march of 35 miles, through the district of Luimbe, and reached the boundary of Songo, near the residence of the *soba* Mongoa. During the first days of this march the vegetation was low and moderate in amount, but when the level gradually became higher it was found to be more abundant and vigorous. Numerous fig and sycamore trees, with extensive branches, were encountered, containing innumerable larvæ of the *Ptyalus olivaceus*,\* from which water was constantly dripping to such a degree as to make the ground muddy. Troops of monkeys gambolled about and fled terrified at the approach of the travellers. They appeared to be of the *Cynocephalus* species.

This region is populated by numerous *senzalas*, and the inhabitants of Luimbe, who are partly Ganguelas, are at once distinguished by their strange head-dress. Some women looked tolerably well, and contrasted favourably with those of Bihe by their more delicate features.

The Lu-ando was crossed near Mongoa in 11°, 34', 5" S. Lat. 18°, 0', 35" E. Long., not, however, without opposition. The chief had no objection, but his vassals gathered round the party and offered resistance; fifty loads piled up, and as many muskets ready to fire upon them, soon brought them to reason. After the confusion had terminated, it was found that two packages had been abstracted, and on a demand for their restoration being made, all knowledge of them was totally denied.

---

\* The *Ptyalus olivaceus* is an insect, a kind of artificial rain, especially and the larva in which it is wrapped from the branches of sycamores, continually exudes water, producing

A stratagem was accordingly resorted to, and the next morning the whole expedition appeared in front of the *senzala* before day-break, and, firing about a dozen shots into the air, threatened to burn the *senzala* by setting the surrounding vegetation on fire, whereon the stolen packages were immediately restored and the expedition peaceably departed on the 24th June.

On the morning of the 16th July the two explorers left the *senzala* of Mungo Quiban, the last halting-place near the sources of the Cu-ango, which they reached after a walk of half an hour, the aneroid indicating an altitude of 1,450

Sources of the Cu-ango determined.—Magnificence of the country and misery of the inhabitants.—The district of Cassanje, and departure from it to Duque de Braganza.—Terrible mortality.—The Ambaquistas.—Meeting Dr. Max Buchner.—Arrival in the Fort Duque de Braganza.

metres. An extensive but uneven tract of country constitutes this culminating point a kind of St. Gothard of the African rivers. Through a narrow and tortuous valley the Cu-ango flowed northwards, passing afterwards through plantations of manioc and massambala (*Sorghum*), where numerous girls were seen at work. To

the north-east the Tchirungo mountains, and on their eastern declivity the sources of the Tchicapa, were perceived at a distance of about 25 miles from the point of observation, which was in 11°, 17' S. Lat., and 19°, 11', 30" E. Long. from Greenwich.

Having thus determined the sources of the Cu-ango, the explorers had executed one portion of their instructions, and intended to follow the course of this river northwards till it discharges itself into the Congo-Zaire, which they would then have followed to the sea to terminate their labours. In this attempt they were, however, foiled as we shall see.

In the region where the explorers now happened to be, a variety of springs, the directions of which were approximately determined by the compass, flowed into the Tchicapa, the Cu-ango, the Cassai, the Lu-me, the Lu-ando, which, in their turn, poured their waters into the Congo-Zaire, the Cu-anza and the Zambeze, losing themselves in valleys in which the more vigorous vegetation indicated their tortuous course.

The aspect of the country was magnificent. As far as the sight could reach eastward, the green valley of the high Cassai plateau extended, populous with numerous *senzalas* (hamlets) of the Ma-Quico and the Ma-cosa tribes, indicated by the white spots of manioc flour spread out on mats of *mabu* (*Papyrus ant*). This was just the bee-season when every tree contains a hive, from which honey is collected in the months of July and August. It is remarkable what regard the negroes entertain for the hives of each other, the smallest abstraction of

wax from one of them being looked upon as a serious case of robbery. Meanwhile hydromel flows in torrents, and life is spent in drunkenness and in haggling with traders. Most of the people are poor, their whole dress consisting of a piece of hide tied to the waist by a rope, and, as a distinction, some have wristlets, necklaces of beads, and hair braided with many shells in it; but the women are satisfied with an apron of *mabella* (texture of palm-leaves,) their infants riding on their haunches as we often see also in India. Their huts are seldom thatched or covered with mud, grass being considered sufficient. Both sexes are fond of wearing a little stick transversely in the membrane which separates the nostrils; it looks like a pencil and is parallel to the mouth.

In order better to determine the hydrographical basin of the Cu-ango, the two explorers separated; one caravan taking the western, and the other marching along the eastern, banks of the river at some distance. They again met at Cassanje in 9°, 35', 6" S. Lat., and 17°, 54', 30" Long. according to their previous arrangement, that the explorer arriving first at the commencement of September in Cassanje, should wait ten days for his companion, and then go in search of him. They do not state when the western caravan arrived in the said district, or locality, but their first observation in it is recorded in their table of geographical co-ordinates on the 9th September 1878, and the last on the 18th of the same month. The western caravan arrived first, because the eastern was subject to delays on account of the difficulty of obtaining carriers for the baggage; it made, however, its entrance into Cassanje, on the day just named, amid the firing of muskets and joyful songs to celebrate the meeting of the two caravans.

After a stay of several months in Cassanje, where also a fair, annually visited by Portuguese merchants, is held, and after making excursions into the districts to collect specimens of the Flora and Fauna, the explorers receded still more from the river Cu-ango in a western direction, took affectionate leave of their friend Narciso A. Paschoal, who appears to be a Portuguese trader settled in Cassanje, and began, on the 19th February 1879, their march to Duque de Braganza, which is situated in 8°, 57', 16" S. Lat., and 16°, 10', E. Long.

After undergoing some hardships, the expedition arrived in the concelho, or district of the Malanje, where a halt was made at N'Dala Sumba, the date being marked 4th March in the table of geographical co-ordinates, which are 9°, 27', 43" S. Lat., and 16°, 50', 30" E. Long. Before arriving in this place, Portuguese and African graves were frequently met with,

and bore testimony to the precariousness of life in the few establishments where agents from the commercial houses of Malanje take up their abode on the route in order to be the first to meet the caravans. In these regions the mortality is terrible, although the miasmatic influence is not equal throughout the year. During the rainy season the high temperature causes the soil to evaporate more; people perspire abundantly, drink a great deal and absorption is considerable. The constitution being thus disturbed, any sickness becomes more dangerous and intense.

During their sojourn at Cassanje the explorers saw three merchants die, one of whom was a European. A firm of Malanje, with a branch at Cassanje, and established by three partners, had to close business because two of them died. The climate is not at all suitable for Europeans (as condições de habitabilidade por aqui não satisfazem as exigencias européas).

Close groves occur, which are sometimes full of water, and in the little open patches, tracks of game could be seen, although a chance was seldom got to fire at any, owing to its shyness. The explorers were followed for miles by the small headmen of *senzalas*, often wearing the uniform of a captain, although occupying only the rank of a private in the Portuguese-African forces; they came with their followers, and generally had also a loafer from Ambaca for a secretary. These people offer gifts and pester travellers most persistently to obtain some of their goods.

Some of these advanced denizens of Ambaca, or *Ambaquistas*, as the explorers call them, must have made themselves very obnoxious, because they are dubbed "the damned souls of the interior," which appellation appears, however, to be belied by the portrait of one, who is represented in European garments with a cylindrical hat, and looks rather sedate, and respectable, much resembling the half-caste Portuguese class we see in the Bombay Presidency. This *toilette*, by which, and by his generally pox-marked features he is at once recognized, is the characteristic of the Ambaca trader who is represented to be more cunning than a fox. He is deeply conversant with the habits of the aborigines, enters a *senzala*, creates a position for himself, gains the favour of all, but especially of the headmen, decides questions, maintains his supposed reputation of a scholar by narrating stories about the customs of Europeans to the people, gives them glittering accounts of religious ceremonies, and writes letters for them. On all his marches he carries paper and ink, taking from 2 to 4 yards of cloth as the price for writing a letter to a headman, or a petition to some official.

After passing beyond Melanje, the explorers had just returned

to their encampment on the 19th March from a little excursion, when a European, riding on an ox and accompanied by two or three blacks, suddenly made his appearance in the clearing. They went towards the stranger, who dismounted, and likewise approached them.

"I am Dr. Max Buchner," said he, "a German explorer, sent on a special mission to the regions of Lunda, where I am to encounter the Muata-Jauvo. I am in Malanje completing the number of my carriers and waiting for some things which I am to take with me. I knew that you had arrived here, and came with the double intention of making your acquaintance, and of ascending the mountain in front of us; an idea which suggested itself to me as soon as I entered this district." Having invited him to their hut, they breakfasted together and conversed, whereon he departed in the direction in which they had come, but returned at four o'clock in the afternoon with a burning fever, and it became necessary at once to take leave of their sick guest.

Coasting along the mountains to their right, the explorers had on their left, an immense plain, full of brooks, and marched in six days through the borders of the *concelho* of Malanje to Duque de Braganza, sleeping one day near a small hamlet, another on the bush, and again another on the banks of some river.

On the 28th March the river Lucalla was crossed for the first time, at the habitation of Calandula near the rapids of Faba, ascending from which the great cataract of Lianzundo, a beautiful sheet of 30 vertical metres, was encountered, with beautiful primeval vegetation on the sides, and an orange-grove near the foot. On the 30th the fort of Duque de Braganza was reached, where the Portuguese commandant, Captain A. Silveiro, a kind old man, wearied of, and spent in, the service of his country, received them hospitably. After constructing their encampment in three hours, the explorers entered the *residencia* to which they had been invited for dinner, and found it to be a stockade, with two large verandahs in the interior, one containing the kitchen and the other the dining-room. A dozen negroes with a few pigs, hens, a monkey, a gazelle and a parrot, appeared to be the only tenants of this vast enclosure, besides the captain the master of all. We reserve a description of this *concelho* or district, for the second visit to it of the explorers, on their home journey.

The expedition now again marched towards the river Cu-ango

Banks of the Cu-ango.—A portion of the diary of the 28th May 1879.

in order to trace its lower course, after taking a rest of 26 days at Duque de Braganza. Accordingly they started

again on the 28th April 1879, precisely 534 days after their departure from Benguela. During this portion of the march, the explorers suffered most, not only from the usual fevers, but also from scorbutic eruptions and even scarcity of provisions; they however reached the banks of the Cu-ango at last in 7°, 27', 18" S. Lat., and 18°, 88', 8" E. Long. on the 27th May, and found a hamlet in which they obtained plenty of food. The people here are Ma-Jaccas, and some account of them, as well as of other tribes, given in a portion of the diary dated 28th May, is here inserted:—

“The aspect of the Ma-Jaccas is not so distinct as that of the peoples of the south. They are mostly peaceful, at least, those of to-day with whom we entered into relations, but they are very wild, and show extreme diffidence. Their head-dress is original and most varied, the hair being so cut as to give it the appearance of a bonnet without a peak, and a portion hanging down around the back of the head in tresses; some have shaved stripes extending from the nape of the neck to the forehead; in fact their hair is arranged in a variety of shapes which cannot be described in any particular manner. They walk about almost naked, having only *mabellas* (a wrapper of a texture of palm-leaves or of the *Hyphane guinensis*). Their habitations, geometrically well constructed of *marianga* (penisetum?) interlaced with grass present from a distance an interesting perspective. They cultivate the ground but little, they fish, however, on a grand scale, and have no inclination to keep cattle. When speaking to Quizengamo about cattle, he informed us of a strange custom, which is, however, rare in the rest of Africa, and is the reason why the Ma-Jaccas cannot produce oxen, and scarcely any sheep, goats, &c.; the chief, namely, has alone the right to possess and to propagate cattle, and any one infringing it invariably loses his head; in case he should endeavour to flee, the Fetishmen would discover him. He said that if we were to pass through the whole country on the left bank of the Cu-ango, we could not obtain sight of even one ox. This strange custom, about which we intend to make inquiries, has no satisfactory explanation. One of their occupations is the chase, and they hunt *pa-lancas*, enormous antelopes (*Hippotragus*?) of which they showed us the antlers, and gazelles, &c., abounding in that region.

“The regions on both sides of the Cu-ango are divided into many districts, with special names, to which the traveller must pay attention in order to avoid confusion. Thus, to the west, the districts of Quiteia-N'bungo, Macume-N'jimbo, Futa, of which we have already spoken, extend; they are inhabited by the Ma-Sossos,

who give them various names, in conformity with the localities. Towards the east the case is the same with Jaccas. The principal chief of the Ma-Jaccas is the Mequianvo, Quianvo or Muene Puto Cassongo. His habitation is in S. Lat. 6°, 30',\* near a rivulet called N'ganza, at a distance of about four hours from the Cuango. The tales narrated to us about the Quilolos were so different and contradictory, that they would be doubtful even if expurgated. Some asserted that the Quianvo is more powerful than the Muata of Lunda, because he performs the ceremony and installs the successor when the Janvo of Lunda dies. Others denied this, and even asserted that the former is a vassal of the latter. Lastly, the interpreters denied all this, as they were not even acquainted with each other; this assertion we, however, suppose to be inaccurate, because it appears that both presented themselves. The Quianvo is a man of regular and athletic stature. On reception days he wraps himself in a cloth, and wears on his forehead a broad bandage of glass-beads, which is tied behind, and has on its upper rim many red feathers of parrots. He wears armlets and wristlets. He drinks a great deal of *malivo* (the native name for *brandy*) and eats only choice game, such as gazelles, &c. He maintains commercial relations with the coast (Ambriz) by a direct route continued on the river Lojo, by means of the Ma-Sossos, when they go to procure caoutchouc and ivory, and pass through his territory in order to travel as far as Muata Compana and Muene Congo Tubinge. This last chief appears to be important. His habitation is on the bank of the Muluia and is bounded by a great river said to be named Baccari. His estates are on the frontiers of the country of the Ba-Cundis or Ma-Cundis, ferocious cannibals, extending towards the north-east, it was said; and spoken of with terror. Lastly, they have a great river, like the Cuango, which flows into the sea; and we being the first white men who had made our appearance in the territories of Muene Puto, they insisted on our paying them a visit. After the Quizengamo had departed, a native of Sosso was introduced to us who gave us some more information. He says that he resides on the road to S. Salvador, knows the Congo-Zaire, N'cusso, and lives near the habitations of Mambo Assamba and of Malungo Atca. He offered himself to us as a guide. The sources of the Lu-quiche, the last affluent of the Cuango on the left bank, are situated in the Zombo mountains. On ascending the river for two days, numerous rocks obstruct its course at a site named Quicungi, and still further up, the mouth of the Cu-ilo Quiasosso occurs. He continued to maintain that, hereabouts, there is no further road along the Cuango, but a desert.

---

\* This Latitude is also the extreme limit of the progress of the expedition.

He speaks of the union of the Cu-engo with the Cu-ango, and further on of the Cassai and of other rivers, of great extent, saying that they are enormous, and the country inundated. He told us that two years ago a *mun-delle* (white man) had passed there (to the *massun go*, the point of confluence as he says) in a *oáto-iá-pulo* (European boat), who was, no doubt, Stanley. He certifies the existence of a great lake and that of the celebrated dwarfs. He concludes that, to reach the *massango* [confluence of the Congo-Zaire with the Co-ango], a journey of six months is required !

The aborigines invited the explorers to pay a visit to the residence of Quianvo, their chief, but it was on the other side of the river, as already mentioned in our extract from the diary.

The explorers, determined to advance, started again on the 29th May, in the morning, when the yet dark hills began to assume every shade of green, the intervening plains appeared to be lakes, and the distant mountains reflected the azure tints of the sky. Nature smiled ; the fields and the sky were adorned, the former with

March of the expedition back to Duque de Braganza, and description of it.—Departure towards Dondo on the river Cu-anza.—Von Mechow, a German explorer encountered.—Dondo.—Luanda.—Departure to Portugal.

flowers, and the latter by the rays of the brilliant orb of day. The river Cu-ango having been reached, soundings were taken in a small boat, and the average depth found to be eight feet. It was dotted with small islands of white sand, and on its banks numerous hippopotamuses were observed. The heat was, however, suffo-

cating ; and both the fever and the dysentery of the explorers became more obstinate.

After having, nevertheless, again progressed a few stages, an altercation arose with the guide, who insisted that, in order to reach the habitation of the Quianvo, the river must be crossed and the march continued on its right bank, as no track could be found for a long time on the left. From the 5th to the 8th June the expedition still advanced, but in a state of great despondency, at some distance from the river, through a region which contained no inhabitants at all, and on the 9th it reached the extreme limit of its progress. \* Returning thence to Duque de Braganza, it reached that place in about 26 days, and the altitude of the sun was taken for the first time at noon on the 30th June 1879.

Duque de Braganza, of which we have already given the geographical position, is situated on a treeless plain, 1,060 mètres above the sea, on the right bank of the Lu-calla river. The seat of the *concelho* is composed of an ample fort of mud-bricks, with loopholes, parapets and fosse in bad condition, surrounded by two



dozen habitations at the most ; among which the residence of the commandant, which fronts the east, is the most notable. The fort was built at a time when the Government sent an expedition to the place to check the excesses of the Jinga aborigines, who threatened the district of Ambaca with their raids. The commerce is almost nil, there being no important firms here. Some little efforts at cultivation are, however, being made in this vast agricultural region, as a little tobacco, cotton, and, further to the north, in Danje, some colossal sugar-cane, with other produce, has been seen.

The uncultivated condition of this region must be attributed to military preponderance. Duque de Braganza is distant from the centre of the Government and contains 50 or 60 military stations, the commandants of which, when they have no occasion to display their prowess against turbulent natives, are covetous enough to extort tithes (which have been abolished) from the Jinga vassals and to commit other depredations. Thus, for instance, the explorers were told that an officer had despatched a private soldier to levy a certain mulct from a chief ; which being refused, he marched with the detachment under his command and lifted 180 heads of cattle which the said chief possessed. The consequence was that the latter retired to the Jinga country, as many others had done before him, and depopulated the *concelho*. The people are a mixture of Jingas, Ambacas and some Bondas, who intermarry with the soldiers of Luanda, and, constituting the existing families, cultivate small plots of ground by which they live.

After making excursions into the surrounding country, the explorers departed, on the 14th September, for the last time, from Duque de Braganza, hoping to reach Dondo on the 23rd or 24th. They took an affectionate farewell from Captain Silverio who said :—"Go ! go ! Europe is waiting to reward you for your sufferings, and to appreciate your services. Now, the time for taking rest, and profiting by it is at hand. As to me, being old, I shall never return to see you again, and the grave will shortly receive my bones."

As the track by which the explorers marched gradually approached the river Cu-auza and the land was sloping towards it, they saw exotic palm-trees, the *Eriodendron*, with a straight trunk partly covered with the branches of the *Cochlospermum angolensis*, full of yellow flowers, *Erythrinas* with rosy clusters, and other plants. Birds gambolled about, and some of the trees were covered with their suspended nests, forty-seven being counted on one. Among those most worthy of mention was the *Bucorax caffer*, called wild turkey, but stouter than those seen in Europe, with a long beak, the breast red in front, and a

large tail. It lives in flocks in these groves, perched on high trees, and is on that account difficult to get at, and also because one, posted as a sentry, gives notice of the least danger by the alarm cry *có có*, whereon all fly away.

The uninterrupted movement of the caravans marching both ways along the track followed by the explorers was something marvellous, scarcely an hour elapsing without dozens of negroes passing, laden with caoutchouc, ivory, &c., but oil was the article most frequently transported. A march with negroes affords opportunities of observing their ornamentation, of which they are fond. Their long tresses are adorned with beads, shells and bits of metal and carefully smeared with palm-oil. They use feathers of birds and skins of animals, horns and even human teeth; they pierce not only their ears but the nose for the insertion of little sticks of wood, and disfigure their bodies by incisions with knives, the scars being considered beautiful. Circumcision is performed among the Ban-Galas, often on adults, who also file their upper front-teeth to separate them; their brutal cupping operations with ox-horns and knives are frightful.

Having on the 17th reached Nhangue-ia-Pepe, the explorers encamped near a *senzala* enclosed by a hedge of euphorbias, with the intention of visiting a cataract on the 18th, which was done. The defile through which the Cu-anza precipitates itself opens out here, so that the river is about 30 mètres broad. Falling from a height of 8 to 10 mètres, the river continues its westward course. There being also many rocks and other difficult passages in the river, it is navigable neither above this locality nor from it to Dondo. •

On the morning of the 20th September, after the travelers had crossed some little brooks, and passed a few establishments called Cassoqui, they met a numerous crowd of porters, whose peculiar loads, such as scaled boxes, new trunks, &c., made them suspect the presence of a European. They were not mistaken in this surmise, for a few minutes afterwards two white men emerged from a bend in the road, and the one arriving first appeared to be the chief. He was a robust man, with a fair beard, and an ample hat, but, as he did not break the silence, they took him to be one of the little communicative (*pouco expansivo*) sons of Great Britain. His gentlemanly appearance, however, inspired them with confidence and they saluted him with the customary "*Bons dias, cavalheiro*" whereon he explained in broken Portuguese that he was a German explorer, Von Mechow by name, coming from Luanda, and travelling to Malanje, where he intended to organize a train of attendants, for descending the Cu-ango in a boat of his

own, and making a complete reconnaissance of it to its junction with the Congo-Zaire. The illustrious traveller had already encountered much trouble in engaging carriers; his cheerfulness, however, had overcome all obstacles and he was determined to try his luck. Some difficulties the explorers had met with in those regions, chiefly with the Jingas who inhabit them, and the fevers as well as the other hardships they had suffered from in the interior, having been explained to Von Mechow, he seemed to make but little account of them, and the two parties separated again.

When the explorers perceived many telegraph poles they knew that European civilization had begun to invade these parts, and they were soon agreeably surprised by the visit of Duarte Silva, an officer of the Portuguese army employed in the Department of Public Works in Africa, who was encamped there, and came to bid them welcome. The news of the arrival of the explorers soon spread in the adjoining camps, and invitations with congratulations poured in from all sides; the grotesque commercial corporation of Dondo (9°, 41' S Lat., 14°, 31', 54" E. Long. observed on the 30th September) also offered a few days afterwards a banquet to the explorers, during which they were introduced to the gentlemen who composed it.

On the 11th October the explorers embarked in a steamer and arrived on the 13th at Luanda (just 729 days since their departure to the south) where the Governor-General Vasco Guedes de Carvalho e Menezes received them with much kindness, but they lived with all their attendants at the house of St. Manuel Raphael Gorjão, the Director of the Public Works of Angola, who had within the short space of three years established an extensive telegraphic line, built an office and a hospital, organized a professional school, and surveyed a line of railway which is to extend 250 kilometres.

The town of Luanda in 8°, 47', 56" S. Lat. and 13°, 7', 30" E. Long. situated on the sea shore, is divided into the high and the low town (*cidade alta e baixa*), but has also many country houses called *musseques*. The population of the interior does not exceed 9,000 inhabitants, 3,500 of these being men, 3,000 women, 1,200 boys and 1,300 girls. The Europeans number at the utmost 1,100, two-thirds of whom are *degradados*, namely, persons exiled for crimes. The *musseques* contain 2,000 inhabitants, and the suburbs with the island 2,350, so that the total population would amount to about 13,350 persons.

The commercial association of Luanda likewise gave a banquet to the explorers, at which H. E. the Governor with the whole body of merchants was present; but, being desirous of recovering their

strength in the more benignant climate of Mossamedes, they sailed for that port, where they spent two months, and then returned Portugal.

From the experience gathered by the expedition, the following conclusions may be drawn:—The life of Africans is simple,

Final remarks about the customs, character, languages, food, &c., of the aborigines.

—The vegetable animal and mineral products of Africa — Condition of the Negro and African colonization.

primitive and coarse. In the thousand *senzalas*, or hamlets, visited by the explorers, they met with but little variety, and always the same arrangement of constructing, covering, and grouping the habitations. Poles or canes firmly fixed

in the soil, interlaced with grass, or plastered with mud, covered with leaves, and arranged in a round or quadrangular form, constitute a hut, which has two or three divisions inside, but is generally the property of one man. The headman nearly always surrounds his domicile with the huts of all the other inhabitants, encircling the whole hamlet with a stockade which can be closed. Around the stockade there are small patches of plantain trees, stramonium, and fields cultivated for daily subsistence. The will of the chief is law, and, as the strong oppress the weak, he is often displaced by another, the people emigrate elsewhere and the hamlet is broken up.

The conjugal advantages are all on the side of the husband, who compels his wife to work for him like a slave. The African has no religion, and his *Fetish* is supposed by him to be a kind of talisman, by which noxious influences are counteracted, while "conscience," as Captain R. Burton has well said, "does not exist, the only repentance which a native is able to feel, being grief for having allowed an opportunity to escape to commit a crime. Thieving distinguishes a man, and assassination, above all, if accompanied by atrocious incidents, makes a hero of him." This picture is somewhat overdrawn, and it must be admitted that moral sentiment exists among Africans, although in an embryonic state only. Thus, in every tribe visited by the explorers, a rich murderer could indemnify the relatives of his victim by paying a blood-ransom, and then again continue his wicked career; and they knew of a native who had committed three murders without the least compunction as the most natural thing, only at the instigation of a chief. This is just like a still living Arab Sultan, whose name we need not mention, and who simply orders one of his attendants to shoot a man when he dislikes him.

Without inflicting upon the reader the enumeration of a score of languages spoken by various tribes, we may observe that unwritten idioms are most subject to change, and that a small difference in the pronunciation may give rise to subsequent

modifications, still more enhanced by the migrations of the people and by the transformation of their usages. Thus, for instance, people who have gone from a level country where they had no occasion to shout, into mountains, where they call one to another from different heights, accustom themselves in course of time to draw out certain syllables long in a kind of chanting tone, to be heard at a distance. The result is the same near great rivers, cataracts, &c., where the accents which have been in the middle of words are generally transferred to the final syllables. In course of time it will no doubt appear that some languages, at present considered different, are merely dialects of one, and their number will be considerably reduced.

It is remarkable that the aborigines have very little or no tendency to contradict, and always reply in the affirmative. Accordingly, in order to elicit the truth on any subject, a great deal of circumlocution is required. Their notions of time, distance and quantity are extremely confused, and cause much perplexity to a European. Thus, for instance, the question, "What time will it take us to reach the point where the Cu-ango flows into the Zaire?" was, after a long preamble, answered thus:—"It will be necessary to use up two pairs of sandals!"

In their barter the same confusion prevails. Thus, for instance, an agreement having been arrived at to buy a head of cattle for 54 yards of cloth, the payment in pieces was arranged as follows:—

1 whole of ...	..	...	18
1 cut of ...	...	...	15
1 cut of ...	...	...	16
5 yards more ..	...	...	5
Total ...			<u>54</u>

Not understanding this calculation, the savages insisted that it should be arranged in lots of 9 yards (half-pieces) as follows:—

Complete ...	...	...	9+9
Cut ...	...	...	9×6+3
Cut ...	...	...	9+7+2
Total ...			<u>27+22+5=54</u>

The chief articles of food in the regions through which the expedition marched, are the following four:—Manioc (*Jatropha manioc*); Massambala (varieties of *Sorghum*), massango (*Penicillaria typhoideum*) which belongs at present to the genus *Pencillaria*, and Indian-corn (*Zea mais*), which likewise occurs in great abundance. All these articles are made into bread after being reduced to meal; unfortunately, however, the people have no mills, and grind it only by pounding. With the bread the negro

eats whatever of flesh, fish, or vegetables he can get. *Ginguba* (*Arachis hypogea*) is also of great value to them, and entire tribes live on it, especially the Jingas, the Ma-Hungos, and the Ma-Jaccas, who swallow astonishing quantities of it raw as it is taken from the ground.

Then come indigenous and exotic fruits, too numerous to enumerate, from the *Vitis heracleifolia* to the plantain, as well as the variety of Inlame, tubercles of *Helmin*, potatoes, and little known roots, which are devoured greedily.

Lastly, a stick of sugar-cane, a gourd of soured milk or hydromel, complete the series of aliments in a luscious repast.

Vegetable diet prevails almost exclusively over the whole continent, and a head of cattle is slaughtered only in extraordinary cases, when the native who is generally puerile, gives vent to most stupendous excesses of joy. Able to bear hunger for a long time, he contents himself with four grains of *Arachis*, but when the moment to appease his appetite arrives, he is insatiable. He stuffs himself gradually with several pounds of flour till his abdomen swells, shines, and appears ready to burst. This voracity is most prevalent among old men.

The African manifests a decided propensity for drink. Either the scarcity of European liquors, or the temporary oblivion of the wretched and monotonous life of a negro which their abuse causes, makes him very greedy for drink, and the explorers scarcely knew a case in which, if a chance were given to one of them, he did not drink till he fell down. Some beverages of the country also produce intoxication, but a great deal of them must be swallowed gradually, whereas brandy effects it very speedily, so that the native considered the drinking of it to be as pleasant as that of hydromel is melancholy.

As to the food of the African, it is unsavoury to a palate not habituated to it. He does not recoil even from putrefaction, and European perfume is unpleasant to him, to such a degree, that he would prefer a sweet fruit with a terebinthine flavour to any other which a European would prize. Some fruits with a most disgusting smell, say a variety of the *carica papaya*, are highly appreciated; but inodorous and insipid substances also are devoured with a great gusto.

The vegetable products of Africa embrace, first, the gigantic trees, then a variety of bushes and unknown plants which it would take volumes to describe. We shall in this place enumerate only such as have been utilized in commerce, namely, a variety of palms producing oil, especially the *Elais guineensis*. Plants the leaves of which are used in the manufacture of hats and other articles; these are the *Hyphe* and the varieties of the *Borassus*.

The fibres of the *Adansoniinas* are at present exported on a great scale for the manufacture of paper and other articles. The *Palma Christi* is used for medicines. *Aloes* occur in great abundance. *Tobacco* grows everywhere, and that of Ambaca has a special aroma. The *sugar-cane* prospers wherever water is abundant. *Cotton* occurs in the whole province of Benguelas; the *coffee*, which is now appreciated in Portugal, comes from the whole mountainous region, and that from Cazengo is considered the best. *Giuguba* (*arachis hypogea*) which yields much oil, appears to be extremely abundant in the table-land of Ambaca and in the eastern districts. All kinds of *pepper* occur every where. *Rice* was seen under cultivation by the explorers in the district of Bihe, where large tracts of country appeared to be devoted to it. *Indian-corn* was very fertile at Quillengues, Caconda and Duquede Braganza. *Sorghum* was the general food of the people of the interior, but *Massungu* (*Penisetum typhloideum*) is invariably the staff of life to the Ganguellas and to the Ma-Quicos. There is an amazing quantity of *Balsamum Elmi*, and along the coast, as well as in the interior, there are notable tracts full of *Copal-gum* trees. *Caoutchouc* is the product of colossal creepers, which the aborigines destroy in order to extract their sap. The production of the resin called *Dragons-blood* has already been attempted.

Animal products are:—*Ivory*, represented by the tusks of the elephant, which is always in great request, but the explorers appear never to have met the animal nor the *Rhinoceros*, the horn of which is also an article of trade. The Ganguellas are the greatest producers of *war*. Spiders and worms produce *silk*. The Marabout-bird yields *feathers*, sold in various markets. *Skins* of oxen and of wild beasts, such as leopards, panthers, lions, &c.

Lastly, the mineral products are:—*Iron* and *Brimstone*. In all the mountains and in the interior *Copper* is found, and, when cast, marked with the figure of a cross. Signs of coal exist. *Gold* occurs in the Lombiye and other districts. *Silver* is found in Jinga (Dallango), Cambambe, &c. *Rock-Salt* is gathered in many places.

The history of Africa is as old as that of Europe, but excepting the northern portions nothing of it is known. All the races who had come into contact with the negro only subjugated him, and, slavery having been abolished even by European nations in comparatively recent times only, it is not to be wondered at that the hereditary terror and hatred which the negro entertained towards all men of a lighter complexion than his own has not yet disappeared. His physical and moral position will henceforth be modified by other influences than hitherto; let us hope that his future will be brighter than his past, and that he will in course of time become

civilized, although it must be admitted, that at least for the present the prospects of colonization are very scanty in tropical, and chimerical in Central Africa, where the life of Europeans is endangered by maladies and other dangers. There are, indeed, salubrious districts in the interior, and delightful large rivers, but when will they become navigable, and when will railroads or even common tracks connect the interior with the litoral and make European colonies possible which have not been attempted even in this country, although it affords much greater facilities of communication with temperate localities in the North-Western Provinces, in the Himalayas, the Nilgiris, &c., than will be possible in Africa even after a large influx of Europeans has taken place.

E. REHATSEK.



### **ART. III.—LANDED PROPRIETORSHIP, LAND-TENURES, AND THE VESTIGES OF LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT UNDER NATIVE RULE IN ORISSA.**

"England will arrive at a true knowledge of India only by the concrete study of individual localities. A time for safe synthesis and theorising will come in due course, but meanwhile the most solid service which an Indian investigator can render, is a careful collection of facts."—*W. W. Hunter.*

**A**T a time when measures for the classification of land-tenures, definition of tenant rights and the establishment of a system of Local Self-Government are being warmly discussed by the public and the Press, an account of the past history, and the existing customs and conditions under which land is held, rent is paid, and village communities are managed, in districts not affected by modern ideas on the subject, will not be out of place. If example is better than precept, living instances must be more valuable than abstract theorems. The ground occupied by the subjects above indicated is no doubt a debatable one. Much may be said on either side. Big champions have appeared in the field; experienced Justices and able civilians have flourished lances of pointed logic and bright rhetoric; but, leaving abler controversialists to argue and fight over their respective lines, we would confine our task to a faithful narrative of facts, drawing such inferences as those facts alone may warrant, and making a distinction of rights of which a confusion alone is now made by the infusion of foreign ideas and foreign modes of thought.

We venture to state that in no other part of the Province of Bengal, not even Behar excepted, does the native system of land-tenure exist in its primitive type of integrity to the extent observable in Orissa. The feudal Barons, their compact territories, the patriarchal institutions, the village organization, vestiges of the landed militia, the village servants, and lastly, the most important class of people, the hereditary cultivators of the soil, have each a distinct existence in the Province. The landmarks are clear which the misrule of neither the Pathans, the Moguls nor the Marhattas, nor the levelling policy of the settlement under British officers in 1805, has yet been able wholly to obliterate. Generally speaking, the people of Orissa are ignorant of law. Any idea of change they religiously avoid. Their ignorance has helped them to adhere tenaciously to customs and traditions, to teach them to live in peace with, rather than in defiance of their ancient and cherished institutions. Foreign

domination for years has hardly been able to engraft one foreign word upon either the literature of their indigenous institutions, or the vocabulary of their agricultural terms. The Dalakoran, the Dandási and Paricharaka, are titles yet held by public servants in the Rajwaras, or principalities of native chieftains. They have not yet entirely given way to such foreign terms as the Sardar, the Chowkidar, or the Mandals, of districts where the social, like the religious, fabric, is at present in a state of transition. Religious customs and social institutions are fixtures in Orissa. In every aspect of life, social, mental and external, Orissa is the India of the Hindu Period of history, unaffected in most questions by external influences. The fondness of the Uria for keeping his habits distinct is observable even in his colloquial language. He would scrupulously avoid borrowing a foreign word. The Road-cess is his *Patha-kura*. The Provincial-cess is his *Prodesi-kara*, and the distributory of the canal is expressed by him as the *Kamál*, or the arm of the canal. The Dandasi (club or swordsman), the Pradhan (village headman), and the Paricha (village supervisor), are, with the Uria, living terms yet. Unlike his more mobile brethren, he shuns reformation, as reformation is perversion according to his estimate. This traditional habit and religious scrupulousness have enabled the Uria to keep himself beyond the influence of foreign regulations. Orissa, therefore, affords the best field for depicting the native institutions and for investigating the rights and interests developed by them.

Nowhere, again, in the province is the native system of land-tenures visible in greater integrity than within the Killájatas, or barouies, whose chieftains were virtually the sovereigns of their estates. "They paid a light tribute and were independent within their jurisdiction." (G. Toynebee's *History of Orissa*). The earliest investigators into the claims of these chieftains and their tenures have held that they were the military nobles of the ancient times, who established their principalities either by right of conquest or from grants from the Paramount Power. Their rights were admitted by the greatest of the Orissa monarchs, Ananga Bhuan (1175 A. D.), who divided the province into two parts, making half over to these chiefs, the officers of State, and to the men of the sacerdotal order, retaining the other half only as his royal domain. The territories of the feudal Lords are situated along the seaboard on the east, while those of the military fief-holders are on the mountainous regions on the western borders of the province. The Crown lands lay in the intermediate Deltaic plain; the former amounted to 19,000 square miles in extent, leaving 5,000 square miles only as the portion of the King. Eight of the principalities were situated on the sea-board, known

as the eight *Tálá-Gárhás*, or lower forts, in contradistinction to the hill forts or the military fiefs on the western borders: the latter served as break-waters to such waves of disturbance as could possibly approach from the savage, mountaineer tribes beyond the frontier. These estates were Killahs Darpan, Sukiinda and Modhupur.

The territories of the feudal Lord were Al, with Darabisi Keyanga, Kanika, Chedra, Patya, Hurishpur, Marichpur and Bishanpur. These estates, or Baronies, were held by their respective chieftains subject only to the payment of a small quit-rent and the rendering of certain military services. They were settled in perpetuity by the Board of Commissioners whose proceedings received the confirmation of the Governor-General by Regulation XII. of 1805. The Crown lands called "Mogul Bandi" at the time of the acquisition of the province by the present Government, were settled temporarily with persons in possession whose "land itself was held responsible for the payment of public revenue" (Sec. 2, Reg. XII of 1805.) No distinction was, however, made between the titles of the ancient chiefs, and the landholders or the managers of the Crown lands. In the confusion of rights which ensued from "the Bengal idea of proprietorship" in land, confirmed or created by the Regulation of the Decennial Settlement, these ancient chiefs, it may be noted here, were styled zemindars, equally with the managers of the "Mogul Bandi," or Crown lands, settled by Raja Todar Mul. Their responsibility, however, of furnishing guards and suppressing robberies within the Crown lands bordering on their respective territories was continued for a time. The tax called "Chaupani" or Mángon "Khândáiti" which they were hitherto allowed to levy for the purpose being abolished and substituted for an "equivalent in money from Government" (Cl. 5, Sec. 4, Act XII of 1805.)

As instances of want of precision on the part of the revenue officers in 1805, we may state that the first three chiefs, *i. e.*, those of Fort Darpan, Sukiinda and Modhupur were granted sannads of appointment at the settlement of 1805, and to exchange agreements as ordinary zemindars. The chiefs of Killahs Kujang, Kanika and Al, Harishpur and Marichpur, were permitted to execute *Ikrarnamas*, which were documents of a political character, confirmed by the Governor-General in Council, while the revenue payable by them was styled *Peshkash*, or tribute. The Hurishpur and Bishanpur chiefs were not styled Rajahs in these engagements, although the documents were the same as those executed by the Rajahs of Kujanga and Kanika and Al. The last three were thus, in 1805, placed in a more independent and exalted position than the rest of the chiefs.\* The status of these Rajahs has,

---

\* Statistical account, Cuttack District, by W. W. Hunter.

however, been gradually levelled down to that of the ordinary zemindars by the course of the action adopted by public officers on the one hand, and the ignorant readiness with which the Rajahs themselves on the other, submitted to the altered process.

We find also no mention of three other states, Domporá, Kalkala and Chedrá, in Reg. XII of 1805. The *Peshkas* of Chedrá was, however, settled in perpetuity. Kalkala was formerly included in Darpan, but, on the application of the owner, was separated from the parent estate. The Government Revenue of Domporá was enhanced by the Commissioners at the settlement; but in April 1829, on a representation to the Board of Revenue, the Janna was reduced by the Governor-General in Council.

With the exception of the three estates in the Western borders of the district and two on the seaboard, the remaining six Gáras, or forts, mentioned in Reg. X. of 1805, have gradually passed away from the hands of their original owners, having been sold for family debts, or for default to pay the Government *Peshkash*. Domporá, Sukinda and Modhupur on the west, and Al and Kanka on the eastern border of the district, still continue in the hands of the descendants of their original chieftains.

Darpan is held by a gentleman, the scion of an adventurous Brahmin, from Cashmere. Some of the most important of the Talgarhs, such as Chedra and Kujang are owned by the zemindars of Bengal, these "great proprietors" who, to quote Dr. Hunter, live in luxuriant villas around Calcutta "and its adjacent districts, with mirror-covered walls and every latest luxury from London or Paris."

The proclamation embodied in Regulation XII. of 1805, regarding the settlement of the Province of Orissa, was, no doubt, based on the idea that lands in Orissa were held by a body of rent-collectors whose right in the soil was homogeneous. It was certainly the preconceived idea of the Calcutta Council "who were led to believe that the tenure of land in Orissa was the same as found in Bengal, previous to the date of the Decennial Settlement." As a matter of fact, however, the conditions on which land was held or owned in the two provinces could not be more different. Moderate in its demand, wise in its intentions, and ever anxious to promote the welfare of the people interested in agriculture, it cannot but be admitted that the Government of those days overlooked the licenses and the privileges of at least one class of proprietors throughout the country. The possessors of territories, estates, or lands, whether they were the ancient nobles, the feudal lords, the military fief-holders, or the officers or managers of fiscal divisions in the king's dominions, who amidst anarchy and misrule obtained a quasi-proprietory

right in land, had but one name—itsself a foreign one—to hear, viz., the Zemindar. The Regulations mention no other title. The Maharajahs, the Rajahs, Dandapats, Samantas, Revenue administrators and petty grant holders, had but one name to stand by. The Maharajah of Al, the scion of the ancient sovereign, Mukund Deb, was classed in the same rank as the canongoe of Baliá, in the same way as the Rajahs of Doomraon, Bishienpur, Nagore and Chandra Darpee were grouped in the same revenue roll with the Canongoe of Jagpur and the farmers of Patashpur in the sister province. The recognition of their proprietary titles was all the compensation which the ancient nobles and barons of "the land, received equally with those land-managers" whose rights were thrust upon them at the revenue settlement, and stood at the time on a questionable official basis. The same revenue sale-law, the same rules for the management of the property of minors, the classification of landed property, held under very different titles in the same category, and the same procedure for settlement and survey of *Peshkash* and rent-paying estates reduced the one to the lower grade of the others. This was principally effected during periods when the public officers represented both the interests of Government, and the proprietors managed the *Peshkash* estates on the part of the Court of Wards.

A brief account of the history and the institution of one of these Rajwaras, or *Peshkash* estates, is necessary for the purpose of this article. We take up Kujang, as it is not only one of the most extensive and important of the Talgarhs, or lower forts of the Province, but because it has passed through many a vicissitude and different managements, until now, owned by by one of the wealthiest of the zemindars of Bengal. From the hands of its original chieftains it came to be managed by the Court of Wards; it came again to be managed by the Civil Court, until it was brought ultimately to the hammer, when the "Fort" was purchased by the Maharaja Mahatab Chand Bahadur of Burdwan.

The nucleus of the present Raj of Kujang was originally confined to Dobas Garh which was situated in the seaboard of the Cuttack district, within the meshes of streams and the seclusion of the Orissa Sunderbuns close to the mouths of the Mahanadi, near False Point. The chieftains belonged to the military caste of Rajputs who spread their dominions in all directions when pressed by their Mahomedan conquerors in the north-western parts of the country. The authentic history of the Kujang Raj family commences from 1052 V. S., corresponding with 1641 A. D. From that year down to 1811 A. D. the estate

went on extending its limits, until the territories of eight other neighbouring forts were annexed to it, rendering it continuous with its existing boundaries. It comprised an area of 35,847 square miles or 2,29,366 acres. Of this about one hundred thousand acres, or less than one-half the total area, is cultivated, the remainder being occupied by rivers, jungle and prairies.

We have no account to tell how Dobas Gurh was originally formed. The earliest history of the Kujanga Raj commences, as we have above stated, with 1641 A. D., in connexion with the incident which acquired for the family the surname of the "Sundo," or 'bull. About that year the Rajah of Dobas Gurh owned a Brahmini bull which grew savage and committed great devastations. The brute became a terror to the country, knocked down houses, killed numbers of the people, and destroyed so much of the crops that many of the tenants began to migrate. The Rajah, who was a Hindu Khetri, hearing of the devastation caused by the bull, and that numbers of people were leaving his territory, issued a proclamation that a fourth of the kingdom would be given to any one who would rid the country of the ferocious bull by driving him away without maiming or hurting him in any way. At this time one Mullick Samant, a relation of the Rajah, was staying on a visit at the Gurh and, hearing of the proclamation, offered to accept the terms. He insisted only that the terms be at first engraved on a copper-plate. This being done, on an appointed day, Mullick Samanta fought the bull naked and, unarmed. He is said to have taken the bull by the horns, and after twelve hours' wrestling, to have completely overpowered him, so that on being let off, he ran away, and ran away whenever any man approached him. The bull at last left the country.

Mullick Samanta thus got the one-fourth share of the kingdom, and, from the day of his instalment, was known by the surname of the Sand (bull) which has continued in the family up to this day. On the death of the Rajah of Dobas Gurh, Samanta Sand annexed the whole Raj. He reigned altogether 29 years, or down to the year 1074 V. S. The date of the fight with the bull may thus be put down as 1052 V. S.

His son, Sochendra Sondo Sand, reigned 21 years. His grand-son, Damodor Sand, about the year 1113, fought with the chief of the Gokhas, or fisherman of Sen Bench, and added their *Bedi*, or Gurh, to his raj.

The next Raja, Bishumber Sanda, made great friendship with the Raja of Romita Gurh, but when he had found out his strength, fought, and killed him and annexed his Raj (1145.)

His son, Chhater Bhuj, employed himself in successive raids,

killing the Rajah of Kujanga Gurh, which, up to 1165, formed a separate principality, and annexing that estate to his own. He also fought the Rajah of Kaukas Daya Gurh and another, and succeeded in taking the entire estate of the former and four villages of the latter. He died childless.

In 1184 Chhatter Bhuj's brother, Krishna Chunder Sanda, took the Raj, and reigned 21 years. He was a powerful man.

In 1205, when the next prince, Gangadhar, succeeded to the throne, the State of Kalladwipa on the seaboard was yet in existence. It stood, however, as a sort of Afghanistan between two large kingdoms. The Raja of Kanika on the one hand, and Kujanga on the other, entered into intrigues which ended in the demolition of the Raj, and its division among themselves, making the Pantia Pal river the boundary of their respective dominions. The Chakrakhandia thus became a portion of the Kujanga Raj.

About this time Gangadhar Sanda collected some 122 families of freebooters and settled them in Jaigeers, named *Bhurarec tenures*, of which more hereafter. These men were robbers, pure and simple, who went out to the neighbouring districts and out to sea in their long boats manned, it is said, by 40 or 50 rowers, in their thievish and piratic excursions, and returned with their boats to be harboured by the Raja in secure forts within the Sunderbuns and creeks of the Mahanadi opposite Paradwipa. He also instituted the *Paikla Jagirs*, in which he settled some 300 families, the members of which formed his militia, who were bound to turn out at a moment's notice and be ready to fight. He also instituted the *Mati Paricha* (Sardari) jagirs, and the *Paik-rao* system, and gave them to the chiefs of his soldiers. By the help of these men he fought and killed the chiefs of Tikri, Ramchunderpur, Bidyadharpur and Gajanga, Boro Pât and Bara Bander, and annexed some 84 villages to his Raj. The glory of the Raj now reached its climax.

In 1803 A. D. (1219), his son, Chandra Dhajâ, was installed Raja. During Chandra Dhajâ's time, the Province of Orissa passed under British rule. Ignorant of the prowess of the British lion, and secure in his position among the meshes of the delta of the Mahanadi, the Rajah was detected in carrying on a correspondence with the Rajahs of Khurda and Kanika with a view of entering into a triple alliance against the British authority. When the three principal towns of Orissa (Cuttack, Puri, and Balasore) were reduced, a detachment of the force was accordingly sent to Kujanga under Colonel Harcourt. The Rajah, hearing of the arrival of the force, fled from his fort. His elder brother, Bir Chandra, whom he kept in confinement in the fort of

Paradwipa, was released and seated on the throne. The Rajah was, however, shortly after captured and sent to the fort Barahati at Cuttack. His fort was also dismantled, and his cannon carried away to Cuttack. Among these were found two brass guns, nearly new, which bore the stamp of the Honourable East India and Company, and which must either have been found as a wreck, or captured by the Rajah's men in one of their excursions. (Toynbee's History of Orissa.)

Disturbances, however, continued in the Killa, as in other parts of the province, the Paiks of the estate forming a disturbing element for a period of years. At the insurrection of the Paiks of Khurda and Puri (1817-18) there was a general rising in the southern and eastern parts of the Province. The Paiks of the Kujang and Kanika estates took an important part, secretly encouraged by the Rajahs of those Killahs. To quote Mr. Toynbee, "their action, however, took more of the nature of various bands of dacoits acting independently, than striving to rid themselves of a foreign yoke."

When the Khurda insurrection was quelled and the Rajah of Puri was made a captive, it was time to send a detachment of troops to Killa Kujanga. "On the 13th September 1817, Captain Kennet embarked with a small force on board of country boats at Cuttack, and, taking advantage of a high flood, reached Paradwipa the next day. The place was stockaded and strongly defended. His boats being clumsy and the current very strong, Captain Kennet deemed it advisable to run them ashore, and, disembarking, advanced against the stockade and took it by storm.

"A party under Lieutenant Forester pursued the rebels into the village, killed 15 of them and captured three 3-pounder guns which had been placed to defend the main approach. Two other parties under Captain Kennet and Lieutenant Wood also pursued the enemy in other directions, but, night coming on, most of them escaped into the dense jungles, of which that part of the country mainly consists. The troops bivouacked in the stockade during the night, and the Paiks kept up a desultory and random fire of arrows, which, however, happily did no harm. Next morning Captain Kennet marched with two companies against the village of Noagurh. The enemy kept up a random fire on the troops from their shelter in the jungles, but their march was not seriously impeded. All they found at Noagurh was a quantity of arrows, a few cannon, and three elephants. The Paiks had evacuated the place and fled to Kujanga. Captain Kennet then resolved to proceed to Perau, but as the intermediate country was in possession of the Paiks, it was necessary first to come to an action with them. This he succeeded in doing on the



19th September. Though numbering upwards of 2,000, and though greatly favoured by the nature of the country, they were completely routed. Two elephants and eight horses fell into the hands of the victors, and the Rajah, perceiving it hopeless to continue the struggle further, came in and gave himself up to Captain Kennet on the 2nd October. Partly by means of information given, and partly by stratagem, Narayan Puram Guru and Bamdeb Pât Josi, the chief leaders and instigators of the outbreak, were also taken prisoners and carried with the Rajah to Cuttack. The latter was imprisoned for one year in the fort, the former were both transported for life. Captain Kennet returned with the majority of the force, leaving Captain Sampson with a few troops to complete the pacification of the country."

When the Marhattas were finally expelled and peace and order restored in Orissa, the British authorities commenced constructing the revenue system which led to, among other things, an investigation into the rights of the landed aristocracy of the Province. It was found at the settlement that the Rajah's revenue amounted to 14,011 Kahau Cowries only, for his extensive domain of 220,000 acres of land. The Cowrees were valued at Rs. 11,503-9-7, of which again Rs. 4,000 was remitted on the understanding that the Rajah would keep the embankments in proper order, and that no remission should ever be given to him in future on account of losses by flood or on any excuse whatever; the balance, therefore, Rs. 7,503-9-7 was fixed as the revenue in perpetuity.

At the settlement the Rajah was called upon to give a list of the villages and boundaries of his estate. In doing this the Rajah, with that timid and suspicious spirit which yet marks the Urya, purposely omitted 60 villages, fearing that he had actually more land than he had stated before the Settlement Officer, *viz.*, 22,000 acres. When the survey of the district was finished, this of course was detected, but it was then too late to claim them. The 60 villages were then farmed out as a separate estate, known as the "Satia Mouza" (60 villages), which is now owned by the heirs of the late Dwanika Nath Tagore of Calcutta, yielding a revenue of Rs. 14,000 per annum. From the year 1810-11 to 1867, six more Rajahs owned Kujanga. During the incumbency of one of these Princes, Rajah Janardan Sanda, in the year 1835, a terrific cyclone blew over the coast, and the sea came over the Killa, driving away thousand of the tenants and their cattle, totally destroying the crops for the year, and causing great damage to the fields when the salt evaporated.

In consequence of this total loss the Rajah had to borrow money to pay up his revenue. This was the commencement of the Kujanga Rajahs' debt, which they were never able to free

themselves from, and which gradually increased to upward of five lakhs of Rupees, until the estate was brought to the hammer.

In June 1867 the estate was attached under orders of the Civil Court, notwithstanding the sympathy of the Rajah's creditors for an ancient and respectable family. Bidyodhar Sauda found himself totally unable to extricate the Raj, and, the question was, how to command a bid, which, after payment to the *Mahajans*, would leave the Rajah a handsome balance. Capital was not forthcoming in all Orissa. None of the landlords, nor any of the princes of the Tributary Estates could be persuaded, or was able, to pay out such a sum as half a million of Rupees in purchasing the estate. The present writer then happened to be at Cuttack, and under his advice the Maharajah of Burdwan was induced to purchase the Raj, which was knocked down at Rupees 5,50,000. A strong feeling of sympathy certainly prevailed throughout Orissa for the fallen Raj. The Uria public talked of the purchase as another instance of usurpation on the part of the Bengali zemindar. Scolds were not wanting to sing of the fallen fate of the Sanda Rajah; but years of litigation failed to revoke the sale, or avert the doom. The Maharajah of Burdwan, on the other hand, took advice of his friends and very generously offered to grant a loan of Rs. 7,500, and to assign such an amount of pension as would enable Bidyadhar Sanda to live in ease in his own fort at Paradwipa. But the Rajah was in bad hands. Greedy people, whose ill-gotten gains had launched him into ruin, still impelled him to further depths. He sued the Maharajah of Burdwan and twice carried up his case to the Privy Council, where he lost his claim on both occasions. At last he instituted a civil suit to alienate the religious endowments from the revenue-paying portion of the Raj. The case lay pending in the court of the Sub-judge of Cuttack, the Rajah residing in Cuttack awaiting orders. In 1873 the Sub-judge gave the case against the Kujanga Rajah. As soon as the orders were passed, the Rajah started in his boat for Gurl Paradwipa; but the next morning he was found dead in his cabin at Bosepur lock in the Kendraparah canal. A diamond ring which the Rajah always wore, was missing, and it was said that he died by swallowing it; most probably he exchanged the ring through a servant for a dose of poison, as all hopes of recovering his estates were gone; and he would in a short time have been a wreck and a perfect pauper. The Rajah's fate is to be deplored. But it was merely the lot of a reckless family who never knew the proper use of wealth, and of a comparatively independent position which that wealth conferred. Let us hope better for the large population of this extensive estate, and "let us wish that the wealth and the public spirit of the noblemen into whose

hands it has passed, may invigorate a new life into these parts of Orissa.”—(*Dr. Hunter's Statistical Account of Cuttack*, p. 29).

We have given a detailed account of the Rajas of Fort Kujanga, to enable our readers to understand the process by which they acquired their property, the relation in which they stood to the sovereigns of Orissa and the neighbouring principalities, and the nature of their title, to which reference will be made hereafter.

“A careful study of Indian History leads to the support of the opinion, that India at a period long antecedent to the Mahomedan conquest, was divided into so many small estates, the owners of which possessed the rights and privileges of sovereigns.” \* When valour and prowess raised a chief to the paramountcy of a province or the entire country, confederacies were formed. The feudal ones acknowledged the allegiance, and the King over all was turned into an Emperor by probably the same steps as King Frederick of Prussia has in our own days been acknowledged as the Emperor of Germany. India was too large a country to have been held continuously for centuries under a single sovereign, nor was a central Power, a strong national federation, possible, where provinces and districts were widely scattered without easy modes of communication, where Codes and Regulations and a uniform understanding were wanting, and resources which would command an efficient administration were difficult to organise. It was only in spasmodic periods of valour, in the era of a Yudhistira, or a Bikromaditya of Ujjain, that the entire continent could be held under one umbrella. The powerful paw of the British lion, which holds in one mighty grasp the Indian Empire, could not be expected in the olden times. India was thus necessarily split into a number of principalities, and their chiefs, whether they acquired their territories by the force of their own arms or by favour of the Paramount Power for the time, were not certainly the quasi-landholders, or revenue officers, who, by inheritance and recognition amid Mahomedan misrule and Marhatta disorganization, developed themselves into the zemindars of a subsequent period.

The Chiefs or Lords of the land had a compact territory; they enjoyed the privileges of sovereignty; were the judges and magistrates within their own States, and the *plenum dominium* was vested in them. Their estates lay beyond the boundaries of the Crown lands, and to the latter they either rendered services as occasion required, or paid a small tribute as the admission of a subordinate position, which owed allegiance to the Paramount Power for the time. The Rajah, or the hereditary Prince, was then the abstract owner of the land. “They succeeded by inheritance,

---

\* Grant Duff's History of the Marhattas.

exercised power of life and death within their lordships or jurisdiction, maintained forces, proportioned to their means, and paid, if any thing, only a light tribute, as their tenure was that of military service. They were rather, therefore, the Princes than proprietors in the European sense of the term, though of course they would not allow anybody to dispute the latter title with them."—*Sterling's Minute*, para 20).

The officers of the Sovereigns of Orissa, the zemindars of the Mogul Bundi, or the Crown-lands of the Mahomedan period, were very different from the feudatory nobles. The former held the administration of the Royal Domain situated in the intermediate low alluvial tract. It was divided into a number of Bisis (Bisaya) and Khandas divisions, or fiscal circles, names which yet survive in the Parganas, such as Derahisi, Baluhisi or Lohakhanda and Kokuakhanda. These were administered by revenue-officers known as Bisorji or Khandadhipati—the "owner" of the estate or circle, or the collector of revenue, Chowdri, of the Mahomedan period, his chief accountant (Canongoe) and the chief swordsman (Khandal) who amidst the disorder of the Mahomedan and Marhatta rule, subdivided the territories under their charge and gradually developed themselves into landholders, which resulted in their recognition as the proprietors of the soil. The distribution between these two classes of landowners may be thus noted :

The ancient Rajahs were, during the Mahomedan period, described by Ferishta "Rajan, Zaminderan, as powerful and formidable chiefs, commanding troops and possessing forts, like the Barons of the middle ages"—(*Sterling's Minute*, para. 20). "They manifestly stand in a predicament widely different from that of other landholders, and I believe all are agreed in opinion as to the necessity of maintaining them where they exist, and the policy of cautiously avoiding any steps leading to their revival in cases where they may be out of possession, unless some very urgent reason exists for pursuing an opposite course"—(para, 21.)

The collectors of land-revenue, on the other hand, were the officers of Government, appointed to manage portions of the Royal Domain.

1. They had the right of collecting the Government revenue and were answerable for arrears.

2. Their profits arose from the extension of cultivation.

3. They had the privilege of selling or leasing the jungles or waste-lands, "Benger Kunj Juma."

4. They had a share of the sugar duties and certain taxes on trade and artisans, tithes on fisheries, pasture-grounds, gardens, woods, bamboo-jungles, and the plains called "Bena-bat," yielding the grass for thatching.

5. They were allowed ground for building "Khana-hori" and cultivated certain portions of their estate free of assessment for their subsistence called Khamar, "Nij Jote," or the Nonkar of the Talookdars.

6. Were jointly responsible with the Khandaits and village watchmen for the Police of the country.

7. They derived advantages from fines, forfeitures and bribes, with taxes on marriages so regularly taken under the Marhattas, as to have become an avowed impost in the revenue accounts.

8. During the Marhatta period the profits of the salt land were enjoyed exclusively by the proprietors.

The nature of the tenures of these collectors and managers of revenue may best be judged from the *sannuds* they received from the Government and the engagements they entered into for the performance of their duties. Thus a *sannad* conferring a *Khandaiti*

Mahomed Shah  
Pulsha Gha. ce  
Fidree Roostum Jung  
Morshod Couley  
Khan Bahadoor  
110

"It is necessary that he pay his *peshcash* with regularity to Government, never falling a dam or dirhem into balance; perform with zeal all duties attaching to his situation; attend the Foujdar of the above Thanahs with his contingent (*jameut*); protect the Pargunnahs of that quarter in such a way, that there remain no traces of theft and robbery; keep the ryots contented and prosperous, and abstain from levying unauthorized *abwabs*."

The engagement of the Khandait was worded as follows:—

"I do by my own full and free consent, declare that I will perform the duties of the above office with honesty and fidelity; I will behave towards the ryots in such a way as to keep them happy and contented; I will exert myself to the utmost in cultivating the Mouzahs attached to the above Killah, and the separate Mouzah specified, and pay the public dues without fail. It shall be my special care to guard against the occurrence of theft, dacoity and highway robbery; should those crimes at any time be committed, I will apprehend the robbers with the property stolen and bring them before the Foujdar. Whenever the Foujdar may have occasion to march against any rebellious and turbulent persons, I will join him with my *jameut* (contingent); I will never myself join with turbulent and rebellious zemindars, nor will I myself be guilty of disobedience. Should I ever violate the above conditions I shall

be considered to have forfeited my zemindari. I will collect none of the prohibited *abwabs*. This is written as a *Muchalka*."

The Danda Patis, Bisorjis, Khand Patis, of the old Hindu period were changed into Talookdars, Canongoes and Chowdhries during the Mahomedan period. These terms came to be used in the Bengal Regulations indiscriminately without, we are afraid, any precise idea of the title they conferred on the holders. In Section 4, Regulation VIII of 1793, it is said :—" These settlements under certain restrictions and exceptions shall be concluded with the actual proprietors of the soil of whatever denominations, whether zemindars, talookdars or chowdhries."

" Nobody," observes Mr. Sterling, " ever supposed that the person called Canongoe by the Moguls was other than a mere servant of Government, though succeeding by regular inheritance to his office." Again :—" There is obviously no more reason to assume that the Chowdhries, or chiefs of Parganas, were the proprietors of the land comprised in them, than that the Canongoes, or Talookdars were, a conclusion from which most minds would probably revolt, however predisposed to see an absolute European landlord in every superior revenue manager connected hereditarily with the soil."

At the settlement of the province in 1805, these feudal nobles and fiscal officers were jumbled together in one class. The only distinction made at the time was the settlement of the permanent revenue on lands of the former, while the assessment of the estates of the latter were fixed for a time only. The latter was termed *Jemá*, the former *Peshkush*, or quit-rent only. Both classes of proprietors, however—the ancient hereditary princes, as well the holders of military fiefs—were equally deprived of their Magisterial and Police power, their licenses and privileges, until by a slow process of the law on the one hand and the imbecility and ignorance of the Rajah's themselves on the other, they have been levelled down to the rank of the ordinary zemindars of the later Mahomedan period.

## II.

From the account of the hereditary princes and other landed proprietors in Orissa which we have given above, we turn to the classification of tenures held under various titles in their estates, and which may be noted as follows :—

*Class 1.*—Rent-paying lands, which are sub-divided into three, 1 Thani, 2 Pahi, 3 Chandna. The Thani ryots are the hereditary occupiers of the soil and the residents of the village in which their tenure is situated, being members of the village corporate body, enjoying all the rights of the villagers. The word is the opposite of the Sanskrit "*Sthaniya*," or local. Besides other

privileges of the village men, such as the free use of the pastures, the Bena Bat or grass plains, and works of irrigation, &c. : the Thani ryots had formerly each an allowance of one mán, 18 ghoot of land within their respective tenures, which they held rent free. In return for this favour the holder was required to furnish labour for the purpose of repairing the village embankments, or do any other kind of work which the prince thought necessary for the general welfare of the tenants. Most of these lands have now been resumed by the Maharaja of Burdwan, and the *Betia* or labour system done away with. At the settlement of 1837 the rights of the resident cultivators were formally recognised by Government and secured to them by Leaf Pottas, or leases. Their strong love of home, however, enabled the landlord to enhance the rent of the holding to a much higher rate than was possible in the case of the Pahi or migrating rayats. Indeed, this system of rack-renting went so far, that the earlier settlement officers observed that the only check to the excesses of the landlord was apprehension of the depopulation of his estates by flight of his tenants. Exactions, however, seldom induced the Thani rayat to migrate; his love of home was strong; his advantages over the Pahi rayat were manifold. He had his home where he and his fathers had lived for ages, on a plot of Chánduá exempted from rent. He had improved the lands which he knew to be his own; his classic groves and cultivated croft, his status and character among the village community in which he lived in heartfelt sympathy. Although he could not transfer his tenure, it had a high credit in the market, which enabled him to borrow largely from the village *Mahajan*.

"As far as fixed hereditary occupancy of the soil independent of the will of another can convey a title, the Thani rayat of Cuttack may be considered in some sort a proprietor of land." His rate of rent was liable to enhancement, but none would think of ejecting him so long as he paid the prescribed rent. His right was thus never precarious. The rate was increased only at the periodical settlement conducted by Government officers, and not at the will of the Zemindar, or under the conditions now prescribed by Section 17 of Act X of 1859. "According to the theory and admitted principles of the country" observes Mr. Stirling, "those rates could never be altered except on the occasion of a new general settlement undertaken by the Government, which would supersede the order of things at the preceding one." It was thus unnecessary for the zemindars to take any action for enhancement or to adopt steps for eviction. Indeed, no thought of evicting a hereditary tenant was ever entertained so long as he paid the enhanced rent assessed at each settlement, and so long as, we may

presume, the idea of an occupancy right and the law of limitation were unknown. In this view of the case it seems doubtful whether Section 17 of Act X, which enables proprietors to claim and obtain enhancement at times other than the general settlement, has been an advance on the old revenue system, or has conferred greater benefit on the Thani tenants.

The Pahi rayat was a non-resident cultivator, native of a village other than that in which his tenure lay. Whatever might be the extent of his tenure or the amount of his rent, he was never admitted into the corporate rights of the village men. He had no right of occupancy and was subject to enhancement of rent. These once tenants-at-will have, however, acquired rights of occupancy since the enactment of Act X of 1859, and, what with the decay of the village corporate body, and the provisions of the existing law, the line of distinction between the two classes of rayats is gradually fading away.

Chândná rayats are non-cultivators who hold the land on which their homes stand, and work as labourers and artizans.

*Class II.*—The history of the next class of tenures, which were service grants or Jagirs, gives an insight into the social state somewhat different from that which the Permanent Settlement has introduced into the provinces of Bengal and Bihar. It will be seen that men of almost every profession and art, from the Brahmins who officiated at religious ceremonies down to the woodcutter and washerman and the torch-bearers, had each an assignment of the village lands which they held generation after generation in lieu of wages for rendering either religious or temporal services to the village community. Wages were almost unknown, and the liberal spirit of the Hindu lauded system becomes the more conspicuous when we proceed to notice the various rent-free tenures which were created for social purposes, or for objects tending to the convenience of the community.

(1). On the head of the list of service grants stands the "*Mátíá Porichá*" (supervisor of earthwork). This supervisor of the village works had an assignment of 10 to 20 acres of land.

His business was to see to the proper execution of the earthworks and embankments, and the collection of the *Betias*, or labourers who were bound to render service. The supervisor still holds about 350 acres of land in the Kujang estate, paying little or no revenue, and they are evidently the men whose services could be utilized under the local Boards now under contemplation.

(2). The next class of tenures are the Shasnam, or grants of Brahmins, who paid only a rupee as quit-rent for one Bati, or 60 acres of land, known as "*Bati Tanke*," and two to six cocoanuts per annum. The holders also annually subscribed and presented to the Rajah one gold cord, or sacred *Poita* a year, worth 50 to 60 rupees.



These Shasnamns were the most flourishing villages in the District. They could be distinguished by the tall crests of the cocoanut trees which the Brahmins alone were privileged to plant, and by the neat dwellings within their boundaries amidst surrounding darkness and disorder. These Shasnamns were the defences of Hinduism and the repositories of Sanskrit learning.

(3). The third kind of tenures under this class have two sub-divisions ; they are generally known as the " Máfih," or land exempted from assessment.

The first is enjoyed by Karans, or men of the writer caste who pay only at half the ordinary rate of rent. The other kind of Máfih land is held by the Khasbas, or *Bhadralogs*, gentlemen who enjoy small grants, rent free. Some of these tenures have been lately reserved by the Moharaja, but some villages till hold out and pay no rent whatever.

(4). In the fourth class of Jagir lands are included all grants given to members of the village guild, retainers to the village servants, whose labour was in constant demand among the people. These servants were the *Bhandári*, or village barber, the washerman, the carpenter, the blacksmith, the village confectioner, the oilman, the weaver, the potter, the boatman, and the fisherman, the skinner and the cobbler, the basket-maker and *Paricha* or the supervisor of the guildsmen, and, last of all, the Náik, or village astrologer.

The duties of some of these village servants, it may be interesting to note. The *Bhandari*, as the name signifies, was the general store-keeper on all occasions of public feasts, marriages and funeral ceremonies ; he had charge of the stores of food and served as a barber on all the above occasions. He had also to render service at the Rajah's court for a certain time in the year, and was, moreover, the torch-bearer to benighted travellers. Each village barber keeps himself duly supplied with a store of oil and torch ; it is amusing to note the punctuality with which he comes forward at the call of the watchman whenever an officer of Government or the Rajah is in need of his services, or passes by his village-fields overnight.

Apart from his legitimate duty of washing clothes, the village Dhobi is the woodcutter throughout the province. Whenever a tree is to be felled, or wood prepared for fuel, either for domestic purposes, or for festivals, or at the time of the obsequies of the dead, the washerman's service is in demand. Men of no other caste would profane their hands by holding the axe, any more than by adopting the profession of the skinner or cobbler.

Besides serving the village community each of these men were required to attend the servants of the Rajah or the Government officer when out in camp. For the due performance of these duties a Behera, or Chief, was appointed who enjoyed a separate Jagir

The earnings of these village heads and village servants may be noted as follows:—

Names of village servants.	Assignment of land in acres.	Services or contribution to the Rajah.
1. Poricha (Porichakra)	10 to 22	×
2. Priests	10 to 100	×
3. Men of the writer-caste,	Remission of ½ rent	½ rent.
4. Karans	4 rent	10
5. Bhadracharya, Khasbaa	1 acre	8 annas per acre.
6. Bhandari, or Barber	Do.	Do.
7. Washerman	½ acre land free and ½ piece 5 for diet	
8. Carpenter	5 acres and food as wages	
9. Blacksmith	½ acre of homestead land	
10. Confectioner	½ Free wood from the jungles	
11. Oilman	½ an acre	
12. Weaver	½ to one man and free wood from jungles to make pots	
13. Potter	½ acre, 4 pice per day when catching fish	
14. Fisherman	...	
15. Gotha	½ a man	
16. Chammars	½ a man, 3 pice per day for food	
17. Basket-maker	½ to ½ man	
18. Khandait Behara, or Chief of the guildaman	5 man	
19. Náik, or astrologer	½ man	
20. Watchman	...	

Re. 1 per acre.  
Supply *Handi* at all the festivities and to Rajah's servants and officers in camp for which they are paid a pice for each *handi*.

Supplies each village *Hat* some fish at the three festivals held on the full moon day of Kartick and Pous, and the Sunya or the new year's day, and also to keep ferry and supply boats.  
Has to supply all the palm leaves required Has to supply fire-wood at festivals, creepers for ropes, posts and rafters at the annual repairs of the Rajah's kitchen.  
Has to supply palm leaves for the records which are still used in lieu of paper, and make mats.  
Supply baskets at festivals.

As none of the above men know how to read and write, a supervisor has to be appointed to write out the necessary orders and keep accounts with them.  
Prepares the Almanacs, and is the fortune-teller.  
Records births and deaths and is writer of Horoscopes.  
Area of the smallest Jagir tenure 1 Bigha.  
Do. largest Jagir 18½ Bigha.

*Class III.*—Besides the service land, we have in the rent class the regular rent-free, or *Lakhrāj* tenure, such as Debotter, Brahmotter, Baishn'ab Britti, Jogi Britti and Pirotter, the extent of which ranges from 1 to 500, and in some cases to 1,000 acres of land. (Already much land has been lost, as cases have been summarily decreed, as rent-free.)

Foremost among these grants are the endowments assigned to the Thakur Baladevjee of Kendrapara, who has two entire villages, with plots of land in a number of others, yielding altogether a rent of 884 rupees per annum. Lands were also given in free gifts to poets, musicians, and even the jugglers who contributed to the amusements of the Rajah; and the question of assessing rent on these lands is now submitted to the decision of our Courts. The grantees have the prescriptive right, while the landlord pleads the abolition of the services for which the grants were originally made.

IV. Apart from land-rent there were three kinds of taxes or cesses imposed,—the fourth and the last source of the Rajah's revenue:—

(a). The first of these was called the *Patki-jummá*, or Trade-tax. Thus the smiths pay a tax of 8 annas on each bellows, really the bamboo handle attached to leather hood, or *Phaniká*.

(b). The second was the *Mukis Nejuri*, a tax of 4 annas for every buffalo in milk that is allowed to graze in the sand hills or jungles on the seashore.

*Jhar Kharida*, or purchase of bush. Each rayat pays 1 to 2 annas per annum for the right to bring from the jungle any wood for posts for his house, and also lathis and creepers for thatching. Besides making free grants, the Rajah exercised the privilege of conferring titles for meritorious services on every class of his people, extending from his Beborta, or his minister, to the lowest huntsman and coral fisher, or the artful juggler.

From the sketch we have given above, it will be seen that the conditions of the rent-paying and rent-free class of tenants in the estate were widely different. While the superstition or the whims of a mind not fairly balanced left a large class of men in sufficient ease and affluence, the pressure of rent fell heavily in the really useful class of agriculturists, whose business-habits and liabilities prevented them from adopting an idle profession. Indeed, the bounties of the Rajahs were so great, that the present manager of Kujang writes, that the extent of the rent from grants must equal half the cultivated area of the Killa, and the more inquiry is made, the existence of more such tenures crops up to notice. Nor was the general management of the revenue department quite satisfactory. Every

village was made over to a Jamadar under a short lease, or *outbati* system, answering to the thikadars of Bihar, who at every successive settlement, at the end of three years, offered an enhanced amount of rent for the entire village with the evident intention of recouping himself by rack-renting the poor tenants. These farmers were not generally the well working *Prodhans*, or heads of villages, but, as has been truly observed by one of our settlement officers, "a duplicate set of oppressive zemindars." Nevertheless, amidst a good deal of disorder and exercise of arbitrary power on the part of the ruling chieftain, the convenience of the people and the preservation of the village government formed a subject of careful consideration. A spirit of trading industry was almost unknown. There was much apathy in developing the resources of the land to their fullest extent. Locomotion and communication little understood, migration was equally unknown. Village life consisted in satisfying the more urgent necessities of nature, in raising food-grains, building huts, attending religious ceremonies and husbanding the resources of agriculture, so as to live independently of the market. Division of labour, except in the cases where the rules of religion imposed particular occupations on particular castes, was hardly adopted. Tradition and scrupulous superstition drew a hard-and-fast line between men of different trades, or village guilds, and a spirit of mutual dependence was thus generated. Alongside of the agriculturists, it was necessary, therefore, to unite the artizans and the village servants together for the disposal of questions, religious and social, as well for the decision of temporal rights. The retention of an establishment of priests, Panchayats and their executive subordinates, extending down to the barber, the Kela, or digger, the sweeper and the watchman, was found equally urgent. Within these well defined rural limits the agriculturist, with the artizans, tradesmen and village officials, formed a corporate entity which had little interest in the concerns of the outside world. The wants of life were few, and a bazaar, or even a shop in the village for the supply of provisions, was a rare sight. But for the ceremonials and festivals established by an elaborate system of religion, the villagers' life was uneventful. Every thing was home-spun, the people generally lived from hand to mouth, employed in agricultural affairs, or broils connected with questions of caste and religion. The conservation of the village corporation and the social and religious fabric were, however, subjects of the foremost importance. The authority of the village priest, the village Panchayat and the village supervisor was great. The first two were selected village men, the latter was an official

supported by grants of land and the representative of the feudal Chieftain. Innumerable questions were submitted to the council of the village heads for consideration and decision. This jurisdiction was co-extensive with the social and religious grievances of the village community. The execution of works of public utility, the clearing of water courses and channels of irrigation, the construction of grain *Bheris*, or embankments, village sanitation and repairs of the village temple at the expense, and with the aid, of the villagers, were the first items of duty. Next to these, the disposal of social questions arising out of marriage, offences against the rules of castes, ranging from abduction and illicit intercourse of the sexes down to the profane touch of the Paria, and other petty disputes, fell within the jurisdiction of the village council. In short, the members transacted all matters tending to the common welfare or amusement. The provision of funds and their administration for the above purposes were also entrusted to the village heads; nor were funds wanted when the raising of subscriptions under the various names of Mathot, Magan, Chand, rested in the hands of these village elders. Indeed, no marriage took place, no common or petty offence was detected, no party disputes were reconciled, no caste question was decided, which did not add to the village funds. These institutions, indeed, were founded on the suffrage of the entire nation; and therefore retained an element of stability and vitality which survived the commotions of ages. The Hindu sovereigns of Orissa were overturned by the Pathans, the Moguls turned out the Pathans, and were in their turn turned out by the Marhattas. Each set of sovereigns had their own polity and code of regulations, but they no more touched or disturbed these village institutions than the roar of the sea disturbs the sleep of the young eagle in the solitude of its native mountain.

It was left, however, to existing regulations, to Land Settlements, Rent Laws, Penal and Criminal Procedure Codes, to give a rude shock to these ancient and useful institutions. We will trace their decay step by step. The land-revenue settlement of the Cuttack District absolved the zemindars from all police and administrative duties. The smallest exercise of the latter functions came to be watched with jealousy and visited with severe punishment. From the heads of the social fabric the landlords dwindled to mere rent-collectors, and all institutions which flourished and lived with their permission and their authority, commenced, from the earliest days of British rule, to fall and fade away. The public servants and the humblest police assumed the functions of the village heads and threatened the members of the village, *Bhalo Manushya* (good men as the umpires were styled), with penal consequences if detected in the legitimate exercise of their duties sanctioned

by prescription and age. It has been already stated here that the chieftains of the Killajat, termed Rajas at the settlements, in time became ordinary zemindars; their functions were curtailed, and, bereft of all other sources of income, they made it a point to increase their revenue by the gradual absorption of the service lands which supported the village servants. Some, indeed, and the most necessary ones, yet survive, but others have vanished, and large areas of land, which properly belonged to the public, have been turned into private property of the Zemindar here as elsewhere throughout the country. The loss in this respect to the public, and ultimately to Government, has been irreparable. The social and official influence of the village heads and the village Panchayats has disappeared. Their power of raising funds even for the most beneficial purposes has been challenged and gradually set at naught. Zealous public servants, more anxious to foster their own authority than promote the public wealth, treated every attempt at a village organisation with severity and hardship; one had to raise the cant of "illegal cess" to command the sympathy of the local authority, until, however, in the course of time, in some instances, these cesses have been legalised, though raised by a different and more costly agency, yet for precisely the same objects as ever. In the meantime, however, the resumption of the service land, the abolition of the posts of village officials, and the fear of the law, have completely disorganized the village institutions. No doubt, in one way, it has tended to great good. A wise code of laws and administrative vigour have tended to the growth of individual rights. Exactions at the hands of the landlord and village managers have decreased, and the rayat has learnt to know his rights and is learning to hold them firmly. But at the same time the decay of corporate rights has resulted in some evil to the country generally. It can hardly be denied that great care for the individual has led to the decline of a public body whose function, on the whole, was beneficial to the general community. It could be invoked by the poorest rayat at the smallest cost. Under the existing system a more expensive mode of litigation has, however, become the general fashion. We congratulate ourselves annually on the growing elasticity of the public revenues, on the increased proceeds of the Judicial Stamp duty, increased profits of Jail industry, increased receipts of Judicial fines and deposits. But do not these increased receipts represent largely outlay from the funds of the village agriculturists? Do not the receipts under each of the above heads at times absorb the savings of entire classes and entire villages engaged in litigation, or carrying on actions at law? All the penalties which the village heads ever hoped to collect, all the

illegal cesses or *awabs* which the zemindars could ever aspire to extort, all the contributions which the village Panchayats ever dared to levy for village purposes, were lighter in the scale than what the rayat now pays to obtain redress and squanders in litigation. The amounts representing the so-called exactions of the village authorities were within a short space of time redistributed in the locality where the money was realized. The contributions to the stamp revenue and judicial fines, stream into the ocean of the Imperial treasury, whence the opposite current is not quick to flow out to the locality which contributes it. The formation of funds for purely local purposes would thus be a boon to the village men: in Orissa the justice of the British Raj is universally respected; but its elaborate and expensive system of Judicature is unfavorably contrasted with the cheaper indigenous institutions of old. The revival of the latter under a cheap controlling agency would no doubt recommend itself to the circumstances of the poor people of Orissa. The fashion of running to court on the most trifling causes has marred the old spirit of fellow-feeling and sympathy among the village men. The functions of the village heads and supervisors have ceased, and what has been the effect? All works of public utility have suffered; old village roads have been effaced, or overgrown with jungle, village embankments, have been gradually washed down, water channels filled in, tanks have become choked with moss and weeds, area of pasture-land has diminished, cattle have deteriorated, and the state of village sanitation has throughout the province become unsatisfactory. The amusements of the people also, which tended to ward off the gloom of rural life, have suffered from the decay of the influence of the corporate body which formerly provided the necessary funds. The promotion of the local boards and the local unions would thus be a very wholesome, as well as a timely measure. The laws on the subject would merely necessitate institutions which were permitted to fall into decay because their utility was never before properly enquired into. When these proposed Local Boards are formed, it may be found that the local rates which had the sanction of custom and were quietly levied, were not so obnoxious in their objects as has been hitherto supposed. They have, as occasion required, received the sanction of Government in somewhat different garbs, as there was a measure of wisdom in these humble indigenous institutions which went for a long time unrecognised. Nor is this to be wondered at: we live under the auspices of legislators whose measures, as has been shrewdly observed, are never above the necessity of revision. Whether from want of forethought, or leniency towards their own cherished ideas, or reluctance to grasp at vexed questions, or from the mere

love of change, or say desire of progress, their legislative measures change with a speed which keeps pace only with their advanced modes of locomotion. Our Legislative Council is a standing committee of change, whose aim seems to be to thrust on the country new codes with the best of objects, but with little consideration for the old and hallowed institutions which they are made to supersede or the influence which they are likely to exert over native society. Errors have not therefore been unfrequent, or their acknowledgment less so. The amended Acts are numerous and as speedily introduced as the original codes are hurriedly passed. But great minds are open to conviction, and we feel assured that, should our legislators stoop to enquire into the efficacy of the indigenous measures and existing native institutions, they might be satisfied, in many instances, that practical wisdom is not the monopoly of any particular nation. It would be well, therefore, if the efficacy of existing institutions were properly weighed before they are condemned one day as sources of irremediable evil, to be hailed back at another time in a new garb, as measures of great and original reform.

Much anxiety, indeed, has ever been felt to improve the condition of the rayat, to protect him from exactions and to confer on him fresh privileges; but what has been the effect of the rent-law, of the occupancy and tenancy rights, as compared with the old revenue system of the country? While the law has conferred new rights on the tenants, his sense of security in the tenure has suffered. Very unfortunately, mutual good understanding between the landlord and the tenant in the country has declined. Rayats, indeed, have partly prospered everywhere in the country, but this is owing to those influences under which the country is generally advancing, rather than to the definition of tenant-right, or the grant of privileges by the rent-law alone. The landlords have exercised more actively of late the rights to evict and to enhance rent, than was the case when the right of occupancy rested on custom and not legislative enactment. They have also grown more exacting and uncompromising in realising rent now than when there was no law of limitation of three years. The relief, indeed, given by Act X of 1859, has been considered so small and unsatisfactory, that it is now intended to enact laws aiming at the opposite extreme, and tending virtually to transfer rights hitherto vested in the proprietors. It is certainly the duty of the ruling power to enact rules, to encourage rayats to industry, and secure them in the fruits of that industry. But the great question to be solved is, should these objects be attained by the total extinction of the existing rights of any other class of men, or should these be so qualified as not to



over-step the bounds which divide the use of privileges from their abuse. Amidst discord and disputes regarding the rate of rent and its collection, the one idea in former times, equally entertained by landlords and tenants, was that their best interests in the long run were identical. Has the tendency of the rent laws been to strengthen that belief or to create a spirit of jealousy, if not of opposition, between the two classes? More tenancy rights have immersed the people in more debt. They have benefited the money-lender more than those for whom they were intended, for privileges can benefit those only who know how to use them.

The general indebtedness of the rayats has been urged as a reason for extending to him greater protection. The reform of the rent-law of the country has thus been suggested as a way of rendering the rayat independent of the landlord. But how did this indebtedness arise? For the purposes of agricultural operations the rayat wants money as much as the showers of heaven. Generally speaking, his holding is large enough for his support only in ordinary years. Little is left to him for laying by a provision for a rainy day. In this country, where a good outturn of crops depends on the chances of the seasons, where the payment of rent or the provision of food is facilitated, or not, as the clouds may melt at a particular season or not, when help has to be taken of a capitalist on marriage as well as funeral occasions, on the occurrence of a cyclone, or a destructive fire, during a season of disease or cattle-plague, or one of extraordinary drought or extraordinary flood, sympathy and co-operation between the landlord, as the local capitalist, and the rayat, is a matter of the greatest importance. So long as the last grains of such a good feeling remained, enhancement of rent and eviction were never thought of, but as the exceptional punishment for insubordination or systematic refusal of payment of rent. The Zemindar thought it as much his duty to advance seed-grain, supply funds for purchase of agricultural implements and cattle, and take all other steps for the conduct of agricultural operations and to prove the guardian of the people, as to support his own family. The rayat had, indeed, to pay back the advances he took with interest, and with large interest, to the Zemindar. But the convenience of the tenant and the prosperity of the season were consulted. There was no hurry, no fear of lapses, or of the law of limitation to hasten an adjustment. Nor were there any court fees, lawyers' fees, registration fees, or commissions to pay. There was, indeed, a chronic burden to bear. Has it been made light, however, by the recent laws, or have the latter merely conjured up a duplicate set of oppressions? "We have found," said the Famine Commission, "no reason to believe that

the agricultural population of India have at any known period of History been generally free from debt." "The recourse of zemindars and cultivators to money lenders has the effect of diverting much of the rental fund from the proprietors to usurers, and Government has thereby lost a serious amount of revenue." It was then a convenient and safe system of banking when the landlord and the *Mahajan* happened to be same individual. The rate of interest on arrears of rent was smaller than that charged by the money-lender, and was therefore no less advantageous to the rayat than to the Zemindar. So far as Orissa is concerned, great changes have come over those relations. On the 23rd May 1817, in a letter to the Board of Revenue, Mr. Collector Trowser wrote, "The country has decayed ever since the Marhatta conquest; under the Moguls it was happy and prosperous. Our first assessment exceeded even the collection of the Marhattas by a lakh of rupees, to say nothing of other taxation and *Salâmi*, &c., to the Amlâ at each new settlement" At the same time the revenue sale law was put into force with great rigidity, so that between the years 1805 and 1818-9 no less than 1,129 estates, bearing a jama of Rupees 965,958, were sold for arrears. Many of those estates were sold more than once in the same year. One was even sold seven times in four years, one six times in the same period, another three times in three years, and a fourth four times in five years. Another officer wrote: "Public sales, instead of being the last resort, had in Orissa been the first and only one. The practice of issuing written demands for arrears of revenue fell into disuse at a very early period." "These measures ruined the old Uriya zemindars and transferred their lands to absentee Bengali zemindars and the Amlâ of the Courts." The zemindar, as the local capitalist, thus became extinct, and the rayat was thrown on the mercy of a new class of village *Mahajans*, or money lenders, whose practice has proved "fatal to all successful agricultural enterprise" throughout the country. In another important respect also the Government itself receded from the people. It has ceased to make advances which "had formed an integral part of the Imperial Revenue system." The zemindars have, in their turn, followed the example of Government. Tucavi advances have fallen into disuse. The *Mahajan's* rate of interest has thus disproportionately increased, and no wonder that the borrowing portion of the people of Orissa have taken rank among those "individuals or classes who have fallen into deeper embarrassment than was common under the native dynasties which preceded it." On what measures, then, does the emancipation of the rayats depend? Not merely on tenancy titles, occupancy rights, or transferability of holdings, but on conditions entirely different: ability to make head against the reverses of the seasons and freedom from indebtedness.

Ignorant and poor, the rayat cannot also be expected at present to make head against intelligence and wealth. Under present circumstances no fighting will avail. You may enfranchise the rayat from the hold of the Zemindar, but how do you mean to save him from the casualties of the seasons or from the clutches of the *Mahajan*? The prosperity of the people must depend more on the strength and well-regulated conduct of its individual members than the privileges conferred on it by the Legislature. We must hesitate to create rights and grant privileges which cannot be used to advantage, but would merely tend to open sores and create jealousy between classes among which a spirit of sympathy is most desirable. The condition of the people can not be suddenly and adequately raised by mere legislative acts or administrative vigilance. We should at the same time attempt to uplift the load of ignorance which the mass of the Uriya people have been for years sadly groaning under. In no other part of the country are the wants of education more urgent. Dispel the darkness of their provoking ignorance, teach them a knowledge of their own rights, and the Uriyas will not only use their rights for their own good, but rebuild the revenue system of the country on the broad basis of knowledge. The Government, indeed, is so sensible of the weakness of the tenant, that the provisions of the proposed rent bill appear to have been drafted more with a view to its introduction among idiots, minors and wards than among agents that are free—(*Vide* sections 59 and 60, *et seq.* of the Tenancy Bill.)

In the relation of landlord and tenant scarcely any friction is observed in Orissa; the existing rent-law gives ample protection to all classes. The province has fortunately very minute records of tenures and tenant-rights prepared at each successive settlement of the land-revenue after elaborate investigation. Every field has its number and class in the village field book. The village accountant, or Patwari's papers of classification and collection, are filed at the district offices year after year. It has also a local agency in the Purgannah,—Canongoes, who are daily engaged in taking notes of agricultural prospects and operations and embodying agricultural statistics which materially help the revenue officers in the disposal of questions regarding land and rent.

The right of occupancy and the right of enhancement have not placed the tenantry on a precarious footing. The difficulty experienced in finding the local measure of land or the local rate of rent, in classifying the different descriptions of land and in deciding what would be a fair and equitable rate in claims of enhancement, which have exercised the minds of the judges in Bengal, and is said to have established the necessity for amending the rent-law, is not felt in Orissa. Those difficulties can be experienced in

Districts only where a most important duty was originally neglected or delegated to the proprietors, *viz.*, the record of the rights of the tenants. They require, however, that the existing rights should be ascertained and recorded, rather than new rights created, or existing ones extinguished, or indigenous ideas regarding property and existing customs ignored. A reform in the usury law, the establishment of agricultural banks, or loan offices, the restoration of the local system of Tucavi advances for agricultural operations, are probably more urgently wanted than amendments in the existing rent-law. A tenancy bill to disturb existing relations, without adequate provisions to extricate the rayat from chronic indebtedness, would not alone, under present circumstances, secure freedom to the rayat.

C. S. B.

---

## ART. IV.—TRANSMIGRATION OF SOULS.

### 1.

#### *Solidarity and Continuity.*

**M.** COMTE rests his system of universal morality virtually upon certain simple ideas conveyed by the two words *Solidarity* and *Continuity*. The one represents that feature of man's social life which puts together the varied experiences of different men in any given unit of time as a net result of many forces, *i. e.*, in the form of a general consensus, or like many rays of light brought into a common focus. *Continuity* suggests what follows, when this consensus is viewed as carried forward in the course of time. It serves, as it were, to project the successive pictures of each unit of time, upon the same spot in the mental background, and yields at last something like a polyorama, representing what is especially the *HUMAN* at once in the past, the present, and the future. There is between man and man a divergence as well as a convergence, but the aggregate result thereof, whether by addition or by subtraction, is fairly proved to be definite, by facts showing the historic truth of men's collective existence. And the sum of a series of such aggregates, each confined to a certain space of time, though far from being wholly true of every one, must still be generally true of all of the elements which may have been brought together.

The doctrine, broad as I believe it to be, may thus be presented as a simple truism. That which is common to a given number of phenomena, is true of them all. That which is true of all, is true of each. Exceptions certainly there must be ; but for purposes of generalisation, as well as for regulating our activity, they may be put aside. It is only necessary to understand the process by which the aggregate is made up, and the totality will present a distinct image.

Modern Science takes facts as they are ; assumes a kind of fixity in phenomena, and as apart from the observation thereof, and, taking the phenomena variously, as observed at different points and successive moments. Science, strikes a sum-total, and in doing so fairly eliminates what may have been peculiar to each observer. Man now distrusts himself more than he does the outer world, and we therefore compare notes as between one observer and another. And thus, where the notes coincide, a safe basis is obtained for our mutual guidance in spite of the impossibility of knowing *the absolute*.

What is acceptable to one is tested by the experience of another. And the same process is also applied to successive experiences of each and of all. And the result obtained is what we call man's wisdom : an aggregate not of absolute truths, but of opinions accepted by the *soi-disant* ALL.

Each man's observation, however, to be made broad enough, must be extended as far as human thought can reach. And, in fact, our memory generally helps us to project upon the same background, the successive experiences of our own lives. The skill of the operator, indeed, is taxed not a little, in arranging the relative proportions of the various images brought together in this mental polyorama ; but the collocation assumedly effected by the same agent is a phenomenon no less substantial than each of the distinct experiences put together ; for the integral character of a whole life's experience is not now called in question, the man's mental identity being inferred from his physical individualism. Such, then, are our ultimate units.

But between one individual and another the separation is wider and oftener perceived to be such. Hence that which pleases one man in the rose, needs to be carefully compared with the source of another man's gratification in or about the same object. Here, as it were, the screen on which the image has to be projected is itself uncertain, and the size and proportion of each focus, as well as the portion of the screen occupied by each and all of them are all sources of the utmost perplexity.

However, the gulf between one individual and another has been bridged, and the units are massed even from day to day, and all by that most wonderful of all our inventions—LANGUAGE. Moreover, commercial intercourse promises to furnish means to bring into a still more complex focus all the languages of the world. Imperfect as this contrivance (a common language) may be, there can be no question that it imparts a powerful vitality to the solidarity of men ; but this growing solidarity arising from different languages interpreting one into another, collects the continuity of each nation into a common whole of which the vastness is enough to gratify all the normal requirements of human contemplation and meditation.

After all, then, solidarity and continuity respectively represent only the language and the history of mankind. Language, when regarded not as the instrument but as the product of human utterance, masses into an audible and visible whole those super-spiritual entities, the thoughts and feelings of the human being ; history collects these varied masses for sociology to systematize into science, and sociology leads quietly on to the science of morals,

2. But let us for one moment try to forget the gigantic power that we now wield with these two grand heritages from the past. Let us forget how man can thus penetrate into the mind of man, and how individual men may be leavened together into one uniform mass. Let us forget, too, that the records of one age furnish, with those of another, the materials for an induction which must effectively resist all scepticism in any questions of prime necessity to man. And let us then try to discover a means which, however feeble, when compared with our present possessions, would somehow gratify our craving for the ethical products derivable from language and history. The idea is obviously bewildering. But let us ply our imagination a little even in dull prose.

Our first requisite is, that the soul of one being should penetrate into the body of another, and that this should be done otherwise than by language. Now, if John may not by language pass into the soul of James so as to move James' body, as if it were his own, we shall suppose him by some supernatural agency to effect the entrance, and thus attain the wished-for end. Thus we will assume, James comes to think and feel as John had done, except in so far as the body out of which John had passed happened to yield experiences peculiar to himself. If, originally, James was white and John black the transformation would require James' soul to get accustomed to the black complexion of John as his own. Such special experiences, however, of John or James may be easily left out of account as foreign to either. And the result of the process adverted to, will be a mass of experience common to John and James both.

Our next requisite is, that the experiences of one age should be added to those of another. History is the modern means to attain this end. An allied instrument may also be traced in the doctrine of heredity. For just as a nation's character is depicted by the aggregate of what is traced in its history, from year to year, so the life of each individual is understood to contain in itself the habits of all his ancestors. But we have given up history, as if it were unavailable, and heredity is, after all, too feeble to gather the nice and varied experiences of the past to the extent we require. So we shall suppose that the same human soul has the power to occupy one body after another, as they are successively cast out in the course of natural death. The experiences of successive existences would thus live, though the material receptacles which held them from time to time had been reduced into atoms, and the memory of those experiences might revive at some stage or other, though it had undergone an indefinite period of hybernation.

To sum up: let us suppose that the soul can pass from one body into another, and collect, of and in itself, the varied experiences, such

as would be yielded by different people and in successive generations, and we shall conceive of an instrument which would serve us well enough instead of language and history both. The acquisition of such an instrument may be as hopeless as the philosopher's-stone or elixir vite. But the conception is clear and precise enough. And there is no doubt that the ends of solidarity and continuity could be attained, and by a royal road too, with the help of the hypothetical process above described. Nothing could so enable us to wind ourselves into one another and produce a solid consensus, nothing so to carry us from age to age in order to yield a ripe philosophy as this supposed supernal means, binding as it were, all sorts of beings, and removing the cold obstruction of death itself. I say, all sorts of beings, for the process would apply equally to man, beast, or even in-ert matter, being independent of all such human instruments of acquiring wisdom as speech, language or history.

3. Where is the good of such a ludicrously impossible conception? The good of it is, that such a conception is a historical fact, and, therefore, useful for the very ends of man's solidarity and continuity.

The Hindus have a department of literature known by the name of "Yog Philosophy," which might be better called Yog mysteries, and adepts in the art were believed to be able to leave their own bodies and pass into those of others. "When a Yogi knows the process . . . he can enter . . . into the body of another, whether it be dead or alive . . . And the Yogi who has entered another body uses it as his own." \*

These mysteries have fallen into decadence for reasons which may be diversely described by friends and opponents as natural growth of wisdom, or as fading popularity and extinction of teachers. But, whether as part of them, or as an independent product of the human mind, another doctrine exists, and is implicitly accepted by a considerable portion of the human population. I allude to the doctrine of transmigration.

4. Transmigration is generally regarded by several Asiatic peoples, as distinct from the processes of Yog mysteries. In the one case, the soul passes from one body to another after death, the common fate of men, and in the other, the effects of death can be counteracted at the will of the Yogi. But for collecting into one mass the experiences of different beings and times, both the conceptions are pretty much on a par.

This doctrine viewed barely as a subjective construction has, however, had a remarkable influence in the education of the



Indian mind. It comports at once with the Buddhist doctrine that it is nothingness alone which exists, and with the pantheism of the Hindu and the Buddhists, that the grandest and the sole existent being is the ALL. It comports with a belief in the dogma that cause is অনাথা নিদ্বিশূন্য নিরুতা পূৰ্ণবৰ্ত্তিতা i.e., uniform antecedence (effectuation in any other manner being absent), as well as with the belief in the existence of innumerable orders of imaginary beings possessing extra-human powers, such as the Devas, the Gandharvas, Yak'has, Kinnaras, and even the speaking monkeys, and so forth. It is acceptable as much to the fatalist or the evolutionist, as to the man who believes in astrology and refuses to assume the personal identity of the individual. It is consistent at once with the convictions of the self-immolating *Sati* (Hindu widow) and Gymnosophist, the mysterious Yogi, the Tantric debauchee and the ecstatic Vishnuvite. It is vigorously endorsed by the apparently inert mind of the Hindu woman and proletary, and it would not be rejected by the transcendental and accomplished professor who claims to look upon the religion of Humanity as a chapter of Tantric Philosophy.

5. I have endeavoured only to draw attention to this doctrine, but I do not venture to substantiate that, between the elements which make up the doctrine of solidarity and continuity on the one hand, and those which have gone to build up this Hindu conception, on the other, the wide discrepancy has to be accounted for by what in Comte's system is set forth under the hierarchy of the sciences. But what shall we say of the primitive people of India who also sought to establish their ethics apart from revelation and theory upon a merely subjective construction, and one which could at one time serve so well as a substitute for both cosmology and sociology,—a people with whom such an elaborate and well considered fiction as the theory of transmigration could grow to be regarded as objective truth?

## *II. Transmigration in relation to development of Bodhi-knowledge.*

1.. "The merits of a Tathagata (Buddhist saint) are that he is perfectly enlightened, learned, well conducted, well bestowed, that he is perfectly conversant with the ways of men, he is without a superior, he has a complete control over the senses." This we learn from the valuable book recently brought out by Dr. R. Mitra, entitled *Nepalèse Buddhist Literature* (see p. 208.) Elsewhere we read as follows:—"When the Lord was on the Gridhrakuta hill, Maudgalyayana, son of Sari, vanished like a fire when the fuel had been burnt out. The Bhikkhus (mendicant Buddhists) asked the Lord if this was his final deliverance, or

the lot which his forefathers had been destined to. The Lord said, Maudgalyayana had obtained final deliverance, and not the lot of his forefathers, and then recounted the former history of the departed hermits." Then follows a story of one Chandraprabha, a king of a city called Bhadrasila, concluding in the following words:—

The Lord said:—"The town which formerly was Bhadrasila is now called Takshasila. He who was king Chandraprabha is now myself, the two ministers (of the king in the story) are now Sariputra and Maudgalyayana, and Rudraksha, the beggar Brahman, is Devadatta" (p. 310)

The founder of Buddhism was, indeed, believed to have gone through many existences. And from the case of Maudgalyayana we learn that the education thus received would point only to the final deliverance called *Nirvan*. There were also innumerable model-men (Tathagatas), each without a superior, and one essentially like another in the possession of Bodhi knowledge. Thus each saint, however imaginary, was a model-man and the outcome of the education afforded by many existences. And, considering that each of these fictitious existences must have been drawn from at least supposed types in contemporary life, we infer that the Buddhist Saint, or Tathagata, represented in one sense, the solidarity of all his constituent types; and that the long range of time given to his growth, coupled with the notions of permanence characteristic of primitive history, not unnaturally precluded all thought of a further development in the future. There was a continuity distinctly recognised, in this education covering several existences. But the continuity was one at last determined by the perfection of the Saint. On the other hand, a succession of the Tathagatas was accepted to keep up the continuity of the perfect founder, though necessarily without any further development in his wisdom or character.

2. We are told also that when the Lord suffered himself, as Chandraprabha, to be decapitated at the instance of his great enemy Devadatta, he was anxious not only for Bodhi knowledge—"acquiring which, one may control the uncontrollable, restrain the unrestrainable, redeem the condemned, and quench the unquenchable"—but he desired his remains to be preserved in a *charitya* (tomb, monument, &c.) In other words, we see that the Buddhist conception of the Tathagata had not only formed a perfect model from mundane elements, but had coupled with it an element of a quite incongruous kind, *viz.*, a solicitude entirely inconsistent with the character of Nirvana, or perfection, such as would be acceptable to the Indian mind, whether Buddhist or Hindu. One who was conceived to be constantly looking forward to final deliverance, and with whom the highest ambition was a state of

perfect unconcern with the affairs of the world, even such a one, we see, was giving specific directions about the keeping of his relics after death; even such one was solicitous about a *chaitya*, of which the rational significance could only be to furnish a solemn remembrancer of his holy teachings, certainly a most valuable instrument of man's moral education and activity.

That the doctrine of transmigration was actually resorted to as an instrument of education, would also appear from the story of a whale which, more sensible than that of Jonah, not only vomited out certain Buddhist merchants in the situation of the Hebrew Prophet, but, struck by their miraculous deliverance, thenceforth "ceased to be a carnivorous animal, and died for want of proper food." And then the whale's putrid carcass was thrown on the sea-shore "where the bones formed a hill of no small height." Meantime the penitent whale was born again, and in the family of a Brahman. But even as a babe, and despite his subsequent conversion to Buddhism, he could not get quite rid of the taint of heredity. His whale-like voracity survived his cetacean existence, and rendered him, both as child and man, a veritable pest of society. Eventually the Lord came to his help. And here at last we find the rationale of what would otherwise have been a mere nursery tale. The Lord "took him to the above mentioned bone-hill and reminded him of his doings in his previous existence which exerted in his mind a feeling of resignation. He obtained Arhatship from Lord Buddha."—(*Do.* pp. 71-72.)

3. I cannot venture to assert that the genesis of the Tantric or Sivite symbols, is to be found in the logic of the Buddhist *chaitya*. But certain it is, that the originator of the conception of Bodhi-knowledge, attempted to break through the sanctity and continuity of the Vedic word (Veda is knowledge, and knowledge enshrined in sacred and unbeginning words), and that this primitive revolution, whilst violating the ties of caste, naturally led to the formation of the Buddhist congregation called *संघ* (*Sangha*). These two first principles, *Buddha* (knowledge) and *Sangha*, seem, however, to have early proved insufficient. And the exigencies of propagating Bodhi-knowledge, in and around the new organization, must have suggested the third principle *Dharma* (religious feelings,) which then went to form the Buddhist Triad. Mere knowledge is after all a feeble influence as compared with feelings, whether good or bad. So that feeling could not fail to be early recognised as an indispensable instrument with a view to perfect the mind and gratify the heart. And then, not only did these abstract conceptions crystallize into definite images, like those of the abstract Triad, knowledge, society and religious feeling, but material representations of such images, as well symbols of a more pronounced character, to help meditation, were also called

into requisition. These symbols, often mistaken for fetiches or images of divine beings, are after all a valuable help to the mind. They ought at least to recall by their very sight, long trains of definite ideas, which would be the natural antecedents of appropriate feelings and consequent activity. In any case, subjectivism of this kind should least deserve to be scorned or condemned as objective, useless, and stupid, or as vicious idolatry, in an age remarkable alike for its doctrines of hero-worship and æstheticism and for its scientific views of historic development.

4. We have thus for our data certain felt wants of quite a definite character. First of all, the congregation of Buddhists, whose size and condition would naturally suggest the inquiry, how knowledge of an admittedly most abstract kind was to be instilled into the minds of people taken indiscriminately from all castes of the primitive Hindu Society. Then there was the subjective construction termed *Dharma* (religious feeling). In other words, a spiritual condition of the human being, was invoked, evidently with a view to supplement the comparatively barren dogmas about Buddha and Saugha. Finally we know that mnemonic instruments—to wit the Triad,—were laid hold of both as ideas and images in furtherance of the same propagandist movement. But an element suggesting *growth* was still sadly wanted; and this must have been felt all the more keenly when the opposing orthodox school of Brahmins naturally plumed themselves upon having taken generations to cultivate their Vedic knowledge. Hence, I suppose, it would not be surprising if the then widely prevalent doctrine of transmigration had been utilized to suggest a way of perfecting Bodhi—i. e., the new substitute for Vedic—knowledge. And evidence has been adduced to show how the perfection of the Tathagata was made a matter of gradual evolution upon the basis of the prevailing notions of cosmology.

5. The extract given in the foot-note, from the Bhagavad Gita, will probably also yield a link between the Buddhist and Hindu conceptions of the perfect man, the Tathagata, and the Avatar\*. The Vishnuvite conception has, however, a more theological character, and evinces no traces of the gradual development

---

\* The Holy One spoke : 'I delivered this imperishable doctrine of Yoga to Vivasvat. Vivasvat declared it to Manu, Manu told it to Ikshvaku. Thus the Rajarshis learnt it, handed down from one to another. During a considerable period of time this doctrine has been lost in the world, O harasser of the foes, I have now explained to thee this same ancient doctrine, (as I considered) that thou wert both my worshipper and my friend. For this mystery is very important.'

Arjuna spoke : 'Thy birth was posterior, that of Vivasvat anterior. How shall I comprehend this (that thou sayest) "I was the first to declare it?"'

characterising human existence. Consequently the doctrine of Transmigration here loses an important significance and helps only to establish a continuity in the one eternal and perfect, but concrete and human instructor. Thus it would seem that the human conception of the Tathagata has been subjected to a process of excision in order to furnish forth the conception of the Avatur, and must, as such, be held as the more primitive of the two, whatever may have been its actual history or may yet be the result of the present researches in Indian chronology of doubtful value.

### III.

#### *Transmigration in relation to Yog.*

1. The doctrine of Transmigration, thus viewed in connection with Buddhism, may possibly furnish another key to the history of the Hindu mind. It is generally accepted that the founder of Buddhism, on renouncing his worldly career, took for a time to the practice of Yog mysteries, and then left them off in order to spread the gospel of his subsequent inspiration—the tenets of the Buddhist religion. Now the mysteries of Yog are supposed to have emanated from Siva; Siva is known by the significant name of Yajñari, i. e., the enemy of Yâg, and Yâg again is unmistakably suggestive of Vedic rites. In other words, Yog is to be regarded as antagonistic to Vedic worship and antecedent to Buddhist revolution.

Thus the substitution of Bodhi knowledge in place of Vedic knowledge appears to have been preceded by a similar attempt to substitute Yog in the place of the probably effete Yâg. The Yâg rites are usually rendered into English by the expression burnt-offerings; they were obviously connected with Feticistic worship of fire, and were supposed to yield such tangible blessings as rain, wealth, children, success, and so forth, by the mere utterance of the unbeginning, miracle-making words of the Vedas.

2. It would also seem that Yâg or Vedic worship retained its fullest influence only till the origin and development of the various

---

The Holy One spoke: 'I and thou, O Arjuna,' have passed through many trans-migrations. I know all these. Thou dost not know them, O harasser of thy foes! Even though I am unborn, of changeless essence, and the lord also of all which exist, yet, presiding over nature (Prakriti) which is mine. I am born by my own mystic power (mâyâ). For whenever there is a relaxation of duty, O son of Bharat! and an increase of impiety, I then reproduce myself for the protection of the good, and the destruction of evil-doers. I am produced in every age for the purpose of establishing duty. He who truly comprehends my divine birth and action, does not undergo regeneration when he quits the body, but comes to me, Arjuna!—*Thomson's Bhagavad Gita*, pp. 29-30.

schools of Hindu philosophy. In other words, the progress of the Hindu mind, as evidenced by these schools of philosophy, helped, and very naturally too, to displace the primitive fetichism of the Vedic times, which then ceased to be a living faith. We know that the atheistic Sankhya School explained the origin of the world upon a dualistic basis, signifying an inert and active agency, or permanence and change, rather than male and female. We know, too, that the dogma of Indian Logic, that cause is *অন্যথা সিদ্ধি শূন্য নিষত্তা পূর্ববর্তিতা* uniform antecedence, effectuation in any other manner being absent—so suprisingly in accord with the modern doctrine about relations between phenomena—was no recent discovery of the Hindu mind. Thus it would be no great wonder, if, when these ideas were evolved, the sanctity and influence of the Vedas and Vedic rites should have naturally faded away from the Hindu mind.

3. But what had they then to occupy their minds with instead ? The answer offered to this in the following paragraphs, necessarily with a large measure of conjecture, is briefly this :—a mystical knowledge called yog, which had the semblance of science, and, which if it did not originate, at all events, largely fostered, the doctrine of transmigration, and served in that regard the same purpose that modern science does to the doctrine of the solidarity and continuity of mankind.

At the time we are speaking of, algebra, geometry and astronomy had made considerable progress. But the time for mechanics had not come yet, and physics, chemistry, physiology and medicine could not pass the-empiric stage. I owe it to a venerable friend to suggest that the Yog exercises were essentially an attempt to bring under voluntary control the involuntary functions of the body. And it is well known that with this essentially human instrument they sought to attain more than the early Vedic rites had ever promised. The representative of Yog—the ascetic Siva—was the enemy of Vedic rites, and this conception obviously connects an anti-theological evolution with man's normal ambition to overmaster the forces of nature. But what is now, and to the modern world, the only means to this end—*viz.*, development of objective science, was then completely inaccessible. And thus it seems primitive unbelief attempted, by means of Yog, to cut the Gordian knot. The enemy of theologism was in this case intensely metaphysical, but the armour put on bore an unmistakeable resemblance to the positivism of true science.

In these days of Theosophic ardour, when the Hindu mind is not unnaturally tickled by genuine or make-believe admiration for

Yog, it would require a better knowledge of the physical sciences than I possess, to proclaim, with my betters, the absurdity of the occult sciences. But if the Nineteenth Century can tolerate, before the light of science, aught that savors of occultism, it cannot certainly be too much out of the way to claim for Yog a place in the history of scientific progress at a time which preceded the evolution of Buddhism itself. The perfect master of Yog, it is maintained, could do all that science ever hopes to attain and many things more. And this he could do, not by the help of Divine aid, nor even by the ultra-human agency of such imaginary beings as Pisachas, Yakshas, or Gandharvas, but by the self-directed energy of the Yogi to bring under voluntary control the involuntary functions of the human organism. Again, the processes of Yog, however deserving to be withdrawn, like nitro-glycerine and similar explosive compounds, from general access, are fully believed to be governed by nothing short of invariable laws. And thus, too, the Yogi may be classed with the ordinary votaries of physiological science. Now it was a part of the teaching of this occult science that the spirit of man might by Yog leave his own body to occupy that of another.

4. Let us suppose that, for some reason or other, the doctrine of transmigration had so strong a hold upon the early Hindu society that it survived even the belief in a god-head, and it would not be hard to conceive how the primitive scientist still revelled in vagaries about the disembodied spirit. The Vedic longings for increased longevity had not vanished with the faith in the efficacy of Vedic rites. Siva was significantly called the conqueror of Death. A Hindu Kaviraj\* (professor of medicine under the native syst.m), guiltless of any predilection for European science, once freely admitted to me that the predictions of Hindu astrology could not be consistently accepted by his fraternity, who professed to resist fate and the ravages of death, and then, by way of showing more clearly the futility of astrology, he referred to Yog, which he said was a power even higher than that of medicine.

When the study of science had not advanced far enough to restrict itself entirely to phenomena and give up all speculation about the Noumena, and when yet, by a happy guess, men had attained that grandest of all inductions, the one about invariability of relation between antecedences and sequences, it was not after all, too great an aberration of the primitive Hindu intellect, to apply the principle to entities like the disembodied spirits. And when once this positive principle was associated with such metaphysical entities, the whole host of primitive beliefs,

---

\* By name Ananda Chandra Sen, inhabitant of Konra, Sub-division, Satkhira.

however incoherent as between themselves, or inconsistent with the results of modern research, naturally laid themselves open to systematization, such as we have had in our literature and religious convictions. The doctrine of Comte, that the sciences can be best systematized with the help of subjective assumptions, has yet to fight out its way through the fatalism which underlies the current faith in the universality of spontaneous evolution. But the history of the Hindu mind clearly proves what a stable system of belief can be constructed from merely metaphysical ideas, but upon a harmonious relation between the objective and the subjective.

5. Be that as it may, we are now able to see how the doctrine of transmigration, if it survived Vedic theologism, might subserve a metaphysical belief in imaginary beings, lead to a vigorous prosecution of the occult sciences, and even establish a more or less perfect system of ethics, though history, and the universal brotherhood which results from language and commercial intercourse, were entirely wanting. And all this, I should like to account for, by showing how transmigration furnished the important teaching in respect of solidarity and continuity which is now derived from sociology and other sciences.

#### IV

#### *Sraddha and Communal Life.*

A further step in the study of the past would disclose that the primitive Fire worship of the Hindus prevailed side by side with considerable progress in industry and the abnormal solidarity of our early communal life. The family organism was somehow or other enlarged to inordinate dimensions, so that the loss or accession of individual units failed to receive the attention due to such events. The son quietly took the place of the father, and the brother that of the brother. Possibly also, the daughter had not then, as now, to be cast out, nor the wife taken from beyond the limits of the family, or rather gens. The work of tillage and pasturage went on uniformly and regardless of domestic occurrences. In such societies the Pitris (ancestors) became not unnaturally some of the most important objects of worship. But the requirements of industry, of functions of proprietorship, and of safe inheritance, seem to have suggested the fiction—"the soul is born again in the son" (ভাইরৈ জায়তে পুত্রঃ), aided, as it must have been, by the positive evidence of maternity and the no less unmistakable effects of heredity. And after the ancestral rites had once got mixed with Vedic ceremonies, even Siva, the arch-enemy of Yag, would fail to oust the faith in the existence of spirits which, on the one hand, were supposed to pass into their heirs, and on the



other, to gather around the Sraddha entertainments prepared for them from time to time.

Thus it would seem that a rapid progress of industry, which was probably due to climatic causes, became adapted to rather untoward social conditions, *viz.*, primitive communal life; an extraordinary hankering for systematization mixed up the worship of fire with that of ancestral spirits, and suggested the progress of these spirits from generation to generation. Primitive science, in the form of Yog, failed to uproot the belief in imaginary beings, though it openly rebelled against the sovereignty of the Most High. Nay, the crude conceptions of Yog, it seems, improved upon the existing preternatural beliefs and gave currency to still more marvellous stories and pretensions. Buddhism arose, and rejected the questionable morality of Yog, but it could not throw over the doctrine of transmigration. On the contrary, it seems to have utilized that doctrine for educational purposes. And this led to a spirit of anthropomorphism, both Buddhist and Hindu, which was subsequently employed to replace atheism by pantheism, and also to transform or construct a worship of cosmic forces furnishing the most elaborate cultus ever heard of. All along, however, the positive spirit involved in a sound doctrine of causation has worked upon the Hindu mind, in which a "theological temperament," rather than the genuine primitive feeling which goes by that name, is associated with a confused belief in metaphysical existences and untenable physical laws.

Is it desirable that this long evolution must now cease for ever, because we are enabled to establish our ethics and even our worship upon the cosmology and sociology of Europe? And shall it be impossible to connect our ethics, such as we find it handed down to us, logically with European progress, and historically with Indian antecedents?

JOGENDRA CHANDRA GHOSH.

---

## ART. V.—ENGLISH SPELLING AND THE SPELLING-REFORM.

(Independent Section.)

SINCE the opening of Dr. Duff's five pupil schools in 1830, higher education in India has been steadily advancing. Its history is instructive and interesting from various points of view, and it has not yet arrived at a period of still waters. One of the points now attracting attention is the improvement of our elementary and lower schools. In the code of education drafted last year by the Education Committee, a decided advance is made in the direction of science. It is proposed that in elementary (or primary) schools instruction should be given in form and colour, the uses of plants and animals, and the properties of air and water. Every teacher knows how much such instruction is needed. Even our Entrance candidates are woefully ignorant of these matters. To them lever and pulley are, as a rule, unknown: *barometer* and *gravitation* are only terms in Blandford's Physical Geography; and light and heat have no more meaning for them than for their domestics. These subjects are now laid down for the middle schools, and botany and drawing are in addition recommended as optional subjects.

Now the question must arise in the minds of thinking men whether time can be found for all this work. The standards of the code, ranging up to the Entrance Course, correspond pretty nearly, as far as the elementary subjects go, with the classes in the chief schools of the day. It is clear enough, then, that the present work of these schools is ample for the time at their command. Doubtless good management could find time for a little extra work; but in this case simple economy cannot do much. There is one of the elementary subjects on which a deal of valuable time is wasted, and that is—*English*. This is the most necessary and most difficult subject we have to teach, and we do not think enough attention is paid to it. It may seem a paradox to say that time is wasted on it, and yet enough attention is not paid to it. The explanation is simple. In the elementary schools, it takes up too much time; in the middle schools it has not enough attention. In these papers we will show that reason and experiment teach us that a great reduction can be made in the time and energy spent in teaching English. Assuming the number of working hours in a week to be twenty-five, it may fairly be said that thirteen are spent on English in elementary schools. Yet our children pass with a bad grounding to the middle school, where other subjects

cramp the study of English into, let us say, eight hours a week, and at the end of a course of seven years the result is bad composition, a poor vocabulary, little or no etymology, and unintelligible reading.

The cause of this unsatisfactory state of things is to be found in the present method of spelling English. If English spelling were phonetic, no more than eight hours a week would be required in the elementary school, for a thoroughly good grounding in the course of three years, and no more than five hours a week would be needed in the middle school to build on that foundation a nobler and sounder knowledge of the language than can now be done with eight hours' work. The time thus saved could be devoted to the subjects recommended in the code, with, perhaps, the addition of shorthand in the upper forms of middle schools.

The utter absurdity of English spelling has been shown by the leading philologists of the day, and yet how high a place among accomplishments is given to a knowledge of its eccentricities. It is the bug-bear that attends us from the nursery to the grave. As soon as the child speaks a few words distinctly, he begins his share of labour in the world by learning to spell. Passing from his mother's knee to the school form, he finds that spelling is still the most important work demanded of him. A little later, spelling has no rival as a plague, with the doubtful exception of the weights and measures. By and bye, the youth finds that there are many other branches of knowledge that he is to work at, and so much attention is not given to his spelling lessons. This he feels to be a relief, and yet, to his utter bewilderment, no private letter, no class exercise, no examination paper meets favour unless it shows such a familiarity with the received spelling as he certainly did not acquire at the "Infant School." And, then, when the youth becomes a man, and is called upon to earn his own livelihood, he sees that the spell of spelling must last 'till the spell of life is broken.'

That English spelling is really difficult to learn will easily be seen. The very alphabet, as boys in some of our elementary schools already learn from Dr Morris, is imperfect and redundant. This is the root of the evil, but it is not the whole evil. Imperfect and redundant alphabets can be and have been used consistently; but the application of the English alphabet is so whimsical that, as Mr. Ellis says, "no Englishman can tell with certainty how to pronounce any word which he has only seen written, and has not heard spoken, and no Englishman can tell with certainty how to spell any word which he has only heard spoken and has never seen written." There are, again, some languages which profess to retain in the forms of words an indication of

their origin, such as the Dutch and the Hindustani. But there is scarcely a language in which the derivations of words are so hopelessly obscured as in English. The great majority of present English spellings date no further back than the sixteenth century. English spelling, in short, is neither etymological nor historical, neither phonetic nor consistent; it is "corrupt, effete, and utterly irrational." This state of things causes a great waste of time; it is an obstacle to popular education and a hindrance to advancement. Something therefore must be done; English spelling must be reformed so as to present a tolerably good picture of English speech.

English spelling must be reformed. To most readers in India this statement seems surprisingly strange. We are told, that we are merely dogmatising, that there is no reason for our views, that a reform of English spelling is seriously to be objected to. Let us therefore hear what can be said against a spelling-reform, and if we answer the objections we shall have gained our point. This shall be the main purpose of the present article, and in a second, we will mention some further reasons for the reform. Spelling-reform is as old as spelling itself, and the arguments that will most readily occur to our readers have all been advanced before. There is at present a considerable spelling-reform, partly in England, and partly in America. The subject has been attracting great notice, and is making rapid progress in public favour. It is a strange fact, however, that although every other reform proposed in Europe is widely reported in India, this important one is hardly mentioned. We hope to be able to show that a reform is necessary, practicable, pending, of which most Indian readers and students know little or nothing.

The first important objection to a spelling-reform is the *conservative objection*. This is the most natural of all. There is, deep-seated in the human heart, a general disinclination to part with what has long been. But this feeling should not be carried to an extreme. While taking care that we do not let ourselves be tossed about by every breeze that blows, we ought to consider thoroughly all proposed schemes of reform to see if there be any real advantage to be gained by change. No man should be allowed to say on any matter, as Archbishop Trench does on this of spelling, that "custom is law here for better and for worse." This is tantamount to saying that what is bad must continue in use simply because it is now in use. It is, however, a noteworthy fact that most changes that have had the welfare of mankind for their object, have been adopted at last, though laughed at and attacked when proposed. In the words of Max Müller, "The innate regard for truth and reason, however dormant or timid at times, has

always proved irresistible in the end, enabling men to part with all they hold most dear and sacred, whether corn-laws, or Stuart dynasties, or Papal legates, or heathen idols. Nations have before now changed their numerical figures, their letters, their chronology, their weights and measures." But this is not all. The defenders of conservative spelling forget that the subject of spelling-reform must come up, some time or other, in the history of every written language. Spoken language *must* vary; changes *must* take place. Of course, there are men who meet every argument with a flat denial. Thus in the Educational Blue-Book for 1881-82, Mr. Brodie, the Inspector of Schools for the district of Worcester, says, that "pronunciation has altered very little since the days of Shakespeare." Very different is the idea of the learned writer of the article on the alphabet in the "Encyclopædia Britannica," when he says that "if Shakespeare could now stand on our stage, he would seem to speak to us in an unknown tongue." We need say no more on this remark of the last professed champion of settled spelling than that the great champions of the past Bacon, Alford, and Trench, acknowledge that pronunciation must change, and that it is continually changing.\* The argument of Bacon and Trench here is that if we alter our spelling to suit pronunciation now, we shall have to do so again and again as pronunciation keeps changing. This argument is based on a wrong hypothesis. It takes for granted that a word is something that is written, and that spoken language is only of secondary value. This opinion is very largely held in India; but the case really stands the other way. Language is essentially spoken, and written language is to be valued only in as far as it gives us a faithful representation of spoken language. This is the foundation of philology and phonetics. If, therefore, the pronunciation of any word change after a phonetic notation has been adopted, the form of that particular word should undergo a further modification. We find the following sentences in Chamber's Encyclopædia. "The Sanscrit language furnishes the most convincing proof of the originally phonetic character of alphabetic writing, for not only were the words written exactly as they were sounded, but every change which a word

---

\* We speak of Trench as a past champion, because his views are antiquated. The great philological lights of the present day are all in favour of a spelling-reform. See what Dr. Murray says: "It is not only pitiful to see the expressions of Archbishop Trench quoted against the rational reconstruction of our spelling, but

it is unfair to Dr. Trench himself, who then stood so well in the front of philology, and we may be perfectly sure that, if leisure had been given him to keep pace with the progress of science, he would now have been second to no one as a spelling-reformer."

underwent was consistently indicated by a change in the writing. Notwithstanding this fact, there is no language in which the etymological and grammatical relations of words are more clearly exhibited or more easily traced than in Sanscrit." It is also a well known fact that in phonetically represented languages pronunciation changes much more slowly than in those that have a capricious notation like the English, and this has been abundantly proved by students of Italian and Spanish. On the other hand, if a capricious spelling is considered unchangeable while the pronunciation goes on changing, the time must come when the spelling and pronunciation will bear no resemblance to each other. This has already taken place in Thibet and China. The Chinese written language is composed of several thousand word-signs instead of letters, and there are thus 1,100 ways of representing the simple vowel sound of *be*. From Dr. Tylor we learn that the Thibetans obtained their alphabet from the Sanscrit, and yet the word spelt *s-g-r-o-l-m-a* (according to Roman letters) is pronounced *dolma*, and the name of the province of which Lassa is the capital is sounded *oo*, but spelt *D-b-u-s*. There is deep wisdom in Bacon's remark. "Time is the great innovator, and if time of course alters things to the worse and wisdom and counsel shall not alter them to the better, what shall the end be?"

We will now go on to speak of some of the spelling-reforms of the past, with a view to show that the subject is by no means the crotchet of a few, that it is, indeed, as we said, inevitable in a written tongue. When the Greeks of old borrowed the alphabet from the Phœnicians, they did not take it as they found it, but made several alterations in the forms and uses of the letters, and even added to their number. They traced their characters from left to right, and employed as vowels what before were only breathings. As time went on, and education spread, the alphabet underwent continual changes, and in B. C. 403, the Athenians officially altered their spelling. The Romans adapted the Greek alphabet to their language; but they abandoned the significant names of the letters, which the Greeks had taken over from the Phœnicians, and named each letter according to the nature and quantity of its sound. The letter they used least was the Greek *kappa*, *c* representing both the sound of that letter and the hard sound of *g*. This imperfection is said to have been remedied by the keeper of the first writing school in Rome, about B. C. 230. A separate character was introduced for *g*, and *c* was kept for the sound of *kappa*. The only other glaring imperfection in the Roman alphabet was the use of *v* as both a vowel and a consonant. The Emperor Claudius proposed to adopt a turned *f* for the

consonant sound; but this and a few other attempts of the Emperors were unsuccessful. Yet the Roman notation was to a great extent phonetic, and the spelling followed the pronunciation. Professor Max Müller says, "when the copies of books could easily be counted, and when the *norma scribendi* was in the hands of a few persons, the difficulty of adapting the writing to the ever varying pronunciation of the language was comparatively small. The small minority of people who were able to read and write pleased themselves as best they could, and by timely concessions prevented a complete estrangement between the written and the spoken language." The phonetic notation of the Romans lives, with but slight change, in the modern Italian, which is therefore justly considered one of the easiest languages to learn. The language of Spain, composed as it is of various elements, had originally a most corrupt and confused spelling. The labours of Lebrixa and Aleman in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries did much to reduce it to order. The Academy then took up the work, and by repeated efforts at last succeeded, at the beginning of the present century, in bringing about so thorough a reform that the pronunciation of any word is now immediately known to one who is acquainted with the phonetic values of the letters. (See Ticknor's "Spanish Literature," part III.) In French, which is mainly derived from Latin, the written and spoken languages are very dissimilar; but the old idea of consistency is still distinctly traceable, in the use of digraphs and combinations of letters, as well as in that of single characters; and the employment of accents is an additional help. Yet see what Mr. Pagliardini says: "I may just call your attention to the fact that so far from a reform of spelling being repulsive to the feelings of philologists and great writers in France, such men as Fénelon, Labruyère, Bernardin de Saint Pierre, Voltaire, Rousseau, Charles Nodier, Firmin Didot, the Philological Society of Paris, and a host of others were favourable to phonetic spelling for the French language." In Germany, where the spelling never deviated much from the phonetic standard, there is a strong spelling-reform movement. The *Kölnische Zeitung* a very influential paper, following the example of Schleicher, has dropped all silent letters, and advocates the adoption of the Roman character. Prussia, Austria, Bavaria and Wurtemberg have now an official spelling, and the Prussian minister of education published a couple of years ago the Government rules on orthography, to be introduced into all Government and military schools. Most of the great political papers have adopted this spelling. There are also said to be good phonetic systems by Professors Rammer and Sanders. The

reform of Spelling in Holland was an accomplished fact a hundred years ago. The spelling, however, is not entirely phonetic, though very largely so ; in some instances an etymological spelling has been preferred. In England there have been several attempts at spelling-reform of more or less merit. The first great spelling reformer was the author of the *Ormulum*, in the twelfth or early part of the thirteenth century. He adopted a consistent representation of the sounds of his own dialect, and tried to introduce a uniform system of orthography. On this account his work is said by Dr. Morris to be "a mine of philological wealth." In the sixteenth century the great scholars, Sir John Cheke and Sir Thomas Smith, the latter Secretary of State to Edward VI. and Elizabeth, were in favour of a phonetic reform of spelling. There were also Thomas Churchyarde and the great schoolmaster Alexander Gil. In 1569 a writer, named John Hart, published a book printed phonetically, and recommending a reform of English spelling. In the following century, Dr. John Wilkins, the eloquent and scientific Bishop of Chester, argued strongly for a reform, and it requires no Macaulay's school-boy to discover that Milton, who had studied under Gil at St. Paul's school, in many cases, preferred a phonetic to a stereotyped spelling. But, as Marsh justly remarks, "all the old English writers on orthography and pronunciation fail alike in the want of clear and descriptive analysis of sounds, and the illustration by comparison with the orthoepy of other languages more stable and uniform in articulation." And this was the cause of their failure in carrying a reform. The only way to effect a reform of spelling is to analyse carefully, and yet not too fastidiously, the sounds of the language, and this is what is done by the best spelling-reformers of the present day. Among the reformers of the last century and the early part of the present, the names of Benjamin Franklin and Noah Webster will live to show that America has not been behindhand in this effort to cast aside a pet abuse. Dr. Franklin was in favour of a strictly phonetic notation, and Dr. Webster, working in the time of Lowth and Walker, changed the spelling of hundreds of words on the grounds of analogy and etymology.

The next important objection to a phonetic spelling reform is, that "the derivations of words, especially from foreign languages, are utterly defaced and extinguished," or, as Trench puts it, that "it would obliterate those clear marks of birth and parentage which words out of number bear now upon their very fronts, or are ready upon a very slight interrogation to declare to us." Now it might and should be considered a sufficient answer to such an objection that it is not



the purpose of alphabetic writing to teach etymology. This answer acquires additional weight from the testimony of such men as Professor Sayce and Mr. Ellis. The former says, "Historical comparative philology is based on the assumption that Sanskrit, Greek, Latin, Gothic, or any other of the ancient tongues were pronounced, roughly speaking, as we find them spelt, and it is upon this assumption that the laws of letter change and the whole framework of modern philology have been built." Mr. Ellis is even more explicit. "Those," he says, "who will be at the pains to examine any *original language*, such as the Sanskrit, the Phœnician, the Arabic, the Gothic, the Russian, or the Cherokee, will at once perceive that the fundamental idea which actuated their inventors, was, to create a set of symbols, sufficiently distinct in outline and easy of formation, which should correspond with the elementary sounds of any particular language, in such a way, that the sight of any combination of symbols should instantly re-call the correspondent combination of elementary sounds to one familiar with the language; and conversely, that the hearing of any combination of those elementary sounds which were considered in the invention of an alphabet, should instantly suggest to one who is familiar with its use, the correspondent combination of symbols. In other words, all original alphabets are essentially phonetic." That alphabetic writing was originally phonetic the upholders of the present orthography cannot and do not deny. They seem to glory in the changes of the past, but shudder at further change. In the actual using of words, moreover, whether in speaking or writing, we never stop to think of their derivation, and only exceptionally of their relation to the words of other languages. If we know the correct meanings of the words we use and are sure that we use them in a received sense, we are content. And then, again, the number of the students of etymology is very small in proportion to the number of general readers and writers, for most men take etymology on trust.

But the believer in etymological spelling is not to be so easily satisfied. And we will go on to show what we said above, that our present spelling is *not* etymological. There are hundreds of unetymological spellings in English, but time and space will admit of our noticing only the typical words of two of the most important classes of such spellings, those that entirely fail to suggest their etymons, and those that are positively misleading as to their derivation.

It is a strange fact that the majority of etymological objectors among Indian students are but disciples of Archbishop Trench, and feebly echo his plea that 'in English words a letter silent to the ear is yet most eloquent to the eye,—the *g*, for instance, in *deign*,

*reign*, and *impugn*, telling as it does of *dignor*, *regno*, and *impugno*; even as the *b* in *debt* and *doubt* is not idle, but tells of *debitum* and *dubium*.<sup>\*</sup> All these words will be noticed in their proper place. Suffice it here to say, that the *g* lauded by Trench is not used systematically. If it is to appear in *deign*, why not in *disdain*? if in *reign*, why not in *rule* and *realm*? if in *impugn*, why not in *poniard*? But it is even stranger than this to find Trench, after speaking up thus boldly for the existing spelling on etymological grounds, actually going on to prove, in the most conclusive way, that English spelling is by no means etymological. Among the words he cites for examination are *scent*, *ceiling*, *ell*, and these come under the first class of the words we will take up. Trench's remarks on the first and last of these tell more against than for his purpose. "In the earlier editions of '*Paradise Lost*,' and in the writings of that age, you will find *scent*, an odour, spelt *sent*. It was better so; there is no other noun substantive with which it is in danger of being confounded; while its relation with *sentio*, with *result*, *consent*, and the like, is put out of sight by its novel spelling; the intrusive *c* serving only to mislead. *Ell* gives us no clue to its own meaning; but in *eln*, used in Holland's translation of Camden, we recognise *ulna* at once." The French *sentir* and the Anglo-Saxon *eln* are the direct etymons of these words. In *ceiling* the Archbishop is deceived. The best authorities agree in the opinion that it is a different word from *sealing*, and owes its origin to the French *ciel*, heaven, a canopy. *Feather*, *measure*, and *treasure* have no right to the *a*. The original Anglo-Saxon *is* and *wrecca* are entirely disguised in the modern *ice* and *wretch*. *Newt* and *nickname* have stolen an *n* from the indefinite article, the original forms being *ewt* and *ekenname*,<sup>\*</sup> while *alder* has lost an original *n* (Anglo-Saxon *nældre*). The *ph* in *nephew* is neither etymological nor phonetic; both the Old English and the French forms were *neveu*. It is only to those who are acquainted with Hindustani that the derivation of *sepoy* through that language from the Persian *sipah*, an army, is at all clear. *Candidate* and *pontiff* have changed so much in meaning, that their descent from *candidus* and *pontifex* is by no means evident.

In treating of the words that mislead as to their origin, we will first deal with the extolled silent *g* and *b*. It is said that the *g* in *deign*, *reign*, and *impugn* tells of *dignor*, *regno*, and *impugno*; but the fact is that the *g* has crept into the English words, not because it appeared in the Latin, but because it was retained in the old French forms from which they were directly taken. But in

---

<sup>\*</sup> Anglo-Saxon *ecán*, to add. to be similar in formation. Thus *nickname* and *surname* are seen

Old French, as also in modern French, the *g* was preserved for a distinct orthoepic purpose, and where no such purpose would be answered the letter was dropt, as in *daintie*, *desdoin*, *reule*, *realme*. The 'orthoepic *g*,' as we may style it, is seen in many French words which had no *g* at all in their Roman forms. Let the *g* in the English *dignify*, *regular*, and *regal* tell of their immediate French etymons or of their ultimate Latin roots ; it has the best right to hold its place, and that is, it is *sounded*. In *feign*, moreover, the silent consonant is worse than useless ; for the word comes, not directly from the Latin  *fingere*, but from the French *feindre*. The old English forms were *fuynen* and *feynen*, and the middle English *feinen*, and, as Max Müller says, " It was a mere etymological feint to insert the *g* of the Latin  *fingo* and the French  *feignant*." Similar is the case of the words *sovereign*, *foreign*, *debt* and *doubt*. *Sovereign* and *foreign* have nothing to do with the French  *régne* and the Latin  *regnum*. They come finally from the Latin *super* and *foras* modified by the adjective termination *anus*. The old French words were *soverain* and *forain*, and the middle English forms actually had no *g*, but were simply *soverain* and *foraine*. *Debt* and *doubt* do not come directly from the Latin *debitum*, and *dubium*, but from the old French *dette* and *douter*, and the words were first spelt *dette* and *doute* in English. A *b* was afterwards introduced into the old French words, but it has again been thrown out. In English the *b* is not found in these words till the sixteenth century. As instances of words that easily tell their derivation, Trench mentions *grogam*, *pigmy currants*, *bran-new*, *scrip* (of paper), and *frontispiece*, and, these like all the rest, serve only to weaken his position, for *grogam* (O. E. *grosgrain*) has no connection with *gram*, nor *pigmy* (Fr. *pygmé*, from the Latin and Greek) with *pig*, nor *currants* (L. *corinthus*) with *current*, nor *bran-new* (A. S. *brand*, a burning,) with *bran*, nor *scrip* (O. F. *escript*, from L. *scribere*) with *scrup*, nor *frontispiece* (O. Fr. *frontispiece*, from L. *frontem* and *spicere*) with *piece*. *Bridegroom*, again, is the Anglo-Saxon *brydgum*, the bride's man, and *drake* is compounded of *end* the old word for *duck*, and the masculine suffix *rake*. *Lanthorn* was formed on the supposition that the word had some connection with *horn*, because the sides of lanterns were originally made of horn. But the true derivation, Latin *lanterna* through the French *lanterne*, is now well-known, and the form *lanthorn* has all but passed away. *Pickaxe* is unconnected with *axe*, the middle English and old English *pikois* meaning a mattock and coming from the old French *piquer*, to pierce. *Stirrup* is the Anglo-Saxon *stigrap*, a rope for mounting. The strange form

*I wis* arose from the mistaken notion that *wis* is an inflection of the old verb *witan*, to know. The real old form was *gewis*, an adjective connected etymologically with *witan*, but used adverbially in the sense of *certainty*. The middle English forms were *ywis* and *iwis*. *Isinglass* is not a derivative of *is* (*ice*) and *glæs* (*glass*), but a corruption of the old Dutch *huzenblas*, from *huyzen*, a sturgeon, and *blas*, a bladder. *Shame-faced* is similar in formation to *steadfast*, having nothing to do with the Latin *facies*. It comes from the Anglo-Saxon *scámu*, modesty, and the suffix *fast*, fixed. The form *shamefastness* appears in Tyndale's *New Testament*, and *shammfasst* in the *Ormulum*. The spelling *scissors* reminds us of the Latin *scissus*, passive participle of *scindere*, to split, and the meaning seems to endorse such a derivation; but the middle English forms were *sisoures* and *cisoures*, which point to the old French *cisoirs*, shears, derived from the Latin *cisus*, passive participle of *cœlere*, to cut. The etymological spelling would be *cisors*, which would be consistent with *incisors* and *incision*. *Controller* is bad etymological spelling, but *comptroller* is positively misleading, having been introduced under the mistaken idea that it is connected with the French *compte*, whereas it comes from the old French *countre-rolle*, a cross-register to check an original. The words *island*, *tongue*, *icicle*, *deuce*, *clerk*, and *disk*, wear a decidedly French appearance; but the first three are genuine Teutonic words, and the last three were taken directly from the Latin. The *s* in *island* was inserted from the fancied connection of the word with the French *isle*; but the spelling *ilund* was common in Shakespear's time, and the Anglo-Saxon word was *eulund* or *igland*. *Tongue* is etymologically independent of *langue* and *lingua*, for *tunge* is the Anglo-Saxon, old English, and middle English form, while *tung* was by no means uncommon in middle English. The Anglo-Saxon *isgicel* (*icicle*) was formed from the word *is* and the diminutive termination *gicel*. *Deuce* is nothing but the vocative case of the Latin *Deus*, God, used as an interjection in France and England. *Clerk* and *disk* were introduced at the time of the mission of St. Augustine, under the forms *clero* and *disc* from the Latin *clericus* and *discus*. *Adventure*, *assault*, *default*, and *vituals*, on the other hand, seem to come directly from the Latin, but they owe their present forms to the pedantry rife at the revival of learning. The old forms of these words in English were *arenture*, *assaute*, *defaut*, and *vitailles*, which are plainly of French origin. *Rhyme* and *scythe*, again, are falsely suggestive of Greek roots; but *sithe* is the genuine Anglo-Saxon and old English spelling, while the form *rhyme* for *rime* (Teutonic *rim*, number) according to Skeat, cannot be found earlier

than 1550. *Whole* and *could* have been formed on the false analogy of *who* and *would*; but the old forms were *hole* and *coude*. In many English words a distinctly phonetic tendency can be seen in their departure from an etymological spelling, and first among these comes *ant*, which Trench traces through five stages of its history. But on Trench's etymological hypothesis the word should be pronounced as it now is pronounced, and yet spelt *amt*. The word comes from the Anglo-Saxon *cemette*, and all the old spellings preserve the *m*. But *historical* spelling is not now possible, and the *n* in the word *ant*, is neither etymological nor historical, but phonetic. *Lord*, *lean*, *laugh*. *lot*, *loud*, *nut*, and *roof* had their Anglo-Saxon etymons beginning with *h*, and *nail* and *tail* are all that now remain of the ancient *nægel* and *tægel*. *Tense* was spelt *temps* by Chancer and is undoubtedly of French derivation. *Savage* is the Old French, *salvage* and the Latin *silvaticus*. And the common words *each*, *which*, and *such* have dropped an *l*, which they had in the Anglo-Saxon and old English.\* Many amusing mistakes are made about such common words as *gibberish*, *tarpauling gin* (spirit,) *cousin-german*, *gherkin*, *grass-widow*, *equerry*.

This section would be incomplete if we said nothing of the words ending in *our*, those beginning with *ph* and *kn*, and those containing the *gh* which was once a guttural, for it is about these words that etymological objectors are particularly furious now, though many of our readers doubtless know that Dean Alford, oppose such spellings as *color* and *labor* adopted by the Americans, but few of them can be aware of the facts contained in the following extract from an article by Mr. E. Jones in the *Schoolmaster*, for October 1872.

"As an instance of the futility of his objection to phonetic spelling, we may refer to the letter of the late Dean Alford published in *Good Words*, a few years ago. In spite of his great learning and ability, the Dean, like many other highly educated Englishmen, was led away by this popular fallacy to write as follows : \*I remark, as to spelling, on the trick now so universal across the Atlantic, and becoming in some quarters common with us in England, of leaving out the *u* in the termination *our*, writing *honor*, *favor*, *neighbor*, *savior*, etc. Now the objection to this is not only that it makes very ugly words, totally unlike any thing in the English language before, but that it obliterates all trace of the derivation of the word. It is true, that *honor* and *favor* are derived originally from Latin words spelt exactly the

---

\* This subject of past phonetic changes in English words will be more fully dwelt on in our second article.

same, but it is also true, that we do not get them direct from the Latin, but through the French forms which ended in *eur*.'

"It was pointed out, however, to the learned Dean by some of the readers of *Good Words* : (1.) As regards the ugliness of *honor*, *favor*, etc., without the *u*, and that there was nothing like it in the English language before, that there are not less than three hundred words of this class, while there are only about thirty in all in which the *u* is ever written. (2.) That as the French form for *honor* was spelt with two *n*'s (*honneur*), we ought, on etymological grounds, to spell the English word in the same way. (3.) The French termination being *eur*, why should the English be *our* ?

"The Dean at once saw his error, and as a man of *honor* frankly and candidly admitted it, saying, that the spelling in question was not guided at all by the derivation of words. In the same manner all similar objections will fall to the ground when brought to the test of facts, and this incident shows the importance of taking nothing upon trust, even from great men."

Kingdon Oliphant says that the word *honour* was introduced into English at the conquest, and that *honure*, the French form, had existed in Gaul for 1,100 years before, and then goes on to say, "If we change it into *honor*, we pare down its history and we lower it to the level of the many words that came in at the Reformation." But is not *honour* itself such a change of form and paring down of history as *honor* would be? The latter form has at least the plea of *primitive* spelling; but *honour* is neither French nor Latin; it is a mere confusion of the two. There are many words in English which once ended in *our*, that have dropped the *u*. As familiar instances we may mention *tutor*, *professor*, *author*, *editor*, *doctor*, *governor*, *emperor*, *error*, *terror*, *inferior*, *superior*. There is also great inconsistency in the spelling of derivatives from the words in question. Thus we have *discolour* but *discoloration*, *labourer* but *laboratory* and *elaborate*, *vapoury*, but *vaporous*, *odourless* but *odorous*. And are *neighbour* and *harbour* of French origin?

With regard to the *ph* in Latin and Greek derivatives, it is said that it helps us to trace the words to their originals. Here we will quote the words of Max Müller. "Because the Italians write *filosofo* are they less aware than the English who write *philosopher*, and the French who write *philosophe*, that they have before them the Latin *philosophus* and the Greek *philosophos*? If we write *f* in *faney*, why not in *phantom*? if in *frenzy* and *frantic*, why not in *phrenology*? A language which tolerates *vial* for *phial* need not shiver at *filosofer*." In the same way, it is no easier to trace to the

Latin and Greek *phthisis*, the modern English *phthisic* than the Italian *tisico*, the Spanish *tisica* and the *tizzic* of Milton. *Vixen* is a mere corruption of *fosen*, and *visicion* for *physician* is found in Tyndale's *New Testament*. *Fisionomie* and *visionomie* are the middle English forms of *physiognomy*. These words in *ph* are only the types of the class of words directly from Latin, which it is said with truth represent with great exactness their Latin spellings. But as we have seen the resemblance of form is not needed to show the derivation, and we may further remark that it is just these words that will be the least changed in any system of phonetic notation, for they are, as a rule, pronounced as they are spelt. The most important change in these words will be as regards the letter *c*. But it is well known that the Latin *c* was pronounced as *k* is by us, and since the English *c* does not uniformly represent this sound, it should be replaced by *k*. When the Greeks of old adopted a Roman word or name in which *c* appeared, they substituted their *kappa* for it, and the English have already followed their example in the spelling of such words as *convolve*, *provolve*, *embark*, *remarkable*, *embarkation*.

The *k* in such words as *knave* and *know* is defended by referring to the Anglo-Saxon *cnaftu* and *cnavan*. It is said besides, that the present spelling shows at once the relation of *knave* to the German *knabe*, and that the *k* in *know* is seen to be useful in forming compounds like *acknowledge*. But if *c* is the letter in the root of the English word, why put *k* in its place? If the *c* became silent so long ago as the time of the Conquest and cannot stand, it had better go without a useless substitute. The Germans write *knabe* with a *k*, not to show its relation to similarly derived words in other Teutonic languages, but simply because the *k* is sounded. And such also is the example of the Romans, who, from the root *gno*, form *nosco* and *cognosco*, *notus* and *ignotus*, and from the root *gna*, *nascor* and *cognatus*, using the *g* where it is required by the sound and dropping it where it is not.

And so also, we are told, that the *gh* in *night* should not be cast aside, because it was once pronounced and corresponds to the *ch* of the German *nacht*; and here our answer is the same as with reference to *k* in *knave*. And then, if we are to write *gh* in *night* because it was once sounded, should we not preserve the symbol of the guttural in *law*, which comes from the Anglo-Saxon *laga* or *lagu*, in *Sunday* from *Sunnandæg*, in *Friday* from *Frigedæg*, *lie* (to rest) from *liegan*, *lie* (to utter falsehood) from *leogan*, *elbow* from *elnboga*, and a host of others? In *ghost* and *aghost* there is no reason whatever for the *h*, for

the old forms were *gost* and *agust*, and the *h* is not to be found in the Anglo-Saxon roots; while in *sprightly* there was no guttural sound at all, since the word comes from the French *esprit* and was spelt *spritly* and *spritely* till comparatively modern times. We will close this section with a quotation from Professor Skeat. "It deserves to be stated that a great number of our words have been at various times re-spelled according to their supposed etymology, and that, in many cases, such re-spelling is utterly misleading. I wish to state that I have been for years three and more [now seven years] at work upon English etymology; and that I have been much struck with the stupid way in which our spelling has been tampered with in order to suggest, encourage "and make the public swallow a false derivation."

Closely connected with the etymological are the *historical and relational objections* to a phonetic spelling-reform. It is said, for instance, that the words *conscience* and *sight* cannot now be altered since their present spellings are as old as the writings of Chaucer. But we have already seen that there have been many changes of spelling since the days of Chaucer. Some of these changes have been distinctly phonetic, while, on the other hand, many words spelt phonetically by Chaucer have been tampered with by the pedantry of modern times. If historical spelling is to be worth anything, it should be systematic, and old spellings should be restored after the fashion of Walter Savage Landor. But even Landor was not consistent, for he adopts some old spellings and rejects or neglects others. And it is no marvel either, for it is a difficult matter to decide where the line should be drawn. Shall we adopt spellings which can be found in Chaucer? or shall we go as far back as the *Vision of Piers the Ploughman*? or, on the other hand, shall we content ourselves with the forms of the Elizabethan era? If we strive to write the earliest form that a word assumed in the language, we must write *kanave* for *knave*, *puntillo* for *punctilio*, and *ellagaito* for *alligator*, and this, moreover, while we pronounce the words as they are now pronounced. Professor Sweet in his *Hand-book of Phonetics* remarks, "Historical spelling *destroys the materials on which alone history itself can be based.*"

In his *Study of Words* Trench declares that phonetic spelling would destroy the 'lively interest' with which we 'discover words to be of closest kin which we had never considered till now, but as entire strangers to one another.' A good answer to this argument on the 'ethnographic relations of words,' as DeQuincey has it, is to be found in the fact that there are, indeed, very few English words in which these relations are immediately evident from their



forms. It is perfectly right and in accordance with scientific phonetics that the difference in the sounds of the words *wring* and *wrong*, *haft* and *have*, *shred* and *sherd*, *shire* and *shore* should be denoted by a difference in the spellings. There are meanwhile, such words as *height*, *flight*, *sieve*, and *mirth* which are needlessly distinct from *high*, *fly*, *sift*, and *merry* as far as the vowels are concerned. Furthermore, there is no difficulty in tracing the connection between such differently spelt groups of words as *bleed*, *bless*, and *blossom*; *cordial*, *courage*, and *quarry*; *risk* and *section*; *enthusiasm* and *theology*; *evince* and *vanguish*; *wealth* and *wilderness*; *gaud*, *jewel*, and *joy*; *burden* and *bairn*; *madam* and *monkey*; *alley*, *ledge* and *larv*; and these are but few among scores of groups that will readily occur to every one. Again, who does not know that *cow* and *kine*, *cat* and *kitten*, *corn* and *kernel*, *quell* and *kill*, *fancy* and *phantom*, *skim* and *scum* are etymologically related? "When words," writes a lady educationist, "so apparently different as one *tear* and the French *larme*; as the Latin *coquo* and the Greek *pepto*; or French *meme* and Latin *ipse*, are shown to be closely related, we need surely not be afraid of any result from phonetic spelling. If, again, the Sanskrit *coupen* can turn into *palace* and *courts* in the hands of the professors of this science, we may securely leave the matter to them and not feel under any necessity to sacrifice the good of the greatest number to the claim of the privileged few." And Dr. Morris says, "we have documents in an unbroken line from the time of Alfred the Great to the present day. Were we to write *ov* instead of *of*, and *nave* instead of *knave*, and *rite* for *right*, etymology would not suffer. Older records of our speech would give us all the information we want."

Another of Trench's arguments does not readily occur to every one. He says, "There are in every language vast numbers of words which the ear does not distinguish from one another, but which are at once distinguishable to the eye by the spelling. Now, of course, it is a real disadvantage, and may be the cause of serious confusion that there should be words in our spoken language of entirely different origin and meaning, which yet cannot be differentiated from one another. The phonographers simply propose to extend this disadvantage, already cleaving to our spoken, to the written language as well."

We hold that it is no disadvantage at all that there are such words in English, which cannot be distinguished in sound, but are undoubtedly distinct in meaning. There is, and can be, no confusion at all in the use of such words. If there were, some change would, of necessity, be introduced into the sound of one or some of the words for the purpose of distinction. Let any of the groups

instanced by Trench be incidentally introduced into a sentence, and if the sentence contain any meaning, that meaning and the meaning of each individual word will be perfectly clear as soon as the sentence is pronounced, independently, that is, of the spellings of the paronyms. The uselessness of such distinctions in spelling is made still more evident by the fact that there are in English very nearly *seven hundred homonyms*, words of the same spelling and sound, but of different application. We have not included such words as are merely the same word used as different parts of speech, for if these were taken into consideration, the number would be, not hundreds, but thousands. And surely if there be any virtue in *paronymic distinctions*, these numerous English homonyms should be made 'distinguishable to the eye.' If *hew*, to cut asunder, should be written differently from *hue*, a colour, this *hue* and the first word of the phrase *hue and cry* should also be distinguished in form, especially as they are 'the same parts of speech.' And so with *queue* and the two *cues*; *betel* and the three *beetles*; *peal* and the three *peels*, &c. But this distinction of paronyms is worse than useless; it is mischievous. When children of the tenderest years are checked for confounding the spelling of paronyms like *air* and *ere*, *ate* and *eight*, *medal* and *meddle*, they lose their self-confidence and nervously avoid attempting to spell such words. And then it is entirely forgotten that there are in English very many words which are of the same spelling, but are sounded differently for different applications (and these we may call *dionyms*), such as *bow*, *row*, *sow*, *gill*, *gout*, *lower*, *hinder*, *canon*, &c. Now all these words would, in any system of phonetic spelling, be written differently. Thus, both by reducing paronyms to homonyms and converting dionyms into differently spelt words, a phonetic notation would be a decided advantage, and not a disadvantage.

We have sometimes been asked, "who is to be the judge of those words that are now variously pronounced?" This objection is carried a little further by Trench, when he says, "Before there was any fixed and settled orthography in our language, when, therefore, every body was more or less a phonographer, seeking to write down the word as it sounded to him (for there was no other law to guide him), the variations of spelling were infinite." And, again, "uneducated people in our own day have no rule but the sound to guide them. How is it that they do not all spell alike?" The former of these quotations implies that at the time spoken of there was a settled English language, but no settled English spelling, and that the result of such a state of things was the confusion of spelling. Now a glance at Oliphant's *Sources of Standard*

*English* or the Clarendon Press *Specimens of Early English* will show the most superficial student that down to the sixteenth century there were numerous dialects in England, very many more than are said to exist still among the uneducated, and with this additional disadvantage that there was no received standard of pronunciation. The dialects then existing could be roughly divided into three groups, the Northern, the Midland, and the Southern, and these differed from one another almost as much as distinct languages, not only as to their pronunciation, but as to their vocabulary and grammatical terminations as well, while in the Danelagh there was a constant modification of forms and paring away of terminations going on for centuries. "Each shire spoke that which was right in its own eyes." Hence the great diversity referred to by Trench. When printing presses arose in England, it was found convenient to have one form for each word, and the printers began, without even the rule of *pronunciation* to guide them (for foreign printers, as Caxton's men undoubtedly were, could hardly be expected to have mastered the various English dialects,) to print the same word always in the same way, sometimes after the spelling of one writer, and sometimes after that of another. This evil existed for many years, in the sixteenth century the commonest words often appearing in two or three forms in the same work. We are not yet quite free from the effects of this practice. Occasionally a compromise was struck between two dialects; thus the Northern *suord* and the Southern *swurd* were combined to form the present *sword*. "Never," says Oliphant, "did any tongue employ so many variations of vowels as the English to represent the sound *e*: here is one more puzzle for the foreigner. This comes from our tongue being compounded in different shires; the form, *ie*, came from the South-East, the form *ea*, from the South-West, the form *e* and also *ee* from the North." When Trench says that uneducated people now have no rule but the pronunciation to guide them, he implies that the educated *have* some other rules for their guidance. We have already said enough of the fancied guidance found in the etymology and history of English words, and we now see that English spelling is not even phonetic; it was not built and does not stand on phonetic principles. Where then does the guidance come from? It is also quite incorrect to say that the 'bad spelling' of the uneducated is due only to their following the sound. The true explanation is to be found in the 'innphinitley divoursified plaau auve spneling,' as Professor Gregory wittily writes it. There are in English so many signs for each sound, that those who write phonetically after only a brief acquaintance with printed words have

before them a wide field of choice, for the symbolisation of their pronunciation, and the result is, that very few choose the same letter or combination of letters for the same sound. If the English language were phonetically written, this would not and could not happen. If the spelling of words were in accordance with pronunciation, pronunciation would not change so quickly as at present. A symbol would be fixed upon for each sound, and whenever that symbol met the eye its proper sound and no other would unhesitatingly be uttered. It is true, that there are some words which are now pronounced differently by different men of the best education, such are *cognizance*, *either*, *neither*, *larynx*, *pharynx*, *imagery*, *fealty*, *kumble*, *slough*, *seamstress*, *samphire*, *privacy* and a few others. But since these words are by no means numerous, no harm would be done if they were for the time being written in two different ways. The best pronunciation, and therefore the fittest spelling, would, as a natural consequence, survive. Those who object to such an arrangement should lift up their voices against numerous similar duplicates already existing in English, such, for example, as *anapest* and *anapäst*, *anchoret* and *anchorite*, *felly* and *felloe*, *Brahmin* and *Brahman*, *basnet* and *basenet*, *caldron* and *cauldron*, *clinch* and *clench*. On their hypothesis, one form should be chosen and kept to at all risks, while the pronunciation is left to range at large. But what can be said in defence of the words that have two received spellings each, both of the same origin, meaning, and sound? Mr. Webb, in his key to the Entrance Course for this year, has drawn the attention of Entrance students to three such double forms, *vender* and *vendor*, *pedler* and *pedlar*,\* *licence* and *license*. And he might have gone on to warn them that there are scores of such words in English. As familiar instances we may mention *juil* and *goal*, *draft* and *draught*, *bully* and *bulley*, *meter* and *metre*, *center* and *centre*, *balk* and *baulk*, *bark* and *barque*, *dram* and *drachm*, *calif* and *caliph*, *cigar* and *segur*, *coco* and *cocoa*, *coolly* and *coolie*, *burden* and *burthen*, *choir* and *quire*, *licorice* and *liquorice*. In a system of phonetic spelling, such absurdities would be impossible.

It is said, that there are in English rules for marking the difference between long and short vowels, and reference is made to the doubling of a single consonant after a vowel to intimate that it is short, and to the addition of a final silent *e* to intimate that the preceding vowel is long; as, *Mary* and *marry*, *mad* and *made*. The word *rule* applied to crotchets like these is but a misnomer. To see how inadequate the first of these rules is,

\* There is also a third form, *peddler*.

we need only glance at such common doublets as *fagot* and *faggot*, *wagon* and *waggon*, *foray* and *forray*, *caligraphy* and *culligraphy*, *calisthenics* and *callisthenics*. *Bade* and *bass* are types of a class of words in which the rule of doubling the consonant is exactly reversed, and there are hundreds of words in which the letter *l* is doubled without any orthoepic effect whatever. With regard to the final *e* the incongruities are still more striking. The youngest children have to be taught that *h-i-v-e* is *live*, but *l-i-v-e* is *live*, that *l-a-v-e* is *lave*, but *h-a-v-e* is *have*. We teach them the difference of sound between *bar* and *bare*, and then confront them with *are*! We make them distinguish *cone* from *con*, and then surprise them with such puzzles as *done* and *gone*! Worse than all this, we expect them to see the difference between *rove*, *move* and *love*! A few years after (but still *years*, sad to say,) they have to combat with *entice* and *notice*, *revive* and *motive*, *juvenile* and *fertile*, *vulpine* and *doctrine*, *erudite* and *favourite*. Again, we may ask, with Mr. Evans, "what does the final *e* tell our pupils about the character of the final vowel sound in *police*, *advice*, and *notice*? Or, in *prestige*, *oblige*, and *vestige*? Or, in *magazine*, *divine*, and *doctrine*? In *simile*, *apostrophe* and *hyperbole*, the final *e* has a sound of its own and leaves us to guess that of the preceding vowel. If it is said that these are of Greek origin, we answer 'our children are not born with' a knowledge of etymology, and the Greek origin cannot help them. And if these come from the Greek, so do *anatomy* and *euphony*, *apogee* and *perigee*. What again is the office of the final letter in *centre*, *accoutre*, and *metre*? Of course the choice has not yet been made between *meter* and *metre*, and yet *barometre* is considered intolerable!

We have said enough now to show that English spelling is not governed by rules, but is entirely capricious, inconsistent and false; that there is, in fact, as the Right Hon'ble Mr. Gladstone says, "a total absence of rule, method, system, and all the auxiliaries which people generally get when they have to acquire something that is difficult of attainment." We will take up this subject again in our second part with special reference to the difficulty of teaching spelling. But some declare that this very difficulty of learning to spell, the very complexities, in fact, the very eccentricities, are useful for mental discipline, and that they teach the pupils to believe rather than argue with their teachers. We ask such cavillers what mental exercise is afforded by such lessons as "*H-i-g-h* is *high*, but *h-i-g-h-t* is not *height*, *h-e-i-g-h-t* is *height*"? It takes years for a child to reconcile himself to such eccentricities as *pity*, *piteous*, and *pitiful*. Is this mental discipline? The faculty of memory is overburdened, and the perception and reason

are left to take care of themselves. Does the inconsistency of spelling foster confidence in the teacher? We rather think that it engenders distrust, and destroys all confidence in self.

The present style of spelling, then, cannot be defended on any ground. The fact, therefore, that it is clung to, is to be accounted for only as the result of prejudice. The late Dr. Thirwall, the good and learned Bishop of St. David's, says, "I look upon the established system of spelling (if an accidental custom may be so called,) as a mass of anomalies, the growth of ignorance and chance, equally repugnant to good taste and common sense. But I am aware that the public cling to these anomalies with a tenacity proportioned to their absurdity, and are jealous of all encroachment on ground consecrated by prescription to the free-play of blind caprice." Since the great Bishop's death the reform of spelling has made great progress in England and America. The present spelling-reform movement began with Messrs. Alexander John Ellis and Isaac Pitman in 1842. These gentlemen together invented a set of letters containing a symbol for each simple spoken English sound. This alphabet has been continually undergoing variation and improvement, and it has now assumed a permanent shape, with definite and convenient characters for the italic and script forms as well. This system of reformed spelling is called *Phonotypy*, and consists of the Roman alphabet supplemented by thirteen new letters, seven for vowels and six for consonants. The five Roman vowel signs are retained for the short vowel sounds of *pat*, *pet*, *pit*, *pot*, and *put*, and the new signs, which are somewhat similar in form to the *a*, *e*, *i*, *o*, *u* of the Romans, represent the vowel sounds of *palm*, *page*, *peat*, *pall*, *pole*, *pool* and *pun*. The diphthongs are represented by constant digraphs suggestive of their elements, *ci*, *iu*, *ou*, *ai* and *oi* respectively standing for the diphthongs of *height*, *pew*, *pout*, *ay* and *point*. Of the Roman consonants, the redundant *c*, *q* and *x* are thrown aside, and the others are regularly used to mark severally the sound they ordinarily represent. Single characters are also substituted for the misleading *sh*, *ch*, *th*, and *ng*. The *th* of *thin* is distinguished from the *th* of *then*, and a convenient letter, the tailed *z* is used for the sound of *s* in *pleasure*. *Phonotypy* has the merit of perfect practicability as well as the utmost of scientific exactness that practicability will allow. It is not so scientifically accurate as Mr. Melville Bell's *visible speech*, which furnishes a sign, not only for every spoken English sound, but, for every sound which the human voice produces, or can produce, each sign by its very shape suggesting the position of the vocal organs by which the sound is generated. Such a system can be employed only by one who is thoroughly versed in the science of phonetics,

while it has been proved by experiment that a child of eight years can be taught to read Phonotypy fluently after a week's constant practice. It is sometimes argued that adults who have been accustomed to the established style of spelling would find a great difficulty in the change of systems, and that the wealth of literature now existing in the common orthography would be entirely lost. But experiments in the Portlaw schools in Ireland, and in many of the schools in America, prove that there is no transition so easy as the transition from phonotypy to the common spelling or from the common spelling to Phonotypy. Those who have been in the habit of using the old spelling for years find no difficulty in reading phonotypy, when once they know the phonetic values of the letters. We are not perfectly acquainted with the *pronunciation* of Chaucer and Langhorn and yet we read their works with ease after some careful study. How much easier, then, will be the reading of what we know to be in accordance with the pronunciation with which we are *familiar*. Those, again, who have been trained to read phonotypy find no difficulty in reading works printed in the old spelling. And there would thus be no necessity of reprinting or casting aside our present books. But all books of any worth must and do appear in new editions according to the demand for them. If such new editions are required by a generation trained in Phonotypy, the publishers will consult the taste of the age and issue the work in Phonotypy. The only real difficulty in the way of the immediate adoption of such a system is the printers difficulty in procuring new types. But this, of course, is only a *present* difficulty.

The superiority of Phonotypy to other proposed phonetic schemes will be seen from the fact that it has been adopted by the English Spelling-Reform Association, which was formed in 1879 for the purpose of taking some steps to bring about a reform of English spelling. A petition from *a hundred and thirty-seven* English School Boards had been presented to the Education Department by a deputation of eminent men, but it did not succeed in securing the authority of the department for the cause of spelling-reform. It was thereupon determined to form an Association to keep the matter before Government and the public. The Association is composed of all those interested in a reform of spelling, among whom are very nearly all the great philologists and educationists in England. The Rev. A. H. Sayce, Deputy Professor of Comparative Philology in Oxford, and author of several valuable philological works, was President for three years, and is now a Vice-President. The present President is Dr. J. H. Gladstone, Member of the

School Board for London. Among the Vice-Presidents are the Right Hon'ble J. Mundella, Vice-President of the Committee of Council on Education, the Hon'ble W. W. Hunter, L.L.D., C.I.E., Sir John Lubbock, M.P. for the London University, the Bishop of Exeter, the Poet Laureate, Professor Skeat, Dr. Murray, President of the English Philological Society, Dr. Morris and Professor Sweet, both ex-presidents of the Philological Society, and the great Doctors Abbot, Angus, Bain, Scott, and Taylor. The Association, after three years of careful examination and comparison, has selected Phonotypy as the most practical system of phonetic spelling. There has been another Association of spelling reformers (comprising no less than fifteen hundred persons) in existence since 1813, that is the Phonetic Society, of which Professor Max Müller is President, and Drs. Latham, Morris, and Murray, and Professors Sayce and Sweet are Vice-presidents.

A Spelling-Reform Association has existed for many years in America, and the great American philologists are to a man in favour of a spelling-reform. Of the learned Americans who have written in the cause of the reform, we may mention in particular, Professor March of Lafayette, Professors Whitney and Lounsbury of Yale, Professor Child of Harvard, and Professor Barnard of Columbia College. The Association and the American Philological Society decided on adopting for the present a partial reform of spelling, and accordingly published the five following rules which have met with the best reception and are already carried into practice by hundreds of newspapers and journals, and many thousands of private persons.

"1. Omit *a* from the digraph *ea* when pronounced as *e* short as in *hed, helth*, &c.

"2. Omit silent *e* after a short vowel, as in *hav, giv, liv, definite, forbud*, &c.

"3. Write *f* for *ph* in such words as *alfabet, fantom, camfor, filosofy, telegraf*, &c.

"4. When a word ends with a double letter, omit the last as in *shal, wil, claf, ey*, &c.

"5. Change *ed* final to *t* where it has the sound of *t* as in *lusht, imprest, fixt*," &c.

The English Philological Society has taken a similar step. At the last meeting of the Society, Mr. Sweet submitted by request a list of amended spellings for English words. This list embraces the ground of five American rules and goes considerably further. All letters that are useless, both phonetically and etymologically, are omitted from the spelling of words. The past tense of the verb is formed by adding *ed*,



only when the *ed* is a separate syllable (i. e., after *t* and *d*, and in other cases for poetic rhythm); otherwise simple *t* or *d* is added accordingly to the sound. No letter is doubled unless there is a double sound, as in *immoral*, *illegal*; *ee* is substituted for *ie* and *ea* in words like *fief* and *cheat*, *oo* for *o* in *move*, &c., and the *i* disappears entirely from *friend*, the *o* from *country*, the *u* from *guest*, and the *ue* from *catalogue*. *Tongue* is written *tung*, and *dumb* and *doubt* lose their *b*. There are in all about seven hundred words that undergo more or less change. These corrections were discussed at six meetings of the Society before final presentation. They have only to be seen to be approved, and were almost unanimously adopted by the Society, *whose Transactions are henceforth to be printed in this reformed spelling*.

We have thus two good schemes of reformed spelling, one radical, the other partial, the first adopted by the Spelling Reform Association, the second by the Philological Society. Now, as we have seen, there exists a very great deal of prejudice on this subject, and we think that the public mind is not ready for so thorough a reform as the adoption of Phonotypy. As long as spelling is regarded by the great majority of educated people as something sacred and unchangeable, there is not much room for argument. What is immediately wanted is that the belief in the sanctity of spelling be dispelled. Let it once be acknowledged that a man may spell *psalm* without a *p* and *wrapped* with four letters instead of seven, and yet be neither a pitiable fool nor a scheming knave, and the death-blow of conservative spelling is struck. We would propose that the spelling of the Philological Society be used in printed works, and that the more correct Phonotypy be introduced into schools. Let the rising generation be taught to spell reasonably, and let the working men of the present day regret that they were reared under such disadvantages. "All true reforms have been gradual." And there can be no confusion caused by the two systems existing side by side for a time, for, as we have intimated, the resemblance between Phonotypy, and the common print is so great, that it is not difficult to pass from one to the other. Those of us who do not wish to take the trouble of writing Phonotypy (though the trouble would in reality be very little), need not do so at all. The system of the Philological Society is learnt in a few minutes, there being no new letters in it. But even this is not necessary. There will be only the temporary discomfort occasioned by the strange appearance of the printed page. But if the present spelling is radically incorrect (and that it is so, must be clear

to every thinking reader), some little inconvenience should not be objected to for the sake of getting rid of it. By the introduction of Phonotypy into schools, spelling and good reading will come almost naturally. All the time now wasted over spelling, reading, and dictation lessons can be devoted to fresh and more profitable subjects. Our children will love school when they find how interesting it is to hear the talk of their teacher about the wonders of the commonest objects. They will no longer be in constant fear of making a mistake at their reading. It is but too often that a lasting dislike has been taken to study on account of the harshness of teachers to little ones that cannot spell. The more logical the young mind is, the less of purely *mechanical* turn, the more will it rebel against English spelling.

Those of our readers who have followed us carefully will, we think, acknowledge that the present style of spelling is utterly mischievous. If this be their deliberate opinion, they should not fail to give it expression and carry it into practice even to a slight an extent. He who drops the *e* from *live* in his ordinary correspondence, does much to bring about a reform.

G. S. GASPER.

---

## ART. VI.—THE SANKHYA PHILOSOPHY.

THE Sankhya Philosophy and its counterpart, the Yoga, have lately been invested with a peculiar interest in the writings and Peripatetic discourses of the champions of Theosophy in India. The speculations formulated in the one, and developed in a series of practical rules of the most stringent type in the other, have been placed above the most improved science of the day; and results are anticipated, compared with which those by which the comforts and conveniences of life are being multiplied, are as trifles. It is proposed in this paper to show, by a careful analysis of the contents of one of the two original documents from which our knowledge of the Sankhya Philosophy is derived, how far the glowing eulogy bestowed upon it by Indian theosophists is well merited.

The founder of the Sankhya, the first of the six schools of Indian Philosophy, was Kapila, one of the great thinkers whose speculations in the region of pure thought have, not merely left an indelible mark in the literature of our country, but exercised a mighty influence on our national life. Nothing certain or reliable is known about this great man; and he must therefore be held up as a mythic, rather than a historical character. The traditions current about him are such as are manufactured, in an age of superstition, by what Grote calls the retrospective veneration of a few devoted followers, and accepted as invested with peculiar sacredness, if not as positively and indisputably unexceptionable, by the unthinking masses. He is said by some champions of his school to have been one of the seven great sons of Brahma, who cut a figure in the theogonies of the Puranas; while by others he is held up as an incarnation of Vishnu himself. Others, again, led by the etymology of the word Kapila, which means a *tawny brown color*, as well as *fire*, look up to him as the great Vedic god, Agni himself, in a human form. He is, moreover, said to have been a descendant of the celebrated Indian lawgiver, Manu, to have lived in retirement as a recluse, to have successfully controlled his appetites and passions, and to have been invested on that account with various kinds of supernatural powers. But if he is identified, as he has been, with the irascible sage in the *Ramayana*, who destroyed the sixty-thousand sons of King Sagara of Ayodhya (Oudh) in a fit of rage, consequent on their impudence in accusing him of the great crime of having stolen their father's sacrificial horse, the complete self-control he is said to have attained becomes problematical!

Various other stories are told about him of a piece with these ; and the best thing the enquirer can do is to be content with the bare fact, that Kapila was a Brahmin and the founder of the school of philosophy the speculations of which may be found as an underlying vein of thought in the most advanced of the systems elaborated in ancient India. Nor are we in possession of the writings of this great sage, the works ascribed to him, viz., the *Sankhya-Pravachana*, or Sankhya-Aphorisms and the *Tattva Samasa*, or compendium of principles, being decidedly more modern. The former, translated by Dr. Ballantyne years ago, is not even mentioned by Sankara Acharya, the great Vedantist's Commentator, who lived in the latter part of the seventh and the earlier part of the eighth century ; and it is not even referred to in the *Sarna-Darsana-Sangraha*, a philosophical treatise evidently composed in the fourteenth century. The *Sankhya-Pravachana*, however, is a standard document of the Sankhya school ; and, in our attempts to expound the principles of the philosophy associated with this school, we cannot but give it a prominent place. We shall, therefore, present a synopsis of the contents of this work, before proceeding to our examination, in another paper, of those of a treatise, which is decidedly more ancient, viz., the *Sankhya Karika*, or exposition of the Sankhya Philosophy, recently translated by Mr. Davies of the Royal Asiatic Society. Another treatise, also recently translated, we shall refer to, the treatise already named, the *Sarna-Darsana-Sangraha*, or Review of the different systems of Hindu Philosophy ; a work of very great importance which the student of our national philosophy will do well to master with a view to an intimate acquaintance with the lines of thought and reasoning embodied in it.

The *Sankhya-Pravachana* consists of six books and five hundred and twenty-six Sutras or Aphorisms. The first four books present the principles of Kapila's philosophy, without, it must be confessed, much regard to the advantage of a perspicuous or luminous arrangement, but with considerable acuteness and force. The fifth book grapples with and refutes some of the objections to his system current, if not in his age, at least in subsequent times ; and the sixth, being a recapitulation of the principles enunciated in the first four, bears to the whole the same relation, which the book of Deuteronomy bears to the Pentateuch. Several commentaries fitted to elucidate the contents of this hoary document, and demanded peremptorily by its studied brevity and sententiousness, exist ; and a recourse to them is absolutely needed to clear up its obscure passages and make its many legendary and other references intelligible. But great caution must be exercised in their use to avoid the common fault of transferring the

traditions and associations among which the commentators were brought up, to the age when the passages elucidated were penned. The best of these commentaries is *Sankhya-Pravachana Bhashya* by Vijnana-Bhikshu, who seems to have been an ardent admirer and a redoubtable champion of the system, at a time when it was attacked by certain phases of pantheistic and nihilistic thought, as well as by persons who derived their inspiration from prevalent forms of theistic belief. The Sankhya Aphorisms, together with valuable portions of this commentary, were translated into English by Dr. Ballantyne, whose accuracy as an interpreter or expounder of Hindu Philosophy has been generally acknowledged by Sanscrit scholars. These translations are to be utilized in the following synopsis of the contents of this memorable work.

The grand object of this philosophy is set forth in the very first of the five hundred and twenty-six Aphorisms of which the book consists :—" Well, the complete cessation of pain (which is) of three kinds, is the complete end (*summum-bonum*) of man." The three kinds of pain are particularized, not so much by the author of the book, as by his commentators. Pain " natural and intrinsic," or pain arising from bodily and mental infirmities, and weaknesses, is comprehended in the first class; and that, " natural and extrinsic," or pain arising from such external causes as " cold, heat, wind, rain, thunderbolts " is included in the second class. The third class comprehends, according to the commentator Vachaspati Misra, pains proceeding from the influence of planetary bodies, or from the malice of impure spirits, such as Yackchas, Rakshases, &c. The subjection of the soul to this three-fold pain, or to pain in its three-fold aspect, is its bondage, and liberation from it should be, if it is not, the sole object of earthly and even heavenly existence. The object of Sankhya and every other system of Indian philosophy is to show how this consummation is to be brought about, or how the final emancipation of the soul from the bondage of pain in its three-fold aspect is to be effected.

The diagnosis of a disease is the first step towards its cure; and, therefore, an attempt is made to set forth the cause of this universal bondage, before the sources of emancipation are pointed out. The disquisition on this cause is worthy of a detailed notice, inasmuch as it points to the varied antagonistic forces with which the system had to contend in its advanced, if not in its incipient stages of development.

The great Napoleon developed a principle of universal applicability, when, immediately after his coronation, he said :—" A new dynasty must be baptized with blood." A new school

of philosophy, as well as a new Empire or a new dynasty. has to pass through a season of almost ceaseless struggle for life ; and it is not established till it has proved its right to live according to a law now said to be universally operative, the law of the survival of the fittest. And it cannot but be very interesting to notice the phalanx of antagonistic forces, through which it has, in its inception and development, to force its way to maturity, renown, and far extending and triumphant influence, if not to universal ascendancy. But this cannot be done in the case of the system of philosophy under review, inasmuch as we are not in possession of documents fitted to throw light on its early development. But we can indicate the varied hostile theories with which it had to contend when the *Sankhya-Pravachana* was composed.

What, then, is the cause of the universally admitted bondage of the soul, or its subjection to the varied kinds of pain, the complete cessation of which is the object of philosophy or right knowledge ? Various parties come forward with varied answers, which are plausible enough at first sight, but which, when properly weighed in the balance of reason are found wanting. The ordinary thinker, or one not far advanced in philosophy, comes forward and points to *time* and *place* as the cause, jointly and separately, of the bondage of the soul. But his theory is very easily exploded, as, both *time* and *place* being associated with all souls, those which are in bondage and those which are beatified, if they were the obnoxious cause, release or liberation would be an impossibility. But liberation is a fact, and souls released exist free from all pain, and beatified. *Time* and *place*, therefore, cannot be the cause we are in quest of. The metaphysician steps forward, and affirms that the bondage of the soul arises from its being conditioned and therefore necessarily defective. The reply to this is plain. The premises are incorrect, and therefore the conclusion is faulty. The soul is absolute and unconditioned ; a position established both by Scripture and common sense. But this reply elicits the rejoinder :—" If the soul is absolute and unconditioned, why talk of its bondage and subsequent liberation ? " It is not at all difficult to dispose of this demurrer. Forms of expression, conventional, though not scientifically accurate, cannot be very well avoided. When the bondage of the soul and its liberation are talked of, the real meaning is not hidden, though some homage is paid to usage. The body is really in pain, the soul's bondage is only reflectional, as the red color in a crystal vase containing a China rose.

The metaphysician retires, giving place to the priest or the champion of current orthodoxy, who holds up works as the cause of the bondage of the soul. But works cannot weave a net for that

to which they do not appertain. Works belong to the mind, and their influence, good or bad, does not and cannot extend to the soul, to which they do not, in the slightest degree, appertain. The Vedantin, or the pantheist of the Vedantic school, then comes forward, and with an air of triumph insists upon Avidya, or ignorance, as the cause of this bondage. But ignorance, look upon it as you will, or from whatever standpoint it may please you to do so, cannot cause bondage. Ignorance, according to the Vedantins, is unreal; and that which is merely a phanton cannot be the cause of that which, like bondage, is a reality. If, however, it is affirmed that ignorance is real, and not phantom-like, the very foundation of monism, or exclusive belief in, or affirmation of, one entity, is shaken. But suppose ignorance is represented as both real and unreal, what then? Such a reconciliation of opposites, such a naked paradox, is almost unthinkable, and cannot be accepted by any but "children and madmen." Such a thing, moreover, which at one and the same time is both real and unreal, is not included in the six all-embracing categories of the Vaiseshikas, *viz.*, substance, quality, action, generality, particularity and inherence. How, then can its existence be admitted?

The idealist then advances, and affirms that, as nothing but thought exists, bondage is unreal and dreamy. But here, again, the premises are not correct. Our intuition of the external world proves its reality as decidedly as our intuitive knowledge of thought proves its reality. If intuition is to be set aside as fallacious or unreliable in the one case, it ought to be cast overboard in the other also. The believer in momentary existences, or he who believes that existence, instead of being a continuous, connected chain, consists of distinct and separate parts, each leaping into momentary existence only to be replaced immediately by its successor, steps forward or walks into the arena with his theory, which, but for the fact that nothing is too absurd in the region of metaphysics or speculative science, might be looked upon as too odd to be entertained by sensible men even for a moment. He affirms that the bondage of the soul is occasioned by the influence of external objects of momentary duration. He, however, does not clearly see that external objects, being locally separate from the soul, cannot weave a net of bondage for it, and that things ephemeral, which make their appearance one after another, only to die, cannot have a permanent effect, as the bondage of the soul confessedly is. And the last gentleman whose opinions are weighed and found wanting, is the nihilist, who maintains that, as nothing exists but an eternal and unutterable void, bondage is suppositious,

a myth or a non-entity. This gentleman has directed against him the very weapons by which his brother champion the idealist is chased out of the arena.

Some of these opponents are regarded as brethren with mistaken notions, but the opprobrious epithet of heretic is applied to the rest, especially to those who uphold nihilism in one form or another.

The varied theories of the bondage of the soul which Kapila's system had to combat and overcome, indicate the forms of thought and belief, current in what might emphatically be called the Age of Indian Philosophy, and in times immediately subsequent to it. There was the tendency to reduce all forms of existence to space and time, or to merge the sensuous objects of nature into the suprasensuous forms of thought. There were the theories of the absolute and the relative, the unconditioned and the conditioned, propounded, matured, held as life, and fought for; as well as forms of thought arising from current superstition. There was, moreover, the transcendental type of monism, which, originating in pure Vedantic times, was being gradually fitted, by an inflexible and uncompromising logic, for that ascendancy which it has enjoyed in our country for ages untold. There was idealism ready to affirm the existence of nothing but pure thought, side by side with nihilism proclaiming an interminable and absolute void under diversified forms of fictitious and deceptive existence. And finally there was the strange and paradoxical theory of an endless chain of unconnected existences, an infinite concatenation of finite links without anything like an interdependence or correlation of parts. Do not our modern philosophers find some of their most favourite whims anticipated in these forms of thought.

It is desirable to state here, that Kapila's system, though thrown into the shade by the ascendant star of Vedantism, has maintained its influence, in spite of these forms of thought, so far as to give rise to the saying, quoted by Monier Williams in his excellent treatise, "*Indian Wisdom*," viz, "there is no knowledge like Sankhya and no power like Yoga." Let it not, moreover, be forgotten that the ascendancy of the Vedanta has been secured and maintained by an assimilative process; that is, in consequence of its adoption and assimilation to itself, of some of the characteristic ideas of the Sankhya philosophy. The Sankhya philosophy would exist in Vedantism in a noticeable form even if its existence as a separate system were utterly extinguished, or thrown beyond the confines of possibility.

The question must once more be raised:—"What is the cause of the universally admitted bondage of the soul?" Two



Aphorisms in Book I are calculated to bring us to the conclusion arrived at by the commentator, Nijana Bhikshu, who lived and flourished about three hundred years ago, *viz.*, that "the immediate cause of the bondage of the soul is the conjunction of Prakriti and of the soul." But the commentator is of course aware, as all students of Sankhya philosophy are, that the real cause lies beyond this conjunction, which, as Prakriti and soul are both pervasive, and fitted to attract each other by inherent laws, is inevitable, and from which, therefore, there is no exemption even for beatified souls. The true cause of the bondage of the soul is "non-discrimination." The soul is really different from Prakriti and its products, *viz.*, intelligence, egoism, mind, &c.; but it is led by non-discrimination to identify itself with them. Hence its bondage!

But the problem is not solved here. Another question arises. If the earth stands upon the elephant, what does the elephant stand upon? If non-discrimination is the cause of the bondage of the soul, what is the cause of non-discrimination? Some persons may be prone to maintain that merit or demerit is the cause of non-discrimination. But merit or demerit, desert, good or bad, springs from non-discrimination; and therefore we must merit one non-discrimination to explain another; and there will in consequence be a *regressus-*ad-infinitum**. But suppose we have recourse to the theory of spontaneity, and affirm that non-discrimination comes naturally and spontaneously into being, will not such a hypothesis be enough? No; for in that case there can be no guarantee that liberated souls shall be freed from its molestation. Non-discrimination is really "beginningless." But that which is beginningless is really everlasting or endless and therefore the emancipation of the soul, consequent on the annihilation of non-discrimination, is an impossibility. It is not, however, beginningless, indivisible and endless in the sense in which the soul is; but it is beginningless "like an onflow (which may be stopped)." Nor is this to be wondered at, considering the fact, that the beginningless, antecedent non-entity of a jar terminates as soon as it is made. Non-discrimination, though without beginning, is happily annihilable; and the question how it may be annihilated—is properly speaking, the burden of the book under review.

But before pointing out the means prescribed for bringing about this happy consummation, the annihilation of non-discrimination and the liberation of the soul under its bondage, let us ascertain what is said in these Aphorisms about the soul, and what about Prakriti, or, in other words, let us look into the psychology and physiology of this ancient document.

Let us, in the first place, group a number of its declarations about the soul (Purnah):—

"But not without the conjunction thereof (*i. e.*, of Prakriti) is there the connection of that (*i. e.*, of pain) with that (*viz.*, the soul), which is now essentially a pure and free intelligence"—(Book I, Aph. 19.)

"Because this is impossible for what is inactive (or, in other words, without motion, as the soul is, because all pervading, and therefore incapable of changing its place)"—(Book I, Aph. 49).

"Soul is something else than body, &c. Because that which is combined (and is therefore discernible) is for the sake of some other (not-discernible)"—(Book I, Aph. 139-140).

"And (the soul is not material) because of its superintendence (over Prakriti). And (the soul is not material) because of its being an experience"—(Book I Aph 142-143).

"From the several allotment of births, a multiplicity of souls (is to be inferred)—" (Book I, Aph. 149)

"It (soul) is altogether free, (but seemingly) multiform (or different in appearance from a free thing) through a delusive resemblance of being bound. It (soul) is a witness through its sense-organs (which quit it on liberation). The nature of soul is constant freedom. And finally (the nature of the soul is) indifference (to pain and pleasure alike). Its (soul's) fancy of being an agent is from the proximity of intelligence"—(Book I Aph. 160-164).

"It cannot be of its own nature, (that is to say) meditation cannot belong to soul essentially, because of the immobility of the soul"—(Book II, Aph. 44.)

"Bondage and liberation do not belong naturally to soul (and would not even appear to be), but for non-discrimination"—(Book III, Aph. 71.)

"Soul is, for there is no proof that it is not. This (soul) is different from the body, &c. because of heterogeneousness (or complete difference between the two)"—(Book VI. Aph. 102).

The plurality of soul is proved by the distribution (announced by the Veda itself in such texts as whoso understand this, these are immortal, while others experience sorrow."—(Book V. Aph. 45.)

These texts are fitted to prove that, according to the Sankhya system, souls are multitudinous, immaterial, uncompounded, undiscernible, all-pervading, immobile, and inactive. They are uncreate, and essentially intelligence and freedom. They superintend or guide the evolutions of Prakriti, and experience pleasure and pain, but in a unique sense.

As regards the origin of souls, the theory of creationism can not but be discarded in a system which is essentially atheistic,

and which at the same time cannot homologate so incongruous an idea as that of a pure spirit emanating from impure matter or from non-entity. Its great principle, *ex nihilo nihil fit*, is emphatically stated in Aphorism 78 of the very first Book :—"A thing is not made out of nothing (that is to say, it is not possible that out of nothing—*i. e.*, out of a non-entity—a thing should be made, *i. e.*, an entity should arise."

The theory of what in theological parlance or phraseology is called traducianism, or that of souls propagating souls by the laws of generation, is also repulsive to a system which looks upon the absence of all desire, and all activity, voluntary if not automatic, as essential to their perfect freedom from misery. And, therefore, the remaining theory of the pre-existence of souls, maintained by so many philosophers of so many different schools in ancient times, and in the church by no less a man than Origen, is the only theory that can be propounded in consistency with the principles of the Sankhya School. Souls are, therefore, represented as increate; but it is to be observed that the glory of being so does not belong to them exclusively.

Again they are said to be multitudinous, or rather innumerable, to avoid another difficulty. The object of creation or rather evolution being to effect the liberation of souls from the power or influence of non-discrimination, these must be numerous or innumerable to prevent the premature collapse or cessation of omnific work. The greater the number of souls, the longer is the process which first enslaves them one after another, and then effects their liberation singly, not *en masse*. The idea of the diffusiveness of souls is but a corollary deducible from their numerousness. It ought not to be forgotten that the Hindu philosopher, like his brother philosophers of other ancient schools, had at best but gross ideas of spiritual substances, and was therefore prone to confound them with material substances of a tenuous nature, such as ether, &c. Souls could not therefore be, according to him, multitudinous without being all diffusive and all pervasive. But is not each soul in itself, or apart from the congeries or mass of souls, diffusive and pervasive? To some extent it is; but perhaps not all-diffusive and all pervasive; though all that is said of souls and Prakriti may lead one to the conclusion that they overlap and interpenetrate one another, and are, moreover, overlapped and interpenetrated by Prakriti. The predications with reference either to the soul or Prakriti are by no means marked by perfect consistency and harmony.

Activity, as has already been indicated, can on no account be attributed to souls, it being invariably associated with pain and

misery through desire and aversion. Souls, therefore, are passionless and perfectly quiescent. But intelligence is certainly ascribed to souls ;—they are said to be intelligence itself. It may be said that intelligence and perfect quiescence can not co-exist ; and that, souls being subjects of knowledge, they must pass through various states of consciousness, such as sensations, intellections, emotions and volitions ; especially as omniscience, implying unchangeable thought and feeling, is not ascribed to them. But intelligence in this case, as in that of the Supreme Spirit of the Upanishads, is tantamount to non-intelligence, inasmuch as it makes or implies no distinction between self and not-self, subject and object. The Hindu philosopher is prone to look upon the pure spirit as a material entity of extreme tenuity ; and he speaks of its intelligence, as he speaks of the color of a coloured substance, as a material attribute, inherent rather than accidental. According to him, the intelligence of the soul is its golden color, its transparency, its luminousness. Its inherence in the soul can no more be the cause of intellectual, emotional and volitional activity, than the color of a colored substance, say the rosy hue of a rose, can be the cause of any display of activity on its part. Nor must it be forgotten, that intelligence in the proper sense of the term, is, according to this system, a product of Prakriti, the root-principle of nature, not an attribute or predicate of the soul.

The soul's essence is not merely intelligence but freedom. Then why talk of its bondage, a thing which, as contradictory to its nature, cannot exist in it without annihilating it. Here the Sankhya philosopher seems to falter for a moment, but gets rid of the difficulty with an ingenuity which may be commended. The soul's bondage is reflectional, not real. Its proximate cause is contact with Prakriti, the root-principle of nature, called the *Amulam mulam*, the rootless root, or, in modern phraseology, the cause uncaused. This principle attracts the soul, just as loadstone attracts iron ; or it is attracted by the soul which is represented as thoroughly immobile.

In this description, however, our philosopher loses the balance of his logic, and gets entangled between the horns of a dilemma. If he maintains that the soul is attracted by Prakriti into juxtaposition with itself, the doctrine of its immobility is neutralized ; while if the conjunction of the two is attributed to the attractive power of the soul, its complete passivity or quiescence is made problematical. The Sankhya philosopher gets out of the horns by ascribing to the soul some kind of automatic influence or attractive power. Voluntary activity is most emphatically thrown out of the circle of the soul's predicates ; but some irresistible influence

or virtue emanates from it, in the same manner in which some mysterious influence is exerted automatically by the load-stone over a piece of iron. But our philosopher does not see that there is absolutely no necessity of his positing an attractive force either in the soul or in Prakriti to account for their conjunction. Both the substances are in his opinion all-pervasive ; and therefore their conjunction is inevitable. But here a fresh difficulty of an appalling nature makes its appearance. If Prakriti and souls are so universally diffusive that their union, or rather interpenetration, is inevitable, why are not souls simultaneously brought into bondage, and where are the beatified souls lodged ?

Leaving this difficulty unremoved, as the Sankhya philosopher leaves it, let us advert to the lamentable fruits of the inevitable contact of souls with Prakriti. From it proceed all the troubles of the mind (*manas*), which is a product of Prakriti, and therefore no portion of the soul ; and its sufferings are only reflected in the luminous and quiescent soul, and in this reflection consists its fictitious bondage. The soul is, therefore, in a very loose sense called an experiencer ; and all that can properly be predicated of it is, that the ephemeral pleasures and pains brought upon the mind by its own malignant activity are reflected in its tranquil substance. In a sense still looser, as we shall see, the soul is called the ruler of Prakriti, and the witness and regulator of its evolutions.

But does not the Sankhya philosopher assume the reality of the bondage of the soul in his argument with the Vedanta and other philosophers of the phenomenal school ? But by the bondage of the soul he means in reality the bondage of the mind, but as the mind is only a material evolute, its bondage can not be real, at least, in a spiritual sense. This is one of the glaring inconsistencies into which our philosopher is betrayed in spite of his logical acumen and philosophic penetration.

The existence of a soul distinct or different from the innumerable souls posited by Sankhya philosophy, bearing relation to them as that which the creator bears to the creature, or the ruler to the subject, or the benefactor to the dependent, or even the superior to the inferior, is peremptorily denied. But is something like realism maintained in the Aphorisms ascribed to Kapila, such as may justify our looking upon multitudinous souls as modifications of one primal soul, their generic head ? Such an idea is not discoverable in them, though it might have been, and perhaps was, originated in his school in subsequent times. The idea appears in Nijana Blikshu's commentary, in a connexion, however, which makes it difficult to ascertain whether the primal soul spoken of is the generic soul, the pattern and exemplar of all, or whether it

is nothing less than the pervasive, all-embracing spirit of God Himself.

In the Sankhya Aphorisms are posited two, and only two, entities, souls which are neither evolutes nor evolvent, and *Prakriti*, the evolvent root-principle of nature, and therefore not an evolute. Is there not a third entity spoken of as eternal, in the sense of having existed throughout past eternity, but not everlasting in the sense of being inherently fitted to exist throughout future eternity? Is not non-discrimination represented as having existed throughout past eternity, though terminable, or rather destined to pass into non-existence and continue therein for an almost incalculable cycle of ages? Is non-discrimination real or non-real? If real, the dualism assumed vanishes into thin air, or gives place to triadism. If unreal, how can it hold in bondage realities like living souls? Are we to look upon it as the Vedantins look upon their ignorance, or Nescience, or *Maya*, as both real and unreal? But such contraries cannot meet in an entity; such union in one substance is unthinkable. The very argument which the Sankhya philosopher sets in battle array against the Vedantic notion of the soul being held in bondage by ignorance, may be marshalled in all its entirety against his favorite non-discrimination. But this he does not pause to consider.

Now let us see what the Aphorisms say of the second entity, *Prakriti*, the self-evolvent principle, to which creation, or existence, in all its proteus-like forms, is to be traced, as well as the temporary bondage and ultimate emancipation of souls. The word *Prakriti*, we may mention by the way, has been, as a rule, translated 'nature,' but by no means with accuracy. \*It may be rendered, in deference to the scientific phraseology of the day, 'the primordial form'; but the better word is 'the self-evolving principle, the root of nature, called *Anmulam mulam*, the rootless root.'

The passages to be extracted in illustration of the nature of *Prakriti* are these:—

"*Prakriti* is the state of equipoise of goodness (*Sattva*), passion (*rajas*), and darkness (*tamas*)."—(Book I., Aph. 61).

"Since the root has no root, the root (of all) is rootless (that is to say, there is no other cause of *Prakriti*, because there would be a *regressus-ad-infinitum*, if we were to suppose another cause, which by parity of reasoning, would require another cause, and so on, without end). Even if there be a succession, there is a halt at some one point, and so it is merely a name (that we give to the points in question) when we speak of the root of things under the name of *Prakriti*. Alike in respect of *Prakriti* and of both (Soul and *Prakriti*, is the argument for the uncreated existence).—(Book I., Aph. 67-69).

"Her (*Prakriti's*) imperceptibility arises from her subtlety. (*Prakriti*) exists because her existence is gathered from beholding of productions (which have these qualities)."—(Book I., Aph. 109-110).

Though she be unintelligent, yet *Prakriti* acts—as is the case with milk (that is to say, as milk, without reference to man's efforts, quite of itself changes into the form of curd). Or, as is the case with acts (or on-goings), for we see them, of time, &c. (the spontaneous action of *Prakriti* is proved from what is seen). The action of time, for instance, takes place quite spontaneously in the shape of one season's now departing and another's coming on:—let the behaviour of *Prakriti* also be thus,—for the supposition conforms to observed facts. But still a senseless *Prakriti* would never energize, or would energize in a wrong way, less because of there being (in her case) no such continuing as, "This is my means of producing experience," &c. To this he replies,—From her own nature she acts, not from thought—just as a servant (that is to say, as in the case of an excellent servant, naturally, merely from habit, the appointed and necessary service of the master is engaged in, and not with a view to his own enjoyment, just so does *Prakriti* energize from habit alone). Or, from attraction by deserts which have been from eternity.—(Book III., Aph. 59-63.)

Here we bring our string of quotations, from the text—as well as from the commentary—to a close, and emphasize the points made. *Prakriti* is eternal, imperceptible, indiscerpt, unintelligent, and ever active, except when in a state of equipoise. It resembles the soul in eternal duration, imperceptibility, and undiscerptibility, but differs from it in activity or energy of self-evolution, not in its want of intelligence, as the intelligence of the soul, being destitute of the elements of self-consciousness and world-consciousness, is equivalent to non-intelligence.

Here a couple of questions ought to be raised and disposed of.

The first is—If *Prakriti* is imperceptible, how are we to be sure of its existence? To be able to answer this question, it is necessary to look into the laws of evidence which are recognized in the Sankhya School. The champions of this school admit only three kinds of proof, *viz*, perception (*Prataksia*), inference (*Anuman*), and testimony (*Salida*); and they discard comparison (*upamana*), which the Logical schools add to the list, as well as the two others admitted in the Vedic schools. The objects of the external world make their existence known to us through the medium of perception, or the

impressions made upon the senses by them. But they are, each of them, discernible, and consequently destructible. Their discernibility, or divisibility, proves that they are not eternal, and that, therefore, they cannot be the ground of their own existence. The law of inference leads the mind to look for the cause of their existence or manifestation apart from them; and the ultimate ground at which we arrive, when we trace the different lines of causation to their converging points, is *Prakriti*. Its existence, therefore, is proved by inference based on perception.

Again it is plain that these objects, evolved from *Prakriti*, do not exist for themselves. Or, in other words, *Prakriti* does not evolve for its own advantage. With its varieties of evolutes, it exists for something else, as "axes for cutting," or "houses" for the benefit of those who dwell in them. For whom, or for what does *Prakriti* evolve, or do the evolutes of *Prakriti* exist? For souls, certainly. The laws of inference, then, not merely establish the existence of *Prakriti*, but that of souls also. And as *Prakriti*, like the soul, is indiscernible, it is uncreate and eternal. In this piece of reasoning the doctrine of final causes is recognized as in the preceding are the doctrines of efficient and material causes.

Now comes the second question:—How can *Prakriti* be called discernible, seeing that it consists of the three qualities (*gunas*), goodness, passion, and darkness, held in equipoise?

What are these *gunas* or qualities? Are they elementary substances of extreme tenuity, or are they mere predicates or attributes of substances? If they are qualities or attributes, in the ordinary sense of the term, of substances, their inherence in *Prakriti* does not militate against its indiscernibility. If, however, they are elementary substances, their union in *Prakriti* establishes its complex nature and its consequent discernibility. Their nature should, therefore, be thoroughly looked into before the claim of indiscernibility advanced in favor of *Prakriti* can be adjudicated upon.

The word *guna*, generally translated "quality," means a cord, and the three *gunas* of the Sankhya School are the three cords by which the soul, or rather *Prakriti* itself, is fettered. They are *sattva*, *rajas* and *tamas*. The word *Sattva* means purity and goodness; and the *Sattva* *guna* is that which enlightens, soothes, purifies, causes virtue, and communicates pleasure and happiness. It prevails in ethereal regions, and causes the enlightenment, happiness and joy, characteristic of those seats of purity and goodness. In the world it predominates in fire, and that is the reason why flame tapers towards the sky, and sparks fly upwards. When it abounds



In man, he becomes virtuous and happy ; and to its preponderance must be ascribed the acknowledged happiness of superior orders of beings, such as Prajapatis, Indras, Pitris, Gandhavas, Gods and Demigods. The word *rajas* means passion, energy and activity ; and the characteristics of the *rajas-guna* are variability, activity, vehemence and restlessness. It is accompanied by vice and misery, and when it prevails in man, he becomes a child of error and wretchedness. It abounds in the atmosphere, and accounts for its fitful and erratic movements. And lastly, the word *Tamas* means stolidity and darkness ; and the *tamas-guna* is that which produces sorrow, dulness, stupidity and inaction. It predominates in earth and water, and accounts for their downward tendency ; and when it abounds in man, it makes him sorrowful, stupid, lazy and immobile.

The three qualities abound respectively in upper, mundane and nether creations. " Aloft (above the world of mortals) it (the creation) abounds in (the quality of) purity. Beneath (that is to say under the world of mortals) (the creation) abounds in darkness. In this midst, (that is in the world of mortals) (the creation) abounds in passion." (Book III, Aph. 48-50.)

But it is to be observed that they are, as a rule, if not invariably, found mixed in varied proportions never almost dissevered or separated from one another. In the highest ethereal regions, as in superior orders of beings and the very best of men, purity abounds ; but it is not altogether dissociated from its troublesome companions, inasmuch as these exist, albeit in very small proportions, along with it. And in the lowest infernal regions, as in demons and evil spirits, as well as the worst of men, some degree of purity, however inconsiderable, is found in conjunction with the preponderant passion and darkness. This fact explains or shows the distinction there is between these qualities, or rather material attributes, and the substances in which they are found mixed in varied proportions. They are almost inseparable in reality, though separable in thought. They are a material trinity in unity, and unity in trinity. They are held in equipoise only in *Prakriti* in its quiescent state, and their union in it in equal proportions cannot militate against the theory of its eternity and indescriptibility. They are moreover, ubiquitous, existing in all the productions or modifications of *Prakriti*, in all the regions of space, in endlessly varied proportions. And they are, in their joint capacity, as well as singly, an evil ; they being the cause of that bondage of the mind which is reflected in the soul, and from the reflection of which it has to be liberated.

*Prakriti*, in its Trinitarian essence, is the great omnific principle,

and it energises spontaneously, as milk coagulates into curd when let alone. Though destitute of intelligence, and acting from a simple automatic impulse, it never errs, as "an excellent servant" anticipates and obeys the commands of his master "from habit." The order of creation is presented in Aph. 61 of Book I:—From *Prakriti* (proceeds) intelligence (*Buddhi*), from intelligence egoizer, or I-maker (*Ahankara*), from egoizer the fine, subtle elements (*Tanmatras*), and both sets (internal and external) of organs (*Indriya*) and from the subtle elements the gross elements (*Sthul bhuta*). Intelligence, the first product, or evolute, of self evolving *Prakriti*, is called great (*Mahat*), because it is a principle of "superlative purity," and occupies in creation the same place which the Prime Minister occupies in a well organized government. It gives birth to egoizer, which is the cause of the distinction we make between self and not-self, a distinction fictitious rather than real, and one which proves to us a source of vexation and trouble. Then come the fine, tenuous elements, imperceptible to man, but perceptible to superior beings, or even to man when his natural powers are indefinitely enlarged by meditation, *viz.*, sound, touch, color, taste or sapidity, and smell. These seven principles are evolutes of *Prakriti*, and evolvent; and to their omnic activity, or prolific energy, creation in its multifarious aspects is to be traced. Then there are sixteen other principles, which are evolutes or productions, not evolvents or producers, *viz.*, the five gross elements, earth, fire, water, air, ether; the five organs of knowledge (*gyan-indriyani*) the eye, the ear the nose, the tongue, the skin; the five organs of action (*Karma indriyani*) the hands, the feet, the larynx or the organ of speech, the orifice and the generative organ; and the mind (*manas*) called the eleventh organ, the real cause of the bondage under which it itself groans, and from the reflection of which the soul has to be freed.

The existence of these twenty four *tattvas*, or categories, is proved by perception and inference, which last is a process of demonstration rising from what is perceptible to what is imperceptible. For instance, the gross elements, earth, fire, water, air, are perceptible to mortals; and their existence is proved by the simple testimony of the senses. But they do not explain their own existence; and therefore we are led by the laws of reasoning to the tenuous principles, the subtle rudiments from which they proceed, and by which their existence is accounted for. But these subtle elements, imperceptible to men in general, though perceptible to superior beings, or even men endowed with powers of perception keener and more

expanded than human beings ordinarily possess, are only modifications of the I-maker, which again is a modification of intelligence, the first-born of Prakriti increate. Again, the mind, the eleventh organ, is another modification of the I-maker, and its existence is proved by that of the perceptible organs of knowledge and action.

The existence of the twenty-fifth category, the soul, which is neither an evolute nor an evolvent, is proved by the creative energy of Prakriti, which energizes, not for its own advantage, but for that of an entity apart from itself. This is emphatically stated in such verses as these :—"From Brahma down to a post for its (soul's) sake is creation till there be discrimination (between soul and Prakriti) on which its liberation ensues." "Prakriti's creation is for the sake of another, though it be spontaneous, for she is not the experiencer, just like a cart's carrying saffron for the sake of its master."

But why not carry the arguments from inference a step further, and recognize a Lord (Iswara behind the varied) manifestations of *Prakriti*, as the ultimate ground of existence? There are insuperable obstacles in the way. A Lord cannot possibly be the creator of the universe. If he exists, he must either be free or bound. If free, he cannot have a desire to create prevalent enough to determine his will, or lead to volition and action. It is an established maxim of Hindu philosophy, that a desire leading irresistibly to action, good or bad, is bondage. Such a desire on the part of God cannot but militate against his assumed freedom. If, however, he is bound, how could he possibly create? The supposition, therefore, of a Lord behind the veil of shifting phenomena, is both irrational and useless.

How thoroughly the atheistic speculations of our vaunted age of progress were anticipated in times which may be called pre-historic, in India and other countries! The scientists and philosophers of the day now and then betray a little meekness, to which their prototypes of ancient times were utter strangers. Given matter and the laws immanent in it, they have no difficulty whatever in explaining the wonders of creation, or solving the knotty problems of existence. But they manifest a little hesitation when they have to settle the question :—"How came matter to be, and how and by whom were its laws impressed upon it?" Their hesitation, however, is momentary, as they shake it off by assuming the eternity of matter, and the eternal inherence of its laws, as well as by upholding the principle, *ex nihilo nihil fit*. But our redoubtable philosophers of ancient times presented a braver front, and did not hesitate for a moment in affirming with oracular assurance the eternity of matter ;

and their dictum, as has already been said runs thus:—"A thing is not made out of nothing." And even when they admitted the existence of a God, their principle, that an impure thing, such as matter in this opinion is, cannot possibly emanate from, or be created by, a pure Being, made it impossible for them to represent such a Being as its Creator. God or no God, matter, according to their teaching, is eternal, along with the laws inherent in it.

But the way in which our philosophers dispose of the argument based on testimony, which is one of the three kinds of proof admitted in his school, is worthy of consideration. By testimony they understand, not only what is ordinarily included in that term, but a great deal more, even the teachings of revelation, and those of devotees and adepts, who by virtue of intense meditation have obtained, and may obtain, the power of recalling to their minds the varied events which occurred to them in several, if not all, of their past lives, and that of discovering and bringing to light occult truths, or truths hidden among the arcana of nature. But revelation distinctly affirms the existence of a Lord. How is this to be accounted for? Is revelation to be discarded as a tissue of Old Men's Fables? Our time-serving philosophers did not allow themselves to be ostensibly carried thus far by their scepticism. They got rid of the difficulty by resorting to orbits of shuffling criticism, not unknown to modern sceptics. ("The scriptural texts which make mention of 'the Lord' are) either glorifications of the liberated souls or homages to the recognized (deities of the Hindu Pantheon)." And, besides, "There is scripture for this (world's) being the production of Prakriti (not of a Lord)."

It may be mentioned here that, even when Hindu philosophy allows the existence of a god, it makes him so quiescent and inactive, that creation cannot possibly be attributed to him. We cannot ascribe creation to him without making him subject to passion, the second of the three qualities from which he must be free, and, therefore, representing him as actually held in bondage. Nor can he be the governor of the universe without being "selfish" and "liable to grief." In Book V. we have these Aphorisms:—

Ahp. 3—"If a Lord were governor, (then) having intended his own benefit, his government (would be selfish) as is the case (with ordinary governors) in the world."

("He must then be) just like a worldly lord (and) otherwise (than you desire that we should conceive of him, ; for if we agree that the lord is also benefited, he also must be something

mundane,—just like a worldly lord—because, since his desires are (on that supposition) not (previously) satisfied, he must be liable to grief.” And besides the supposition of a lord is useless. He cannot create, cannot govern, cannot judge, cannot reward or punish—the last prerogative, *viz.*, that of bestowing rewards and inflicting punishments being a prerogative of works, not of God. In Aph 2 of this Book, we have these words:—“Not from its (the world’s) being governed by the Lord, is there the effectuation of the fruit, for it is by works (that is by merit and demerit) that this is accomplished—(by works alone which are indispensable,—and if we do make the additional and cumbersome supposition of a lord, he cannot reward a man otherwise than according to his works.”

If there is no Lord, the question arises, why believe in a revelation at all? The proper answer to this question brings forward a theory, which in absurdity has not its parallel even in the history of wild speculation. The Sankhya philosopher does not hold, like the Mimamsakas and the Vedantins, the eternity of the Vedas. The forty-fifth Aphorism of the Fifth Book of the work under review runs thus:—“The Veda is not from eternity, for there is scripture for its being a production.” If not eternal, it must have been written either by God or by some gifted man. It could not possibly have been written, or vouchsafed through verbal communication, or in any other way, by God, for the Sankhya philosophy does not recognize his existence. Nor could it have been written by a gifted man, such a man must be either liberated or in bondage. If liberated, he could not have a prevailing desire leading to its composition; and if in bondage, he could not but have lacked “the power” needed to bring about so glorious a result.

The Vedas, therefore, could not have proceeded either from God or from man, nor are they eternal. How then is the mystery involved in their existence to be unravelled? Here is the explanation:—“The Vedas, just like an expiration, proceed of themselves from the self-existent, through the force of fate, unperceived by thought.” To explain this statement of the commentator, Nijnana Bhikshu, two questions have to be raised. Who is the self-existent from whom the Vedas are said to have emanated as an expiration? The self-existent must either be Prakriti itself, or some evolute of Prakriti, there being nothing knowable or within the reach of proof behind it, and the soul being incapable of sending these venerated books out even as an efflation. The Sankhya philosophers speak of an emergent deity, whom they call Brahma, when he creates, Vishnu when he preserves, and Siva or Mahadeva when

he destroys. This emergent deity is the first evolute of Prakriti, intelligence, called Mahat, the Great One, not, however, personal intelligence, but something like general intelligence, the intelligence of which personal intelligence, mine or thine, is only a form. This great one, the first-born of Prakriti increate, is the unconscious author of the Vedas, because they emanate from him as an expiration.

When do they emanate? Here we have to unfold the doctrine of metempsychosis, which underlies all the philosophical speculations of ancient India; which even those bold spirits, who, like Kapila and Buddha, cast aside all faith in God, personal, if not impersonal, did not dare abandon. Prakriti creates one world after another in endless succession, to meet the exigencies of human desert, or to afford scope for the consumption of the fruits of work. One world is evolved after another to reward or furnish cause, by its own accumulated work added to the tremendous load it inherits, for the existence of those which succeed. Every renovated world, with its shifting panorama of moral actions and moral deserts, is thus connected with an endless chain of antecedent, and an equally endless chain of consequent stages of existence. Each of these gradually unfolded stages of existence or works vanishes, when its appointed service is over, only to see another springing up, and contriving its great work of rewarding virtue and punishing vice. At each of these renovations of the world, the Vedas issue out of the emergent deity, called intelligence in the original Sutras, and the self-existent, or Brahma, in subsequent times, as an afflation.

In conclusion, let us ascertain what the work under review says of liberation, the great object and scope of all the speculations embodied in its pages. Prakriti creates or energizes, to liberate the soul from the bondage of non-discrimination, or misapprehension, or misconception. How is this effected? Not by worship, for worship takes for granted what is not admitted, the existence of a creative and controlling being behind the veil of natural phenomena; not by sacrifices, because these, as they inflict pain upon the victims, cannot but occasion pain to those by whom they are offered, by the law of retribution; not by rites and ceremonies of a bloodless character, because whatever efficacy they may have is of a transient, not a permanent, nature. These all are certainly praised in various parts of scripture. The sacrifice of the horse is said to give the offerer power to conquer all worlds, expiate sin, overcome death, and attain immortality. The juice of the soma, the moon-plant (*Asclepias acida*) is said to have conferred victory,

triumph, "effulgence" and "deathless being" on Indra himself, and the subordinate gods and goddesses of the Indian Parnassus. But it is to be borne in mind, that the benefits conferred by bloody and bloodless rites are evanescent, and that even the gods perish at every dissolution of the world, or at the consummation of every single stage of existence. "Many thousands of Indras and other gods have passed away in successive periods, overcome by time; for time is hard to overcome." Freedom from the galling yoke of transmigration, from an almost interminable chain of births and deaths, religious observances cannot possibly secure.

Such freedom is the result of right knowledge or discrimination, which is obtained by meditation. "From knowledge (acquired during mundane existence) comes salvation (soul's chief end)"—(Book III, Aph. 23). Knowledge alone, dissociated from, not in conjunction with, works, is the fountain of liberation, as the verse following the one quoted assures us,—“Since this (*viz.* knowledge) is the precise cause of liberation, there is neither association (of any thing else with it, *e. g.* good works) nor alternativeness (*e. g.*, of good works in its stead.) This knowledge is attained by meditation, on the nature and efficacy of which the following verses give information :—

“Meditation is the cause of the removal of desire (that affection of the mind by objects which is a hinderer of knowledge.) It (meditation, from the effectuation of which, and not from merely communing upon it,) knowledge arises, is perfected by the repelling of the modifications (of the mind which ought to be obstructed from all thoughts of anything.) This meditation is perfected by restraint, postures, and one's duties. Restraint (of the breath) is by means of expulsion and intention. Steady and (promoting) ease is a (suitable) posture, (such as the crossing of the arms). One's duty is the performance of the actions prescribed for one's religious order.”—(Book III, Aph. 30-35.)

The subject of meditation, and its varied appliances belongs, properly speaking, to Yoga philosophy, the counterpart, not only of the Sankhya system, but in some respects of every system of philosophy propounded in India, not excluding almost all of those systems, which, like Buddhism and its offshoots, are branded heterodox. Meditation, not in its incipient stages, but when perfected, years of close attention, and rigid conformity to its almost endless varieties of stringent rules, beget right knowledge, which dispels non-discrimination, and brings on emancipation. The essence of the knowledge begotten by meditation is the distinction between the soul and non-soul, the passive, quiescent, immobile spirits and the ever-active, plastic, formative Prakriti. When this distinction

is clearly apprehended by the mind, the soul is set free from the bondage of its desires and aversions, its good and bad deeds, and their woeful consequences in an almost endless chain of transmigrations.

The soul is, of course, in a very loose sense said to be set free, its bondage and liberation being nominal, not real,—reflections and shadows, not realities. The bondage and liberation spoken of throughout this book are in reality the bondage and liberation of Prakriti, which, first of all, weaves a net for its own entanglement by a process of evolution, and ultimately effects its own emancipation by a process of meditation. And to this mischievous activity it is impelled by passion (*rajas*), the second of the three qualities, which form its Trinitarian essence.

RAM CHANDRA BOSE.

---



## ART. VII.—SÚFIISM.

**I**T may seem somewhat strange that Sûfism, a mystical form of religion, should take its rise and flourish in a system so exact and uncompromising, so rigid and final as Islâm, but the truth is, that it is a re-action from the burden of a rigid law and a wearisome ritual; an attempt to reconcile philosophy with the dogmas of the Qurân. The needs of the human heart, the spirit of an Eastern people, required something warmer than the cold orthodoxy of the Faithful. The tendency of Sûfism is decidedly pantheistic, that is towards Pantheism from its philosophical side, as teaching that "there is one eternal and infinite substance of which all things that exist are modifications with no permanent individual existence." It is not so much the deification of the finite, as the nothingness of all phenomena. To the pantheistic Sûfi, the world and all things therein are fleeting. He does not assert that the world is divine, but that it is nothing. The perception of things is only an illusion; the world is a place

"Where nothing is, and all things seem,  
And we the shadows of a dream."

To the Sûfi God is all and in all—One without a second. Beneath the ever-shifting forms, One remains: under the unsubstantial accidents, One is real. "In Pantheism, God, conceived of as the substance of the world, if He lies behind all finite beings and objects, stands, at least, in precisely the same relation to all." Thus, in Sûfism the doctrine often leads to carelessness of life and to disregard of morality, for things base and things pure, intelligent and mean, are all alike related to that which is the substance of all.

Thus Jelâl-ud-din Rûmi \* says:—

" 'God's blessing' is the name of all that's good in man,  
'The curse of God' of all that's evil in our plan.  
In which of these two seas our streamlets may subside  
They but return into the source from whence their tide." †

A system which, in some aspects, conceives God to be as near

---

\* In this article, I take my illustrations from, and base my conclusions on, the teaching of the great master of Sûfism, Moulânâ Jelâl-ud-din Rûmi in the *Musnavi*, and on that of Mahmûd Shâhbiistârî in the *Gulshân-i-Râz*. For the English rendering of the Persian, I am indebted to recent translations of these works published by Trübner. It will be seen that the translations from the *Musnavi* are not very literal.

† صبغت الله نام ان رنگ لطيف \* لعنت الله بوى اين رنگ كئيف  
انچه از دريا بدريا مي—رود \* از همان جا كامد انجا مي—رود

to the heart in which selfishness and lust rule, as he is to the heart, in which purity and holiness have their sway, obliterates moral distinctions in act and life. In yielding to his nature, the Súfí may think he thus yields to God. To him "immersion in the natural is absorption in the divine." This is the natural outcome of the system, but not all Súfis are consistent, and it would be idle to deny that many a Musalmán mystic has tried to lead a higher life than that of his fellows around. That men are often better than their creed, is as true of the Súfí as of the orthodox Muslim.

Súfis, however, claim to be orthodox, and assert that they are the true expounders of the Qurán, and the Hadís (Traditional sayings of the Prophet.) They maintain that they know, as none others do, the esoteric meaning of the words given through, or spoken by, the Prophet :—

"The spirit 'tis gives value : words are mere pretence." \*

This spirit must be earnestly sought for, then

"Will unity be found as in a treasure." †

Jelál-ud-din Rúmí thus describes all those who do not know this esoteric meaning of the Muhammadan Revelation, whether contained in the Qurán or in the Hadís—

"Where'er you hear a note of God's truth-warbling bird, †  
You straightway seize its literal sense, just as 'tis heard,  
You then use suppositions of your darksome mind,  
And form, through wrong conclusions, guesses worse than blind.

"The Saints use terms of technical significance  
Unknown to worldly readers' crass ignorance,  
The language of the bird you learn, as to its notes ;  
But clean forget its sense, as sure as fancy dotes."

The orthodox Muhammadan tenet is that God, having created the world, retired to the 'arsh, the highest heaven, and now leaves His creatures to work out their salvation, according to the light vouchsafed to them through the prophets. He is a God afar off, a pitiless Force, a capricious Despot. From this idea Súfism revolts. According to it God is immanent in all His creatures : the sum of life, in whom all things live. He not only originated all action, but dwells with each individual.

"Eternal and temporal are not separate from one another,  
For in that Being this non-existent has it being." §

\* *ibid.* پائے معنی گیر صورت سرکشست

† *ibid.* تا بینی زیر آن وحدت چو کنج

‡ Muhammad.

§ قدیم و محدث از هم جدا نیست \* که از هستیست باقی داؤمانیست

*Gulshán-i-Ráz.*

The Súfî, the enlightened man, sees behind the veil. He knows *Allah* to be the One, the necessary Being, the First Cause. He looks on the whole world of phenomena as "not being."

"The whole world is merely an imaginary thing,  
It is like one point whirled round in a circle." \*

One day, when expounding his views, Jelâl-ud-din made the following statement: "Thou seest nought, save that thou seest God therein." A certain Darvish came forward and maintained that the use of the term "therein" indicated a receptacle, and that it might be argued that God would thus be comprehended, whereas He is in-comprehensible. To this, Jelâl answered, "The universe of God's qualities is the receptacle of the universe of God's essence; but these two universes are really one. The first of them is not He, the second of Them is not other than He. Those, apparently, two things, are in truth one and the same. How, then, is a contradiction in terms implied? God comprises the exterior and the interior. If we cannot say, He is the interior, He will not include the interior, but He comprises all, and in Him all things have their being. He is, then, the receptacle also, comprising all existences as the Qurân says, 'He comprises all things.'" The Darvish was silenced and became a disciple.

This is a very good illustration of the kind of discussions held amongst the doctors of Súfism, and according to the accounts which have come down to us, they generally convinced all gain-sayers who seem to have been taken aback by such obscure, and in most cases, unintelligible language.

In a verse already quoted from Jelâl-ud-din (p. 324), it would seem as if Súfis hold that evil, as well as good, has its origin and return in God; but there are many statements in the Súfî writings which clearly imply just the opposite, and certainly the general teaching of Súfism seems to be that evil proceeds, not from 'Being,' but from 'not being.' Thus—

"Being is purely good in whatever it be,  
If it also contains evil, that proceeds from 'other.' " †

\* جهان خود جمله امر اعتیاد است \* چو آن یک نقطه کندر دور ساریست \*

*Gulshân-i-Râz.*

† وجود آنجا که باشد محض خیر است \* اگر شریست در وی آن ز غیر است †

*Ibid.*

At the same time, it is held that both are in some way manifestations of the 'Truth.'

"How can it be lust which ravishes men's hearts,  
For 'the Truth' now and again appears as evil  
Know 'the Truth' in the garb of good is the 'True Faith';  
'The Truth' in the garb of evil is evil, is the word of Satan."\*

"There is no worker in creation, save *Allah*" is a dogma of Sufism, but with this is held as firmly "evil comes from 'other.'" This resembles the Augustinian view that evil is a negation, a departure from God, who is the source and sum of all existence. But the fact is that Sufism has not solved the difficulty of the origin and existence of evil; it leaves the problem where it finds it in the Qurán, which is in some places distinctly necessitarian in its teaching, and in others, as strongly on the side of free-will. Take, for example, the two following passages.—"By a soul and Him who balanced it, and breathed into it its wickedness and purity."

(*Súra* 91-8). There is little room for freedom of the will in this. Then take the passage—

"Whatever good betideth thee is from God, but whatever betideth thee of evil is from thyself"—(*Súra* 4-81).

Súfis claim to be the best and truest expounders of the Qurán, but they have not found a key to reconcile these conflicting statements, and so it is not to be wondered at, that there is in their system a want of consistency on this question.

As all created things are included in the category of 'not being,' it is the duty of the man who would be perfect to rise from this state to that of 'contingent being,' where, for a while, laws and creeds are needed for his guidance; but the path lies onward, and the traveller on the mystic road leaves these behind, and as he ascends higher and higher towards 'Being,' he is freer and freer from outward restraints. He returns to God and lives in God?

We may here notice that to the ordinary Muslim the meaning of the dogma of *Jabr* is, that God compels men to carry out His will. Practically, *Jabr* is pure fatalism. The Súfi cannot deny the Quránic teaching on this point, but he regards this *Jabr*, this almighty power, as the constant working of the Supreme Being in the world of phenomena, the manifestation of the divine energy in creation, the immanence of 'Being' in 'not being.' The dogma is thus softened down to a pantheistic view of God, and

کجا شهوت دل مردم رباید \* که حق که که ز باطل می نماید \*  
حق اندر کسوت حق دین حق دان \* حق اندر باطل آید کار عیطان

*Gulshán-i-Ráz.*

deprived of its harsh and rugged aspect. The Muhammadan doctrine of fatalism supplies a basis for the mystic dogmas of Quietism.

The principle underlying the Súfî system is that "sense and reason cannot transcend phenomena, or see the real Being which underlies them all; so sense and reason must be ignored and superseded in favour of the 'inner light,' the divine illumination of the heart, which is the only faculty whereby men perceive the infinite."

Then, when thus enlightened, Sufis see that all the external phenomena, including man, is but an illusion, and as it is "non-existent, it is an evil, because it is a departure from the real Being." The illuminated man gets little help from reason, in fact, it fails him here :

"But, in addition to reason man has a certain faculty,  
Whereby he understands hidden mysteries." \*

This faculty (*taur*) is evoked by desire of the truth. This idea is not peculiar to the Súfî. It underlies the teaching of the mystics of all ages. To take only one, Hugo of St. Victor calls it the 'eye of the soul,' by which he had immediate intuitions of God. He asserts "that this eye beholds what the eye of sense and the eye of reason cannot see, what is both within us and above us. God within, is both what we must flee, and whither we must flee. The highest and lowest are so far identical. Thus do the pure in heart see God."† This is quite in accordance with the Súfî view.

Súfis, in support of their view that the first and most important act of life, is to attain a knowledge of God, quote the verse, "When God said to the angels, 'I am about to place a Viceregent on the earth,' they said: 'Wilt Thou place therein one who shall commit abomination and shed blood?' Nay, we celebrate Thy praise and holiness. God answered them, 'Verily, I know that ye wot not of:.'" (*Súra* 2-28.)—It is said that this verse proves, that though the great majority of men would commit abomination, some would receive the divine light and attain to a knowledge of God. Another verse is also quoted :

"Then found they one of our servants to whom we had vouchsafed mercy, and whom we have instructed with our knowledge"—(*Súra* 18-64.)

There is, too, a tradition to the effect that David said, "'O Lord! why hast Thou created mankind?' God replied, 'I am a hidden treasure, and I would fain become known.'" It is the work of the

---

\* وراى عقل طوري دارد انسان \* که بشناسد بدان اسرار پنهان  
*Gulshán-i-Rās.*

† Hours with the Mystics—Vaughan, vol. 1, p. 158.

Súfi to find that treasure, to gain that knowledge, and so to attain to the Divine light.

The earlier Muhammadan mystics sought to impart life to a rigid and formal ritual. They had no intention of becoming unorthodox. Many of their utterances are very beautiful, such as, "As neither meat nor drink profits the diseased body, so no warning avails to touch the heart full of the love of this world." "The work of a holy man doth not consist in this, that he eats grain, and clothes himself in wool, but in the knowledge of God and submission to His will." "Thou deservest not the name of a learned man, till thy heart is emptied of the love of this world." "Hide thy good deeds as closely as thou would'st hide thy sins."

"And he'll ne'er take his flight towards Heaven's eternal King,  
Who holds at heart the thought that he's a perfect Thing."

One of these men,—men who often successfully withstood the exercise of unrighteous power, was one day ushered into the presence of the Khalif Hárún-ar-Rashíd, who said to him, "How great is thy abnegation?" The mystic replied, "Thine is greater." "How so," said the Khalif. "Because I made abnegation of this world, and thou makest abnegation of the next." Even in a book like the *Musnavi*, we find Jelál-ud-din, who inculcates Súfism, pure and simple, with all its disregard for the outward restraints of an objective revelation, sometimes teaching sounder principles, thus:—

"To trust in God, and yet put forth our utmost skill,  
The surest method is to work His holy will;  
The friend of God must work."

This earlier mysticism, however, gradually developed into Súfism, and towards the close of the second century of the Hijra, it became prevalent. The first fervour of conquest was over and men settled down to consider the grounds of their faith. A reaction from formalism was the result. The creed of Islám concerning God, simple as it was, did not satisfy the minds of those who wanted to know more about Him. Especially is this true of the Persians, who never took kindly to Islám, as the orthodox proclaimed it, and who were, after their conversion, quite ready to adopt a system which, whilst it professes on its exoteric side to be faithful to the Qurán, yet, has its esoteric doctrines about God, good and evil, and the origin and nature of the universe.

The Zindiq and Mutazalá controversies also were introducing a system of scholasticism, from which the Persian mind revolted. Reason and logic could not with him take the place of a revelling in the sense of the beautiful, or of meditating on the union of God with man. As Grecian literature, too, became more accessible, it

produced a latitudinarian spirit which Sûfîsm imbibed. Thus the way was fully prepared for the rise of this school of thought in a system which seems the most unlikely to have fostered such mystical tendencies.

In the third century of the Hijra, there was no doubt as to the pantheistic development of Sûfîsm. Al-Hallâj then taught in Baghdâd thus: "I am the Truth, there is nought in Paradise but God, I am He whom I love, and He whom I love is I; we are two souls dwelling in one body. When thou seest me, thou seest Him; and when thou seest Him, thou seest me."

The authorities in Baghdâd could not permit this, and Hallâj, one of the earliest martyrs of Sûfîsm, was flogged, tortured, and finally beheaded by order of the Khalif. The phrase *Allâh-o-bas*, "God, and nothing else," expresses the stage now arrived at.

The following verse from Hafiz, gives, in its mystical meaning, a clue to the Sûfî system—

"The prayer mat stain with wine, if so,  
The Magian's favour thou canst gain,  
The traveller in the land should know  
The ways and customs of the Inn."

The traveller is the Sâlik, the man in search of union with the Divine.

Wine is the Divine love; the Inn is the stage in which the traveller is immersed in the Divine mysteries. It is, according to Sûfîsm, an error to suppose that man has any existence apart from God, and not until this error is put away, can the mystic journey be entered upon:—

"Plant one foot upon the neck of self,  
The other in thy Friend's domain;  
In every thing His presence see,  
For other vision is in vain."

Or, as Mahmûd in the *Gulshân-i-Râz* puts it—

"Like Moses, son of Amram, press onward in this road  
Till you hear the words, 'Verily, I am God,'  
So long as the Mount \* of your being remains before you,  
The answer to 'Show me' is *Thou shalt not see me*.†

The traveller now sets out upon his path in which he finds various aids. The first is attraction (*jazb*). This is God drawing the man to Himself away from the world. He who enters this state is a Murîd, or one who has inclination (*irâdâh*) towards

\* i. e. Phenomenal illusive existence which hides real absolute Being.

و با چون موسی عمران در این راه \* برو تا بشنوی انی انا الله  
ترا تا کوه هستی پیش بقیست \* جواب لفظ ربی کن ترادی ست

good. If he remains in this stage, he is 'called attracted' (majzúb). He should now submit himself to a very severe self-examination, and probe the very secret recesses of his heart. This he does by the aid of devotion, and henceforth is known as the 'devoutly attracted' (Sálík-i-majzúb). The journey to God is now fairly commenced, and becomes completed when he has attained to the true knowledge of the Supreme, which is, that there is no existence, save *Allah*. Then begins the journey in God, or the gaining of the knowledge of His nature and attributes, and to this inquiry and search, there is no limit. As the Sálík rises higher and higher in this spiritual ascent ('Urúj), he becomes more and more perfect.

From the words, 'are not creation and command of Him—' (*Súra* VII, 52), Sáfís deduce the conclusion, that the works of God are included either in the 'perceived world,' or in the 'conceived world.' The former is the material, visible, created world, familiar to all: the latter the invisible, spiritual, future world. It is the world of command (al-amr), so called from the well known phrase, "Be, and it was" (kun fayakúna). The author of the *Akhláq-i-Jalá'í* tells us, that it is "admitted equally by the masters of perception and conception, that the first principle which, at the mandate 'Be, and it was' issued, by the instrumentality of the ineffable power and will, from the chaotic ocean of inexistence, was a simple and luminous essence, which, in the language of philosophy, is termed the *primary* intellect; (though in some accounts, it is termed the supreme intelligence) and the great fathers of mysticism and investigation call it the Muhammadan spirit."\*

We have thus the authority of one of the greatest amongst Musalmán writers, for the general correctness, according to Muhammadan notions, of the Sáfí cosmogony. According to it, God first created the *primal* element (iauhar-i-awwál), and to the creation of this, the following passage is supposed to refer:—"And it was not the business of an hour, but even as the twinkling of an eye, or quicker still." (*Súra* XVI, 79). This primal element is also called by the names of the 'Pen,' the 'spirit of Muhammad,' 'Primal Intelligence,' 'Universal Reason,' ('Aql-i-kull). This is God's world, near to Him, and ever seeking Him.

The universe is the world of this primal element, but God's voice in the universe is only heard through the medium of this element. Thus, as the 'Pen,' it wrote the commands of God:

"What time the *Káf* of His power breathed on the Pen,  
It cast thousands of pictures on the page of 'not being.' " †

\* *Akhláq-i-Jalá'í*, p. 358.

چو قاف قدرتش دم بر قلم زد \* هزاران نقش بر لوح عدم زد †  
*Gulshán-i-Ráz*.



Then, in obedience to the creative energy thus displayed, came forth intelligences, souls, elements, and heaven. These, again, took up the task, and the three kingdoms—the mineral, vegetable, and animal were brought into existence. Sûfis refer to the verse “N” by the Pen, and what they write (“*Sûra* 68), and say that “N” represents the world of power, or God’s inkstand, that the pen here means the primal element, and that the words “they write” refer to the simple natures. They write on for ever, for, “were the sea ink, it would not suffice for the words of my Lord—” (*Sûra* XVIII. 109). “Thus the universe is ever *evolving* :—sustained every moment by, as it were, pulsations of the pervading spirit, so that it is described as being every moment annihilated and fresh created.” \*

But the final object of all creation is man.

“There is no other final cause beyond man  
It is disclosed in man’s own self.” †

“That which was made last, was first in thought”  
The last that was made, was the soul of Adam. ‡

The meaning of which is said to be that the very essence of man is ‘universal reason,’ so that which was first in the Divine mind was last in fact, and thus man is the final cause of creation.

A sacred deposit is committed to man. “Verily, we proposed a deposit to the heavens, and to the earth, and to the mountains between them, but they refused the burden, and we entrusted it to man, who is unjust and foolish” (*Sûra* XXXIII. 72). This deposit, according to the Sûfis, is the duty of displaying the Divine attributes. It is true, that man is both good and evil, still he can do this work, for though

“The black-hearted and the fool are the opposite of light, §  
Yet are they the theatres of the true Epiphany.”

The good in man represents the beautiful attributes (*Jamál*) of God; the evil the terrible ones (*Jalál*). This, then, is the function of man, and as he comes from the primal intelligence,

\* Kay on Pantheism, p. 52.

نه آخر علت غایبی در آخر \* همی گردد بذات خویش ظاهر †  
*Gulshán-i Ráz.*

هر آنچه آید بآخر پیش می بین \* در آخر گشت پیدا نفس ادم  
*Gulshán-i Ráz.*

ظلومی و جهولی مد نوزند §  
و لیک مظهر عین ظهورند

*Gulshán-i Ráz.*

he must, if he would be perfect, rise up to it again in the primal element. "From Him was the origin and to Him is the return"—(*Súra X. 4*). It is this return which is the aim and object of the traveller's journey. Thus Jelál-ud-din says:—

"From realms of formlessness, existence doth take form,  
And fades again therein: To Him we must return." \*

This is the "procession of essence unto essence."—(*Akhlag-i-Jaláli*, p. 364.)

The Primal element is that of which Muhammad speaks when he says: "The first thing which God created was my soul, my soul was the primal element." The function of this element is to receive and to bestow. In other words, it includes the saintly and prophetic offices. This explains allusions and statements in Súfí writings which seem to imply, especially with regard to Muhammad, the union of prophets and Imáms with the Divine Being. Jelál-ud-dín Rúmí said: "A true disciple is he who holds his teacher to be superior to all others."

In accordance with this theory, when a disciple of Báyezid was asked whether his master or God was the greater, he replied, "I only know my teacher, I know no other than him, and I know that he is greater than all others." Another, to a similar question, replied, "There is no difference between the two. As God does not walk in this world of sensible objects, the prophets are the substitutes of God. No, No! I am wrong! For if thou supposest that *those substitutes and their principal are two different things, thou hast judged erroneously, and not rightly.*"

Both the saintly and prophetic offices are said to be united in Muhammad. This throws some light on the views held with regard to the 'light of Muhammad'—the 'Núr-i-Muhammadi'. The general idea is that, before God created the world, he took a ray of light from His own splendour and united it to the body of Muhammad, to which he said: "Thou art the elect, the chosen, I will make the members of thy family, the guides to salvation." This light (Núr) is said to be of four kinds. From the first kind, God created His throne; from the second, the Pen of Fate; from the third, Paradise, and from the fourth, the state or place of spirits and all created beings. According to a statement made by 'Ali, Muhammad said that he was created from the light of God, whilst all other created beings were formed from the "Núr-i-Muhammadi." In some way, then

Muhammad is supposed to be connected with the primal essence, and this may explain such traditions as this, recorded on the authority of 'Abbás :—"I heard the Prophet say, 'He who blasphemes my name, blasphemes the name of God.'" And also a saying by 'Ali, "The Prophet said that he was created from the light of God, whilst all other created beings were formed from the Núr-i-Muhammadi." This Núr is said to be the greatest of lights

"The light of the Prophet is a mighty sun,  
Now shining in Moses, now in Adam." \*

Muhammad is sometimes called the Great Spirit (rúh-ul-a'zam), the Universal Reason, the Haqiqat-i-Insáni, by which terms is meant that he is of the primal essence, the first emanation from Deity. Hence, he is called the sun. As light was first produced by God, all other prophets are, according to the verse just quoted, but emanations from him. These ideas must be borne in mind in reading such a Hadis, as "He who has seen me, has seen God."

The perfect man sees in the Universe, the book of the Truth most High (Hama 'alam Kitáb-i-Haq Ta'ála ast.) This 'book' is described in the Gulshán-i-Ráz as consisting of chapters, of which the first is 'Universal Reason' ('Aql-i-kul), the second 'Universal Soul' (Nafs-i-kul), the third 'the Highest Heaven' ('Arsh-i-asmán,) and the Throne (Al-kursi); then follow the heavenly spheres (jurmha-i-asman,) the four elements (jurm-i-'anásir), the three kingdoms of nature (jurm-sih-maulúd), and at last comes the soul of man, just as the last chapter of the Qurán is entitled "man." These are all the successive emanations of Divinity, and the soul of man, proceeding, as it is said to do, from Universal Soul (hafs-i-kul), is equally with the heavens (arsh,) a theatre for the manifestation of the Divine perfections. There is a Tradition to the effect,—"The heart of a believer is the highest heaven."—So Mahmúd—

"Of every thing in the world above or below  
An exemplar is set forth in your soul and body." †

As man thus sprung from the primal essence and should return to it, Súfis explain his existence as a circle which meets in the primal intelligence. On the one side of the circle is descent (nazul), "which includes the whole process of development till man becomes possessed of reasonable powers ;"

بود نور نبی خورشید اعظم \* که از موسی پدید گه ز آدم \*

Gulshán-i-Ráz.

ز هر چه اندر جهان از شیب و بالامت \* مثالش در تن و جان تو پیداست †

Gulshán-i-Ráz.

the other side of the circle is ascent ('Arúj), the goal of which is re-absorption in the divine essence. This journey is called the *Tariqát*, or Road, by which is meant that a gradual acquaintance is made with all those doctrines of Mysticism which treat of man's return to God. No one can set out on this journey without a full determination to seek for a solution of all his doubts and uncertainties as regards God and himself. He must most earnestly desire to know, hence he is called a seeker (*Tálib*). If he feels drawn onward, he is "attracted." Then he becomes a disciple (*Muríd*), and attaches himself to some spiritual guide, or *Pir*. The initial stage is now passed and the man becomes a real traveller, a *Sálik*, whose time and thoughts are henceforth to be given to *salúk*, or the prosecution of this journey, until he arrives at the perfect state.

There are now eight stages to be reached. Few enter into and pass from the whole. These stages are service ('abudiyat), love ('ishq), seclusion (zuhd), knowledge (ma'rifat), ecstasy (wajd or Hál), the truth (haqiqat), union (wasl), extinction (faná).

Súfi poets deals mostly with the second stage, in which the *Sálik* is the lover and God the beloved one. Words expressive of one who is the object of attraction and love on earth are then applied in a mystical sense to God. References are, however, frequent to other stages of the mystic journey. The goal of the Súfi is to be reached by divine illumination, not by philosophy.

"The Theologian who has no perception of unity \*  
Is in utter darkness, in clouds and bondage of dogmas.

The Theologian is the *Mutakallim*, or scholastic Theologian, who seeks divine light by the aid of logic and reason, and not by that of illumination. He perceives not the *Tauhid* or unification, that is, that all things are one, or as *Hafiz* puts it.—

"Hafiz, when preaching unity with unitarian pen,  
Blot out and cancel every page that tells of spirits and of men."

A Musalmán author defines *Tauhid*, or unity, to be this : "To annihilate self in the absolute truth, to become eternal in the absolute, to be made one with the one and to abstain from evil," † whereas *Taklíd*, the bondage of dogmas, in which the ordinary Musalmán is enslaved,

كلامی كه ندارد ذوق توحید \* بتاریکی درست ار غیم تقلید \*

*Gulshán-i-Ráz.*

† Tauler says : "If the highest and most glorious unity, which is God Himself, is to be united to the soul, it must be through oneness. Now when the soul hath utterly forsaken itself and all creatures, and hath made itself free from all manifoldness, then, the sole unity, which is God, answers to the oneness of the soul, for there is nothing in the soul beside God."

is the putting on of a collar on the neck, imitation, subservience to authority. Thus man gains illumination, according to the Súfis, by direct intuition, and not by scholastic methods, which deal with quantity, quality and relation.

"The Divine essence is free from where, how and why \*  
Let His glory be exalted above what men say of Him."

This knowledge is not even to be obtained by a demonstration from His works; it is not gained till all the illusory phenomena which cover "the Truth" are annihilated.

"Since His works are manifested from His essence,  
His essence is not manifested from His works;  
The light of His essence is not contained in phenomena,  
For the glory of His Majesty is exceeding great." †

Even an outward revelation is not needed, for

"In that place where God's light is our guide,  
What room is there for the Message of Gabriel." ‡

In other words, the Qurán is not required. Still more, one to whom God's light is thus revealed attains a higher station than Angel ever reaches.

"Though the Angels stand, hard by the Throne,  
They reach not the station, 'I am with God.' " §

There is now no room for the exercise of reason, for

"Reason's light applied to the very light of light  
Is as the eye of the head applied to the sun." ||

In short, one who enters on the mystic journey must remove from the mind all earthly and human accidents, and reduce it to its abstract essence in which Deity appears.

Jelál-ud-dín in the 14th tale of the first book of the Musnavi describes this very well. A dispute arose between certain Chinese and Greek artists as to their respective skill. The

منزه ذاتش از چند وجه و چون \* تغالی شانہ عما یقولون \*

*Gulshán-i-Ráz.*

چو آیانت روشن کشته از ذات \* نکرد ذات او روشنی از آیات †  
نگنجد نور ذات اندر مظاهر \* که سبحات جلالش هست قاصر

*Ibid.*

دران موضع که نور حق دلیل است \* چه دانی گفت و گوئی جبرئیل است ‡

*Ibid.*

فرشته گرچه دارد قرب درگاه \* ننگنجد در مقام لی مع الله §

*Ibid.*

بود نور خرد در ذات انور \* بسان چشم سر در چشمه خور ||

*Ibid.*

Sultan at the request of the Chinamen allotted a house to each party on opposite sides of the street, and supplied them with all the necessary things for their work.

The following is a free translation of the Persian story :—

“The Chinese ask him for a thousand colours,  
All that they ask he gives right royally,  
And every morning from his treasure-house  
A hundred sorts are largely dealt them out.  
The Greeks despise all colour as a stain  
Effacing every hue with nicest care.  
Brighter and brighter shines their polished front,  
More dazzling, soon, than gleams the floor of heaven.  
This hueless shcen is worth a thousand dyes,  
This is the moon—they but her clouding veil;  
All that the cloud is bright or golden with,  
Is but the lending of the moon or sun.  
And now, at length, are China's artists ready,  
The cymbals clang,—the Sultan hastens thither,  
And sees enrapt the glorious gorgeousness  
Suit nigh to swooning by those beamy splendours,  
Then, to the Grecian palace opposite.  
Just as the Greeks have put their curtain back,  
Down glides a sunbeam through the rifted clouds,  
And, lo, the colours of that rainbow house  
Shine. . . reflected on those glassy walls.  
That face them, rivalling : the sun hath painted,  
With lovelier blending, on that stony mirror  
The colours spread by man so artfully.  
Know then, O friend ! such Greeks the Sûfis are,  
Owning nor book nor master, and on earth  
Having one sole and simple task to make  
Their hearts a stainless mirror for their God.  
Is thy heart clear and argent as the moon ?  
Then imaged there may rest, innumeros,  
The forms and hues of Heaven.” •

All this cannot be comprehended by reason, it is enough that the heart is with God, is God. \* Then doubt passes into certainty, and all human arts give place to the inner light and love.

“The outward gilt, the shell of Science they despise,  
The banner of real certitude floats where they rise,  
They've thought abandoned ; light and life they've truly found,  
Their breast and hearts are filled with love's inspiring sound.”†

---

\* عقل اینجا ساکت اید یا مضل \* زانکه دل با اوست یا خرد او سعاد

Musnavi.

† نقش و قشر علم را بگذاشتند \* رایت عین الیقین افراشتند  
رفت فکر و روشنائی یابند \* بسر و بحر اشنائی یافتند

Ibid.

We may now proceed with our disciple, or Murid, upon his upward journey. Though exercising a devotion above all forms and modes, he yet yields implicit obedience to his spiritual guide. He chooses some famous mystic as his *Pir*, who henceforth is his director. It is not often that allusion to such men is made, but, as a matter of fact, they have great authority. At this stage the *Sâlik* is supposed to know his origin, and to be in earnest in seeking to cast off the trammels of a separate existence.

"Again, you ask, 'who is the Traveller on the road' ;  
It is he who is acquainted with his own origin.  
He is a traveller who passes on with haste  
And becomes pure from self as fire from smoke :  
Know, his journey is a progress of revelation from the contingent  
To the necessary, leading away from darkness and defect." \*

"The wine of Divine love and ecstacy now intoxicates All phenomena from the first emanation downwards."

"The Heavens, giddy with this wine, are reeling to and fro,  
Desiring in their hearts to smell its perfume,  
The angels, drinking it pure from pure vessels,  
Pour the dregs of their draught upon the world." †

The angels, as part of the spirit-world, were created before the material universe, and so are an earlier emanation from 'Being'; at length the wine reaches man, who rises to various grades according as he has spiritual capacity to receive this pure wine.

"One from the scent of its dregs becomes a philosopher,  
One from seeing the colour of the pure wine a traditionist,  
One from half a draught becomes righteous,  
One from quaffing a cupful becomes a lover." ‡

مسافر آن بود که بگذرد زود \* ز خود صافی شود چون آتش از دود \*  
بمعکس میر اول در منازل \* رود تا گـردد و انسان کامل  
بدان اول که تا چون گشت موجود \* که تا انسان کامل گشت مولود  
*Gulshân-i-Râz.*

فلک سر گشته از وی در نگاہی \* هوا در دل بامید یکی بری †  
ملائک خورده صاف از کوزه پاک \* بجرعه ریخته دردی برین خاک  
*Ibid.*

ایکی از بوی دردس عقل آمد \* یکی از رنگ صافش فاقل آمد ‡  
ایکی از نیم جرعه گشته صادق \* یکی از یک صراحی گشته عاشق  
*Ibid.*

But the true and perfect man does not stop at such a moderate share. He swallows cup, wine-house, and even wine drinker.

"Well done, O, ocean heart, O, mighty winebibber !  
He drinks up existence as one draught,  
And obtains release from affirmations and negations.  
Freed from dry devotions and empty rites,  
He grasps the skirt of the ancient of the wine-house." \*

The ancient of the wine-house is the *Pr* to whom the devotee yields implicit obedience. Not all at once does he get freedom from forms and formulas, but, having imbibed the pure wine, he fully enters on the first stage and becomes an 'Abd, that is one still in servitude ('Abudiyat).

"The honour of man lies in being under compulsion,  
Not in having a share in free will.' †

This ought not to cause anxiety or vexation, for, as the perfect man is destined to display the Divine attributes, he must be restrained.

"He has imposed on you the law for this cause,  
That He has imparted to you of His essence ;  
Since you are impotent in the hands of ' the Truth,'  
Abandon and forsake this self of yours." ‡

True deliverance is to be found in the 'All' ; true riches will be obtained when the man is united in ' the Truth,' when the Divine will works with the true self.

The next stage is, that of love ('ishq), and it is of this stage that the Sûfî poets mostly treat. The devotee must now often pass out of self, and become unconscious even of time and space.

"Straightway lift your self above time and space,  
Quit the world and be yourself a world for yourself," §

\* رهی دریا دل رند سمرافراز  
در آشامیده هستی را بیک بار \* فراغت یافته ز اقرار و انکار  
شده فارغ ز زهد خشک و طامات \* کسوفته دامن پیسر خرابات  
*Gulshân i-Râz.*

‡ کرامت آدمی را ز اضطرار نیست \* نه آن کورا نصیبی اختیار نیست †  
*Ibid.*

‡ بشرعت زان سبب تکلیف کردند \* که از ذات خودت تعریف کردند †  
چو از تکلیف حق عاجز شوی تو \* بیکبار از میان بیرون روی تو  
*Ibid.*

§ یکی راه بر تو از کون و مکان شو \* جهان بگذار و خود در خود جهان شو §  
*Ibid.*



The devotee must abandon outward forms ('adat) and religious customs. These trammels are not for him.

"If you seek to be a true servant, abandon form,  
Form accords not with tone of obedience." \*

With this dissolution from self, and this abandonment of form, comes freedom from creeds and commands.

"All the authority of the law is over this "I" of yours,  
Since that is bound to your soul and body.  
When "I" and "you" remain not in the midst,  
What is mosque, what is synagogue, what is fire temple." †

Individual personality embraces evil as well as good; get rid of the personality and you need no restraint. So also Jelâl-ud-dîn:—

"This "I," and this "We," thou'st ordained for Thy state,  
That psalms, hymns and lauds may still rise to Thy gate,  
When "I" and when "We" shall unite both in one  
Absorbed they'll be in Thy essence alone." ‡

The third stage is called abstraction (zuld). The devotee must now be abstracted and silent.

"Should any one love thee, do thou silent be?" §

The events of the world, the affairs of every day-life should have no interest or influence on the abstracted soul—

"What care I if cities in ruins should fall,  
In ruins we treasures find dear to us all.  
Man merged in God, most entirely is drowned  
As wave of a sea, soul goes a set round." ||

The word used for "abstraction" is Tajrîd, it means a stripping off, a making bare, hence in Sûfî phraseology it is used to express

عبدت خواهی از عادت بپرهیز \* نگردد جمع عادت با عبادت \*

*Gulshân-i-Râz.*

همه حکم شریعت از من تست \* که آن بربسته جان و تن تست  
من و تو چون نمازد در میانه \* چه مسجد چه گشت چه دیرخانه

*Ibid.*

این من وما بهر آن ساختی \* ذا تو با خود نرد خدمت باختی  
تا من و توها همه یک جان شوند \* عاقبت مستغرق جانان شوند

*Musnavî.*

چونکه عاشق اوست خاموش باش ‡

من چه غم دارم که دیرانی بود \* زیر دیران کنج سلطانی بود ||  
غرق حق خواهم که باشد غرق تر \* همچو موج بحر جان زیر زبر

*Ibid.*

purification from self, a simplification of nature by which the mystic becomes identified with the infinite.

Lahijī, a Muhammadan commentator on the *Gulshān-i-Ráz*, defines it thus :—" A passing by the stages of carnal lust and mental operations, and human pleasures and relations, and emerging from the limitation of self, which veils man's real essence."

This abstraction is necessary in order to think aright.

" Abstraction is a condition of good thinking,  
For then the lightning of Divine guidance illumines us." \*

The next stage is knowledge (*Ma'rifat*). If God and man be one, if the mystic is so immersed in the infinite, as the previous stages imply, it may be reasonably asked how this knowledge can be communicated. This question has been put—

" If knower and known are both the one pure essence,  
What are the aspirations in this handful of dust." †

That is, what is the cause of the desire for the knowledge of the Truth which inspires the mystic? The answer is, that as he has no real existence of his own, ' it is only by the communicated existence and knowledge of God that he can know him.' Thus :—

" Be not thankful for the grace of the ' Truth,'  
For it is by the light of the ' Truth ' that thou knowest the ' Truth,'  
Beside Him is no knower or known, be sure,  
Nevertheless, the dust draws heat from the sun.  
It is not strange that the motes of dust have hope,  
And desire for the sun's heat and light." ‡

The next stage is, ecstasy (*wajd* or *hál*.) The end of knowledge is practice, and the practice of virtuous actions leads to the acquirement of " good states," i. e., ecstatic conditions (*ahwál*).

" An action which proceeds from good ' states ' of heart  
Is much better than the mere knowledge of the word." §

بود فکر نکـ و را شرط تجرید \* پس انکه لعمـه ار برق تائید  
*Gulshān-i-Ráz.*

اگر معروف و عارف ذات پاکست \* چه سودا در سرائین مشیت خاکست †  
*Ibid.*

مکن بر نعمت حق فاسد پاسی \* که تو حق را بنور حق شناسی ‡  
جز او معروف و عارف نیست دریاب \* و لیکن خاک می باید ز خود تاب  
عجب نبود که دارد ذره امید \* هوای تاب مهر و نور خورشید  
*Ibid.*

عمل کان از سر احوال باشد \* بسی بهتر ز عام قال باشد §  
*Ibid.*

This verse is meant to show that the ecstatic state is higher than the previous state of knowledge (Ma'rifat). Hal is defined by Sûfis to be "a state which occurs to the heart spontaneously, and without effort, like grief or fear, or expansion or cheerfulness, or desire or joy, and which ceases as soon as the natural dispositions of the soul manifest themselves, without being followed by similar states."

This stage is described as one of the greatest bliss. Then supposed to be free from the stain of earthly form, they drink what "their Lord gives them to drink"—(*Sûra*, LXXVI, 21.)

"And what is pure wine? It is purification from self!

What bliss, what ecstasy, what intoxication;

O happy moment, when we shall quit ourselves,

When we shall be rich in uttermost poverty.

Without faith or reason, or piety or perception,

Bowed down in the dust, drunken and beside ourselves,

Of what account, then, will be Paradise and Houris." \*

The "uttermost poverty" is the complete effacement of self; the rich state that of union with the divine. Even Paradise and Houris, the object of the earnest desire of the ordinary believer, are to the true mystic as nothing; they are phenomenal, external to real unity—to Tawhid,

"While Heaven and Hell stand in your way,

How is your soul cognisant of this myste y ? !"

These deeper mysteries are only known in the ecstatic state—

"In this matter none can judge you,

For there is no leader of the sect here, save the Truth." †

It is true, that many use expressions and speak of these mysteries; but unless such persons really experience these ecstatic visions, Sûfis hold that they are merely using cant terms, that they are

\* طہرواچیت صابی کشتن از خویش \*

ہی لذت زہی درات زہی ذوق \* زہی حیرت زہی حالت زہی شوق  
خوشا آدم کہ مابی خوش باشیم \* غنی مطلق و درویش باشیم  
زہد بی نہ عقل نہ تقوی نہ ادراک \* فداہ مصت و حیران بر سر خاک  
بہشت و خلد و حرور انجا چہ سنجد \*

*Gutshân-i-âz.*

‡ راین معنی کسی را بر تودق نیست \* کہ حاجت مذهب الیجاغیر حق  
نیست

guilty of merely following (taqlíd) without knowing the real meaning of what they say or profess to do. But—

“ Though all men reach not the mysteries of the mystic faith,  
These mystic states are not mere illusion.” \*

With this estimate of Hal Jelál ud-din agrees—

‘ Unless we see our friend, ’twere better we were blind,  
A friend that is not constant ’s better out of mind.” †

The next stage is, Reality or Truth (Haqiqat). This is the stage known as Saintship, and is said to be exemplified in Saints and Prophets. In its most perfect form it is seen, according to Súfis, in Muhammad, both Saint and Prophet.

“ Individual Saints are, as it were, his members,  
For he (Muhammad) is the whole and they are the parts.” ‡

The next stage is that of complete union (wasl) with the Divine. “ Though absorbed in the ‘ Truth,’ the Sálík is still obedient as regards his essence, because by obedience he attained his exaltation.” Such is the commentary on

“ The Saint is obedient as to his essence,  
He is a devotee in the street of essence.”

And so he passes on to his true end—absorption in the eternal.

“ Howbeit his work is finished at the time  
That his end is joined again to his beginning.” §

Or again,

“ Every man whose heart is free from doubt  
Knows for a surety that there is no being but ‘ One.’  
Saying ‘ I am ’ belongs only to the ‘ Truth.’  
For essence is absent, and illusive appearance is absent,  
The glory of the ‘ Truth ’ admits no duality.  
In that glory is no ‘ I ’ or ‘ We ’ or ‘ Thou ’,  
‘ I,’ ‘ We,’ ‘ Thou ’ and ‘ He ’ are all one thing ;  
For in unity there is no distinction of persons ” ||

نه هرکس یابد اسرار حقیقت \* مجزئ نیست احوال حقیقت \*

*Gulshán-i-Ráz.*

چونکه دید دوست نبود کور به \* دوست کو باقی نباشد دور به †

*Musarrí.*

وجود اولیا او را چو عضو ند \* که او المیست و ایشان همچو جزوند ‡

*Gulshán-i-Ráz.*

بود تابع ولی از روی معنی \* بود عابد ولی در کوی معنی §  
ولی وقتی رسد کارش باتمام \* که با آغاز گردد باز انجام  
*Ibid.*

هرآنکس را که اندر دل شکی نیست \* یقین داند که هستی جز یکی نیست |  
انفایت بود حق را سزاوار \* که او غیبست و غایب هم و پندار

Thus the perfect Súfí, the Wásil-i-Hakk, is one who has gained Wasál, which state is defined to be "the extinction of our own existence in the existence of God, as snow melts in the sea, and as motes vanish in the sun."

Jelál-ud-dín Rúmí uses an illustration, taken from a number of separate candles, each diffusing light; but whose brightness when all are brought together is not divisible—"One light alone we meet." So of the Saints—

"With God they're one; their forms but make Him manifest,  
Thou seest the form alone, thy two eyes are at fault,  
Look with thy soul; thou'lt see as God from heaven's vault.  
Thy two sights will united be straightening in one,  
When thou behold'st the light of God's eternal throne." \*

Other mystics have used similar pantheistic language to describe this union with the Divine. Thus Tauler, in one of his sermons says:—"He (man) flings himself into the divine abyss, in which he dwelt eternally before he was created; then when God finds the man thus simply and nakedly turned towards Him, the God-head bends down and descends into the depths of the pure waiting soul, and transforms the created soul, drawing it up into the uncreated essence, so the spirit becomes one with Him." †

"Rouse thyself to the height of religion and all veils are removed; the world and its dead principle passes away from thee, and the very Godhead enters thee anew in its first and original form, as life, as thine own life, which thou shalt and oughtest to live." ‡

We now pass on to the last stage, which is Faná, or extinction. Al-Afláki gives the following account of Jelál-ud-din's last hours.

"Jelál observed: 'It is as my friends say. But, were they even to pull down the house, what use? See my panting heart, look at my delight. The sun sheds a grateful light on the moth.

جذاب حضرت حق را دوستی نیست \* دراز حضرت من و ما و توئی نیست  
من و ما و تو و اوست یک چیز \* که در وحدت نباشد هیچ تمیز  
Gulshán-i-Ráz.

\* پیش از یک گشت گز صورت برآست \*  
چون بصورت بنگری چشمت درآست \* تو بنورش در نگران یکتواست  
نور هم در چشم نتوان فرق کرد \* چونکه برنورش نظر انداخت مرید  
Munavvî

† Vaughan's Hours with the Mystics, Vol. i, p. 290.

‡ Ibid, p. 212.

My friends invite me one way; my teacher Shemsu'd-din beckons me the other way. Comply ye with the summoner of the Lord, and have faith in Him. Departure is inevitable. All 'being' came out of nothing, and again it will be shut up in the prison of nullity. Such is God's decree from all eternity; and the decree belongeth unto God, the most High, the All-Great! "

The concluding words show the faith of the great master of Sufism in the doctrine of Faná:—

"Let thy existence in God's essence be enrolled  
As copper in Alchemist's bath is turned to gold,  
Quit 'I' and 'We' which o'er thy heart exert control  
'Tis egotism, estranged from God, that clogs the soul."

There is a tradition to this effect: "Inspiration is light that descends into the heart and shows the nature of things as they really are." This the true Sufi realizes when he arrives at Faná—

"The 'Truth' will then grant you whatsoever you ask,  
And show you all things as they really are." \*

In this stage, law and dogma have no place at all.

"Sleep overcomes alike the followers of each creed,  
As water makes all mills to turn and grind, at need;  
The water flows from upward, down upon the mill  
Its flowing through the trough is but man's want to fill.  
No sooner has man's need been fully satisfied  
He turns the water off; straight in its bed its tied." †

"What use to formulate God's unity?  
What use to bow one's self before the Deity?  
Wouldst shine as brilliantly in sight of all,  
Annihilate thy darksome self, thy being's pall." ‡

دید حق مر ترا هراچه خواهی \* نمایندت اشیا کامایی \*

*Gulshán-i-Ráz.*

چونکه جمع مستمع را جواب برد \* سنگ های اسبازا اب برد †  
رفتن این اب فوق سیاست \* رفتنش در اسبیا بهر شماسیت  
چون شمارا حاجت طاهره نماید \* اب را در جوی اصلی باز راند

*Musnaví.*

چیست توحید خدا اموخته \* خوشتن را پیش واحد سوختن †  
گره می خواهی که بفروزی چوروز \* هستی همچون شب خود را

The Saint having now made the journey to God, and having through Faná entered into eternal life, or Buqá, now journeys down again in God.

"He is a perfect man, who in all perfection  
Does the work of a slave in spite of his godliness."\*

For in his downward journey the Saint must obey and observe the law. Whilst in Faná, the devotee is Majzúb-i-Mutlaq, Azád, or Be-shara', that is, the law has no dominion over him; but the more perfect pass on to "sobriety after intoxication."

"His end is joined again to his beginning." †

Then carrying with him 'the truth,' he descends again to phenomenal existence, and for the sake of example obeys law. Thus:—

"He may be likened to a pair of compasses  
Ending in the same impression whence they begin." ‡

It is true that the law is represented as the husk and "complete union" as the kernel, and when the kernel ripens it breaks the husk; still the perfect man does not abide in this ecstatic union, but in the 'Truth'; He wears the law as an outward robe, adopts the Súfí mysteries as the rules of his path, checking the vagaries of the inner light by the guidance of the *PIR*, or spiritual Director, and so performs as 'counsels of perfection' certain outward legal observances.

This explains apparent contradictions in Súfí poetry. Sometimes the perfect man is described as above all law; at others, as when in the downward journey in God, as obedient to law. The 'Truth' in such is said, to be, as a seed, that is, it produces other disciples, who, then, and through the influence of the perfect Súfis, make the upward journey, and so the same circuit is being ever reproduced.

"Another shines, as a bright star still retaining the husk (of law),  
When in this state, he makes another circuit (i. e., in his disciples)." §

So it goes on and on until, "unto God shall all things return—  
(*Súra XVII-6.*)

کسی مرد تماست کز نامی \* کند با خواجهی کار غلامی  
*Musnaví.*

‡ باغز گردد بار انجام †

دگر باره شود مانند پرگار \* بر آن کاری که اول بود درکار †  
*Gulshán-i-Ráz.*

دگر با پوست یابد تابش خور \* درین نشانه کند یک دور دیگر §  
*ibid.*

This concludes the subject which I have tried to explain from the Súfi standpoint. It is exceedingly difficult to treat it systematically, and in interpreting the verses I have quoted, it is not always possible to say to which stage of the mystic journey they refer. I may very possibly have misplaced some of them.

Though I have confined myself to the consideration of two books, yet what is brought together may be of use hereafter to some more competent student of the subject. I therefore proceed to no refutation of the system beyond stating that, whilst there is an element of mysticism in the inner spiritual life of the Christiano it is totally distinct from the spirit of Súfiism, for it recognizes the continued distinct personality of him who "in God lives and moves and has his being," or as Tennyson beautifully expresses it—

"That each who seems a separate whole,  
Should move his rounds, and fusing all  
The skirts of self again, should fall  
Remerging in the general soul  
Is faith as vague as all unsweet :  
Eternal form shall still divide  
The eternal soul from all beside ;  
And I shall know Him when we meet,"

EDW. SELL.



## ART. VIII.—BULANDSHAHR:—A DISTRICT SKETCH.

By F. R. GROWSE, C. I. E.

THE District of Bulandshahr was administered either from Aligarh or from Merath, for the first twenty years after the British conquest; \* and, as a separate political unit, it dates only from the year 1824. Since then it is reckoned as one of the six that, together, make up the Merath Division † of the North-West Provinces. It consists of an oblong tract of almost absolutely level country, covering an area of 1,915 square miles, which is some 35 miles in breadth from north to south, and has an average length of 55 miles from the banks of the Jamuná on the west, to the Ganges on the east. A third river, the *Kálindi*, more commonly called the *Káli Nadi*, ‡ runs through its centre with a south-easterly direction, and divides it into two almost equal portions. The Karwan, the Patwaiy and the Chúiya, are these minor water-courses, which frequently become broad and rapid torrents in the rains; at all other times of the year their bed is a mere shallow depression in the soil, with scarcely distinguishable banks, and is generally brought under cultivation. At some remote period there seems reason to believe,

---

\* After the fall of Aligarh in 1803, Baran and Khurja were first placed under Colonel Ochterlony, the Delhi Resident. In the following year they were made part of the Aligarh District, and so remained till 1818, when Baran and the Western Parganas were transferred to Merath; but this arrangement lasted only for six years.

† Commonly spelt 'Meerut,' for which Dr. Hunter in his Imperial Gazetteer proposes to substitute 'Mirath.' This, however, would be a very unsatisfactory correction. The word is identical with 'Mertha,' the name of an ancient hill-fort in Jodhpur. The first syllable 'mer' appears as a termination in Ajmer, Jaisalmer, &c., and means 'a hill.' The old town of Merath stands on a considerable elevation, though it would seem to be artificial.

‡ When the Hindi word had to be written in Persian or Urdu, the vowel in the second syllable was purposely lengthened by the Munshis in order the better to preserve its sound, and to prevent its degenerating into short *a*, as it soon would, were no vowel expressed. For a similar reason, the common Hindi termination *pūr*, meaning 'town,' is always written by Munshis with a long *u*, and the short vowels *e* and *i* in English Proper names are almost invariably lengthened in the process of transliteration. The stream thus became the *Kálindi*, from which the transition was easy to the more readily intelligible *Káli nadi*, 'Black river'; the pronunciation only being altered, since the written form of the two words *Kálindi* and *Káli nadi* in Persian characters is absolutely identical. The error is of respectable antiquity, as Yahy a biu Ahmad, the author of the Chronicle entitled the *Tārīkh-i-Mubārak Shāhi*, written about the year 1450, translates the name into Persian by the phrase *Ab i-Siyah*.

the Chūdiya was a permanent stream, of much greater importance than now ; for the sites of several ancient towns and forts, as at Chandokh, Indor, Chimávali and Dibháí, can be traced on its banks ; and recently, on sinking a well in its bed, the soil at a depth of 33 feet was found to be full of small shells. It probably depended for existence on the primæval forests, and gradually dwindled away as they were cut down. It still occasionally asserts its old strength, and on the 19th of September 1880, it suddenly rose and swept away a large masonry bridge, near the town of Dibháí, which the Public Works Department had finished only a few months previously. Since the suppression of the Mutiny in 1858, Bulandshahr, for administrative purposes, has been entirely separated from Delhi, which now forms the capital of another Province, the Panjáb. But the historical and social connection between the two localities is not so easily to be severed. The towers and domes of the ancient metropolis are visible from the border of the district, and in modern, no less than in pre-historic, times the special characteristics of the neighbourhood are mainly due to the action of Imperial influences.

According to tradition, the original seat of the earliest Hindu dynasty, which proudly traced its descent from the mythical Regent of the Moon, was at Hastinapur, a name that still survives, but attaches only to a desolate group of shapeless mounds overlooking the old bed of the Ganges, some twenty-two miles north-east of the Merath Cantouments. When king Dhritarashtra divided his dominions between his hundred sons and five nephews, the latter, still famous in popular speech under their names of the Pandavas, founded Indraprastha (now Indra-pat, or old Delhi) as one of their capitals, and gradually cleared the surrounding country both of its primæval forest and of the wild Nága tribes, who had made it their stronghold. On the termination of the internecine struggle, which forms the subject of the Mahábhárat, Yudhisthir, the last of the five brothers, again united the divided realm. He in course of time was succeeded on the throne of Hastinapur by Parikshit, the grandson of his brother Arjun ; and to Parikshit's son, Janmejaya, is ascribed the foundation of Ashári the oldest town in the district, from which he sent out a colony to build the fort of Baran, the modern Bulandshahr.

Thus, to Delhi chieftains are due the first reclamation of the soil and the first establishment of a social community, more than three thousand years ago : while at the present day the local magnates, more numerous here than in any other part of the province, are for the most part the descendants of Delhi courtiers, who obtained grants of land from the Emperors, either,

in recognition of their submission to the faith, or in reward for military services.

Thus the ancestor of the Biluch family at Jhájhar, now almost ruined by waste and litigation, was a companion-in-arms of Humáyun; another Biluch family, seated at Chandam, rose into importance as local governors under Aurangzeb, and a century later acquired the village where they now reside, as a reward for services against the Mahrattas; the wealthy and influential Lál Kháui family, now headed by the two Nawabs of Chhatán and Pahásu, and owning more than 200 villages in this and the adjoining districts, are descended from a Thakur of the Bergújar clan, who abjured Hinduism under Aurangzeb's imperial persuasion; the Pathans of Juhángirabad were connected with one of the principal commanders of the Mughal troops in the reign of Sháh Alam, and subsequently obtained a grant of land from Lord Lake; and, lastly, though the list might be extended to come down to the present day, the nucleus of the handsome estate now enjoyed by the fine old Afghan soldier, Saiyid Mír Khan, better known as the Sardár Bahádur, was won by his gallantry, in the Kabul war, and was augmented in acknowledgment of his distinguished loyalty in the Mutiny.

The proximity to the Muhammedan centre of Government has not only largely affected the character of the entire population in the lower as well as in the higher classes, but has also had a considerable influence on the general aspect of the landscape. In dress, language, and caste-prejudices there is a conspicuous relaxation of customary Hindu usage, and till within the last few years, though every considerable village boasted a mosque of more or less pretension, a Hindu spire was seldom visible; the cry of the Muazzin had all but completely silenced the clang of the temple-bell and the boom of the devotee's conch. Now, that no active demonstration of religious intolerance is permitted, and every sect is allowed to practise its own rites and ceremonies, under the equal protection of the law, it is not to be expected but that the Hindus, who number 748,256 out of a total population of 924,822, will gradually begin to re-assert themselves. The trade of the towns is entirely in their hands, but the prestige that attaches to ownership of the land is mainly on the side of Islám. Though the surface of the stream may appear abnormally smooth, there is a strong under-current of jealousy, faction and intrigue, which rash experiments in administration would speedily develop into a very real danger.

In point of population, as recorded by the census of 1881

the district stands sixteenth in the list of 49 which, together, constitute the United Provinces. But by the License Tax assessments, which are the most trustworthy test of general prosperity, it comes as high as fourth, having only Cawnpur, Merath and Aligarh above it. This remarkable pre-eminence is due to a variety of causes, the principal being the lightness of the Government demand under the head of land-revenue. The existing settlement was completed in 1865, and will expire in 1889; when it is estimated that the demand will advance from a little over 13½ lakhs to at least 18. This event is naturally anticipated by the landlords with some little perturbation; but while they appreciate the manifold advantages to themselves of the present golden age, they also recognise the right of the State to participate in the general increase of agricultural well-being. Great attention has been paid by the staff of district officials to the maintenance of the village maps and records of crops and rents, and—when the time comes for the new assessment—it is hoped that these papers will form a sufficient basis for all the necessary calculations. If so, the Government will save the large cost of a special establishment for a period of several years (the last settlement and its revision lasted from 1856 to 1870!) the people will escape a vast amount of annoyance and litigation, and the land will not be thrown out of cultivation, or denied improvements, in the fraudulent hope of concealing its capabilities. In no district as yet has any such summary procedure been found possible; if it is sanctioned for Bulandshahr, and works well, it will be a matter for unqualified congratulation.

The soil, which is naturally fertile, and of very uniform character, has the further advantage of almost universal protection from drought; being largely capable of artificial irrigation from the distributories of the Ganges Canal. This flows through the whole breadth of the district in three wide, and nearly parallel branches, one to the east, the other two, to the west of the central Kálindi. Thus, the terrible famine of 1877 was here almost unfelt. No poor-houses or relief works had to be started by Government, nor had any steps to be taken to stimulate the importation of food-stuffs. The grain accumulated in more prosperous seasons, was extracted from the pits in which it had been buried, and sold greatly to the profit of the dealer, but, at the same time, not at utterly prohibitory prices; while the credit of the tenant still remained so good, that he was able, if, necessary, to negotiate a temporary loan without permanent embarrassment. Gangs of starving vagrants from Mathurá, Bharatpur, and other centres of distress, plodded along the main

roads; but the able bodied among them gradually found work in the Municipalities or elsewhere, and the utterly helpless were kept alive by the daily dole of food that was freely given by the larger landed proprietors in the villages, and by wealthy traders in the towns. It may, therefore, be considered as established by a recent and crucial test, that the district is practically secure against any ordinary calamity. But to map out the entire area—as has been proposed—in deeper and lighter shades of color according to a nice calculation of possibilities, and to determine, once for all, that such and such tracts will be entitled to relief in time of drought, and that others can always do without it, seems as unpractical a project as an attempt to construct a permanent chart of the clouds in the sky. If accurate observations are maintained, the occurrence of a storm and its probable intensity may be predicted, and precautions taken to minimize the danger; but circumstances must be treated as they arise, and no region in the world, by virtue of long previous exemption from misfortunes, can be marked off as absolutely secure for ever from special visitations of Providence. Inflexible routine may be a welcome support to a feeble administrator, but it is simply an embarrassment to a competent one; while legislation in itself is always an evil, and our Indian land-laws, above all, have had the disastrous effect of inflicting permanent injury on the class whom they were chiefly intended to benefit. When left to their own good feelings, the landlords, as a rule, are disposed to treat their tenants, in times of difficulty, with the same liberality that they exhibit in the other ordinary relations of life: it is only when the law confronts them with its rigid impersonality that they refuse to listen any longer to the voice of equity.

The great curse of the district is the prevalence of fever, an evil which must in part be attributed to what is otherwise so signal a boon,—the large extension of canal irrigation. In the autumn of 1879, an unusually heavy rainfall, following upon several years of drought, developed a terrible epidemic, which literally more than decimated the population. The crops stood uncut in the fields, the shops remained closed in the bazars; there was no traffic along the high roads, and no hum of business in the market-places; the receding flood of the great rivers showed their sands piled with corpses, while scarcely a water-course or wayside ditch but contained some ghastly relics of humanity, hastily dropt by hireling bearers, or even by friends, too fearful for themselves, or too enfeebled by sickness to observe the funeral rites that are ordinarily held so sacred. In most of the towns and villages there was not a single house in which there was not one dead; in many, entire families had perished,—

parents, grand-parents and children,—and whole streets became deserted. Probably, not a thousand people in all, from one end of the district to the other, escaped without some touch of the disease. The Pargana least affected was Ahár, which then by equitable decree enjoyed its compensation for many permanent disadvantages. It is a narrow tract of country, running along the high bank of the Ganges, with a poor soil inadequately watered and ill provided with roads, and which thus offers no attractions for the investment of capital on the part, either of traders or land-owners.

As a result of the general mortality, the population which had been 937,427 in 1871, and since then had largely increased, fell in 1881 to 924,882; the solitary town in the whole district which showed any augmentation being Bulandshahr itself, which rose from 14,804 to 17,863. Still, distressing as it was at the time, the epidemic ran its course and left no lasting ill effects behind. On the contrary, the result was rather one of relief from overcrowding, and when the period of depression had passed, a large increase in the birth-rate showed that it was chiefly the very old, or young, or infirm, who had been removed, and that the actual vigour of the community remained unimpaired.

Much has been done of late years by the irrigation department to correct the excessive humidity which has been caused by their canals, and extensive schemes for the relief of the most low-lying and water-logged lands have either been carried out or are still in progress. More than 150 miles of drainage cuts have been excavated; the Kálindi has been straightened and kept within its banks, at a cost of Rs. 94,757, and similar operations are now being commenced on the Kauwan. All this must have a beneficial effect on the general atmosphere; but the special conditions of the towns and villages are so unfavourable, that many years must elapse before any marked improvement can be expected in their vital statistics. The whole surface of the country is a dead level, with the population massed in artificial depressions, which have been dug to supply the earth for building purposes. The houses, instead of being raised—as sanitary laws would require—are sunk some two or three feet below the level of the ground, and the sides of the pit form the basement of the walls. To complete the necessary height, mud is mixed and brought in from any waste spot near at hand. The result is, that the village itself stands in a hole, and is hemmed in by an irregular circle of trenches used as receptacles for every kind of abomination. Add to this, that herds of cattle every evening return to the homestead, and during the night share the same quarters with their masters. The soil is thus in the course of years

saturated with impurities, and, as it is the custom to sleep either on the ground or on a very low pallet, it is no matter for surprise that the annual victims of fever are more than of all other diseases combined.

In the majority of cases, it is not altogether poverty that is responsible for the utter want of domestic comfort, but rather an apathetic acquiescence in a degraded standard of social life arising from ignorance that anything better is obtainable. The characteristic oriental craving for decoration is frequently indicated by the carving of the wooden eaves and brackets and by the plaster niches and mouldings of the doorways, which, though rude in execution, are often of appropriate and picturesque design; but there is no appreciation whatever of cleanliness or ventilation, and no effort is made to secure them. In a really rich man's house the latter defect is equally conspicuous; the courtyards are larger and the buildings are substantial but the arrangements for conservancy are not a whit better, and there is generally much less evidence of taste, in consequence of a vicious tendency to abandon the indigenous style and copy the hideous vulgarisms of the Public Works Department. Before the people of India can claim to rank on an equality with Europeans, it is above all things necessary that they should reform their domestic habits of life: when they have learnt to order these matters aright, their political enfranchisement will follow spontaneously on their capacity for it; the reverse process must be unreal and can only eventuate in failure.

Next to the unhealthy condition of their homes, the two institutions that most conduce to the propagation of disease are pilgrimages and marriage-feasts. Both practices have their root in the intolerable monotony of ordinary existence, which grasps at any change for a relief, but disguises the real motive by an affectation of religious or social obligation. Closely packed in bullock carts or some other equally clumsy vehicle, the guests start in straggling procession, and jog along the weary roads for the distance of a hundred miles or more, halting only for an hour or two at an occasional well for a draught of water and a mouthful of parched grain. Aching in every limb from the jolting of the springless cart and the cramped position into which they have been squeezed, choked with dust, dizzy from the glare of the sun and want of sufficient food, for they purposely starve themselves in order to do more justice to the feast, they at last arrive at their journey's end. Here no accommodation has been provided for them, and no amusement, beyond enormous piles of indigestible food, with which they gorge themselves without intermission for three days and nights, freely abusing their host,

should there be any shortcoming, and then start on the homeward journey, to endure the same discomforts as before, now aggravated by the agonies of indigestion. Every year half the outbreaks of cholera that occur may be traced up to these ghastly merry-makings. At pilgrimages there is no over-eating, but the exposure and the crowding are greater, and an essential part of the proceedings generally consist in drinking some filthy water from a turbid stream or stagnant tank of reputed sanctity, where thousands of people have been bathing. On neither occasion is there any thought of pleasing the eyes or gratifying the mind, except by the excitement inseparable from being one of a crowd which is moved by a common object.

If the sordid discomfort of home were relieved by some element of culture, people would no longer look abroad for their enjoyments. They would be happier and healthier, nor would the ultimate cost of living be increased. Instead of money being hoarded for special occasions, and then squandered in thankless and unprofitable profusion, it would be distributed with judicious economy over the whole area of domestic requirements. Food, clothing, shelter and education are comparatively so cheap, that all but the very poorest could rear a family in a decent and respectable manner, if it were not for the extravagant outlay on marriages. The various attempts that have been made to enforce the reduction of such expenses are well-meaning, but have not achieved much success, nor do I think they are ever likely to do so. The root of the evil lies deeper, and it is that which has to be attacked. Make the general aspect of life more attractive, and there will then be less desire to smirch it with crude blotches of colour.

The recent advance in the general prosperity of the district has been faithfully reflected step by step, and year after year in the annual Criminal Returns; for in India, as in England, to use the words of Tennyson's Northern Farmer, "Tisn't them as has money that breaks into houses and steals." But anomalies of all kinds, however gratifying may be the exceptional circumstances which they indicate, are always *per se* displeasing to the compiler of official statistics at head-quarters; for he has no personal concern with the facts, and is interested only in the symmetrical appearance of the figures exhibited in his tabular statements. A conventional explanation of the discrepancy has therefore to be found in an alleged concealment of offences. There is, however, no good reason for supposing that the people are more unwilling here than elsewhere to invoke the assistance of the Police for the recovery of stolen property, or the redress of any real injury. A murder or a burglary can scarcely be committed without attract-



ing attention, and if in the case of petty disputes there is a reluctance to waste time and money by coming into court about them, such a habit of mind is rather to be encouraged than condemned.\*

Another matter in which the district falls short of official requirements is the consumption of spirituous liquor. Temperance is a virtue, in which the excise authorities are by no means ready to believe. If the revenue is not up to the ordinary standard, the only explanation of the fact that they will accept is smuggling. But in spite of exceptional vigilance, an evasion of the law is very rarely detected, and probably is rarely practised. The absence of drunkenness and the absence of crime go together and explain each other. If a tempting array of bottles were displayed at selected spots along the most frequented thoroughfares, many a dusty pedestrian might be induced to assuage his thirst with a draught, and so acquire a taste which would eventually be beneficial to the excise revenue. A similar result might follow from an increase of the number of drinking-shops in the towns and large villages, to serve as social clubs for the dissolute; but the advantage to the respectable community may be doubted, while the gain to Government would be more than counterbalanced by the charges of extra police and increased jail accommodation. With a large number of wealthy landed proprietors, mostly Mahomedans, living on their own estate, in the midst of their own tenantry, as many as thirteen of them exercising the powers of Honorary Magistrates and ready to report any suspicious circumstance they may observe; with the whole population singularly well to do and largely impregnated with Muhammadan ideas of social propriety; and with whole tribes ordinarily reputed criminal, forsaking their old predatory habits for the more assured profits of honest husbandry, it would be strange, indeed, if the district statistics coincided precisely with those of other localities where industry and sobriety are not so conspicuously remunerative.

---

\* It is satisfactory to observe that the altered condition of things has at last been recognized. Mr. Webster, the Inspector-General of Police, who was Magistrate of Bulandshahr from 1863 to 1866, writes as follows in his review of the year 1882:—"The circumstances of the people have changed greatly. They are far more prosperous than they were; cultivation has greatly extended, and large tracts which were grass jungles when I knew the district, and which harboured cattle-stealers and their booty, are now well-cultivated corn-lands; and what is more important as regards the cessation of crime, the very persons who used these lands as asylums in their thieving forages are now the cultivators of them. The Gujars, who used to commit at least a third of all the crime in the district are now to a certain extent reformed, and only occasionally vary their agricultural pursuits by an expedition for the purposes of cattle or other theft."

In addition to the many advantages already enumerated, the district is well provided with communications, having as many as seven Railway Stations, four on the East Indian and three on the Oudh and Rohilkhand line. It is also traversed by the Grand Trunk Road from the Aligarh to the Delhi border, and has a complete net-work of minor thoroughfares radiating in every direction from the town of Bulandshahr, which occupies the exact centre of the whole area. A few years ago, during one of the periodical financial panics, several of the roads were summarily condemned by the head of the Public Works Department, and broken up at considerable expense ; but their construction will be one of the first acts of the new Local Committee. The greatest obstacle to freedom of communication has hitherto been the Kaliudi, which has a permanent bridge only at Bulandshahr, and no bridge or ferry of any kind whatever between that town and Hapur in the Merath district, a distance of about 30 miles. As the banks are high and sudden floods frequent, it is never safe for a traveller to reckon on the possibility of a passage, and the obstruction to traffic has thus been most serious. This is now being removed by the munificence of one of the Honorary Magistrates, Saiyid Mihrbân Ali, who is constructing a substantial bridge near the town of Gulásthî, where his residence is, at an estimated cost of Rs. 20,000.

In such a quiet and prosperous part of the country, where there is no great injustice to correct, or practical grievance to remedy, it seems the height of unwisdom to be for ever introducing new laws and systems of administration, which, however admirable in theory, have never been recognized as wants by the people themselves. What they require of Government is the strong maintenance of order, and the persistent extension of material improvements. These are boons which they can understand and appreciate far more highly than the invidiousness of the franchise and the anarchy of self-Government. Under sympathetic guidance, they are capable of great and rapid advance, but without direction of some sort, they are absolutely powerless. They can admire action in others, but without a strong stimulus are loth to engage in it themselves ; their philosophic literature shows that they can rival the profoundest German professor in tracking the abysses of transcendental speculation ; and with a little practice there can be no doubt that they would soon become as expert as a Frenchman in the elaboration of paper constitutions, and the technical conduct of a debating society ; but in the palmiest days of their independence they never had a metalled road in the largest of their cities, nor a swinging punkha in the most luxurious of their palaces. And these are the typical blessings, which it is the province of the British Government to supply.

In the matter of school education, official efforts have not been attended with very brilliant success. The real civilizing influences, that within the last few years have so largely modified the thoughts and habits of the people, have been the Post and the Railway. Their beneficial stimulus has been felt universally; while the effect of our schools has been limited to a single class, and that numerically the smallest and politically the least important. Every head of a department is beset by a crowd of applicants for clerical employ, who have been taught at the public expense to read and write in the Persian character, and who consider that they have thus established a claim to maintenance for life in some Government office. Certainly, their acquirements would not often stand them in such stead in any other vocation. They have never learnt to think, and have totally lost both the faculty of observation and the instructive propriety of taste which in the uneducated Oriental so often compensate for the want of scholastic training.

Our course of instruction is not calculated to satisfy the modest requirements of the yeoman, the artizan, the trader, and generally the independent middle classes, which ought to supply the material for those local boards which the Government is now so anxious to organize. What primary instruction is given is not regarded as a possible end in itself, but only as a means to passing an examination. A little reflection must show that this is exactly the reverse of what is wanted. Instead of a teacher priding himself on the number of his pupils who have got Government appointments, it would be far more to the purpose if he could boast a long list of boys who, after learning to read, write, and cypher, had settled down contentedly to their hereditary occupations, and had proved the value of education by turning out their work in a more intelligent style than their fathers had done before them. This would be a guarantee of genuine progress, and would check that rapid decay of all indigenous arts and manufactures which is the necessary result of our pernicious system of schooling, which aims at converting all the rising generation into mere office clerks.

There is no occasion whatever for the Government to take up this line of business. If all our village schools were to be closed to-morrow, the only function they adequately discharge, *viz.*, the training of Munshis for Government service, would be carried on by private enterprise with much the same results as at present. A craving for vernacular education by people who can earn their bread without it is the very last want that is felt by an ordinary community. There were schools for teaching Latin in England for centuries before the idea was entertained that the masses required to be taught English. A similar superstition

survives in India, and we encourage it by our village schools for Persian and Urdu. We exhaust the resources of Government in making a free gift of professional training to people who are quite able to provide it for themselves, instead of applying all our means to the diffusion of a simple vernacular education, far more important in its effects on national progress, but less productive of immediate individual advancement, and therefore at once more deserving of, and more dependent on, State patronage. Even in such a Muhammadanized district as that in which I am writing, more than half the members of the different municipal committees can read only the true vernacular character of the country, *i e.*, the Nāgri. In the proposed rural tahsili committees the proportion would be still higher. Such men, having never been brought under the influence of our schools, cannot undertake the management of affairs in accordance with European ideas, and are necessarily quite unable to follow and check intricate accounts which are kept only in Persian and English. If left to themselves, they will either do nothing, or else, in all that they do, they will be absolutely at the mercy of their paid clerk.

The remedies that I would propose for these admitted evils, are two. In the first place, I would do away with the present system of Government inspection and put the primary schools of every district under the absolute control of the local committee, at the same time increasing the staff of the Deputy Inspectors, who would then be Deputies no longer, and the Sub-Inspectors. Not only, as has often been pointed out, are the Inspectors much too highly cultivated for the drudgery that devolves upon them, but in every country Government inspection has the inevitable result of raising the standard, which in primary schools is exactly what is not wanted. The effect of the Education Act of 1870 in England is vitiated by the same incurable tendency: the Board schools, which were intended for the poor, have gradually become suitable only for the lower middle classes, for whose benefit it was quite unnecessary that the whole community should be taxed. Secondly, the only character that I would allow to be taught in primary schools is the Nāgri. This—to say the least—answers as well as any other for all the ordinary requirements of rural life, and it has the special advantage that it does not qualify for any kind of Government service. The Persian character would be taught, as now, in the pargana and tahsili schools, and boys who wished to learn it could proceed there, after undergoing the prescribed course of instruction in the primary school. It appears to me that nothing could be more equitable than this arrangement: Hindus would be gratified by having Hindi recognized as the basis of the vernacular, while the Muhammadan

phase of the language would still retain the stamp of official currency.

✓ As regards the language question, I have no patience with the continued use of the fantastic word Urdu. What people talk all over these provinces is Hindustani, which, when *written*, takes a Persianized form among Muhammadans and a Hindi form among Hindus. In both phases it has a Hindi basis, which cannot be got rid of even in the most artificial Urdu; on the other hand, a multitude of Persian words have been naturalized in its common vocabulary, which even in Hindi it would be pedantic to ignore. As it is already the general medium of intercourse throughout India, all Indian races may eventually be brought to accept it, and therefore the recognition of a multiplicity of spoken dialects as distinct literary languages is much to be deprecated. The best means of checking the growing divergence between Hindustani and other Indian vernaculars would perhaps be found in the institution of an academy of orientalists, who would authoritatively settle the renderings to be adopted for new terms of European art and science. But the universal acceptance of a neutralized Hindustani, involving a complete reconciliation between Urdu and Hindi, can only be effected in one way. So long as the vernacular is written by Munshis in the Persian, and by Pandits in the Nāgri character, it is utterly impossible that purism should be eradicated. The one party will insist on Persian and Arabic for their vocabulary, the other on Sanskrit; and though the grammatical structure may be much the same in both compositions, neither of the two will be intelligible to the writer of the other. The adoption of the Roman character would at once remove the whole difficulty; and if it were introduced in our schools, it would rapidly, without any forcing, supersede both its rivals as the vehicle for ordinary written communication.

I have already alluded to the decay of native arts and manufactures, for which our faulty system of education is partly responsible. Something is being done towards their revival by Schools of Design and by local Exhibitions, as at Lahor, Bombay and elsewhere. But, so long as the dreadful upas tree of the public Works Department is allowed to overshadow the country, sporadic efforts like these can have no perceptible effect on popular culture. Architecture is the first of all the decorative arts, and its degradation paralyses them all. Our public buildings, which with scarcely an exception are either ludicrously mean or obtrusively hideous, now occupy conspicuous positions in every station and municipality, and, being naturally accepted as models for imitation, are rapidly accustoming the native eye to what is vulgar and tasteless. What

weight in the opposite scale can be attributed to the teaching of a few schools or an occasional grant for the restoration of an ancient palace or temple? If there is really a desire to revive oriental art, I believe it can be done without the fussy agency of a department and without any expense to the State, simply by allowing municipal committees to erect their own buildings to make each Town Hall an emporium of local industry, and generally to develop indigenous talent by the exercise of judicious patronage. In technical as well as in the higher literary education, I believe that a healthy influence can be exerted by Government only from the outside, by removing artificial restrictions and encouraging spontaneous action. In primary education, on the other hand, the whole burden must fall on the State ; but, by a simplification of the machinery, the cost and labour may be rendered much less than at present and the outturn much larger and of a more durable quality.

A notable stimulus has been given to indigenous industry by a local show, which was started by a former Collector, Mr. Willock, in 1873. It is supported by voluntary subscriptions which amount every year to upwards of Rs. 4,000. As a horse fair, it has succeeded so well, that it now receives an annual Government grant of Rs. 1,250 for prizes, and attracts remount officers from all parts of India. As regards agricultural produce, greater care is taken than before in the selection of grain for seed, so that Bulandshahr wheat is very largely exported and is quoted at high prices in the London market. Attention to the subject of cattle breeding is encouraged by a special Government grant of Rs. 100, but no improvement has yet been effected. As fodder becomes every year scarcer and dearer, the people must gradually reduce the extravagant number of miserable half-starved animals that they are now in the habit of keeping. With a smaller stock, of better quality, the compulsory reservation of grazing ground in every village will be most beneficial, but if it is started immediately, before the small farmers have fully realized how impossible it is for them, under the altered circumstances of the country, to support a large herd in good condition, the effect will probably be only to intensify the present evil. Until the breed of cattle has been improved, it is premature to attempt any improvement in the native plough. The arts and manufactures represented at the district show were, till lately, ludicrous and puerile. This department has now made great bounds : the Sikanderabad muslins, the Jewar *durries* and rugs, the Khurja pottery, the Jahangirabad cotton prints and the Bulandshahr wood-carving are revivals or developments

which are achieving a more than local reputation, and will all be represented at the forthcoming Calcutta Exhibition.

If in a native State, administration is ruined by caprice, still more so is it in British India by routine and returns. This is most conspicuously illustrated by the department of Public Works. For large imperial undertakings, such as railways, bridges over the great rivers, military roads extending the whole length of the province, and barracks for European soldiers, it is desirable to maintain an adequate staff of European Engineers. But for the ordinary requirements of a civil district, local native talent would be not only more economical, but also more efficient. The masons who reared the tombs and palaces that are still the most notable sights in the country, have direct descendants at the present day, in the creators, for instance, of modern Mathurá, which dates entirely from the beginning of this century, and justly ranks as one of the handsomest cities in northern India. If men of this stamp were allowed to design and execute our district buildings, the promotion of indigenous industry would become so far a reality, instead of a transparent fiction as hitherto. The only difficulty lies in their inability to satisfy departmental requirements in the matter of tabular statements and returns. These are based on an intricate and voluminous system of checks and counterchecks, which it requires some years' training to master, and assiduous labour to maintain. The entire energy of the whole establishment is concentrated on the manipulation of the accounts, and the works are left to look after themselves. However badly the latter may turn out, if only they cost enough, they will make an imposing show on paper at the year's end, and will be regarded with complete satisfaction by the supreme authorities. For example, the completion of an embankment along the right bank of the Kálinđi for the protection of the town of Bulandshahr, was specially mentioned in an annual report as an important work of public utility. The cost was Rs. 4,000: it was not added, perhaps it was not known, that the actual benefit was less than *nil*. In order to construct it, earth was dug from the town side, and the level of the ground was thus reduced below that of the bed of the river. The result was that for some years the drainage from the surrounding country collected, as in a basin, and was barred from all escape. The nuisance was partially remedied by the great flood of 1880, which breached the embankment in several places, thus proving it to be as powerless against the river in exceptional seasons, as it was effective for mischief in ordinary years. This is a fair sample of the injurious results of

a policy which entrusts district works to irresponsible provincial agency ; irresponsible, because the local authorities are powerless to interfere, while the departmental authorities—sublimely indifferent to such petty undertakings—see only the neatly tabulated entries in the official return, and these they complacently pass as quite *en règle*. Besides the embankment and some new barracks in the jail, the only other original work that has been executed by professional engineers during my tenure of office in this district, is the bridge, which, as already mentioned, fell down a few months after it was finished. In the extensive series of improvements, which in the course of four years have converted a mean village into a handsome town, the department has had no hand whatever, except that it greatly delayed their commencement by representing to the Government, with stupefying effrontery, that the result would be “an eye-sore.”

Facts will never run off so smoothly as mathematical abstractions, and, therefore, to avoid friction, it is generally found advisable to adhere to the latter. The district officer signs these fancy documents by scores at a time, in duplicate or triplicate, at the top or the bottom, on the face or the reverse, in the blank spaces indicated by the engineer, and can only hope they are technically correct ; for the purposes of actual check he keeps a simple statement of his own, which may be very unscientific, but is at least intelligible. About the middle of the month, when the returns have all been despatched and objections answered, the European Engineer feels a little at leisure, and drives out to see the bridge, or road, that may be in progress, gives a few hurried instructions, which he cannot stop to see carried out, and returns into the station,\* where he presents his bill for travelling allowance, at the rate of eight annas a mile. If there were only simple returns, such as the Magistrate himself could keep, without the assistance of a trained accountant, the engineer might be a native, who could hire for a couple of rupees an ekka or a pony that would take him to the remotest part of the district, where he could spend a day or two in the leisurely inspection of work, finding all the accommodation he required in some neighbouring village. His pay also would be counted by tens of rupees instead of by hundreds ; and, as his supervision would be more continuous, there would be more of day-labour and less necessity for the employment of contractors, middle-men and munshis. These are the only people who profit by the high rates which prevail in the Department of Public Works. If the money went to the bricklayer, the mason, or the carpenter, there would be less cause for regret ; but the whole present system seems to have been invented solely



for the benefit of that very unprofitable person, the artificial product of our mistaken school policy, the Munshi, the parasite of the real working community. If the position of the latter were improved and their work recognised at its proper value, as in England, the son of a skilled artisan would not think to better himself, as now unfortunately he often does, by abandoning his hereditary occupation and becoming a quill-driver in an office.

The disbandment of the whole corps of executive and assistant engineers would not only be the greatest possible boon to the districts, but would even be welcomed by themselves, if due regard were had to vested interests and appointments of equal emolument found for them in a more appropriate sphere. The officers of the Roads and Building Department are the one body of Government servants in the country who notoriously have no heart in their work. It is impossible that they should have. Though by profession engineers, they are in fact merely accountants' clerks. Of all the multitudinous circulars that year by year are issued for their guidance, scarcely one per cent. refer to matters of construction. The rest are complicated rules of procedure as to filling in returns; corrections of misprints or explanations of unintelligible phraseology in previous orders, or most frequently of all, fulminations of the direst penalties against any attempt to exercise independent judgment. The one exception is probably either puerile or mischievous; such as an elaborate specification and sketch of a child's tub, that was circulated not very long ago, with a sharp metal edge to it, which might be warranted to draw blood whenever used.

Again, what little work a District Engineer has to do out of his office, is profoundly uninteresting. The maintenance of a road is a task that requires no great intellect or skill, and in England would be entrusted to quite a subordinate; while in the matter of buildings, there is no scope for the exercise of taste or ingenuity, standard plans having been provided, from which no deviation is allowed, whatever may be the differences in the locality and nature of the site. The consideration of such particulars is of less importance than might at first be imagined; for the designs have been so skilfully contrived as to be equally unsuitable wherever they may be placed. For a man with the slightest element of humanity and good taste in his composition, it must be unspeakable misery to superintend the construction of edifices which will not only cause daily discomfort to the unfortunate officials who are doomed to use them, but will also permanently disfigure the landscape and pervert the indigenous sentiment of architectural propriety. The only in-

nocent and legitimate source of gratification, of which the circumstances admit, lies in totalling up the number of miles for which travelling allowance can be drawn. On the other hand, no more devoted body of public servants exists than the Engineers in the Canal Department. They are taken from precisely the same class of men as their brethren on the roads; but they are less hampered by accounts; in dealing with such a subtle element as water, they are constantly confronted by unforeseen complications which afford exercise for ingenuity; and they have something in which they can take an honest pride, if at the end of each successive year their returns show a larger area to which they have extended the blessings of irrigation.

In a district like Bulandshahr, with many rich, liberal, and fairly well educated members of the native aristocracy, not gathered together in a few large towns, but residing on their own estates in all parts of the country, it would be an easy matter to constitute an influential and really representative Committee for the administration of local interests. Nothing, however, could be more pitifully unreal than the Committee actually existing. It is supposed to have at its disposal an annual income of over Rs. 70,000; but almost the whole of this considerable sum is absorbed by fixed charges, or has to be expended by departmental agency. A single item of about Rs. 2,500 for petty original works is all that the Committee can call absolutely its own, and can spend on projects of its own selection. If in any year this item is omitted from the budget, the Committee is then debarred from any the slightest exercise of independent judgment. Being entirely supported by arbitrary allotments, it gains nothing by judicious management; for whatever may be so realized, is merged in Provincial funds, and no benefit accrues to the district. With resources of its own, a more complete control over a less extended area, and a system of accounts which it could understand, the Committee would rapidly develop into a genuine district council, a seat in which would be highly coveted, not only as a personal distinction, but for the substantial responsibilities that it involved. The sense of local power would act as a strong stimulus to local usefulness, and spontaneous beneficial enterprise would relieve the State of many burdens now unfairly forced upon it. No reasonable person will voluntarily drop his money into the bottomless pit of a Government department, the mouth of which is so barred by checks and counterchecks that extrication can only be effected by much technical dexterity, and after the endurance of long delay. But, if the committee had greater freedom, it would soon acquire the confidence of the public, and become

the ordinary channel for the distribution of the many streams of private benevolence, which are now too often wasted for want of effective direction.

It is one of the most convincing proofs of the general incapacity for self-government, that in many towns and villages, accumulated funds are often left unutilized, and local improvements that every one desires, are unexecuted, simply on account of jealousy and a want of mutual confidence. If the district officer will take upon himself the responsibility of administration, the community is only too glad to place the money at his disposal and to supplement it by further subscriptions. They will not trust it to any one of themselves; and if the new road, or tank, or market-place, or whatever it may be, involves, as it generally will, the demolition of a house or two and the appropriation of the site, the owners will resist to the utmost of their power any requisition advanced by their neighbours, but will at once, and in a most liberal spirit, fall in with the wishes of a European officer. It is not that any compulsion is used, for complaint would be immediately entertained in the Civil Court, but they have confidence in their rulers, and believe them to act from more impersonal and disinterested motives than they attribute to their own townsmen.

If used as a supplement and an incentive to private enterprise and benevolence, the surplus funds of the Municipalities and Act XX. towns might be made far more generally beneficial than they ordinarily are. During the last four years the improvements that have been effected in all the principal towns of this district are so enormous, that every visitor enquires with amazement where the money has come from. Immediate supervision, with no contractors and middle-men, and no large establishments for the elaboration of accounts and returns, has so far reduced the actual outlay, that it is much below the ordinary estimate for works of such magnitude; but the great secret lies in the persistent adoption of the principle, that no public improvement should be undertaken unless voluntary subscriptions are forthcoming as well as State aid. But in order for this system to succeed, it is necessary to be in sympathetic accord with the people, and not to force upon them anything opposed to their prejudices, or greatly in advance of their real requirements. Though themselves illiterate and indifferent to the laws of hygiene, they are quite sensible of the value of education for their children and of the advantages to be derived from bridged and avennued roads, convenient tanks and ghats for bathing purposes, good wells, clean paved streets, commodious market-places, and substantial water-tight houses. In all such works as

these, the majority of the people concerned are always ready to co-operate, and even the obstructive minority will in the end be gratified by the result. Instead of the impracticable dream of self-government, if only a modest scheme of decentralization were introduced, every District Committee, without the worry and delay of repeated references for sanction to higher authority, would have certain limited funds of its own to lay out in the furtherance of local projects and the encouragement of native enterprise. The result would be a great and immediate saving in State expenditure, and the eventual development of a public spirit, which would be a real qualification for higher political responsibilities.

---

## ART. XI.—THE KANJARS OF UPPER INDIA.

THE present article is an attempt to piece together such scraps of information as could be collected on the manners, industries, religion, and traditions of the Kanjara tribe,—a tribe which is itself found only in scraps or fragmentary groups, scattered among the different districts of Upper India, and is one of the few surviving remains of the old wandering and predatory nations, by whom the entire country was peopled in the earliest times. As little or no information could be collected from books, almost all the facts hereinafter described are the results of personal observation, or of direct enquiry made from Kanjars themselves.

The largest account of this people that I have seen in print is that contained in the late Mr. Sherring's *Hindu Tribes and Castes*, Vol. I, p. 389. This account does not fill one entire page, and a good deal of the space is taken up with giving the names of the seven clans, into which Kanjars are nominally divided.

Kanjara is the name by which the hunting and roving clans of Upper India are most widely known; though according to the returns of the census taken in 1881, the Kanjar tribe is less numerous in the North-West and Oudh than the Baurias, Cháis, Thárus, Nats, Banmánush, and Kols,—all of whom are approximately in the same backward stage of culture. The term Kanjara is often loosely applied to other tribes, who call themselves by a different name, but lead a similar life. The name does not appear among the savages of the Punjab.\* But roving tribes bearing this name are found in Rajputana,† in Behar, ‡ in Bengal as Gangwar, § and in the Deccan as Kanjar, Zingar, or Jingar. || The name "Kanjara" re-appears in various forms, not only in India but in those countries of Europe, which have been invaded by

---

\* The tribes in the Punjab, corresponding to the Kanjars of Hindustan, are the Sansis and Bauriyas.

† *Sherring's Castes*, Vol. III., p. 62.

‡ *Bengal Census Report for 1872*, p. 158, where they are said to be very numerous in the Purneah district.

§ *Asiatic Researches*, Vol. VII, Article 19, p. 457. Here the Gangwars are said to be a clan of Nats. But it is well known that Nats in many of their habits closely resemble Kanjars.

|| The Kanjars are described as a wild tribe, living in the jungles between Nagpur and the Warda rivers in *Sherring's Castes*, Vol. II, p. 155. The same writer mentions the Zingars or Jingars in Vol. II, p. 123, as artisans of an inferior order. The two statements are not contradictory, but rather confirm each other.

Gipsy tribes from the East. Thus in Roumelia these tribes are called Cingarees; in Roumania, Tschingenes; in Hungary, Tzigany; in Italy, Cingari; and in Spain, Zincáro. The German "Zigeuner" for vagrant, and the English "Conjurer" for juggler, may perhaps (though other etymologies are given) be derived from the same root. The Gipsies of Europe have, for purposes of concealment, adopted a Hindi patois as their peculiar cant, and have given it the name of Romancy from the country (Roumania), where they first encamped in Europe. On the other hand, Kanjars have adopted a secret language of their own, and use the vulgar tongue only when they speak to outsiders.

There is scarcely a district in Upper India, in which small encampments of Kanjars cannot be seen at times, either in solitary jungle tracts which are favourable for game and secrecy, or in the outskirts of villages, wherever it may be convenient to them to halt and sell their wares.\* All true Kanjars are addicted to a roving life; and if they halt for a time near some town or village, they put up their temporary sheds, made with poles and matting, in a grove at some distance apart from the abodes of the settled inhabitants. They have no connection whatever with Hindu forms of worship, or with the rules of life which that religion prescribes; † and are entirely outside the pale of caste. Their natural home is the forest, where they subsist by hunting jackals, wolves, hares, and any other kind of animal that they can kill or catch, by gathering such roots and vegetable products as require no cultivation, and by extracting juice from the palm-tree, which, after it has become fermented, is the favourite beverage of almost all the wandering and low caste tribes of India. They are clever, too, at trapping birds and squirrels, and digging out snakes, mungooses, bandicoots, field rats, lizards, and any other

---

\* During the time of the kings of Oudh, they were much more numerous than they are now in the Bharaich district. *William's Oudh Census*, Vol. 1, p. 108. In the Census Report of the North-West Provinces, 1865, it is noted that they were found in 30 out of 35 districts. In the Census Report of the North-West and Oudh, 1882, they are said to have been found in every district of the United Provinces except Lalitpur and Garhwal.

† I inquired once of a Kanjar woman who formed one of a gang encamped in the Lucknow district at Bakshi Talau, what their religion was. This encampment had remained stationary in that spot for more than six consecutive years, and its members were evidently on the road to absorption into the great vortex of Hindu castes. She told me that they had no religion, but were ready to worship all the gods alike, if they could be allowed, the Hindu, the Mussulman, and the gods of the *Sahib Log* (European), and that if she had her choice she certainly preferred the last, as they were obviously by far the most powerful of the three. Her remark, that she had no religion of her own, was an exaggeration of the fact, though she was evidently forgetting what her own religion was, or losing faith in it.

kind of vermin that chance may throw in their way; all of which they eat indiscriminately. Many of the *dakaitis*, or gang-robbers, who infest the public highways at night are Kanjars; and in the pursuit of this calling they are sometimes associated with evil-doers from among the Hindu community.

Kanjars are seldom or never seen in groups of more than 20 or 40 persons of all ages at a time, and the number is sometimes even less. These little groups may unite sometimes for special and temporary objects. But large groups are never permanently formed. Small wandering hordes, such as may still be seen among the lowest races of men, are the germs out of which all the largest societies or nations have gradually sprung. When life is so rude and simple, that separate class interests, each depending on the other, cannot be created, no permanent cohesion of parts is possible; and a larger group, if it should be formed for a time, rapidly falls to pieces again. "Scattered over many regions," says Mr. Herbert Spencer, "there are minute hordes,—still extant examples of the primordial type of society. We have Wood-Veddahs living sometimes in pairs, and only now and then assembling; we have Bushmen wandering about in families, and forming larger groups but occasionally; we have Fuegians clustered by the dozen or score. Tribes of Australians, of Tasmanians, of Andamanese, are variable within the limits of perhaps 20 to 50. And similarly if the region is inhospitable as with the Esquimaux, or if the arts of life are undeveloped as with the Digger-Americans, or if adjacent higher races are obstacles to growth as with hill tribes, like the Juangs, this limitation to primitive size continues." \* Among the Kanjars there are some groups or clans, which make a habit of keeping within easy reach of towns and villages, while others seldom or never leave the forest. But even among the former, it is not merely the proximity of settled communities, which prevents the formation of larger groups. For even in wider forest tracts, where there is ample space and no impediment from higher races, the same

---

\* *Principles of Sociology*, Vol. I, Part II, Chap. III, p. 482, Ed. 1877. In the text the phrase is Digger-Indians; but I have taken the liberty of changing it to Digger-Americans, so as to prevent the misunderstanding which might arise from the use of the word *Indian*. A fuller account of the root-Diggers or Shoshonees, who live near the sources of the Missouri may be seen in page 60, Vol. II of *Great Deserts of America*, by Abbé Em. Domenech, published by Longman and Green in 1860. The same writer speaking of the Comanchees, a less savage tribe than the Shoshonees, says:—"This tribe possesses an infinite number of petty chiefs, who lead bands of marauders," &c. (Vol. II, p. 341); and of another tribe he says:—"The Selishes have no regular form of government: they live in bands of 200 or 300 individuals," Vol. II, p. 343.)

law of petty non-associative hordes prevails ; and it would be a rare thing to find an encampment of more than, or even as many as, 50 persons. In the earliest times this type of society must have prevailed throughout the whole of India, and it is well known that it still prevails very largely in some parts of the centre and the south where settled Hindu communities scarcely exist. It was only when agriculture had transformed the habits of some of the hunting and nomad tribes, and drawn around it the various class interests inseparable from the settled state, that larger communities could at last be formed. The system of Indian castes was based upon the division of labour ; but this principle could not take root in the soil, till it was sown there with the crops of the husbandman.

The Kanjars live chiefly, as we have seen, by hunting and trapping, and by gathering the spontaneous fruits and roots of the forest. But there is no savage race in the world, in which certain rudimentary arts have not been practised from the earliest times. The Kanjars not only practise such arts as are necessary to their own existence, but they have acquired certain other crafts which are of no little utility to the settled communities, amongst whom they wander. They make mats of the *sirki*, reed baskets of wattled cane, fans of palm leaves, and rattles of plaited straw ;—the last of which are now sold to Hindu children as toys, though originally they were used by Kanjars themselves (if we are to trust to the analogies afforded by other backward races) as sacred and mysterious instruments. \* From the stalks of the *munj* grass and

\* Thus among the Abipones of South America, the priestess who conducts the ceremonies in connexion with the worship of the Pleiades "rattles a gourd 'full of hardish fruit-seeds to musical time.'" The Congo-Negros "had a 'great wooden rattle, upon which they took their oaths.'" In North America, when any person is sick, the sorcerer or medicine-man brings the sacred rattle and shakes it over him : this says Prescott, is "the principal catholicon for all diseases." According to some of the earlier travellers in America (Lafitau, Vol. I, p. 211), the rattle was even regarded as a deity. These examples of the rattle have been chiefly taken from Sir John Lubbock's *Early History of Civilisation*, Appendix Part II, p. 405, Edit., 1870. In Burma (as I have seen) diseases like small-pox, measles, cholera, &c., are ascribed to visitations of evil spirits. I remember once seeing a whole village turn out at a stated hour in the evening and commence violently beating the hollow bamboo piles on which the floors of their houses are raised above the ground. A loud clattering and rattling noise ensued : and I was told that this was intended as a simultaneous raid against the evil spirits, who resided inside the hollow bamboo poles and afflicted the dwellings of the people with the epidemic then raging. A rattling discordant noise seems to have been considered efficacious as a devil-driver amongst the Hindus. Mr. Sherring (*Hindu Tribes and Castes*, Vol. I, p. 344) alludes to a low Indian caste called Jalwa, who, a few days after the birth of a child in a great man's family, come around the house to yell and shriek. "This is supposed to be a preservative from ghosts, imps and hobgoblins, who are frightened away from the infant by these hideous sounds." Here the barbarian tongue does duty for the barbarian rattle.



from the roots of the palāsi tree, they make ropes which are sold or bartered to villagers in exchange for grain, milk, pigs, &c. They prepare the skins of which drums are made, and sell them to Hindu musicians ;—though, probably, as in the case of the rattle, the drum was originally used by Kanjars themselves and worshipped as a fetish :\* for even the Arya tribes, who are said to have been far more advanced than the indigenous races, sung hymns in honour of the drum or *dundubhi* as if it were something sacred. They make plates of broad leaves, which are ingeniously stitched together by thin stalks ; and plates of this kind are very widely used by the inferior Indian castes and by confectioners and sellers of sweetmeats. The mats of *sirkī* reed, with which they cover their own temporary sheds, are largely used by cart-drivers of all classes or castes, to protect their goods and themselves against rain. The toddy, † or juice of the palm-tree, which they extract and ferment by methods of their own, and partly for their own use, finds a ready sale amongst low caste Hindus in villages and market towns. They are among the chief stone-cutters in Upper India, especially in the manufacture of the grinding stone which is very widely used. They gather the white wool-like fibre that grows in the pods of the *Sālmali* or Indian cotton tree, and twist it into thread for the use of weavers. In the manufacture of brushes for the cleaning of cotton-yarn they enjoy an almost entire monopoly. ‡ In these brushes a stiff mass of horse hair is attached to a wooden handle by sinews and strips of hide ; and the workmanship is remarkably neat and durable. Another complete, or almost complete, monopoly enjoyed by Kanjars is the collection and sale of the roots of *khushkhaṣ* grass, which are afterwards made up

\* According to the late Dr. Muir (see Sanskrit texts, Vol. V. p. 466, Edition 1870), in the Atharva Veda, V. 20, there is a hymn addressed to the drum as a sacred instrument. It is stated by Mr. Tylor that the drum, like the rattle, is a serious instrument, and not a plaything, amongst modern savages, *Anthropology*, Chap. XII, p. 293, Edit. 1881.

† The word toddy is the Anglicized form of *tādi* (ताडी.) the juice of the ताड़ or fan-palm, from the stem of which the liquor is extracted, and from the leaves of which the Indian fan or hand-punka is made. On the love of savage races for spirituous liquors, see *Great Deserts of America*, by Abbé Domenech, Vol. II, p. 27, 50, 57.)

‡ There is a small Muhammedan caste of recent formation, whose special function it is to manufacture weavers' brushes. This caste is called Kunchi-band. The brushes are made by them on precisely the same plan as those made by Kanjars. It is not impossible that the members of this caste were originally Kanjars, who have been converted to Islam by men of the Julāha, or Muhammedan weaver caste, whose attachment to the creed of Islām is more than ordinarily intense.

by others into door-screens and used as refrigerators during the hottest months of the year. The roots of this wild grass, which grows in most abundance on the outskirts of forests, or near the banks of rivers, are dug out of the earth by an instrument called *Khanti*. \* The same implement serves as a dagger or short spear for killing wolves or jackals, as a tool for carving a secret entrance through the clay-wall of a villager's hut, in which a burglary is meditated, as a spade or hoe for digging snakes, field rats, lizards, &c., out of their holes and edible roots out of the earth, and as a hatchet for chopping wood.

In most of the above arts or industries, it is easy to recognize functions or germs of functions, one or other of which has long been the stereotyped hereditary calling of certain inferior castes, such as Bahaliya, Bári, Behna, Chainár, Dharkár, Kori, Kalwár, and others; and hence we may reasonably conclude, that the wandering and predatory tribes, which were once universal in Upper India, but of which now only a few fragments remain, were the *rudis indigestaque moles*, out of which the several castes, with their respective functions, were fashioned by slow degrees.

One of the arts (as we have shewn) in which Kanjars chiefly excel is that of making reed mats, fibre ropes, nets, cane baskets, rattles, palm-fans, &c. The light *sirki* mat, for example, with which they cover their own moveable leaf huts, is a model of neatness and simplicity, combined with usefulness. Almost all the other wandering tribes, besides Kanjars, and almost all the lowest Hindu castes (that is, those who are least removed from the Kanjar stage, such as Dóms, Bhaugis, Khatiks, Bindis, Bhars, Dharkars, &c.) are noted for their skill in similar kinds of workmanship. The proficiency displayed by the Indian\* savage in this respect is one of the many links connecting them with savage races in other parts of the world; for there seems to have been no race of men so ignorant as to be destitute of this art in some kind of form, wherever the materials have been supplied by nature ready to their hands. The Hottentots, for example, made their

---

\* So called from the root खन् which in Sanskrit means to dig or make a hole. The handle is about 3 feet long, and the blade (which is sharpened into a curved point something like the blade of a knife) is about a foot long. The blade is now made of iron, but was originally of stone. The iron blade is procured by Kanjars from ironsmiths. The handle is made by themselves. Mr. Sherring in *Hindu Tribes and Castes*, Vol. I, p. 38, says: "At the commencement of the hot weather the Kanjar takes the sweet-scented *khaskhus* grass and works it into a light bamboo frame." This is a mistake. It is not the grass, but the root of the *khaskhus* which is so used. And it is not Kanjars but Chaparbands and others who make the light bamboo frame and fasten the *khaskhas* roots into it.

huts of plaited osiers covered with mats; and "the mats were "made of bulrushes and flags dried in the sun, and so closely "fitted together, that only the heaviest rain could penetrate them." The Veddahs, the wild tribes of Ceylon, live in huts formed of boughs and bark, and make strings for their bows, and ropes for guiding their hunting buffaloes. The Mincopies, or natives of the Andaman Islands, who dispute with Veddahs the distinction of being the lowest of the human race in the scale of culture, manufacture fishing-nets, bow-strings, and the long cord which they attach to their harpoons; and their women stitch together small leaf-aprons, similar in design to those said to have been worn by our first parents after the Fall, and still worn by some of the Kolarian and Dravidian tribes in Central and Southern India at the present day.\* The Australian savages roof their huts with palm leaves attached to broad pieces of bark, which they strip off the gum-tree, and manufacture vessels of bark for receiving and holding water. The Feejeeans surmount their ramparts with reed fences and stockades, roof their houses with thatch work of wild sugarcane and fern leaves, and rig their canoes with sails made of mats. The Maoris make fishing lines and nets of the fibres of a wild flax plant, and protect the sides of their houses with a wicker work of osiers closely thatched with dry reeds. The Tahitians made fishing-nets, lines, and ropes out of the fibre of the cocoanut and other native plants, covered their houses with palm leaves laid in the form of thatch, and were very skilful in making baskets and wicker work of a thousand different patterns. The Kamchadales build their yourts or joint-family dwellings with wooden pillars, the interstices between which are filled up with a strong wicker work. The Fuegians,—another race for whom a claim has been set up as being the lowest of mankind,—make baskets, water-buckets, and fishing-lines. † It is worthy of note that the Hindu lawgiver, who probably flourished at about 300 B. C., assigns "the working with canes and reeds" as the appropriate function of the lowest caste existing in his own day, whom he calls Sopáka or dog-eater. ‡ The chimpanzee builds

---

\* As for example, the Chenchus: (*Sherring's Hindu Tribes and Castes*, Vol. III, p. 140.) In Vol. III, 208, the Koragars are described as using bunches of leafy twigs.

† This, and the other examples previously quoted, have been collected from *Pre-historic Times*, Chaps. XIII. and XIV, by Sir John Lubbock.

‡ *Institutes of Manu*, Chap. X. sl. 37. The caste, to which this function is assigned, is called Pandusopáka, that is, the dog-eating clan of the tribe of Pándus. Dog-diet is considered unclean at the present day, even by Kanjars. The Lawgiver can scarcely find language to express his abhorrence of the Sopákas, see *ślokas* 52-56.

himself a house or shelter quite equal to that of some savages. The first men that existed may have known this art by inborn instinct; but even if they did not, they must soon have learnt it, when the necessities of their position as hunters compelled them to study the customs and contrivances of the animals with whom they disputed possession of the forest. \*

\* Another art, in which Kanjars especially excel, and which connects them with savage tribes elsewhere, is that of stone-cutting. They are the chief millstone-makers in Upper India. There is one division of Kanjars, namely, the Sankat clan, which has evidently derived its name from this industry. Originally, that is, before the art of smelting and shaping metals was known, all blades, spearheads, arrowheads, &c., were (as is well known) made of stone. The ancestors of mankind could never have maintained themselves against the fiercer animals of the forest, or preyed upon the smaller ones, if they had not found out how to provide themselves with the weapons necessary to the purpose. At present all the implements and tools used by Kanjars, and, in fact, by all the other hunting and trapping tribes still left in India, are bladed or tipped with iron; and the iron is fashioned to the shape required not by the hunters themselves, but by men of the Lohár caste. But though the Indian savage of modern times has lost the art of stone-cutting for the manufacture of weapons, he has retained it none the less for those purposes, in which stone is still useful. The grinding-mill, which Kanjars make, consists of two circular stones of equal diameter. The upper one, which is the thicker and heavier of the two, revolves on a wooden pivot fixed in the centre of the lower one, and is propelled by two women, each holding the same handle. The widespread use of this contrivance is one of the many proofs of the uniformity of human instincts. For millstones of almost precisely the same design were known to the Israelites; † and they are used to this day by the Christians of Abyssinia, ‡ by the wild Turcoman tribes of Central Asia, § and by the natives of India. The same kind of grinding-stone is still used in the Heb-

---

\* *Pre-historic Times*, Chap. XVI, p. 573, by Sir John Lubbock.

† *Luke's Gospel*, Chap. XVII, verse 35: "Two women shall be grinding together: the one shall be taken and the other left. See also Isaiah, Chap. XLVII, verse 2.

‡ *Dr. Wolf's Travels and Adventures*, 1861, p. 491. The Abyssinians work at the mill standing; the natives of India sitting; hence in Abyssinia the handle is long, and in India short.

§ The Turkoman grinding stone is alluded to in many places in the *Mero Oasis*, by Mr. O. Donovan, London, 1862.

rides ; \* and it has only lately been superseded in Europe by the use of iron machinery. Kanjars (as we have said) are the chief manufacturers of the grinding-stone in Upper India. They could not have learnt the art by imitation ; for there is no respectable Indian caste, which could have taught them. † In Upper India there is only one caste, Khatik, and a sub-caste of Kahars called Gond, which share with them the monopoly of this industry ; and both of these are among the lowest of the Hindu fraternity,—only a few degrees raised above the Kanjar stage. On the Eastern coast of the Deccan there is a thieving and hunting tribe, (Bāṁptya,) which is noted for the manufacture of millstones ; ‡ and in the Marhatta country there are several low tribes, (such as Takkári, Páinkár, &c.) § who are by profession manufacturers and menders of grinding-stones, but are still addicted to a roving and predatory life, and are still as much outside the pale of caste as Kanjars. There is, therefore, good reason to believe that the mill-stone is a legacy from the Stone age of the world, and was an invention of savage races. ||

\* *Tylor's Anthropology*, Chap. VIII, p. 202 : MacMillan & Co., 1881. An illustration or drawing of the process is there given. Except for the length of the wooden handle, (which in India is very short), the reader might have fancied that he had before him a picture of two Indian women grinding corn.

† There are only two exceptions to this ; but both are exceptions which verify the rule. There is a small caste called *Sangtarash*, consisting of only 3,286 persons all told, (see *Census of North-West and Oudh*, 1882, Appendix F, p. 5), which follows the trade of stone-cutting. But this (like Beldár, the name of which is derived from Persian, and not from Sanskrit) is a caste of recent origin and is scarcely yet stereotyped. Another small caste of stone-cutters, which is only beginning to exist, is called *Pesharaj*, or one who prepares stone for builders,—this, too, a word of Persian origin. These men, some 50 years ago, were Ahirs or cattle grazers, who from their contact with the forests and quarries in the Mirzapur district become first stone-porters, and then developed into stone-cutters. Mr. Growse calls attention to the fact that *Sangtarash*, as the name of a special caste, is still unrecognized in many places : "Partially developed castes are only recognized in some few districts, and totally ignored in others. Thus Mathura is a great centre of the stone-cutters' art ; but the men who practice it belong to different ranks, and have not adopted the distinctive trade name of *Sangtarash*, which seems to be recognized in Hamirpur, Aligarh, and Kamaon."—*North-West Census Report*, 1873, p. LXXXIV.

‡ *Sherring's Hindu Tribes and Castes*, Vol. II, p. 205.

§ *Sherring*, Vol. II, p. 330.

|| Another reason for ascribing the invention (in India at least) to savages is that in the plains of the Ganges valley, where the great caste-system was developed into what we see, there are no quarries from which the stone could be produced. It is only at the foot of mountains where the forest tribes delight to dwell, that the stones can be procured.

There is one more industry not yet named for which Kanjars are noted, though in a less degree than some of the other forest tribes of the present day,—the collection of herbs and roots possessing medicinal properties. The knowledge of the properties of trees and plants is one of the marked characteristics of savage life not only in India, but in all other parts of the world. Writing of the native races of North America, the Abbé Domenech observes:—\* “If the Red Indians are but poor astronomers, they are, on the other hand, excellent botanists. Living continually in the presence of vegetable nature, they have directed their rare faculties of observation to the study of plants; and their acquaintance with the vegetable kingdom is wonderful. It serves to indicate to them remedies for a great number of wounds and maladies.” The same remarks might have been written with equal truth of the wandering and forest tribes of India. It is these tribes who have laid the foundations of the healing art in this country; and the physicians of India are to this day absolutely dependent on their rude kinsmen of the forest for the drugs which they administer to their patients. Among the medicinal products procured by Kanjars are the roots of the siml or cotton tree, the sap of which is used as a tonic, the fibre and juice of the garh creeper, which are given as a febrifuge, and the bark of the Lodh tree, which is used as a dye as well as for medicinal purposes. Other tribes are noted for extracting the juice (called kathi in India and catechu in Europe) from the khair tree; and hence there is a tribe called Khairwar in Northern India, and Kath-Kairi in Southern. † We have already seen, how the forest-tribes (Kanjars included) were the first discoverers of the art of bleeding the fan-palm and converting its juice into spirituous liquor, just as the native savages of North America discovered the art of bleeding the maple tree and condensing its juice into sugar. ‡ Not less remarkable was the discovery of the properties of *bhang* or Indian hemp (*Cannabis Indica*), which like catechu is largely used in European pharmacy, and which in India has given the name of Bhangi to one of the lowest of the

---

\* *Great Deserts of America*, Vol II, p. 333. The author goes on to show that they use decoction of *Sassafras* for pleurisy, and a kind of *emphorbia* and the oil of *palma christi* for purgatives; how they discovered the red seed of the *magnolia* as a febrifuge, p. 335, the wood of the *acacia* as a cure for toothache, the medicinal properties of *Sarsaparilla* fern. &c, p. 336.

† *Sherring's Hindu Tribes and Castes*, Vol. I, p. 385; and Vol. II, p. 325.

‡ For an account of this process, see *Great Deserts of America*, by Abbé Em. Domenech, Vol II, p. 245.

Hindu castes.\* Another caste, Tamboli, has derived its name from the tambol or betel-creeper, the leaf of which is now universally chewed in India as a stimulant; and the cultivation of this creeper, which originally was merely a forest plant, has now become so delicate as to tax the best skill of the Indian gardener. The wild tea plant was known and used in Assam by the native races of that province, even before the cultivation of tea gardens had been commenced by Europeans. Tobacco and its uses were known to the native races of America, long before its growth had become one of the great agricultural industries of America, Europe and Asia.† In the discovery of the properties of forest plants, it must be admitted that savages have been the originators, and civilized men only the copyists and improvers.

The religion of the Kanjars, so far as we have been able to learn it, is quite what we should expect to find among a primitive and uncultivated people. It is a religion without idols, without temples, and without a priesthood. They live in the constant dread of evil spirits, the souls of the departed, who are said to enter into the bodies of the living as a punishment for past misdeeds or neglect of burial rites, and to produce most of the ills to which flesh is heir. In this creed they stand on the same intellectual level with their more civilized kinsfolk, the Hindus, amongst whom it is universally believed that the air is peopled with *bhuts*, malignant spirits, who haunt graveyards, lurk in trees, re-animate corpses, devour living men, or attack them with madness, epilepsy, cramp, &c. In fact, (according to the highest authority on the subject), "animism, or the belief in spiritual beings, is the essential source" and minimum definition of religion generally;‡ and the belief

---

\* The Bhangî is the caste of sweepers, known in European houses as *Meklar*. These men use *bhang* for intoxication, and not for medicinal purposes. Perhaps they received their name from the skill, with which in their days of savagery they collected the drug.

† In America tobacco was not merely used as a stimulant and narcotic, but for giving the most solemn sanction to intertribal compacts. On the use of the calumet or peace pipe in America, see *Great Deserts*, by Abbé Em. Domenech, Vol. II, pp. 210 and 273. "The calumet is everywhere an object of great veneration. It is never smoked but at the conclusion or ratification of a treaty of peace, which terminates a war, commences an amnesty, or sanctions a territorial agreement." In India tobacco was not indigenous, but is now very widely cultivated. Such is the uniformity of human instincts, that the act of smoking together is considered as a pledge of peace between two persons and as a guarantee that they belong to the same caste. If a Brahmin smoked with a Chamâr, he would be degraded at once to a Chamâr's status.

‡ Tylor's *Primitive Culture*, Vol. I, chapter. XI, Edit. 1871. The words quoted in the text occur in p. 383.

in the preponderance of evil spirits over good is one of the marks of a savage and uncultivated mind. Like the aboriginal Australians, Kanjars have no belief in natural death except as the effect of old age. All deaths, but those caused by natural decay or by violence, are ascribed to the agency of evil spirits. The dead are buried five or six feet deep, lest a wild beast should tear up the carcass, and by disturbing the body send forth its attendant soul to vex and persecute the living.\* When a patient is possessed, they employ an exorcist, or spirit-medium, whom they call Nyotia, to compel the spirit to declare what his grievance is, so that satisfaction may be given him, and he may thus be induced to leave his victim in peace. The spirit-medium has power, they say, to transport the goblin direct into the body of some living person, and to make that person its mouthpiece for declaring its will.

In the wide range of human history, it is difficult to find an example of a primitive tribe or nation, which has not had its inspired prophet or deified ancestor. The man-god whom Kanjars worship is Máná—a name which does not appear in any of the lists of the Hindu divinities. While he lived amongst men, he was the model fighter, the great hunter, the wise artificer, and the unconquered chief. He was not only the teacher and guide, but also the founder and ancestor of the tribe. He is therefore to the Kanjar what Heron was to the Greeks, Romulus to the Romans, Abraham to the Jews, or Fenich to the Arabs, and something more than what Mihir Bunka is to the Banjara, Marjha to the Rewari, Abhá and Wundel to the Bundel, Láí Das to the Chamár, Láí Guru to the Bhoari, or Nának to the Sikh. Máná is worshipped with more ceremony in the rainy season, when the tribe is less migratory, than in the dry months of the year. On such occasions, if sufficient notice is circulated, several encampments unite temporarily to pay honor to their common ancestor. No altar is raised. No image is erected. The worshippers collect near a tree, under which they sacrifice a pig or goat, or sheep, or fowl, and make an offering of roasted flesh and spirituous liquor. Formerly (it is said) they used to sacrifice a child, having first made it insensible with fermented palm-juice or

---

\* The belief that the soul of the dead hovers around or near the place where the corpse was buried, is, or has been, of world-wide acceptance. It was embodied in the Latin saying, *tantum circuevolat umbra*. A large number of examples are given in Tylor's *Primitive Culture*, Vol. II, chapter XII, pp. 24-26, Edit. 1871.



today. \* They dance round the tree in honor of Máná, and sing the customary songs in commemoration of his wisdom and deeds of valour. At the close of the ceremony there is a general feast, in which most of the banqueters get drunk. On these occasions,—but before the drunken stage has been reached,—a man sometimes comes forward, and declares himself to be especially filled with the divine presence. He abstains from the flesh and wine of which others partake, and remains standing before the tree with his eyes closed as in a trance. If he is seized with a fit of trembling, the spirit of Máná is thought to have possessed him, and while the inspiration lasts he is consulted as an oracle by any man or woman of the assembly who desires to be helped out of a difficulty. Any one who has been thus inspired more than once is regarded as a chosen vessel, through whom Máná will reveal his will; and happy is the gang or encampment, which enjoys the possession of such a privileged being. There is no connection between a prophet of Máná and an exorcist or Nyctia. The two functions are quite distinct; and neither of them is hereditary.

There are certain goddesses also whom Kanjars worship; but it is difficult to ascertain their original meaning and character. Their names at least (as I was informed) are Mari, Parbhá, and Bhuiyán. Of these Mari is supreme, † and her worship is celebrated with the same zeal and by the same ceremonies as that of Máná. No such name appears in the Hindu Pantheon. *Mari* would seem to signify death; but she is worshipped by Kanjars (so far as I could learn, as the animating and sustaining principle of nature. *Parbhá*, which would appear to signify light, is worshipped by Kanjars as the goddess of health, and more especially of the health of cattle. The same goddess is worshipped by Ahirs and the other pastoral castes of India, and by men of any other castes who have taken to the same occupation. This is a connecting link between the religion of Kanjars and that of the low caste Hindus. Another link in the same chain is the worship of Bhuiyán, the earth-goddess, (as the name implies.) But her Hindu worshippers have attempted to promote her to the upper ranks of the Pantheon

---

\* The Kanjar who communicated these facts said, that the child used to open out its neck to the knife, as if it desired to be sacrificed to the deity. Possibly, in secluded places, where the original manners of the tribe have been less modified than elsewhere, human sacrifice is not yet extinct. Such seemed to be the opinion of the Kanjar himself, though he appeared to be rather afraid to confess it, knowing that the Government authorities would treat it as a case of murder.

† She is also called Maharáni Devi, that is, the great queen goddess.

by adding the title of Bhawāni, one of the numerous names of Kāli, the queen of heaven.

The marriage customs of Kanjars bear no resemblance to those of Hindus. There is no betrothal in childhood, no selection of auspicious days, and no elaborate ceremonies or ritual. The father or other near relative of the youth goes to the father of the girl, and after winning his favour with a pot of toddy, and gaining his consent to the marriage of his daughter, he seals the bargain with a gift of money, or of some tool or animal which Kanjars prize. The girl selected is never a blood relation to the intended husband, and she is almost always of some other encampment or gang. A few days after the bargain has been made, the youth goes with his father and as many other men as he can collect,—all in their best attire and armed with their best weapons,—and demands the girl in tones which imply that he is ready to seize her by force if she is refused. The girl is always peacefully surrendered in virtue of the previous compact; and this demonstration of force is a mere form,—a survival of the primitive world-wide custom of marriage by capture. Among the Khands of Orissa, the tradition of wife-capture is acted out in a more dramatic form: for here the wedding ceremony consists in forcibly carrying off the bride in the middle of a feast, which leads to a desperate sham fight between the young men, 20 or 30 in number, who champion the cause of the bridegroom, and a body of young women, who assail them with stones and bamboos in order to recapture the departing bride.\* The legend of the capture of Sabine women by Romulus' warrior band, and the Biblical account of the seizure of 400 virgins from Jabesh-Gilead by the tribe of Benjamin, shew that what has since become a form was once a serious reality not unfrequently attended by bloodshed.† Among the wild Turkoman tribes of Central Asia, marriage by capture, though in most weddings a mere form, is still in certain cases practised as a fact. The *form* is that of a sham fight between the male claimant of the bride and the female band who try to rescue her, as among the Khands of Orissa; the *fact* consists in an actual race on horseback between the girl and her pursuer.‡

\* "Personal Narrative of Service in Khondistan," by Major-General Campbell, 1864, p. 44. The same custom is alluded to in Mr. W. W. Hunter's *Indian Empire*, 1882, p. 77.

† *Book of Judges*, chaps. XX. and XXI. For the sake of these 400 virgins, all the other inhabitants of Jabesh-Gilead were slaughtered. The Roman rape had a less tragical close. But a sanguinary war between the Romans and Sabines was only averted by the intercession of the Sabine women who had now become the wives of the Roman band.

‡ Burnaby's *Ride to Khiva*, 1876, pp. 221—224.

It is well known that in India in early times wife-capture was so commonly practised, that it was legalized by the Brahman law-givers and permitted even to high caste Hindus of the rank of Chattri.\* In modern times, the wedding ceremonies observed among all classes of Hindus have been tinged by the tradition of this savage custom. The bridegroom goes to claim his child- affianced bride with all the display of men, servants, horses, &c., that he can collect or pay for; and the bride is then carried off concealed in a sedan, (generally alone, but sometimes with the bridegroom), shunning and crying as if she were being dragged off by violence. Such (as I conceive it) is the meaning of the Hindu *barát*,—a ceremony derived from what was once a living reality, but now observed only as a dull, prosaic, and lifeless form, the costliness of which is a serious drain on the wealth and prosperity of the people.

On the arrival of the Kanjar bride at the encampment of her intended mate, a few simple ceremonies are performed. A pole is fixed in a mound of earth, and on the top of the pole is tied a bunch of *khashhas* root or any thing else that may be equally fitted to serve as an emblem of the Kanjar industries. The bridegroom takes the girl by the hand,† and leads her several times round the pole in the presence of the spectators. A sacrifice of roast pig or goat with libations of toddy is then offered to Mānā as the ancestral hero of the tribe; and songs are sung in his honor. When this is finished, there is a general feast and dance, in which every one at last gets drunk. The father of the bride does not give his daughter away without a dowry. This consists in a patch of forest assumed to be his own, which becomes thenceforth the property of the bridegroom, so long as the encampment remains near this place, or whenever it may return to it. No one without the bridegroom's consent will be authorized to use this piece of forest either for hunting or trapping, or for digging out

---

\* *Institutes of Manu*, Chap. III, sl. 33. This kind of marriage is there called *Rākshasa*, because it was commonly practised by the indigenous races. The Hindus called these people by the name of *Rākshasa* or malignant demon, because they did not worship the Hindu gods, but disturbed the Brahmanical sacrifices and killed the priests and hermits of the forest. The great instance in Hindu legend of a *Rākshasa* marriage (or marriage by capture, is that of the forcible abduction of Sita, the wife of Rama, by Rāvana, the great king of the *Rākshasas*.

† The taking of the girl by the hand appears to be an almost universal custom in civilized as well as in uncivilized communities. It forms part of the ceremony performed in Christian churches. It also forms part of the Hindu ceremony, and is called *pani-grahan*, or hand-taking. In the Hindi language *pani-grahan* (an old word derived directly from Sanskrit) is a synonym for marriage.

roots of *khaskhas*, or for gathering wild honey, or collecting medicinal herbs. If the piece of forest presents peculiar facilities for one or more of these industries, the dowry is a valuable gift. The fellow tribesmen observe faithfully, as a rule, the proprietary right thus conferred upon the bridegroom; but the migratory habits of the tribe make the enjoyment of the gift short-lived and precarious.

The woman, after she is once married, cannot leave the husband without his consent, whatever treatment she may receive. But the man can send the woman away at his own pleasure, provided he pays her something as compensation; and the amount of the compensation is decided on the merits of each case by a meeting of the male members of the encampment. If there are any children, the father is the undisputed owner of all; and if there is a child in arms at the time of the divorce, the mother is not allowed to keep it after it has been weaned. The woman is then perfectly free to marry any one else who will take her. As a rule, however, such divorces are rare; and the women lead happier and freer lives, are more trusted, more respected, have more respect for themselves, and are better treated than amongst most classes of Hindus. In the one case, the woman is left free to take the place for which nature intended her. In the other, she is condemned to child-marriage, household slavery, perpetual widowhood and seclusion, by the cowardly institutions of her country and the false ethics of Brahmins.

A new born child is considered unclean; and hence on the 6th day after its birth a lustral ceremony is performed with water; and the child then generally receives its name. The occasion is celebrated with a feast and dance, ending, as usual, in a drinking bout. When the child is six months old, a further ceremony is

---

\* Lest this language should appear unjust, I would ask the reader to read and ponder what a native writer, Shib Chunder Bose, (*Hindoo as they are*) has the honesty to say on this point:—"The condition of a Hindoo female is usually deplorable. . . . A European lady can have no idea of the enormous amount of misery and privation to which the life of a Hindoo female is subjected. In her case the bitters far counterbalance the sweets of life. The natural helplessness of her condition, the abject wretchedness to which she is inevitably doomed, the utter prostration of her intellect, the ascendancy of a dominant priesthood exacting unquestioning submission to its selfish doctrines, and the appalling hardships and austerities which she is condemned to endure in the event of the death of her lord, literally beggars description. All the graces and accomplishments with which she is blessed by nature . . . are, in her case, unreasonably denounced as unfeminine endowments and privileges, to assert which is a sacrilegious act. If she is ever happy, she is happy in spite of the cruel ordinances of her law-giver and the still more cruel institutions of her country." A great many more passages could be quoted to the same effect from the above writer.

performed which consists in clipping off the hair with which the child was born, and thus removing the last remains of the taint which it received from birth. Among primitive races no distinction is perceived between physical and spiritual uncleanness; \* and it appears to have been very generally believed, that unless the taint of nature imparted at birth is removed by some purifying rite, the child will remain ever afterwards impure and become more than usually subject, as time goes on, to evil influences. Hence the almost universal prevalence of ceremonies for the lustration of new born infants. The naming of the child has been often associated with its baptism; but this is a mere matter of convenience; for the two rites are not in any way connected. Water in some form or other is the chief medium of lustration. The natives of Sikkhim (as I have seen) evince a lifelong aversion to water as a mere means of cleanliness: yet every Bhoota and Lepcha child soon after its birth is soaked, as long as it can bear the process, in the purest water that can be drawn from the hill-side spring. Among the Yumana tribes of Brazil, as soon as a child can sit up, it is sprinkled with a decoction of certain herbs and receives a name. Fire, the other great element of purity, is sometimes used with water. Among the Jakun tribes of the Malay peninsula, as soon as the child is born, it is carried to the nearest stream and washed; and is then brought back to the house and passed several times over fire. Amongst all castes of Hindus, after a child is born, a fire is kept smouldering day and night outside the door of the house; on the 6th day the child is dipped in water; on the 12th the water-purification is repeated; and on both days the floor of the house is smeared or rather purified (according to Indo-Persian notions) with cow dung. † The

---

\* The quaint maxim, which every one quotes, but no one understands, "cleanliness is next to godliness," is probably based upon the old confusion of ideas between physical and moral impurity.

† Most Hindus, however, appear to have lost all idea as to the origin and primary meaning of these lustration ceremonies. Ask a man why a fire is kept up, and he will say "to keep the woman and child warm,"—this, when often there is no fire at all, but only smoke and ashes, and when the temperature of the air is already too hot for health. The fire-custom was imported by the Arya tribes from Persia; as also the use of cowdung, which is still used for making "holy water" by the Parsis. The water ceremony is the indigenous custom of the Indian race, being that followed by Kanjars. It is through the influence of Brahmins that the Hindus have become so wonderfully ignorant of the meaning of their own customs in this and other cases. There never was a people more bound by their customs and more ignorant of their meanings than Hindus. The object of the ceremonies for the purification of a new born child was, however, perfectly well known to the author of the Institutes of Manu. For in Chap. V, sloka 85, it is said that a man who has even touched a new born, that is, an unpurified

Maoris of New Zealand had a baptismal rite of their own before they became Christians. The baptism was performed on the eighth day or earlier by a native priest, who sprinkled water on the child with a branch or twig; and with this lustration it received a name after one of its ancestors.\* In Africa the people of Sarac wash the child three days after birth with holy water. Holy spittle is sometimes used instead of holy water. Among the Mandingos, in the same continent, the hair of the child was cut when it was about a week old, and the priest invoking blessings whispered in its ear and spat three times in its face.† In Guinea, when a child is born, the babe is brought into the streets, and the headman of the town or family sprinkles it with water from a basin, invoking blessings of health and wealth. In the old religion of Peru the significance of the baptismal ceremony as a means of washing away evil influences was emphasised "by the act of throwing the water, in which the child had been washed, into a hole, while the priest or wizard repeated charms."‡ Peruvian converts of the present day still cut off a lock of the child's hair at baptism,—a survival of the old pagan ceremony of cutting off the birth-hair with an obsidian blade which answered the purpose of a razor. In old Mexico, before the Spanish conquest, "the nurse washed the infant in the name of the water-goddess, to remove the impurity of its birth, to cleanse its heart, and to give it a good and perfect life." Within the range of Buddhism in its Lamaist form, we are told that "the Lama blesses

---

child, becomes himself impure and must undergo a lustration-ceremony with water. In slokas 121 and 122 of the same chapter and in many other places, he alludes to the purifying effect of cow's urine and cowdung. The uses of fire as a purifier are constantly insisted on in the same chapter.

\* *Taylor's New Zealand*, p. 184. The best proof that the rite of baptism in New Zealand was a heathen ceremony long anterior to the advent of Christianity is seen in the Legend of Tawhāki told in Sir G. Grey's *Polynesian Mythology*, London, 1855, p. 67—80. The whole of this legend is taken up with the efforts made by Tawhāki to find his lost child and get her baptized. When at last the baptism was completed by the father, "fire flashed from his armpits," and he became the thunder-god.

† *Mungo Park's Travels*, Chap. VI. Holy spittle is very firmly believed in by the Christians of Abyssinia. When the great Dr. Wolff entered that country as a missionary, it happened that the people were expecting an Aboona, or Patriarch from Cairo at the time. Believing Wolff to be the man, they forced him to spit on them till he was exhausted. See Wolff's *Travels and Adventures*, p. 493. Edit. 1861.

‡ *Taylor's Primitive Culture*, Chap. XVIII, Vol. II, p. 394; where he quotes an old formula:—"O thou river, receive the sins I have this day confessed unto the sun. Carry them down to the sea, and let them never more appear."

the water and immerses the child thrice and gives it its name." \* It is scarcely necessary to add that the use of consecrated water for the baptism of new-born children is universally prevalent in the Greek, Roman, and Protestant churches; and that the question whether the water so used is a real regenerator of the soul or merely a symbol of the pure life and Sinless Being, to whose service the child is dedicated, is one of the great points of doctrine, which divides christendom into two hostile camps.

There are three different modes in which Kanjars dispose of their dead; submersion in deep water by fastening a stone to the corpse; cremation; and burial. Each clan disposes of its dead according to its own hereditary and special rites. The first method is the least common; the next may have been borrowed from the Hindu rite, which was itself imported by the Arya tribes from Persia; the last is the one most frequently practised as well as the most highly esteemed. A man who has acted as a spirit-medium to Máná is invariably buried in the earth, to whatever clan he may have belonged. Máná himself was so buried,—at Karra, (as some Kanjars relate) in the Allahabad district, not far from the Ganges, and facing the old city of Manikpur on the opposite bank. Three days after the corpse has been disposed of, there is a feast of vegetables and milk, but no flesh; and a similar feast is held on the seventh day. A third banquet is afterwards given on any day which may be found convenient, and in this banquet flesh and wine are freely consumed. When both the parents of a man have died, a fourth feast is given in their joint honour. In all these feasts, it is the soul of the dead which is fed or meant to be fed, rather than the bodies of the living. It is thought that the soul consumes the light ethereal portion of the offerings, that is, the steam and the odour; the leavings, that is, the grosser and material elements, are then consumed by the living. In the observance of such practices Kanjars are on the same level with the highest castes of Hindus, whose custom it is to hang a lighted lamp on a pipal tree, together with pots of ghee, rice and milk so as to appease the hunger and thirst of the departed soul, and give it light

---

\* *Tylor's Primitive Culture*, Vol. II, pp. 391-5, Chapter XVIII. All the instances quoted in this paragraph, except when other quotations have been noted, are taken from the above chapter in Mr. Tylor's great work. A most remarkable account of Aztec baptism as practised in old or heathen Mexico is given in Prescott's *History of the Conquest of Mexico*, London, 1860, Vol. III, p. 315. Baptism as now practised in heathen China, (a case which Mr. Tylor has not noticed) is described in Doollittle's work, p. 85-86. The writer, an American Missionary, tells us that it is solemnized on the third day after birth "as a kind of purification."

through the night\* The custom of feeding the dead is not confined to India. It has prevailed at one time or other in all parts of the world, and the sentiment which has dictated it must be counted among the universal instincts of mankind. †

Each encampment or group is a self-governing body. There are no hereditary or industrial distinctions of rank. All men are born equal. The affairs of each gang are managed by a council of the heads of families; and this is sometimes presided over by some elderly man noted above the rest for experience, wisdom, and courage, who is looked upon as the kinglet or chief of the band. All questions or disputes about marriage compacts, compensation for divorce, punishments for misdeeds, distribution of game, plunder, or lawful gain, change of camping ground, contracts with landlords or owners of forests, &c., are decided in these assemblies. In primitive unorganized hordes (as Mr. Herbert Spencer has shown), the first and only type of political structure consists in a council of elders, presided over by some chief, and listened to by the juniors and women: "We find it not only among peoples of superior types, but also among sundry Malays, Polynesian races, among the red men of North America, the Dravidian tribes of the Indian hills, and the aborigines of Australia." ‡ The senates, parliaments, and congresses of the most advanced nations have sprung from this simple germ. It is well known that among all the lower Hindu castes the custom still exists of settling disputes by an assembly (now called punch or punchayet), which consists of a few of the leading men of the same caste or clan. As there are now but few dis-

\* In India, however, almost every sentiment natural to the mind of man has been turned upside down by Brahmins and distorted to suit their own ends. The feast of the dead, which in other countries is shared in by the surviving relatives, has been perverted into a feast to Brahmins, who assemble round the house on the 13th day after the death has taken place, and are feasted to their stomach's content by the wretched family who have to provide the banquet. The oldest law books inculcate the necessity of feeding *Brahmins* at such times in preference to feeding *relatives*. Thus: "the food given at a sacrifice to persons related to the giver is a gift offered to goblins. It reaches neither the manes (souls of the dead) nor the gods."—*Apastamba* II, VII, 17, 8. (Sacred Books of the East.)

† A very full and complete account of the feasts of the dead, as practised in all parts of the world, may be seen in *Tylor's Primitive Culture*, Vol. II, Chapter XII, pp. 26-40, Edit. 1871.

‡ Political Institutions (being Part V, of *Principles of Sociology*), chapter V, p. 315, Edit. 1882. He quotes examples from the aborigines of Victoria the red men of North America, certain tribes of Central America, the hill tribes of India, New Zealanders, Tahitians, the Malagasies, the Homeric Greeks, the early Romans, the ancient Germans, the Scandinavians, and the ancient English.



putes which cannot be brought into the Government courts, the functions of the punchayets are in these days chiefly, but not exclusively, bestowed upon purely caste-questions—questions which could scarcely be decided by any other tribunal. But if we are to draw any inference from the custom still prevailing among Kanjars, or if we are to trust the analogies afforded by other backward races still living, we must suppose that the original functions of the punchayet were much wider than they now usually are, and that the custom of referring disputes to the decision of such a tribunal was one of very great antiquity, reaching back far beyond the commencement of the Muhammedan period, or even the invasion of the Arya tribes from the west.\*

For the settlements of disputes, which cannot be decided by the Kanjar council, either from want of evidence or owing to difference of opinion among the assessors recourse is had to a kind of ordeal which might be called the floating test. The disputants go to the bank of a river, accompanied by umpires, and throw themselves into the deepest water. The man who rises first is declared guilty. For the great element of purity is believed to have disowned him as something unclean and cast him up from its unwilling embrace. This custom of relying upon supernatural aid for the settlement of cases, in which natural evidence is wanting or human judgment is unequal to the task, is another of the many links connecting the Kanjar tribe with the savage or semi-barbarous age of the world. Among the Israelites of old, a woman suspected of unfaithfulness, but without proof sufficient for conviction, was made to prove

---

\* Raja Siva Prasad, C.S.I., author of a short History of Hindustan in the vernacular, has, however, expressed a different opinion in Part III of the book named. After pointing out that in the Mahummedan period the entire administration of civil and criminal justice was in the hands of the Kazi, guided by no other law than the precepts of Mahomed, he adds in a note:—"Hence perhaps, is the origin of the Punchayet system and of that of excommunication. When the Hindus saw that they could not expect any equitable decisions of their civil suits from the Mahomedan Kazis, and that their claims to hereditary property were not to be ascertained by their own law of inheritance, they preferred their suits before their own communities (baradari) whose awards they were bound to acknowledge: "if either party shewed any inclination of not abiding by them, he was made an outcaste." If we are to believe the contents of the Hindu law-book known to us as the Institutes of Manu, a low caste man had as bad a chance of receiving fair play from a Brahman judge in ancient times, as his descendant in more recent times had of receiving justice from a Mahomedan Kazi. The fact is, a low caste man had no chance whatever of getting either of these judges to attend to him. So in self-defence he adhered to the old indigenous custom of referring his disputes to the elders of his own class or cast; and this, in my opinion, is the origin of the punchayet.

her innocence by drinking "the waters of jealousy." \* The ordeal of the "red drink" employed at this day by the Negroes of the Gold Coast resembles the Hebrew custom very closely, † Ordeal by fire was known to the ancient Greeks; for, in the *Antigone* of Sophocles, a person suspected of crime declares himself ready "to handle hot iron and walk over fire." Fire-ordeal and water-ordeal were both common in Europe during the dark ages, and though the custom itself has been extinct since about 1200 A.D., the "phrase of going through fire and water" has survived in colloquial speech ‡ The water-ordeal as practised in England in those days, was the same as that now practised by Kanjars. It consisted "in casting the person suspected into a river or "pond of cold water, and if he floated therein without any act "of swimming, it was deemed an evidence of his guilt; but if he "sunk, he was acquitted."§ The same test is very widely used at the present day among all the indigenous races of Central India, whose stage of culture approximates to that of Kanjars in Northern India. The forms in which the ordeal is applied are various; but the substance is the same. || In all cases, if the person is guilty, it is because he is too impure for such a pure element as water to keep him: he is therefore thrown up to the surface, and declared guilty, while the innocent man sinks and is acquitted. Among the Hindus at the present day both fire-ordeal and water-ordeal, with a few other methods, are largely practised. ¶ The former was imported into India by the foreign

\* Numbers, Chap. V, verses 11-31.

† *Encyclopædia Britannica*, under article *ordeal*; 8th Edit, 1860.

‡ By a decree of the Lateran Council, held in 1215 A. D., trial by ordeal, or *vulgaris purgatio*, was declared to be the judgment of the Devil, and not the judgment of God.

§ *Blackstone's Commentaries*, Vol. IV, chap. 27.

|| Two varieties are described in *Asiatic Studies* by Sir A. Lyall, edit. 1882, p. 83, chap. IV. Both are employed for determining the guilt or innocence of a woman suspected of witchcraft. In the one case, the suspected woman is sent down into the water holding a pole fixed upright in the mud. If she can keep herself down, while one man shoots an arrow and another runs and fetches it back to the place from which it was shot, she is declared innocent: but if she rises to the surface, she is declared guilty. In the other case the suspected person is sewn up in a sack, which is let down into the water about three feet deep. If she gets her head above the water, this is considered a proof of guilt. The former method prevails among the Hunting and Fishing Tribes of Berar. See Berar Census, 1881, p. 135.

¶ Amongst the Hindus there are altogether nine different kinds of ordeal; the balance; fire; water; poison; *kosha*, or the water in which an idol has been washed; rice; boiling oil; red hot iron; and images. Sita, the wife of Rāma, was made to prove her purity by passing through a bonfire, and fire-ordeals are still held in higher repute than any others.

Arya tribes from Persia, to whom fire was the most sacred element. The latter (as we have seen) is the indigenous custom of the Indian people.

The language which Kanjars speak to the outside world is the ordinary Hindi or Hindustani spoken throughout Northern India. But among themselves they have a secret language, which no one but a Kanjar can follow. From the specimens which I have been able to collect, (and these were acquired for me by a native with the greatest difficulty), this seems to be chiefly based upon Hindi, with certain inflections which perhaps have been derived from some old *Prakrita* dialect now obsolete. Some of the words, however, seem to have no connection whatever with any of the tongues now written or spoken in India. The following are a few specimens of the names collected :—

<i>Kanjar words.</i>			<i>English meaning.</i>
* टोप्रा	(toprá)	...	... Cloth.
डेहारी	(démhari)	...	... Bread.
फेंसनी	(phénshani)	...	... Pulse.
* खालु	(khálu)	...	... Potato.
* खाक्	(khák)	...	... Fire.
निमानी	(nimáni)	...	... Water.
* बपहिला	(bapahilá)	...	... Father.
* छहंतारी	(chhahantári)	...	... Mother.
* गिहारी	(gihári)	...	... Wife.
* छहिन्	(chhahin)	...	... Sister.
* ककेहला	(kakehalá)	...	... Uncle.
* रैल	(rail)	...	... Ox.
पिडहेला	(pidhelá)	...	... Tree.
रोस	(rósu)	...	... Wheat.
घोर्ना	(ghorná)	...	... Gram.
रिब	(rih)	...	... A mat house.
खोभडा	(khojbdhá)	...	... Rupee.
चिबडा	(chibdbhá)	...	... Rupee.

The words marked with an asterisk seem to be distorted forms of Hindi; as for instance, *toprá* for *kuprá*, *khálu* for *álu*, *khák* for *ág*, *chahantári* for *mahatári*, an old Hindi word for *mátri* (mother), *kakéhulá* for *káká*, an older form of *cháchá* (uncle). As to the words not marked with an asterisk, it is difficult to guess from what source they have sprung; for we can hardly suppose that they have come down direct from one of the ancient indigenous languages, which were spoken in Hindustan before the Arya immigrants crushed them out with their own more powerful Sanskrit.

The following are some examples of Kanjar verbs and pronouns :—

दूतदो हौ	(dútado hín)	...	... He eats.
औघना	(aughaná)	...	... To come.
खगइस्	(lugaís)	...	... Beaten.
बिरोको	(biroko)	...	... To him.
वरो	(waro)	...	... That.
कै	(kai)	...	... Some.
कुरच् रहरो हौ	(kurach raharo hin)	...	... He is eating.
टुर्करिरो हौ	(turkariro hin)	...	... He is sleeping
रर्देस गगोगिरो	(rardes gaogiro)	...	... He has gone to a strange place.
खिआगिरो	(liogiro)	...	... He earned.
* जासि	(jási)	...	... Thou goest.
* पीसि	(písi)	...	... He drinks.
बलाल्	(balál)	...	... Call for, (Imp).
* जान्दो हौ	(jándó hin)	...	... He is going.
केरो हौ	(kero hín)	...	... Has done.
* आबसि	(áwasi)	...	... Thou comest.
* खान्दो हूं	(khándó hún)	...	... I am eating.

I am told that the inflections of the verbs marked with an asterisk are in vogue colloquially in some parts of the Punjab; and there is no reason to doubt that *si* as a sign of the second person is of Sanskrit origin. The termination *aro* or *iro*, which

is so frequently attached to the verbal root, implies that there is something like system in this Kanjar cant, and hence that its inflections are partly, at least, descended from some obsolete *Prakrita* dialect. It is not likely that a rude and ignorant people, like Kanjars, would set to work to make a new language. But it is quite possible that an isolated tribe should have retained some of the inflections of an older form of a language, after these have become obsolete among the more advanced part of the community.

Whatever may be the correct explanation of the origin of the Kanjar cant, it is interesting to notice that the possession or invention of a secret language by tribes, whose position compels them to cope with races stronger and more numerous than themselves, is not confined to Hindustan. In South Africa the Bosjemen (or Bushmen) have adopted or inherited a jargon of their own, which Dr. Prichard believes to be based upon the language of their oppressors, the Hottentots; although it is so far different as to be unintelligible to all but themselves:—“This is considered to be greatly advantageous to the tribe in assisting concealment of their exploits.”\* The same device is or was employed by the Circassians, and for similar objects:—“When they set out on a plundering expedition, they use ‘particular forms of speech known only to themselves.’”† Nor are Kanjars the only tribe in Hindustan who find it convenient to screen their designs behind a secret language. A writer in the *Asiatic Researches*, 1816, speaking of the Badhaks, (a violent robber-clan, which has since been nearly absorbed), “says that they use a cant peculiar to themselves, which ‘renders it extremely difficult to bring them to justice.’”‡ The Cherus, another wandering and predatory tribe, not unlike the Kanjars and Badhaks, are declared in the Behar Census Report of 1872 to “have a language which they use among themselves, ‘unintelligible to Hindus, although speaking Hindi to outsiders.’”§ It is well known that the Gipsies of Europe have a secret cant.

\* *Prichard's Natural History of Man*, Book II, chapter XVI, p. 354, Edit. 1855.

† Klaproth, *Voyage au Mont Caucase*, Vol I, p. 381, Paris, 1823: quoted by Prichard *in loco*.

‡ *Asiatic Researches*, Vol XIII, Article 4. As the writer expressly states that the stronghold of the Badhaks was Utranla, Bulrampur and Bahraich, we may certainly conclude that they are the same people as the Barwars who since the annexation of Oudh and the establishment of a stronger government, have sunk to the level of thieves and petty pilferers.

§ *Bengal Census Report*, 1872, p. 158. It would be proper to add that the possession of a secret language is not an uncommon thing even

It has been said that natives of hot countries seek to adorn their skins, and those of cold countries their clothes. The Kanjars

among the Hindu castes. The Sunâr or Goldsmith caste, and the Kasbara or Brazier caste, are both said to have a secret language for the purpose of concealing their transactions with the thieves who bring them stolen metal for sale. (See Sherring's *Hindu Tribes and Castes*, Vol I, p. 314 : and Sir Henry Elliot's *Races of the North West Provinces*, Vol I, p. 159). The costermongers of London are said to have had, or still to have, a cant of their own. To those who have lived in Burma it is well known that the Chinese merchants, who have migrated into that country, have invented a peculiar telegraphic language, which no one but themselves can understand, and that the secret is faithfully kept.

These analogies, together with those quoted in the text, explain the origin of the Gipsy dialect in Europe, which M. Abel Hovelacque, in the *Science of Language* (p. 195, English version), has rightly included among the Neo-Sanskrit dialects of the present day. It is a fact that the Gipsy tribes of Europe are acquainted with a corrupt Hindi patois, which is known as Romañey or Petty Romañey, having been so called because Romania was the first country in Europe in which the Gipsies from Asia encamped in force. Specimens of this Gipsy language may be seen in pages 328, 331-3 and 334-5, of the *History of Gipsies*, by James Simson, edn. 1865. The commonly received legend, (for it cannot be called any thing more than a legend), is that multitudes of Kanjars were driven out of India by the oppressions of Tamerlane, and it is inferred that the Gipsies of Europe are their direct descendants by blood, because they speak like them, a form of the Hindi language. The supposition that Kanjars would be expelled from India by Tamerlane is extremely improbable. Being a vagrant and savage people, they were altogether beneath the notice of such a rapacious robber as Tamerlane, and being robbers themselves by hereditary instinct, they must have profited more than any other class in India by the anarchy which he produced and left behind him. Not less improbable is the inference, that the Gipsies of Europe are of the same blood as the Kanjars of India, because they both speak a form of Hindi. This may be considered a *reductio ad absurdum* of the argument, which makes language the test of race. For according to writers on Indian ethnology, Kanjars are invariably set down as an aboriginal or non-Aryan people, in spite of the fact that their language is Aryan. How then can the same writers maintain, that the Indian Kanjar and the European Gipsy are of the same blood, on the ground that both speak an Aryan language? The Gipsies of Europe are of the same complexion, feature, and stature as the natives of Armenia, Georgia, and Asia Minor, and do not at all resemble Kanjars : and such affinities are a truer test of blood than any thing else. As the inroad of Gipsies into Europe, *viâ* the Bosphorus, took place at about the same time as Tamerlane's invasion of India, and as these two events have been invariably connected by tradition, the acquisition of Hindi by the said Gipsies might be explained in the following way. The countries between the Indus and the Bosphorus have had Gipsies of their own from time immemorial, and their number must have largely increased during the time of anarchy, which extended between the irruption of Jhengiz Khan and the subsequent irruption of Tamerlane. It is very probable that multitudes of stragglers from these clans followed the armies of Timour into India as camp followers, purveyors, and sharers of booty, just as the Indian Gipsies (the Banjaras) are known to have accompanied the armies and camps of the Mogul Emperors of Delhi, and the Pindaris those of the

are of the former class ; but in the matter of personal vanity they have not run into the extravagances of Hindus or into those of certain other races living in the tropical zone. The Kanjar women tattoo their faces and hands only to a moderate extent,—performing the operation with a needle, the point of which is charged with certain colouring juices extracted from forest-trees. For painting their skins, they use red powder, white clay, and soot or charcoal. They wear earrings made of wood or bone, and sometimes of brass or silver, if they are rich enough to buy these more costly ornaments. Both sexes wear necklaces made of the gūnchi berry, the natural colours of which are a bright red and black. On the whole the love of personal adornment among Kanjars does not run into wild extremes. Among their decorative arts there is nothing so repulsive as the twelve-inch nose-skewer of bone worn in Australia, or the necklace of monkey's teeth in Brazil, or the large cheek-stud of stone among the Esquimaux, or the wooden lip-stud in the interior of Africa, or the brass tooth-stud in Borneo, or the teeth-filing in Sumatra.\* Amongst almost all the castes of Hindus, personal ornamentation (or disfigurement) is carried to a greater extreme than by their ruder kinsfolk, the Kanjars ; and as we ascend in the scale of caste, the love of decoration seems to rise in proportion. Among the upper castes the mark (called tilak) painted on the forehead, breast, or shoulder of a man indicates the god or goddess to which he and his family are specially attached ; just as in certain parts of Africa tribes, sub-tribes, and even families are distinguished by the figures of animals or other pictures blazoned on the leg or face † The Sanskrit poets took a passionate delight in describing the Kānchi or bodylet (now obsolete), which used to be worn by women a little below the waist, and was strung at the hinder part with tiny bells.‡ Ornaments not dissimilar to these are worn by

---

Mahratta chiefs in more recent times. After associating for a time with the Kanjar tribes of India, whose manners resembled their own, these Georgian Gipsies would naturally return by dribblets to their old haunts west of the Indus, taking with them some knowledge of the Hindi patois, the name of Kanjar, and possibly a few Kanjar tribesmen as associates. A secret language, totally unknown outside of India to all but themselves, was much too valuable, when once acquired, to be allowed to be forgotten. The secret would necessarily spread far and wide among all branches of the Gipsy tribes between the Indus and the Bosphorus ; and these tribes on entering Europe would naturally take such a valuable inheritance with them.

\* The examples are taken from Sir John Lubbock's *Origin of Civilization* Chap. I. p. 47—57.

† Captain Burton's account of Abeokuta, Vol I, p. 104 ; quoted by Sir John Lubbock *in loco*.

‡ The Kānchi though obsolete, so far as I know, amongst the fair sex, is still worn by Pāsi men, and by men of other low castes, who are dressed up as women dancers for marriage festivals.

the ladies of certain tribes in America and Africa. \* Nose studs, nose rings, earrings, bracelets, anklets, and toe-lets of various metals are worn by Indian women of all castes; and the eyelashes are blackened with soot or collyrium, like those of the Faletah ladies in Central Africa; † and the finger nails and toe-nails are reddened with lac. If such disfigurements are to be considered as marks of barbarism, the Hindu women are more backward in this respect than the wives of Kanjars.

In the use of their simple weapons Kanjars display extraordinary skill; though doubtless, in ancient days, when points and blades were made of stone instead of iron, their dexterity was still greater in proportion as it was the more needed. The weapon with which they kill little birds is nothing but a pole pointed with a thin sharp spike of iron. The man lies motionless on a patch of ground, which he has first sprinkled with grain; and as the birds come hopping around him to pick up the grain, he fascinates one of them with the pole by giving it a serpent-like motion, and then spikes it through the body. Kanjars seldom or never use the bow and arrow; but they use the pellet bow, which requires much greater skill. The pellet is nothing but a little clay marble dried in the sun. With this they not unfrequently shoot a bird flying. The khanti or short spear (already described) is not merely used in close combat, but is thrown with almost unerring effect against wolves or jackals as they run. For catching a wolf in the earth, they place a net and a light at one end of the hole, and commence digging at the other end. The wolf attracted by the light runs into the net, and the Kanjar then batters its head with a club and kills it.

Whatever a Kanjar kills, from a wolf to a reptile, he eats; and most of what he finds dead, he eats also. But in his love of animal food, he is not altogether omnivorous. He does not eat dogs, though in ancient days these animals were as much eaten by the indigenous races of India, as they still are by those of Indo-China, America, and elsewhere. ‡ Neither does he eat monkies.

---

\* Speaking of the Natchez (in America) Abbé Domenech remarks:—"what they valued above all, were tiny bells, which they hung all over their persons, and the tinkling of which was their delight." (*Great Deserts of America*, Vol II, p. 289). Allusions to similar ornaments being worn by African beauties occur in Sir John Lubbock's *Origin of Civilization*, Chap. I, p. 47.

† Sir John Lubbock, Chap. I, p. 48; where he quotes from Laird's *Central Africa*, Vol II, p. 91.

‡ Institutes of Manu, Chap. X, sl. 37, 38 and 51. Manu's names for dog-eaters are Pandu-Sopāka, Sopāka, and Swapāka, which literally mean "dog cooker." Of the Chandāla and Swapāka he says, "their abode must be out of the town; their sole wealth must be dogs and asses." No



In fact, when a question was put to a Kanjar on this point, it was treated as a joke not deserving a serious answer. They look upon monkeys as companions, almost as kinsfolk, rather than as animals to be hunted and devoured. Perhaps, then, it would not be unreasonable to suppose that monkey-worship found its way into the Hindu mythology and religion through contact with the indigenous creeds, more especially as no trace of such worship has been found, (so far as I know), in the sacred books of the Arya tribes either to the east or west of the Indus. One other animal, which Kanjars profess to abstain from, is the ox. The accuracy of this profession might (I think) be questioned; for cow-worship was not indigenous to India, and in Central India at this day, tribes like the Bhils, &c., who are in the same stage of culture as Kanjars, steal tame cattle, hunt wild ones, and eat both. \* Long contact with Hindus has taught Kanjars to abstain from the flesh of tame cattle: but if they caught a wild ox in the forest, I do not believe that they would scruple to eat it.

The Kanjar nation considers itself to be subdivided into seven distinct sections or clans. But there seems to be no strictly enforced clan system amongst them; and the number has apparently been fixed at seven, merely in imitation of the practice of Hindu castes, each of which generally divides itself into seven sub-castes, whether the number is strictly seven or not. Five of the Kanjars names are well established, and four of them can be explained by the descriptions already given of their creed and crafts:—*Maraiya* (worshipper of Mari), *Bhains* (buffaloe-keeper), *Sankat* (stone-cutter), *Gohar* (lizard-catcher), and *Sodá*, the meaning of which I am unable to trace. † The two remaining names are

traces of the *Swapaka* tribe now remain, unless we are to recognize it in the modern *Bhangi* or *Mehtar*. Of the native races of North America, the Abbe Domenech writes as follows:—"The Indian villages swarm with dogs; of which some are used in hunting, others for drawing loads; some, again, are fattened for eating." Dogs (as I have seen) are eaten by the Burmese; and they are bred for food by the South Sea Islanders.

\* The worship of the cow was practised by the ancient Persians, and must have been imported into India through their kinsmen, the Arya tribes. There is nothing to shew that the worship was indigenous to this country. A sacred cow, that is, one set apart as worthy to be offered to the gods, is called in the *Vedas* *Vasá*. On the love of the Bhils for cow's flesh, see *Asiatic Studies*. Chap. VII, p. 159, by Sir. A. Lyall.

† I have considered these 5 names to be well established because Mr. Sherring heard of them in Benares. (see his *Hindu Tribes and Castes*, Vol I, p. 389), and I myself heard of them independently in Lucknow. *Lakarhar* and *Dhobibans* were the other names given to Mr. Sherring at Benares; *Sauñre* and *Utwar* were the names given to myself at Lucknow. I consider, therefore, that these last two are less established than the other 5. A similar uncertainty exists regarding many of the names of sub-divisions of the Hindu castes.

variously given, being in some places declared to be Lakarhâr (woodman) and Dhobibans (washerman) and in others Sauñre and Utwar. There is no distinction either of craft or worship among these several clans, though some of the names might seem to imply this: nor is there any strict rule which could prevent a man from leaving one clan to join another, if it suited his convenience. Many Kanjars do not know to which of the 7 clans they belong. All are probably of recent formation, devoid of historical continuity, and incapable of minute definition. What we see now of the Kanjar people is no doubt a mere fraction of what they formerly were; and it is probable that, in the course of their history through the long centuries that have passed, their original tribal system, if they ever had one, has been shattered to pieces, and new groups have been formed at different times from the fragments that remained.

According to the Census of 1881 the number of Kanjars scattered among all the districts of the North West and Oudh was only 19,504. Looking to the wide extent of area (Hindustan, Rajputana, Bengal, and Deccan), in which fragments of the race are still to be found, and considering that they gave their name and language, some 5 centuries ago, to the wandering tribes in Europe who lead a similar life, the Kanjars must once have been a much more important people than we now find them. Even if we assume, (which is possible), that many of the encampments were overlooked on the evening when the last census was taken, and that the actual number of persons still bearing the Kanjar name is not less than double that given in the returns, yet there is no reason to doubt that this jungle-nation is gradually dying out, or (to speak more correctly) is becoming more and more absorbed into the far mightier jungle of Indian caste, like the other great nations of this country, which were swallowed up centuries ago or are being swallowed up still. At the present time, for example, (and there are many parallel instances), several little encampments of Kanjars are dotted in different parts around Lucknow; and most of these have halted, where they still are, without a break for the last 7 or 8 years or more. These are gradually learning Hindu rites and forgetting their own. The Brâhman, ever as keenly on the scent for fees as the Kanjar is for jackals, has found them out, and is silently drawing them into the net, from which there is no escape.\* The day of their capture is not far distant.

---

\* The Brahman now comes with the Purana in his hand, and reads out Kathâs or sacred stories, of which the gaping Kanjar, awe-struck in the presence of such a holy man, scarcely understands a word. The Brahman is now beginning to be sent for at times of birth and marriage, and for the disclosing of auspicious days. The alliance between Kanjars and Brahmins

In the Hindu sacred books, of which Bráhmans are the professional expounders, the strictest rules, enforced by the most appalling penalties, are laid down against the communication of divine knowledge to persons or tribes outside the privileged pale. But the remote prospect of these awful consequences does not weigh so much as a feather against the immediate attractions of pice. It is by thus trading on the ignorance and superstition of indigenous tribes, that Bráhmanism, setting out some 3,000 years ago from its narrow cradle on the banks of the Saraswati, has continually enlarged its borders, until this enslaving creed has now at last become the almost universal task-master of the Indian race.

If admissibility into caste depends upon qualifications of function, (for function has, we believe, been the main factor in the formation of Indian castes), then it is easy to see, from the accounts already given of the various arts and industries in which Kanjars excel, that there are many low Hindu castes, into which they could be absorbed at once, if they would drop their tribal name, renounce their freedom, and consent to practise the same worship and the same marriage rites as those of the caste or castes into which they seek to enter. It is impossible to say how many of the caste men, who are now called Chamars, Koris, Pásis, Behuas, Báris, &c., were not originally Kanjars; or how many Kanjars may not have risen imperceptibly, at an earlier stage of their history, into the ranks of castes holding a much higher status than these in the social scale.\* There is one caste called Khangár, the members of which (if we are to trust the similarity of name) must have been Kanjars, not many years ago. This caste now numbers 32,304 according to the census of 1881. They are, (as we might expect them to be, so soon after their absorption into Hinduism), a low and despised caste, still known as hunters and trappers in a small way, but chiefly employed as general drudges, field-labourers, night-watchmen, and swine-herds,—a squalid, fever-stricken, spirit-broken tribe, which has lost the healthy life, the versatile genius, and the happy freedom of their brethren of the forest.

JOHN C. NESFIELD.

is not always, however, based upon piety. In some parts of Oudh there are Brahmins who are rapidly becoming professional robbers. The gang, which eluded the police in the Sitapur road for some 8 years in succession, was found, when caught, to contain 3 Kanjars and 2 Brahmins.

\* Among the low castes, such as Bhar, Khatik, Bind, &c., the tribal name has not unfrequently been retained. But as we ascend in the social scale, it is observable that functional names have almost always superseded tribal ones; and if our theory of caste is correct,—that caste was founded on differences of function,—this is exactly what we should expect.

## THE QUARTER.

**PUBLIC** attention during the past three months has continued to be mainly absorbed by the agitation connected with the Criminal Procedure Code Amendment Bill, which, after an interval of comparative quiescence, has, since the latter end of August, again assumed an active form.

On the 25th June a crowded meeting of the opponents of the Bill in London was held at St. James' Hall, which was attended by all classes of Anglo-Indians, the official, as well as the non-official element being largely and influentially represented, and resolutions were passed unanimously condemning the Bill, and appointing a deputation to wait on the Secretary of State and lay before him the views of the community.

The deputation was received by Lord Kimberly on the 26th July, and informed by him, in terms almost insulting in their curtness and tone, that he had not the least intention of instructing Lord Ripon to withdraw the Bill, though certain modifications might be introduced in it, in accordance with the recommendations of the Government of India.

On the 10th of August the Government of India transmitted to the Secretary of State the opinions on the Bill submitted by the various Local Governments and officials, including not only those of the Judges of the High Courts and the Commissioners of Divisions, but of many district officers and subordinate officials.

The general purport of these opinions had in the meantime become a matter of common report, and it was known that the preponderance against proceeding with the Bill was overwhelming. In the case of Bengal, especially, it had transpired that, out of a large number of Europeans consulted, only one had recorded an opinion in favor of the Bill, while it was understood that in Assam every officer consulted had, without exception, declared against it. It was further known that, while the Heads of local Governments and administrations were about equally divided on the question of absolute withdrawal, not one advocated the passing of the Bill as it stood, and all but one recommended modifications so extensive as to remove the Bill entirely from the foundations on which it had been originally sought to rest it.

It was with intense surprise that under these circumstances the public received the intelligence that the Home Government still refused to abandon a project of legislation which the community mainly affected by it had denounced, with one voice, as

offensive and dangerous ; which the great majority of the officials responsible for the administration of the country had condemned in terms almost as unqualified, and which the bulk even of its supporters admitted to have been introduced on erroneous grounds and without any urgent necessity. Disgust was added to surprise when, on the one hand, the Under-Secretary of State, on being questioned in the House of Commons regarding the result of the reference to the Local Governments, replied in terms calculated to produce an entirely false impression as to the facts, and, on the other hand, the Prime Minister himself, with as little candour as generosity, had recourse to the device of seeking to discredit a verdict which could no longer be ignored, by attributing it to a spirit of ascendancy which must be checked and a malicious desire to obstruct the Government in its humane and righteous policy of building up civilisation in India.

The prolonged reticence of the Government regarding the results of its reference to the local authorities having given rise to a very general apprehension that an attempt would be made to conceal the true character of the verdict elicited, the Council of the European and Anglo-Indian Defence Association determined to convene a second general public meeting for the purpose of considering what further steps should be taken to oppose the Bill. In response to their summons between two and three thousand persons, assembled in the Town Hall on the 24th ultimo, when it was resolved by acclamation to draw up, for presentation to His Excellency, a Memorial, praying him to redeem his pledge of being guided by public opinion, by withdrawing the Bill, or, in the event of his being unable to accede to this prayer, to stay further proceedings in connexion with it until the whole of the opinions should have been laid *in extenso* before Parliament.

The speeches delivered at the Meeting, while entirely free from the tone of hostility to the Natives of the country which had been a prominent feature in those of the meeting of February, bore testimony, by their bitterness against the Government, to the intense irritation and sense of injury caused by its apparently contemptuous disregard of the feelings of the community, aggravated still further by the equally contemptuous and unworthy insinuations of Mr. Gladstone to which we have already referred, and information of which had reached Calcutta only that morning.

Among the speakers was a delegate from the great body of railway employés, who was about to proceed to England to appeal to the sympathies of the operative classes there on behalf of their countrymen in India, and who testified in eloquent terms to the profound sense of alarm which the policy of the Government

had awakened among the poorer class of Europeans and Eurasians in the Mufasal.

The reception given to this and the other speeches by the meeting showed that what the community had lost in hope since February last they had gained in determination.

The Meeting at the Town Hall was promptly followed by others at Assensole, Buxar, Muzafarpur, Karseong, Allahabad, Lucknow, Sakkar, and various other places throughout the country.

At Muzafarpur the Behar planters gathered in great force and passed resolutions which foreshadow the probability that, should the Bill be passed, it will remain in practice a dead letter, like every other law passed in the teeth of a strong and united public opinion.

The Government would do well to pause and reflect that, while, with the active aid, or even the passive sympathy, of the European community in India, it is one of the most powerful Governments,—perhaps, for domestic purposes, the most powerful Government,—in the world, on the other hand, there is no Government in the world that would be more absolutely powerless than it would be if that community were arrayed against it. It is unnecessary and would be unpatriotic to enter into an examination of the circumstances on which this fact depends. The Government cannot be ignorant of them, though, in reliance on the loyalty which it is doing its best to uproot, it may choose to ignore them.

One thing is evident, that, in the present state of public feeling, the passing of the Ilbert Bill, instead of benefiting the native Magistrates and Judges on whom it will confer the new jurisdiction, will inflict a distinct injury on them. For, while at the present moment a native Magistrate might be unobjectionably posted to any district, irrespective of the number of European residents in it, the passing of the Bill will make it impossible for the Local Government to appoint him to a district in which Europeans are numerous, and in which his presence would consequently involve a chronic risk of embarrassing complications, if not of scandalous collisions.

The *de jure* qualification which the Bill, should it become law, will confer on him, will, in short, be a *de facto* disqualification; and it will have this effect, no matter how much the executive Government may wish to fulfil the spirit of the new law, for, under the peculiar circumstances of India, no Government, whichever way its sympathies might incline, would incur, with its eyes open, the grave political risk that would attend an attempt to thrust on a powerful and determined section of the community a Magistrate whose presence among them would be a challenge to defiance of the law.

Subsequently to the meeting at the Town Hall it was announced on apparently good authority, that the Government of India had applied to the Secretary of State for permission to publish the opinions, and, that permission having been in the meantime received, they were given to the world, in an Extraordinary Supplement to the official *Gazette*, on Saturday last.

Considerations of space alone would render it impossible to give here even the briefest summary of these documents, which fill some four hundred pages of small type. The following analysis of the result, taken from the columns of the *Englishman* will, however, be found approximately correct.

In Bombay, according to this analysis, out of fifty officials consulted, including four Commissioners, only five are in favour of proceeding with the Bill as it stands, while thirty are in favour of the complete withdrawal of the Bill, three consider it premature, and twelve advocate some sort of compromise.

In Madras, out of seventeen opinions of Europeans, five of which are those of associations, representing considerable numbers, one only is in favour of passing the Bill as it stands, fourteen are in favour of withdrawal, and two advocate some kind of compromise; while, of six Natives consulted, one is in favour of withdrawal, one of a compromise, and four of the passing of the Bill.

In the Panjab, out of twenty European opinions, not one is in favour of passing the Bill as it stands, while sixteen advocate its withdrawal, and four some kind of compromise. The eight Native opinions received, of which four are those of Associations, are all in favor of the passing of the Bill.

In Coorg, of three European opinions, one that of an Association, all are in favour of the withdrawal of the Bill, while, of three Native opinions, one is in favour of withdrawal and two advocate the passing of the Bill.

In Haiderabad, of eight European opinions, one only is in favour of the passing of the Bill, the remaining seven being for withdrawal.

In the case of Burma, the test is vitiated by the fact that the Commissioners have not forwarded the opinions of their subordinates. Of the five Commissioners, themselves, however, three would withdraw the Bill, and two would pass it. But of these two, one avows his disapproval of the principle of the Bill, and the other admits that his opinion is opposed to that of all the officials consulted by him.

In the North-West Provinces only ten opinions of Europeans appear to have been sent in. Not one of these is in favour of passing the Bill as it stands. Eight advocate its withdrawal, and two are in favour of a compromise. The one Native opinion we can find recorded is in favour of the passing of the Bill.

In the case of the Central Provinces, out of eight opinions recorded, or specifically referred to, seven are against the Bill, and one is favour of a compromise.

In Assam the whole of the European officials consulted have, without exception, pronounced in favour of the withdrawal of the Bill.

In Beugal, of forty-seven Europeans consulted, only one, an American Missionary, is in favour of the passing of the Bill in any form; while of thirty-two Natives consulted, thirteen are against the passing of the Bill.

Altogether, of 222 opinions of Europeans, 13 are in favour of the passing of the Criminal Procedure Amendment Bill; 36 are in favour of some sort of compromise, and 173 are opposed to the passing of the Bill; while of 64 Native Opinions, 49 are in favour of the passing of the Bill in some form or other, and 15 are opposed to it.

This result, it will be seen, fully bears out—in fact, it more than bears out,—the public expectation entertained regarding the opinions. No question of legislation deliberately proposed as practicable and convenient by a responsible Government ever, we should think, received a more conclusive or emphatic answer.

The determination of the Government to disregard the answer, in case of its being adverse to their own views, was, however, clearly foreshadowed in the declaration made by Mr. Gladstone some days before the publication of the opinions, that Anglo-Indian opinion in such a matter was not the best.

The *London Times* of Saturday last announced, in a leading article, that the Cabinet had decided to proceed with the Bill, but to restrict the new jurisdiction to Magistrates of Districts and Sessions Judges.

We need hardly say, no such modification will reconcile the European community in the Mufsal to a change in their legal status which ignores the natural and equitable principle that, wherever possible, a man should be tried by a Judge of his own race.

The Bill, however, has still to pass the ordeal of the Legislative Council, where it will be hotly contested; and, should it be voted by the Council, every effort will probably be made to bring it to the test of a division in Parliament.

An important debate on the Central Provinces Land Bill took place at the meeting of the Legislative Council, held at Simla on the 20th June, the most noteworthy feature of which was the declaration of Lord Ripon, in opposition to his previous utterances and to the principles on which his Indian policy has hitherto been based, that it is beyond the



functions of the Legislature to anticipate the facts of the future.

Meetings of Landholders to protest against the confiscatory clauses of the Bengal Rent Bill continue to be held in the principal districts of Bengal and Behar, from both of which provinces ably argued Petitions against the measure have been submitted to Parliament.

The grant of a regular subsidy of twelve lakhs a year to the Amir has brought the subject of our relations with Kabul again before the public. Beyond the implied obligation of friendship, the gift of this large sum of money from the revenues of India appears to be unattended by any condition whatever. There is nothing to prevent its being used for the purpose of preparing war against the Queen, still less to prevent the Amir from accepting simultaneously a similar stipend from St. Petersburg. Such, at least, is the light in which the transaction is represented by Her Majesty's ministers. That such an arrangement should escape criticism is hardly to be expected. The best that can be said of it, perhaps, is that it can be terminated at any moment without raising any question of good faith.

*September 12th, 1883.*

---

#### POSTSCRIPT.

THE past fortnight has been unmarked by any event of special political importance. The Resolutions that were passed by the Behar planters, at the Meeting at Muzafarpur, mentioned above, have been endorsed at similar Meetings held in various parts of Bengal, and there can be little doubt that the subscribers intend to abide by their word. Nothing further has been heard in the meantime of the intentions of the Home Government as regards the Bill, but it would be extraordinary if they should remain wholly unmoved by a calm study of the official opinions.

*September 25th, 1883.*

---

## CRITICAL NOTICES.

### GENERAL LITERATURE.

*Circulars of Information of the Bureau of Education.* Washington: Government Printing Office, 1883.

THESE Circulars, published by the American Bureau of Education, are almost encyclopædic in their scope, comprising not only such purely departmental or technical matters as Rules for the examination and licensing of teachers, methods of instruction, and the like, but tracts and lectures on all sorts of subjects bearing in any way on the operations or the subject-matter of education. Thus, arboriculture; ventilation and the chemistry of the air; the anatomy and physiology of the ear, and the geography, climate, physical characteristics, ethnology and trade of Alaska are among the subjects dealt with more or less exhaustively in the three numbers before us.

Judging, indeed, from the contents of these numbers, the entire series would prove a most valuable addition to the library not merely of the educationist, but of the statist and general reader in whatever country.

---

*History of Burmah, including Burmah Proper, Pegu, Toungu, Tenasserim and Arakan. From the Earliest Time to the End of the first War with British India.* By Lieutenant-General Sir Arthur P. Phayre, G.C.M.G., K.C.S.I., and C.B. Membre Correspondant de la Société Académique Indo-Chinoise de France. London: Trübner & Co., Ludgate Hill, 1883.

THE people of Burmah present a curious contrast to their Indian neighbours in the position which history occupies in their literature.

Among the latter the nearest approach we have to such composition is, with few exceptions, the paucynic of the Court bard or the wild imaginings of the Epic poet, both idealists, the one bent on gratifying the vanity of a patron, the other on pleasing the popular imagination.

The Burmese, on the other hand, possess copious records of contemporary events, which, again, are supplemented by inscriptions on buildings and on the hills of monasteries and pagodas, including notices of secular matters. These records, moreover,

"deserve, on the whole, the praise of credibility," and display a creditable regard for impartiality. The difference, General Phayre thinks, may probably have resulted from that between Brahmanism and Buddhism. "While the former was exclusive, and sought to subordinate kings and rulers to the sacred race, the latter gave the first place in worldly affairs to the civil power, and held out honour and reward, secular and religious, to all who worshipped the three treasures and observed the moral law. Buddhism favoured the general extension of education, and appealed to the masses through the vernacular tongues; and thus, in spite of its tenets as to the worthlessness of worldly objects, and the misery of being, induced a general interest in the affairs of life."

The chief authorities followed by General Phayre are the *Mahā Rājāwong*, a copy of which was obtained from the library of the king of Burmah; a history of Arakan written by Maung Mi, a learned Arakanese Hsaya; and a history of Pegu in the Mun language by Hsaya Jan Atiwā, a Taling Buddhist monk, which was translated into Burmese.

The narratives of the numerous European travellers who have visited Burmah since the beginning of the sixteenth century have also been used to supplement or correct the native histories; and the annals of adjoining countries where available, have been compared as regards contemporary events.

It has thus been possible to produce a narrative which, though little more than a dry chronicle of wars and dynastic changes, possesses, from the fourteenth century downwards, some pretensions to completeness. Its defect is, that it gives us no insight into the history of the people, who, except as contributing to the armies of the princes, might for all that is said about them, have no existence. How far this may arise from the inadequate character of the materials available, and how far from a defect in the author's conception of what should constitute history, we are unable to say.

---

*Colonies and Dependencies. Part I.—India.* By J. S. Cotton, Late Fellow of Queen's College, Oxford. *Part II.—The Colonies.* By E. J. Payne, Fellow of University College, Oxford. London: Macmillan & Co. 1883.

THE first part of this work possesses a special interest at the present juncture for Englishmen in India. For it furnishes the key to the real significance of that new departure in Indian administration which has just filled the European community throughout the country with such profound alarm. It contains, in short, what there are good grounds for believing to be a candid,

and, as far as the main outlines are concerned, a complete exposition of the Radical programme for the future government of England's Eastern empire, which Lord Ripon has been commissioned to inaugurate, but the full scope of which it is not considered politic to avow officially.

The suggestion that the subjection of European British subjects in India to the jurisdiction of native Magistrates is intended to pave the way for the general supersession of British by native Magistrates and Judges, has, in spite of the plain-speaking of the less reticent members of the party at home been repudiated by the Government of India in the most unqualified terms. But such a supersession is only a minor item in the great series of changes comprised in the openly avowed programme of Lord Ripon's party, and conspicuously stated in the book before us, as not only reasonable and desirable but inevitable.

"Countries," says Mr. Cotton, "have often ere now been conquered and obeyed their conquerors, but the rule of an alien bureaucracy is an attempt foredoomed to failure."

"And we have taught the Indians to appreciate the change. So long as Government was limited to the simple duties of maintaining order, enforcing justice and collecting revenue, unreasoning obedience was easy, despite occasional anomalies. The old-fashioned Anglo-Indian did not always make himself understood, but he was respected as belonging to a higher order of humanity. He had a different language, a different education, different thoughts, and a different theory of administration. If the natives could appreciate him at all, it was just in so far as he had adopted some of their ways. This order of things died with the Company. The modern ideal is to transplant the full-grown tree of European civilisation into an Asiatic soil. An active central Government, stimulating material progress, trying experiments in legislation, subsidising education, and allowing liberty to the press, has superseded the lazy reign of individual Anglo-Indians. The whole land is astir with criticism and fresh proposals of reform. And it is of the essence of the new order that the natives should themselves take part in it. Together with our own language, we have taught them the lessons of industrial prosperity and of constitutional freedom. By so doing we have indirectly, but not less surely, sapped the foundations of our own supremacy. A stationary India, governed by Anglo-Indians, might conceivably remain stable. A progressive India, with rulers selected by competitive examination from English and natives indiscriminately, has entered upon an era of change the end of which none can foresee."

Do Mr. Cotton's clients, then, propose to abandon the natives of

India to their own devices free from all restraint or guidance from without? By no means. Stated in this bald way, the programme of India for the Indians might safely be treated as perfectly harmless, because too obviously impracticable to be ever seriously entertained by responsible statesmen. What is intended is the gradual parceling out of the country into independent Native States under a British protectorate. In the restoration of Mairat to native rule, we have seen the first step towards the consummation of this plan; and possibly Dhulip Singh may yet live to be the ruler of a semi-independent Panjab.

"The emancipation of India" need not necessarily involve a total severance from the British Crown though it would involve the destruction of the English supremacy and the grant of a large measure of local independence. Home Rule for India, as Home Rule has been already conceded to Canada and to the Australian colonies, is by no means inconsistent with the unity of the empire—least of all when we anticipate what the empire will probably be like fifty years hence. And we can press the analogy somewhat closer. Canada is a sort of confederacy; neither Australia nor South Africa has yet entered into the political stage of confederation. India, on the other hand, is only united in external show. In her case Home Rule would mean the restitution of local independence to twenty different provinces or states, which might well find their common head in England."

Again:—

"It would not be such a very difficult task when once the general principle is conceded. An English army, or at least an army officered by Englishmen, would probably be required, even after the presence of English civilians had become rare; for England, in her capacity of protector, might maintain the obligation of guarding India both against any new conqueror and against internal strife. A confederacy of many states and provinces, each developing peacefully after its own fashion, and all united by a common bond to the English name, is our dream for the twentieth century."

Though this plan would as certainly end in ruin as the "bag and baggage policy," the rock on which it would be wrecked lies beneath the surface; and there is but too much reason to fear lest its existence should be ignored till retreat becomes impossible.

This is the ultimate goal at which the Radical party aim, and the arguments in its favour are such as possess a dangerous attractiveness for the average untravelled Englishman. In the meanwhile the way is to be prepared by getting rid of the Civil Service, whose "*esprit de corps*" pledges it to the support of the existing order."

We again quote Mr. Cotton :

"A more genuine obstacle to innovation is presented by the circumstances of the Civil Service. Its members, selected in England by rigorous competition, present the choicest product of Western culture. From the newly-arrived Assistant Magistrate to the Lieutenant-Governor of a Province, they form an administrative hierarchy, bound together by close ties of loyalty and self-interest. They possess a monopoly of all the most valuable appointments, which they can support by an appeal to the Act of Parliament under which they serve. Considering the conditions of their life—exile from home and often separation from family, and severe duties in a tropical climate—and comparing their income with the prospects they might reasonably have entertained in England, it cannot be said that their average salary is excessive. Their incorruptibility, their energy, their self-sacrifice, are above praise. The work they do is of an altogether exceptional character, which none could perform but themselves. They *are* the administration personified, with all its merits and defects. To introduce discontent among them would be to shake the whole fabric, which rests upon their devotion, scarcely less than upon the might of the army. Yet, after all, the Civil Service exists for India, not India for the Civil Service. To reconcile the interests of each will be a most delicate problem, and it presses for solution. The admission of natives without competition to certain grades of subordinate office is an idle device, so long as the phalanx of the covenanted Service remains unbroken. Granting that the vested rights (and even the contingent expectations) of individuals must be guarded, and granting also that some degree of European control will be necessary for years to come, the Indians may fairly claim to be entrusted at once with a share of the higher posts—executive as well as judicial. Considerations of economy here coincide with the demands of justice. It will be necessary to look for the native candidates until they are found. Nor must it be said that the experiment will have failed entirely, if it do not entirely succeed. A native administration can never be the same thing as an English administration. To wait for that to come about would be to wait till the Ethiopian shall have changed his skin. But a native administration stimulated by English example, and still supervised by Englishmen, is a not unworthy political ideal."

We have said that the plan of a confederacy of Native States, with England as the paramount Power, would as certainly end in failure as the "bag and baggage policy" pure and simple, though it is quite probable that it might work for a time. It would end in failure because such a confederacy would certainly, sooner or

later, use its united power to throw off all allegiance to England, and, if it succeeded in that, would, after a further interval, as certainly split up into a number of hostile sections, which, in their struggle for supremacy, would reduce the country to anarchy.

To guard against the first of these contingencies England would have to at least double her present army, for the withdrawal of Civil control, coupled with the facilities for combined action which a federation of Native States would imply, would add enormously to the aggressive strength of the population of India as a whole.

It is not certain, however, that the British Government would ever be permitted by its own countrymen in India to carry out in its entirety any such plan as that contemplated. When once the true character of its design is thoroughly apprehended, every step in the programme will be the signal for determined opposition on the part of the entire European community, which is daily gaining in strength, and which, even now, if united, would probably be powerful enough to compel a respectful, if not a humble, hearing.

Mr. Cotton's estimate of the "Effects of British rule in India" is admirably balanced, and shows a remarkably clear insight into the more intimate conditions of the problem.

That the entire surface of India has never before been so densely populated as at the present time may be admitted. But it is not so certain that the richer tracts now support more than they once did. The recent increase has chiefly been in provinces where there is abundance of waste land; and even of this waste land it must be recollected that much had been cultivated at some previous period. The case of Oudh should induce us to distrust vague statements about the growth of population under British rule. That province was annexed in 1756 on the ground of intolerable misgovernment. In the following year the Mutiny broke out, and for more than twelve months civil war raged in every district. We should expect, therefore, to find the number of the people, if not small, at least rapidly increasing. But the actual figures, so far as they show anything, show the actual converse. The first census of Oudh was taken in 1868, only ten years after the Mutiny, and it gave a total of 11 220,232 souls, being 468 per square mile, or more than 1 to every cultivated acre. This was by far the greatest density in India that of Bengal being only 383, and that of the North-Western Provinces being 378. But this is not all. The second census of Oudh was taken in 1881, and showed an increase of less than 200,000 souls, or only 1·6 per cent in thirteen years, as compared with an increase of 35 per cent in British Burmah, and of 25 per cent in the Central Provinces. No famine or other exceptional event had intervened. From this we learn two things—first, that a province scarcely recovered from native misrule and all the horrors of war could yet maintain a man to every acre; and second, that the increase under British Government has been insignificant, probably not greater than the increase of cultivation. It is evident from these figures that native rule (or misrule, if the phrase be preferred) is not incompatible with a dense population. The truth is that the population of India (like that of every other country) will always be just as dense as the circumstances permit and never any denser.

In India emigration is not one of the circumstances that have to be considered. Agriculture, indeed, is there the sole circumstance. Where waste land permits, population increases fast, only less fast than in America; elsewhere it increases slowly, if at all. The cause that here prevents the increase (directly or indirectly) is simply want of food. This must ever be so where agriculture forms the sole occupation of the people; and just in proportion to the degree that other industries existed in the old days, so had the population a larger margin within which to increase.

When we turn to the material condition of the people under British rule, we find the primary principles reversed. The central government has become stable, while the rural population seems to be losing its secular equilibrium. We have introduced into India the European conception of a state, with a minutely-organised administration, backed by irresistible force. Thus we have done deliberately, under the honest belief that we were thereby conferring the greatest of political benefits. But we have unwisely poured new wine into old bottles. The change has indeed been slow, and is by no means yet finished. The first few generations of English rulers left things pretty much to take their course. They attempted, with more or less success, to fit themselves into their Oriental surroundings. In their time the condition of the people must have been almost the same as under native rule, except that local courts no longer afforded opportunities to the energetic and employment to artisans. But within the last thirty years a revolution has been wrought in the views of the Governors and in the rotation of the governed, which is proceeding with accelerated rapidity. The revolution dates from the epoch of Lord Dalhousie, who carried out into practice his doctrine that the blessings of British rule should be forced upon the people. The theory implied in this doctrine received a temporary check from the Mutiny. It has since been indirectly stimulated by the results of steamships and railways, and directly by the most active English administrators.

The consequences may be seen everywhere, but more especially in the land system, for this is the one point of our administration that is felt in every home. As has been already stated, the land system varies in the different provinces, but the more important features are common to every province but Bengal. The assessment is struck after a most elaborate calculation, and the average rate cannot be thought high in consideration of the increase of price that has taken place. It is fixed for a long term of years, with the object of allowing the occupier to derive any profit from the probable increment. No Irish farmer could ask for more, yet the results have not answered the expectation. Over the large tracts the cultivating class is not only impoverished but demoralised; hardly anywhere can they be said to be prosperous. It has already been argued that the evil is caused by rack-renting. If that were all, it could be easily remedied. It is caused by the introduction of a rigid system, to which the people were not accustomed. Under native rule the assessment was probably no less high, and occasionally it may have been extracted by torture; but custom allowed it to vary with the proceeds of the harvest, and there was always a chance of evasion, and, in the last resource, of flight. The insistence even of a Mughal tax-gatherer was tempered by a regard for future supplies. According to our theory, bad years ought to be set off against good; but the simple husbandman is unable to keep for himself even the profits of good years. He is permanently under the power of the money-lender, who is the only person that has benefited by a low assessment and rigorous collection. While the revenue officers are compelled to proceed against the defaulting peasant, the judicial courts offer every facility to the astute money-lender,



who knows precisely how and when to take proceedings. Such is the result of the application to India of the European maxims of fixed taxation and ready justice. The mischief, however, has been recognised by the Government; and three measures of relief are now under consideration: (1) To shelter the peasant against his natural enemy by altering the law of debt and mortgage in his favour; (2) To empower the Collectors to postpone and even remit revenue; (3) To establish land banks under official patronage, which shall be content with a moderate rate of interest. The aim of these reforms is no less benevolent than was the aim of the original assessment; but when the traditional stability of village agriculture has once been disturbed, it is impossible to predict how it will again settle down.

Take, again, the question of the wealth of the country at large. The total population is certainly larger (probably, much larger) than it has ever been at any previous period, which is equivalent to saying that more land is now under cultivation. That the population is advancing, or will advance, too rapidly for the capacity of the soil to support it, we do not believe. In a purely agricultural country such dangers have their own natural cure. But if the security of British rule has allowed the people to increase, it does not follow that it has promoted the general prosperity. That could only be done in one of two ways—either by producing a distinct rise in the standard of living among the lowest class, or by diverting a considerable section of the people from the sole occupation of agriculture. It is needless to point out that neither of these things has been done. Competent authorities, indeed, are of opinion that the condition of the lowest class has become worse under British rule. Sir Richard Temple expresses himself as doubtful on this point. Dr. W. W. Hunter estimates that one-fifth of the total population, or 40 million persons, “go through life on insufficient food.” To improve the general standard of this miserable class is beyond the reach of any external measures. But possibly their sole dependence upon agriculture might be modified by the creation of other means of livelihood, and thus the pressure on the soil be lessened. Something has already been accomplished in this direction. And here it becomes important to point out that it is not dependence upon agriculture generally, but dependence upon the local food crop in particular that constitutes the mischief. A community entirely engaged in agriculture, or even entirely engaged in raising food crops, may be comparatively well-to-do, if not prosperous. This may be seen in the case of the Western States of America, or even in the case of British Burmah. The whole matter turns upon two questions—whether the cultivators produce more than they consume? and what becomes of the surplus? Throughout India the conditions vary. In Burmah and in parts of Eastern Bengal there is a considerable surplus; in the irrigated tracts of the North-West, in the Madras deltas, and in the cotton districts of Bombay and Central India, a fair surplus; in the rest of the country, probably very little. Whether that surplus takes the form of rice, or jute, or wheat, or cotton, is immaterial. Secondly, what becomes of this surplus? That it is practically all exported does not affect the present argument. We want to find out now who enjoy the immediate benefits of it. These might be appropriated by the State, as indeed they are to a limited extent, by means of an augmented land-tax and an export duty on rice; and thus they would tend to relieve the burden of taxation proper. They might be intercepted by landlords in the form of rent; but even under the *zamindari* system of Bengal this is hardly the case to any appreciable degree. They might again be allowed to remain with the cultivators themselves, so far at least as the non-interference of the State can allow them to remain there; and this, we are glad to believe, happens in Burmah and parts of Bengal. The cultivators here are probably as well off as any peasantry

in the world. Their prosperity is evidenced by their display of silver ornaments, and their purchases of clothing. Lastly, and as a subordinate alternative, these surplus profits which the law leaves to the cultivators they may by their own folly transfer to the money-lenders. We have too much reason to fear that this has occurred in the richest portions of Bombay.

A further question, not unconnected with the above, have been considering, is concerned with the destination of the surplus. Under native rule it was of necessity consumed in the country. It went either to support the luxury of courts, or to encourage local manufactures. In either event it tended to promote variety in political and social life, which is in itself a good thing. At the present time the British exportation is exported, and thus fails to influence any other people in the country than its own producers. To talk of this export as a stimulant to native manufactures. If a Government spends its revenue on a building, or a capital, or a capital dividend in a foreign land, such expenditure can be of no benefit to the home country. But, as already said, the exportation of the surplus we are talking about does not come under any of these heads. It is not a gift of the property of the peasant, which he barter with England for silver and cloth. During the past forty years India has exported English cotton manufactures to the amount of more than 400 millions sterling and has absorbed 300 millions of treasure.

Yet one other aspect of the matter deserves to be mentioned. It is sometimes alleged that the exports must be a loss to the country, because in former days the surplus was not exported but consumed. In so far as the surplus existed in former days, and was then either appropriated by the State or exchanged against local manufactures, this allegation has no justification—if not from the point of view of capitalised commerce at least from that of national well-being. But the real answer to it is that the surplus did not exist in former times to anything like the same extent as now. It has been created, not so much by the security of British rule as by the extraordinary activity of modern trade. Jute has been invented, if we may so say, within the last thirty years. Improvements in measures of weight give an altogether new value to industry. In an isolated country there is little encouragement to increase production, and the bounty of Nature may result in mere waste. When there is no external market a harvest above the average becomes an evil rather than a benefit. Not only will part of the crops be left to rot on the field, but also the excessive cheapness upsets the simple social economy. Of this many examples will occur to those familiar with Indian history. Mr. Lindsay, Supervisor of Sylhet in Assam, towards the end of the last century, reported that the rice harvest in two successive years had been so plentiful that, "the farmers were totally unable to pay their rents." As late as the year 1870, it was recorded in a Bengal Administration Report, that the peasants of Dinajpur grumbled because the season was too favourable. Nor is there any ground for the assertion sometimes made that crops grown for export are unduly encroaching upon the area devoted to food. It is true that a sudden demand, such as that caused by the recent famine in Southern India, may deplete the stores of grain which every Indian peasant lays up against a bad season. But where the demand is fairly constant, the supply is always derived from the superfluity. It will be found universally that the great exporting districts of India are not only the most prosperous but also the least liable to suffer from scarcity. Railways, canals, and steamships are probably the most unmixed benefits that England has conferred upon India; and of these we are disposed to place steamships first.

If we turn to the classes not engaged in agriculture, we shall probably be forced to the conclusion, that their state has not improved under British

rule. The weavers have suffered conspicuously. From some parts of the country this caste has almost disappeared, and everywhere it is in a decaying condition. Lancashire has attained its pre-eminence by annihilating the indigenous industry—first by prohibitive duties in England, and then by the competition of machinery. The recent establishment of steam mills at Bombay and elsewhere, affords a poor compensation for the variety of social life once spread through the country. With the weavers have gone the numerous caste of dyers. In the same way many other handicrafts have suffered either from the abolition of the native courts or from English rivalry. Carpet-making, fine embroidery, jewellery, metal work, the damascening of arms, saddlery, carving, paper-making, even architecture and sculpture, have all alike decayed. In some cases the change is to be regretted, not only as impairing the social economy, but as an absolute loss to the artistic treasures of the world. Processes have been forgotten, and hereditary aptitudes have fallen into disuse, which can now never be restored. An India supplying England with its raw products, and in its turn dependent upon England for all its more important manufactures, is not a picture that we can expect the Indians to contemplate with entire satisfaction.

What answer, then, would a writer, with full knowledge and absolute impartiality, give to the question whether India has benefited by British rule? He would admit that the population has largely increased, and that the aggregate amount of human pleasure (or pain) has been made by so much greater. He would admit that the people, both on British territory, and in states still native, are protected against the grosser forms of injustice, and against the storms of cruelty that used occasionally to sweep through the land. He would admit that the British Government has made strenuous efforts, at least in recent years, to ameliorate the condition of the masses. But he would probably doubt whether the good results have been equal to the good intentions. On the general issue he would hardly feel himself justified in pronouncing a final verdict. A Government can easily obstruct prosperity; it can do comparatively little to promote it. That must depend, after all, upon the people themselves. The State can maintain peace without, and justice within. It can avoid harassing taxation, and can remove artificial restraints upon commerce. But these things are negative rather than positive. They are the absence of wrong rather than the presence of right. They constitute good order. They do not necessarily involve progress. The springs of national development lie deep in human nature, and may escape the reach of an alien administrator who does not possess the divining rod. To introduce the complex machinery of Western civilisation into the simple society of the East is an experiment of which the present generation cannot prudently foretell the result. Japan is trying this experiment with its own native agency. In India, the same experiment is being tried on a far grander scale, and the responsibility rests with the people of England.

---

*Esoteric Buddhism.* By A. G. Sinnett, President of the Simla Esoteric Theosophical Society, Author of "The Occult World." London: Trübner & Co., Ludgate Hill. 1883.

THE author of *Esoteric Buddhism* asks us to accept a certain account of the evolution, constitution, and future development of the universe and man,—not as a conclusion, based on inductive evidence; not as a theory, furnishing an adequate

explanation of known data, but as a fact, based upon positive knowledge; and he asks us to do this on the ground, as far as we can gather, that he himself believes the account to be true, not because it is a logical inference from facts which he has himself observed, but because he has been assured of its truth by certain individuals in whose veracity and competency he puts absolute faith.

When we come to enquire into the grounds of this faith, we find them to consist in the estimate which Mr. Sinnett has formed of the morality of the individuals in question, combined with the fact that he believes them to have performed certain feats which are beyond the power of mankind in general to perform, and the performance of which he can explain only on the supposition that they possess a knowledge of natural laws unattainable by the ordinary scientific methods of observation and reasoning. Supposing that, for the sake of argument we grant all the data thus postulated, Mr. Sinnett's demand appears to us to amount to this, that we are justified in accepting without independent proof, any statement, however it may transcend ordinary experience and means of verification, that may be made by any one in whose good faith he himself believes, and who appears to him to have performed feats which mankind generally are unable to perform, and the *modus operandi* of which we cannot explain.

We need hardly say that this is a monstrous proposition, to accept which would be to place our belief at the absolute disposal of any mystic, plausible enough to disarm suspicion of his honesty, and clever enough to deceive our senses. Indeed, we might go much further and grant, as facts, what Mr. Sinnett asks us to accept as matters of faith, *viz.* that the author, or authors, of the statements made are really honest, that the feats they appear to perform are actually performed, and that their performance is the result of a knowledge of natural laws unattainable by ordinary methods. Still, it would not follow, either that the favoured individuals in question were beyond the influence of self-deception, or that the knowledge which enabled them to perform the feats alluded to, implied an acquaintance with other truths not necessarily connected therewith.

Mr. Sinnett may, perhaps, contend that this is not a complete account of the nature of the testimony offered by him in support of the statements of Esoteric Buddhism, inasmuch as we have omitted to take into consideration what he has told us regarding the method by which the illuminati who make them, arrive at their knowledge of occult things. The claims of these statements on our assent are weakened, however, rather than strengthened, when we come to examine the information afforded

us on this head. For, vague as that information is as to details, it is clear enough as regards the general character of the method pursued. We are told, on the one hand, that the knowledge obtained is arrived at by intuition, and, on the other, that the state of mind in which this intuition takes place, is a peculiar state, which can be induced only by long and painful discipline. Now it follows from the very nature of intuition that, in the absence of verification by the senses, it is impossible to ascertain whether the relations apprehended by it are purely subjective, or correspond to relations between objective facts, and the subject-matter of the statements of Esoteric Buddhism is such as to render verification through the senses impossible.

But, we may be told though verification through the senses may be impossible, comparison of the intuitions of different individuals is possible. Now, in the first place, we have no evidence that the conclusions of Esoteric Buddhism are based on any such comparison; and, in the second place, even if we had such evidence, it would not prove the objectivity of the relations apprehended, for we should still have no evidence that the agreement was not the result of a common aberration, induced by the operation of similar processes on the different minds concerned.

We all know that, by subjecting the eye to a certain preparatory discipline, any one who pleases may seem to see an image of a certain colour and form where there is really only a blank surface. If several individuals subject their eyes to the same disciplinary process the images they will thus seem to see will all correspond in colour and form. Yet these images are purely subjective, and the fact that they are seen by different individuals in the same way is no proof of their objective existence. And if intuitions arrived at by different minds in a state of abstraction induced by the same or similar processes, are found to correspond in many particulars, even when concerned with such questions as the constitution of the universe, we are just as little entitled to regard the correspondence as proof of their truth.

---

*The Legends of the Punjab.* By Captain R. C. Temple, Bengal Staff Corps, Fellow of the Royal Geographical Society, Member of the Royal Asiatic, Philological, and Folklore Societies, the Anthropological Institute, and the Asiatic Society of Bengal. No. 1. August 1883. Bombay: Education Society's Press. London: Trübner & Co.

THE series of folk-tales of which this is the first instalment promises to form a valuable contribution not merely to the study of comparative storiology but to our practical,

knowledge of Indian life and thought. Considering the richness of the field, wonderfully little has yet been done towards collecting and preserving the unwritten literature of India, and Captain Temple deserves the gratitude of scholars for his labours in this direction.

The Adventures of Rājā Rasālu, which have been selected to head the series are, we are told, especially valuable. "The legend gives a hint of the true history of that Indo-Scythian hero, who may yet be identified with Sri Syāiapati Deva, whose coins are still found in such abundance all over the Panjab, and who must have flourished between the first Arab invasion of Sind and Kabul and the rise of the Ghaznavide Dynasty. It also contains in places the most remarkable analogies to the almost universal stories of the *Seven Wise Men*, the germs of which are to be found in the *Sukasaptati* and *Panchatantra* in India, and in the *Story of Sindibād* in Europe and Asia, repeated in Arabic in the *Alif Laila*, in Persian in the *Sindibād-nāma* and the *Tātīn-nāma*, in Greek and Syriac in the *Story of Syntipas*, in the Hebrew *Mishle Sandubar*, and in Spanish in the *Libro de los Engaños de las Mujeres*, besides many modern versions in most of the languages of Europe and in the *bāzār* books of modern India.

The versified passages in the legend possess considerable philological interest, and have been given, in every instance, verbatim.

*Across Chryse, being the Narrative of a Journey of Exploration through the South China Border Lands from Canton to Manday.* By Archibald R. Colquhoun, Executive Engineer, Indian Public Works, F.R.G.S., A. M. Inst. C. E. In two volumes, London : Sampson, Low, Marston, Searle, and Rivington, 1883.

MR. COLQUHOUN'S volumes are full of interest, not only as a graphic narrative of travel through some of the most picturesque country in the world, but as demonstrating the possibility of an Englishman, wholly ignorant of the language, traversing nearly the entire breadth of China without coming into serious collision with the natives. Mr. Colquhoun, no doubt, enjoyed the advantage of a safe conduct from the Viceroy of the "Two Kwangs," which stood him in good stead throughout this part of the journey, but similar documents have before now been set at naught by both mobs and local officials in China, and our traveller's success must be largely attributed to the prudence with which he avoided all chance of hostile encounter, and

possibly to his adoption of the native costume, which tended to render his presence, as a "foreign devil," as little obtrusive as possible. The question whether it is good policy for a European to assume the native garb when travelling among unfriendly oriental peoples, is a vexed one, and it can hardly be said that the present instance decides it. There is, no doubt, much to be urged on both sides. In travelling by river, where the main object is to avoid attracting undesirable attention from a distance, the balance of argument is, perhaps, in favour of the plan. But where a traveller is brought constantly into intimate contact with the people, it probably rather adds to than diminishes his danger.

Mr. Colquhoun was frustrated, by the passive obstruction of the local authorities, in his intention of leaving Chinese territory at Esmok and making his way through the Independent and Tributary Shan States to Moulmein. But his journey through Yunan and Upper Burmah, if not so fruitful of new knowledge, is probably quite as interesting to the general reader.

Mr. Colquhoun's style, while simple and unaffected, is impressive and picturesque. While he avoids all approach to wearisome disquisition, his comments on men and things are pregnant with practical wisdom; and it would be difficult to name a book calculated to be more instructive to any one following in his footsteps than "*Across Chryse*."

#### VERNACULAR LITERATURE.

1. *Bhārat-Kāhinī*. By Rajani Kanta Gupta. Printed by Bhuban Mohan Ghosh, at the Victoria Press, 210-1, Cornwallis Street and published by Gurudās Chattopādhyāya, at the Bengal Medical Library, 97, College Street, Calcutta. 1883.
2. *Arya-kirtī*. By Rajani Kanta Gupta. Second Edition. Printed by Sarachchandra Deb, at the Binā Press, 37, Mechuabazar Street, and Published by Gurudās Chattopādhyāya, at the Bengal Medical Library, 97, College Street, Calcutta. 1883.

**B**ABU Rajani Kanta Gupta has, we believe, done more to popularise Indian history than any other Bengali writer. He is neither an antiquary nor an original writer on Indian history. He works with materials collected by others. And yet he is a writer who stands almost alone among writers on Indian history. The reason is that, though he has no new information to give us, or any new theory to explain, his manner of explaining Indian history is different from that of English historians of India. It is the manner of a patriot—of a Hindu who desires

that his country's history should be so explained and studied as to fill the Hindu mind with patriotic pride and historic enthusiasm. He draws his topics chiefly from Rajputana and the Panjab, and occasionally from other parts of India. Of the two works under notice, the second, *Arya-Kirti*, is the first of a series in which 'the story of the exploits and achievements of the Hindu Aryas will be gradually unfolded.' The author intends, by publishing this series, to serve a great educational purpose. He thinks that the Indian mind is greatly denationalised, and therefore demoralised by the present system of teaching chiefly foreign history and biography in Indian schools. By this system the Indian is taught to think of men and manners in a style which is not of this country, and consequently, he becomes unfit to serve his own countrymen. That there is some truth in this view, cannot, we think, be denied. No man can be blamed for not serving one whom he does not respect. Well, Indian history does, indeed, find a place among the studies of our schools and colleges: but that is only the portion of Indian history in which the Hindu finds himself beaten or outwitted by foreigners. We therefore hail Babu Rajani Kanta's historical series as one which will do much to remedy the defects of the system of teaching which is followed in our schools and colleges.

*Bhārat-Kāhīnī* consists of a number of essays connected with Indian history and politics. The subjects touched upon are—the Aryan settlement in India, Asoka, the Greeks in India, Indian religious sects, Jagat Seth, the martial prowess of Bengalis, Buddhism, the liberty of the Press in India, &c. All these subjects are treated in a plain popular style, and in a spirit of love and respect for the author's own country. To one of the essays in this collection we would draw the attention of our readers, and especially of Bengali school boys. Most people in this country believe that Jagat Seth was the name, and not the title, of a man. The error, we are inclined to think, has its origin in some of the historical works which are used in our schools, and is, we have reason to say, firmly rooted in the minds of some of our most distinguished scholars. Jagat Seth, as a perusal of the paper in Babu Rajani Kanta's book will convince every one, was not a name, but a title embodying an exceedingly interesting personal and political history.

---

*Upanyās-ratnāvalī*. Part I—Nos. 1, 2 and 3. By Dāmodar Mukhopādhyāya. Printed and published by H. M. Mukharji & Co., at the New Samskrit Press, 11, Simla Street, Calcutta.

**T**HIS is a serial containing Bengali translations of three English works of fiction,—Bulwer's *Kienzi*, Scott's *Bride of*



*Lammermoor* and Wilkie Collins' *Woman in White*. The translator deserves praise, because the works he has selected for translation are not of the class of Reynold's *Mysteries*, which many of his countrymen seem fond of rendering into their own vernacular. But we are not sure whether he deserves other praise than this. In the first place, we are not quite sure whether Bengalis, who do not know English, care to read stories in which the thoughts, sentiments, and actions of *foreigners* are described. The story, for instance, of a political movement, like that which was headed by Rienzi, cannot be expected to evoke much sympathy or interest among a class of readers, who do not care much for forms of political life, or know not what political life means. In the second place, Babu Dāmodar Mukharji's plan of relating foreign stories with Indianised names of places and persons—a plan which seems followed more largely in Rienzi than in the other tales—is positively misleading and injurious. In this plan, Bengalis appear thinking, feeling, and acting like persons which they are not. It would have been in every respect better if, following the advice of Babu Kaliprasanna Ghosh, Babu Dāmodar Mukharji had given us a strictly literal translation, or if, in accordance with the advice of Babu Bankim Chandra Chatterji, he had given us neither a literal translation nor a free version. The enrichment of Bengali literature is the plea on which such versions are generally published. But it should be always borne in mind that translations and versions are after all borrowed wealth, and no one can be considered truly rich with borrowed money. Bengali literateurs should therefore pay as much attention as possible to the cultivation of their own resources.

---

*Mānabatattwa*, or a Treatise on the Social, Moral and Intellectual Position of Man. By Bireswar Pānde. Printed and published by H. M. Mukharji & Co., at the New Sanskrit Press, 11 Simla Street, Calcutta 1883.

IT is seldom that we come across a work like this in Bengali literature. The abstruse questions of creation, creative power, the soul-element in man, man's past and future states of existence, the existence of God, the criterion of human duty, liberty and equality, &c., are discussed by the author with great power of thought, great ingenuity, and great boldness and enthusiasm. What is written on these subjects seems to embody the result of careful study and deep meditation. The style in which the essays are written, really challenges admiration. It is remarkably clear, pertinent and impressive, indicating clear thought and deep and earnest conviction. It is a bold and vigorous, but beautifully plain and

simple style. The author appears to revel in the subjects which are dwelt upon in this work, and to enjoy keenly the indescribable luxury of discussing them. On social subjects, the author writes like a conservative. We do not go with him entirely, but we are glad to be able to state, that we agree in almost all his conclusions on the subject of Zenana seclusion, early marriage, widow-marriage, &c. Babu Bireswar Pánde is a thinker of a practical turn of mind, and seems to have been therefore betrayed into some errors by placing undue reliance on the results of statistical inquiries. But in spite of all his errors, his work is really an admirable performance—an exceedingly valuable and interesting contribution to Bengali literature.

---

*Astádas Bidyá. Part I.* By Ráya Gobinda Mohan Bidyábinod-báridhi. Printed by I. C. Basu & Co., at the Stanhope Press, 249, Bow-bazar Street, Calcutta, and published by the Author at Kákiná. 1883.

**B**ABU GOBINDA MOHAN ROY is very favourably known to our readers as the author of some interesting treatises on Hindu astronomy. His present work is equally interesting. It contains a description of the 18 main divisions or branches of Sanskrit learning, and of their numerous sub divisions. As a book of reference, *Astádas Bidyá* is a work of great value. It is the result of vast patient study and clear erudition. Babu Gobinda Mohan Roy is a literary workman of a very serious, earnest and elevated type—of the type which sustains a nation's literature and constitutes its real strength.

---

*Balyasakhá. Part I.* Printed and published by Ramsarbasya Bhattáchárya, at the Bidhán Press, No. 6, College Square, Sakábdá. 1805.

**T**HIS is a collection of easy and interesting poems for children. The subjects selected are likely to be of great interest to those for whom the book is intended; the versification is generally sweet and smooth; and the style is earnest and impressive.

---







